

and the war could not have helped. Beginning in about 1810, however, Sor's guitar music began to appear in Paris in Salvador Castro de Gistau's *Journal de musique étrangère*—notably his earliest published guitar works, including the *Gran Solo*, Op. 14, and the *Sonata*, Op. 15. By 1811, he may have also been published in London. So, by the time Sor arrived in exile in Paris in 1813, the *guitaromanie* had already begun and he was somewhat of a celebrity. His international career had begun.

As noted above, *España de la Guerra* is an unusual and ambitious book that fits into no simple category. Most of it consists of a catalog of about 160 extant songs from various sources, along with original lyrics in Spanish, and (usually) English translations, all presented chronologically in the context of the events of the war. It is not a comprehensive history of the war; the early months of the war generated a great outburst of patriotic music and so get more attention and detail than the last years. Where appropriate, Jeffery provides insightful musicological or literary analysis. His research—uncovering rare scores, multiple editions and variants, library locations, etc.—is thorough and impressive. The Appendices, Catalogues, Bibliography, and Index occupy 134 pages.

The book is well written but, because it is dense with information, it is not an easy read. Given its 400-plus pages, my criticisms are relatively few: It would have been helpful if more scores and musical examples were included (apparently a separate edition of the songs is planned). And Jeffery's graceful translations are missed when they are, here-and-there and somewhat randomly, not included. The Index, less than five pages long, is limited to people and places and so is unhelpful when trying to search for an event, a song title or, e.g., some aspect of Sor's life (he is listed simply as "*passim*"). Jeffery suggests that readers can search in more detail if they purchase the e-book version—a not particularly satisfactory solution to anyone who already paid for a printed copy.

Jeffery's brief but thoughtful Conclusion suggests some parallels with our own age; he points out that there was often a "huge discrepancy between the message and the actual facts" in the lyrics of the patriotic songs in Spain. The nationalist uprisings occurring across Europe after 1806-7 were reactions to Napoleon's Continental System, but the wave of propaganda that emerged suddenly in Spain in 1808 suggests that Fernando and/or his supporters subsidized the deluge, possibly at considerable expense. In other words, a 200-year-old version of "fake news" was spread, meme-like, across the peninsula, striking precisely those notes—*patria, rey, y religión*—that reliably inspired populist fear and anger, in a pattern that would be repeated many times in the next centuries.

—RICHARD M. LONG

<sup>1</sup> The Peninsular War has also provided the dramatic setting for much popular literature, including books by best-selling authors from Bernard Cornwell to Arturo Pérez-Reverte, the ITV series *Sharpe*, and films such as *The Pride and the Passion* (1957). The summation of the war in this review is mine, not a paraphrase of Jeffery's.

<sup>2</sup> One anonymous song, "A las armas coreo españoles," contains lyrics that actually paraphrase the *Marseillaise*. Jeffery managed to locate its music, previously assumed to be lost.

<sup>3</sup> Sor had an unpleasant confrontation with the Inquisition a few years earlier. See Brian Jeffery, "Sor in Trouble with the Inquisition, 1803-1806," *Soundboard*, Vol. XXXVIII, No. 3 (2012): 15-19.

<sup>4</sup> These four songs have been published in Fernando Sor, *Music for Voice and Guitar*, ed. by Jan de Kloe and Matanya Ophée (Heidelberg: Chanterelle Verlag, 2005). Facsimiles of three of these—"Hymno de la Victoria," "Los defensores de la patria [Vivir en cadenas]," and "¿Adónde vas, Fernando incauto?"—were included in Jeffery, *Fernando Sor: Composer and Guitarist*, 2nd ed., Tecla, pp. 14-21. The latter two have been recently recorded on *Fernando Sor: Songs for Voice and Guitar*, performed by Nerea Berraondo (mezzo) and Eva Beneke (guitar) (Naxos CD 8.573686, 2017).

### Confalone, Nicoletta.

*Un angelo senza paradiso: La chitarra alla ricerca di Schubert.*  
Bologna: Ut Orpheus Edizioni, 2017. 351 pp. (www.utorpheus.com).

Nicoletta Confalone is a guitarist and musicologist from Rovigo who has written productively about several early-19th-century guitarists. In this book she tackles a more celebrated composer from the same period, Franz Schubert, whose association with the guitar spanned his tragically short life (1797-1828) and captured the imaginations of guitarists from his own era and beyond.

