

University of Denver

**Digital Commons @ DU**

---

Musicology and Ethnomusicology: Student  
Scholarship

Musicology and Ethnomusicology

---

11-2020

## **What is the Relationship Between Representation and the Safety of Women in Contemporary Scottish Traditional Music Performance in the UK? - Annotated Bibliography**

Sophie Ailsa Lewis

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalcommons.du.edu/musicology\\_student](https://digitalcommons.du.edu/musicology_student)



Part of the **Musicology Commons**



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

---

**What is the Relationship Between Representation and the Safety of Women in Contemporary Scottish Traditional Music Performance in the UK? - Annotated Bibliography**

---

What is the Relationship Between Representation and the Safety of Women in Contemporary Scottish Traditional Music Performance in the UK? - Annotated Bibliography.

The proposed paper will evaluate the relationship between the representation and safety of women in the Scottish traditional music industry. While a lot of the material for this paper will be collected through interviews with women currently working in the industry, this annotated bibliography assesses some of the academic sources available and what relevance they have to the research ahead. This contains a mix of journal articles, reports, blog posts, dissertations and websites.

Barclay, Katie, Tanya Cheadle, and Eleanor Gordon. "The State of Scottish History: Gender." *The Scottish Historical Review* 92, no. 234 (2013): 83-107.  
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/43773985>.

Professor Gordon and Dr Cheadle are current lecturers at the University of Glasgow in Social and Political Science and Gender History respectively. Dr Barclay is the Head of Department in the School of Humanities at the University of Adelaide. The authors of this article discuss the important academic advances in gender studies specific to Scotland. They focus on the literature available in the areas of: Politics; Empire, Imperialism and Race; Work and Economy; Family Life; Sexuality; Education, Women's Writing and Literature and Religious Belief and Practice. While the authors do not mention music directly, this article offers important context into the work that has already been conducted in the area of gender in Scotland and highlights the important gaps in the literature available. The article outlines how women have functioned in wider society historically in Scotland which is an important concept to understand when trying to evaluate how women function in society today. In particular, the authors discuss how women functioned in the household and how this led to pubs becoming safe spaces for men - an idea which is contextualised by the article by Peter Symon - which is important to the proposed essay. Furthermore, they evaluate the literature available on the history of domestic abuse and highlight the unusually high education and literacy rates of women in Scotland historically. Overall, this article will provide important historical context while also providing explanations as to how Scottish trad music became so social. It is also an important source of further material to review.

Creative Scotland. "Understanding Diversity in the Arts in 2016: A Report on the findings of the Diversity in the Arts Survey by Creative Scotland." N.P., Creative Scotland, July 2017.  
[https://www.creativescotland.com/\\_data/assets/pdf\\_file/0020/42923/Diversity-In-The-Arts-Final-Report.pdf](https://www.creativescotland.com/_data/assets/pdf_file/0020/42923/Diversity-In-The-Arts-Final-Report.pdf).

This report produced by Creative Scotland - the national arts body in Scotland - is a breakdown of who works in the arts in Scotland, what work they do, what the working conditions are like in Scotland and what the major barriers to career progressions in the arts are. This detailed breakdown of Scottish specific data is helpful to this research as it highlights issues in gender disparities in the Scottish music industry and is composed of recent data. It also gives an insight into how other minority groups perceive the working conditions in Scotland. This report shows that one of the major barriers to career progression is gender but also having an impact is financial hardship and lack of connections. These are all issues that are fairly prevalent in the traditional music scene and will be discussed in this research paper. While this report is very informative and detailed in its data presentation, it is important to note that it was completed by a small sample size relative to the actual size of the music industry in Scotland and this should be taken into account when evaluating the data.

De Boise, Sam. "Tackling Gender Inequalities in Music: A Comparative Study of Policy Responses in the UK and Sweden." *International Journal of Cultural Policy* 25, no.4 (2019): 486-499.  
<https://www-tandfonline-com.du.idm.oclc.org/doi/full/10.1080/10286632.2017.1341497>.

Dr Sam de Boise is a senior lecturer in music education and music, culture and media at Örebro University in Sweden. This paper analyses the Cultural Policy implemented in the UK and Sweden and by comparing the two, evaluates how public policy impacts gender equality in the music industry. By comparing the UK to one of the most gender equal countries in the world, de Boise makes clear that the recent cuts to the arts sector have had a detrimental effect on the arts industry and thus on gender equality. He also explains the initiatives that encourage folk music venues in Sweden to hire more female performers which is particularly pertinent to this research paper. De Boise concludes the article with possible suggestions on how social policy could be used more effectively in the UK to help gender equality with the primary focus being on funding.

Hawksworth, Catriona. "The Impact of Public Funding on Gender Equality in the Folk and Traditional Music Scene in Scotland, and Ideas for Improvement."  
Unpublished research paper, Newcastle University, 2018.  
<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1OqVCzgp1u34d8U4TGAo1wALYuTO103JV/view>.

Catriona Hawksworth is a contemporary pianist who specialises in Scottish folk and trad music. She holds a degree in Folk and Traditional Music from Newcastle University. This research paper evaluates the impact that funding has on the number of women in the Scottish traditional music industry and proposes ways to correct the balance. Hawksworth, after reviewing both the Creative Scotland and

Aleksandra Webb reports, identifies lack of affordable childcare as a major barrier to women in the industry. She also analyses the De Boise article and uses this as proof that there should be more funding for festivals to include and encourage more women to be involved in the traditional music scene. She also provides an in depth analysis of the gender representation at the 25th Celtic Connections festival which highlights a major gender imbalance. While this paper is clearly well researched and has served as a springboard to finding further material to review, the suggestions for improvement are based more on opinion or personal ideas which seem to raise more questions than they answer in terms of funding and how to secure it. This is a helpful paper to consider as it does point the reader in the direction of a good number of scholarly resources. It also outlines good areas for consideration in terms of how to move towards a more balanced lineup at festivals based on gender which overlaps with many of the considerations of my proposed research. However, I believe it best to proceed with it in mind that this paper was not published through any official channels.

Lockwood, Penelope. "‘Someone Like Me Can Be Successful’: Do College Students Need Same-Gender Role Models?" *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 30 (2006): 36-46.  
<http://www2.psych.utoronto.ca/users/lockwood/PDF/Lockwood%202006.pdf>

Dr Penelope Lockwood is an Associate Professor of Psychology at the University of Toronto. This article is a report on a psychological experiment that assesses to what extent women require same-gendered role models in their field of work to bolster their self image and their belief that they can overcome gender based barriers in the workplace. The author hypothesized that women would be more likely to select a role model that is of the same gender as this is easier to relate to. In contrast, Lockwood predicted that men would be more indifferent to the concept of gender as there are generally less gender related barriers for them in the workplace. While the author acknowledges that there were some limitations to the study due to the fact that most participants are early on in their academic careers - the average respondent was around 19 years old - and have not experienced or decided which career path they intend to pursue. This data aligns with my topic more closely as I also hypothesise that young women entering the Scottish Traditional music industry will feel more inspired by a greater representation of women. While the author admits that her data is not broad enough to be conclusive, it does strongly indicate that gender is important to young women entering into male dominated workspaces and raises the question, how can this be further proved in creative industries?

Shoupe, Catherine A. "Scottish Social Dancing and the Formation of Community." *Western Folklore* 60, no. 2 (Spring, 2001): 125-147.

<https://du.idm.oclc.org/login?url=https://www-proquest-com.du.idm.oclc.org/docview/212107104?accountid=14608>.