The title, *Un angelo senza paradiso* . . . , refers to the Italian version of Schubert's *Leise flehen meine Lieder*, a popular German musical film of 1933 about Schubert's life. It was but one of many novels and theatrical works that appeared in the century after Schubert's death. The brief appearance of a guitar in the film (it is being pawned by the penniless musician) symbolizes for Confalone its ambivalent position in Schubert's life and legend. It was, in effect, an angel without paradise. Ironically, in a 1970 remake of the film the instrument in the pawnshop is a violin.

In the first part of the book, "Schubert and the Guitar," Confalone provides an overview of Vienna's Biedermeier milieu, the guitar's place within it, and the important guitarists of the age such as Molitor, Matiegka, Call, Weber, and Mauro Giuliani. In this context, she examines in detail each of the works including guitar that are associated with Schubert. The revival of the guitar as a concert instrument in the 20th century was hindered by the dearth of repertory from the Romantic and Late Romantic composers, so guitar

Nicoletta Confalone

Un angelo  
senza paradiso

La chitarra alla ricerca di Schubert



Ut Orpheus Edizioni

## REVIEWS: (cont.)

*aficionados* were consequently eager to claim Schubert as one of their own. Opposing them was the Austrian musicologist Otto Erich Deutsch (1883-1967), who loved Schubert and dedicated many years to cataloguing his works. Deutsch held the guitar in low esteem and believed that any association of the guitar with Schubert detracted from the composer's legacy. He rejected almost any attribution of guitar music to Schubert (although he couldn't argue with the *Cantata*, which survived in a signed and dated autograph manuscript). Deutsch even argued that the guitar preserved in Vienna's Schubertbund museum, said to have belonged to Schubert, probably belonged instead to one of the composer's friends.

The first of Schubert's works with guitar, and the only one whose authenticity is completely uncontested, was the sixteen-year-old prodigy's little *Cantata* for three male voices and guitar composed on the occasion of his father's Name Day in 1813. The second is the so-called "Schubert Quartet," which also survived in the form of an autograph manuscript (signed and dated 1814). The manuscript was "discovered" in 1918, attributed to Schubert, and published as such in 1926. Guitarists (in the decade in which Segovia was gaining fame promoting the guitar as a legitimate concert instrument) greeted the discovery with delight, while a few scholars, notably Deutsch, argued that the Quartet was not authentic. In 1928, Deutsch wrote an article in the *Oesterreichische Gitarre-Zeitschrift, SchubertGabe*, with the pointed title "Schubert ohne Gitarre" ("Schubert Without the Guitar"), making clear his disdain for the guitar and arguing that Schubert should not be considered a guitar composer. Deutsch's suspicion was validated in 1931 when the Danish guitar *aficionado* Frederik Birket-Smith came upon a copy of Wenzeslaus Thomas Matiegka's *Nocturne*, Op. 21, for flute, viola, and guitar. The *Nocturne*, published in Vienna in 1808, was clearly the basis for the Quartet manuscript and had been published six years before the manuscript was created. Schubert's contribution, intended for a private performance, had been to add a part for 'cello plus a few other modifications. Nevertheless, the very existence of the manuscript confirmed Schubert's affection for the guitar, and his quartet revision remains the most performed and recorded version of the Matiegka Trio.

Of Schubert's magnificent *Lieder*, at least 26 were published with guitar accompaniments in the composer's lifetime, often by the same publisher as the versions with piano (of which 130 were published in the same years). Confalone examines the complex ongoing relationship between Schubert and guitarist/publisher Anton Diabelli, who may have added many of the guitar accompaniments or paid others to do so. In his catalog of Schubert's works,

Deutsch deliberately omitted the guitar versions of the *Lieder* because, he argued, no autograph manuscripts were extant. But Deutsch did not insist upon this criterion in the case of some piano accompaniments, and the "Schubert Quartet" that he rejected out of hand had, in fact, been an autograph manuscript.

In confronting the complex issue of the Schubert *Lieder* with guitar, Confalone cites Thomas Heck's 1977 article (*Soundboard*, Vol. IV, No. 2 [May, 1977], also published in *il Fronimo*, No. 25 [1978]), which examined many of the methodological and stylistic issues and concluded on that basis that Schubert was probably not responsible for the inferior guitar versions. But the likelihood that other people had provided the alternative accompaniments in no way justified Deutsch's conviction that Schubert had nothing to do with them. For one thing, the composer's continuing (albeit difficult) relationship with the publisher suggests he had authorized or consented to their publication. Also, there is contemporaneous testimony that Schubert kept a guitar by his bed and probably composed upon it (as did other composers, including Weber, Paganini, and Berlioz), so the guitar may well have played some undetermined role in the creation of the *Lieder*. In any case, the contemporaneous guitar accompaniments, while inferior to the piano versions, were intended for a specific market and do not preclude better arrangements from being made in our own times. Today there are in print dozens of modern arrangements with guitar accompaniments based on the piano versions, including complete song cycles; the German guitarist Tilman Hoppstock alone has arranged and published no fewer than 110 *Lieder* (Darmstadt: Prim Musikverlag, 2009).