Catherine A. Shoupe is Professor of Anthropology at Saint Mary's College, a liberal arts college for women at Notre Dame, Indiana. In this article, Shoupe reflects on personal experiences of social dancing from her time visiting Scotland. She analyses how Scottish dancing or 'the dancing' is often used to form or cement the concept of community. The argument is centralised around four main aspects that Shoupe believes makes a community: Geography, society, performance and psychodynamics. This article is a good example and explanation of how rooted in Scottish culture - and identity - the dancing is and, by extension, how rooted traditional music is in the sense of community. It also further explains the concept of using Scottish traditional music as a means of bonding and reinforces the ideas touched upon in the Symon article, that Scottish music is an inherently social style of music.

Stewart, Polly. "Wishful Willful Wily Women: Lessons for Female Success in the Child Ballads." In *Feminist Messages: Coding in Women's Folk Culture*, edited by Joan Newlon Radner, 54-73. Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1993

Dr Polly Stewart was a lecturer in English at Salisbury University for over 30 years and specialised in Folklore and Oral Histories. She passed in 2013. This chapter evaluates the 'success' and 'failure', both personal and cultural, of women in the ballad world of traditional Scottish ballads found in the Child's Collection. In the chapter, Stewart uses textural analysis to categorize the women in the ballads as: personally successful but culturally failed, personally failed but culturally succeeded, personally and culturally successful and personally and culturally failed. This chapter in particular highlights the fact that women only exist in this world when they are in connection with men. Stewart also argues that success is very much relative to the situation and that women are often in a no win position. Crucially to this research paper, Stewart highlights that traditionally, the only thing women have had to protect themselves is their words and their ability to out-smart a man verbally. This is very important to consider when thinking about the safety of women in our current industry. As Stewart points out, the oral traditions of this style of music mean that, to the informed listener, the lyrics can have especially pointed meanings which could mean that these unhealthy messages were ingrained in tradition and passed down through generations of musicians.

Symon, Peter. "Music and National Identity in Scotland: A Study of Jock Tamson's Bairns." *Popular Music* 16, no. 2 (1997): 203-16.  
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/853522>.

Peter Symon is an independent researcher who is unattached to an academic institution. In this article, Symon analyses how musicians revived traditional Scottish music in the 1970's and 1980's and argues that this revival was a huge reflection on the larger concept of what it means to be 'Scottish' in both a musical and political context. Through interviews with members of the band Jock Tamson's Bairns, Symon uncovers how musicians at this time started to move away from the Irish traditions and started to create their own style that they felt to be 'Scottish'. Importantly, this article openly discusses the concept of pubs being a place of educational value to the traditional music revival and how, especially in this era, it was a predominantly male space. This confirms the concepts of the Barclay, Cheadle and Gordon article that pubs were male safe spaces and thus begs the question, how welcome did women feel in these spaces and how safe were they? These are questions that are not answered in the article but that hold special significance to the proposed paper.

The BIT Collective. "#TradStandsWithHer: Our Statement." Date Accessed October 16th 2020. <https://www.thebitcollective.co.uk/tradstandswithher>.

The BIT Collective is "...a community of people interested in discussing and addressing equalities issues in Scottish folk and traditional music." This website - their homepage - is a resource for survivors of sexual assault, contains guidance for allies and educators, is a safe space for reporting instances of abuse, advertises educational events, organises community engagement projects and is a place to present research in the field. This website has an extensive collection of secondary resources to consult when doing research in this area and a good explanation of work that is already being carried out by members of the Collective. It answers frequently asked questions about what to do in certain instances of assault and asks of its allies, how can we do more to protect the vulnerable groups in our industry? It also has a contact section which I hope to make use of by way of emailing the creators of the site to see if they have any research that could be shared and for their insights on representation in the traditional music industry.

Webb, Aleksandra. "Challenges Experienced by Women Working in Music and the Performing Arts sectors." Women and Work Partnership Project. Glasgow, 2016, Government of Scotland and STUC.  
<http://www.stuc.org.uk/equalities/women/women-and-work>.