Confalone next discusses the five quartets for male voices that were published with both guitar and piano accompaniments in 1822-23. The title pages of the first editions seem to attribute both the guitar and piano accompaniments to Schubert. Predictably, Deutsch disagreed, arguing that in the absence of any accompaniments in the original manuscripts, the piano parts are all "dubious;" the very-similar guitar parts, on the other hand, he characterized as "spurious." Ultimately, he is probably correct once again; stylistically, both the guitar and the piano accompaniments appear to be redundant additions to these *a capella* quartets. One interesting detail was noted by Steven Mattingly in his 2007 dissertation, *Franz Schubert's Chamber Music with Guitar*. An extant manuscript variant of D. 598a does contain a guitar part, a fact that Deutsch either overlooked or suppressed.

The discussion of Schubert's works with guitar concludes with a mention of the *36 Original Tänze*, Op. 9, first published in 1821 in a version for piano solo, which was followed, a year later, by an arrangement of ten of them for

flute or violin with guitar. Both the piano composition and the arrangement with guitar were typical of the hundreds of Ländler and waltzes that filled contemporaneous music catalogs, so there is little to indicate that Schubert made the guitar arrangement, but nothing about the music to suggest he could not have done so. Confalone also discusses the 1824 *Sonata* for piano and arpeggione, D. 821, commissioned by the cellist/guitarist Vincenz Schuster to be performed on his newly invented hybrid instrument—a sort of six-string 'cello with frets, tuned like a guitar and played with a bow. Schubert's arpeggione part falls naturally on the guitar and suggests that he would have been comfortable composing solo guitar music. But there is no surviving evidence that he ever chose to do so.

The remainder of Confalone's work, under the heading "The Guitar and Schubert," examines Schubert's musical legacy through the remainder of the 19th century and into the 1930s, and its continuing influence on guitarists. The composer's reputation grew posthumously and spread to Paris, where Chopin and Liszt played his piano music, and his *Lieder* entered the repertory of the celebrated tenor Adolphe Nourrit and his pupil Wartel. Richault and others published some *Lieder* in the 1830s, many of them translated into French by the pseudonymous Bélanger, whose identity remains a mystery. (Confalone notes that the lyrics to Coste's guitar song *Le petit ange rose* were written by a certain Pélan d'Angers—almost an oronym of Bélanger and equally unknown. Brian Jeffery, in his 2011 edition of Coste's guitar arrangements of Schubert *Lieder*, plausibly suggests the translator may have been the poet Pierre-Jean de Béranger.)

Coste's rival Mertz also arranged some Schubert *Lieder*, notably the six *Schubert'sche Lieder* for guitar solo (1845), and still others were arranged for the Russian seven-stringed guitar by Nikolai Aleksandrov in 1865. At the end of the 19th century the Spaniard Francisco Tárrega arranged many beloved piano solos for guitar, and a few of these were by Schubert. Confalone also points out that the Viennese composer Ferdinand Rebay used Schubert's themes in several compositions, and the Mexican composer Manuel Ponce wrote his *Sonata romántica* in homage to Schubert "qui aimait la guitare" on the hundredth anniversary of Schubert's death, in the midst of the 1920s when the controversy over Schubert's authorship of several works was at its peak.

This review has been a mere outline of the richly detailed pages of Confalone's original and fascinating book. The metaphor of the angel not quite in paradise is a successful device flowing gracefully through the narrative. Her research is thorough and meticulous, and

even the sometimes lengthy footnotes contribute nuance and perspective while being a pleasure to read. The book's subtitle, "the guitar on a quest for Schubert," is an intriguing way of suggesting that the guitar somehow wanted or needed a relationship with this remarkable, short-lived genius.

—RICHARD M. LONG



## JOIN GFA TODAY!

[GUITARFOUNDATION.ORG](http://GUITARFOUNDATION.ORG)

"The GFA has long been the most comprehensive US-based source for information on the guitar community's news, its teaching institutions, recordings, scholars, as well as its brightest talents. I cannot imagine either an aficionado or aspiring guitarist being fully informed without the aid of GFA membership."

—Jason Vieaux