This report for the Scottish Trade Unions Congress by University of Stirling lecturer, Dr Aleksandra Webb looks specifically at the barriers that women face in the music and theatre industries in Scotland and makes suggestions for potential ways to remove these barriers. This report worked closely with the trade unions The Musicians Union and Equity and so is based around solving problems that women are experiencing in the industry first hand. An important argument is made in this

report for the issue of women being primary carers for both children and elderly family members, an idea which is discussed briefly in the Creative Scotland report. Indeed, this report touches on many issues raised in the Creative Scotland Diversity report but discusses them in more depth and offers solutions to these problems. Webb argues that representation needs to be enforced in all levels of jobs within these performing industries, not just putting women in more administration positions. This report has many other helpful suggestions for improvement in the industry which will be evaluated and considered in this research paper.

Wilkie, Rona. "Sexual Harassment in the Trad World." *Bella Caledonia* (Blog).

August 20th 2020,

<https://bellacaledonia.org.uk/2020/08/20/sexual-harassment-in-the-trad-world>.

Rona Wilkie is an award winning - BBC Young Traditional Musician of the year - fiddle player and Gaelic singer who is currently completing a PhD at Edinburgh University. This blog post by Wilkie is based on her own lived experiences as a current trad performer and is one of the most up to date pieces available on the topic of sexual assault in the Scottish traditional music scene available today. She briefly outlines the experiences she had as a teenager and how this has impacted her relationship with the traditional music industry in the years that followed. While the Symon and to an extent the Barclay, Cheadle and Gordon articles acknowledge and accept pubs as traditional learning and networking spaces in this industry, Wilkie argues that these are not appropriate or safe settings for young women to be in. This article is extremely relevant to this research project as it was written by someone with first hand experience of abuse and thus her suggestions for change can be taken with some authority that it would help women who are experiencing similar issues. Wilkie challenges the reader with this post to think about how we can do better and argues that men should be at the centre of this movement. She also references the BIT Collective as a strong force for change within the traditional music industry.

Wollstadt, Lynn. "Controlling Women: Reading Gender in the Ballads Scottish Women Sang." *Western Folklore* 61, no. 3/4 (2002): 295-317.

<https://www.jstor.org/stable/1500424>.

Dr Wollstadt is a lecturer of English at South Suburban College in Illinois and holds a PhD from the University of California, Davis. This journal article discusses the idea of 'control' in the worlds of the Scottish Ballads found in the Child's Ballads Collection. Wollstadt evaluates how this concept of control, and the way women are represented in general, can influence a performer's decision to perform a piece of music. Wollstadt builds on the ideas in Polly Stewart's "Wishful Willful Wily Women: Lessons for Female Success in the Child Ballads". She argues that Stewart's four categories for 'success', while valid, do not assess the extent to which this

success is controlled by the women the stories are portraying and so this is what Wollstadt tries to do in her article. Wollstadt argues that the different representations of women are a contributing factor when performers are deciding which ballads to perform and concludes that women tend to sing ballads where women are portrayed more favourably, while men are more impartial to the gender of the subject. This is an important article for this paper as it contains quotes of text from the original ballads and thus shows how women have been portrayed historically in Scottish music. This gives an important musical context to the work and asks us to consider if women are mistreated because they have been in music of the past.

## Assignment 4 Rubric

Criteria	Level 3 3 points	Level 2 2 points	Level 1 1 points	Your Score
Completion / Formatting	At least twelve sources with annotations. All citation errors from Assignment 3 are corrected. Topic and summary stated at top. Correct line spacing, hanging indent, font size and type. Publication agreement completed and submitted.	At least twelve sources with annotations. Fewer than half of the citations have errors uncorrected from Assignment 3. Topic and summary stated at top. Correct line spacing, hanging indent, font size and type. Publication agreement completed and submitted.	Fewer than twelve sources with annotations, OR half or more of the citations have errors not corrected from Assignment 3, OR errors of line spacing, hanging indents, or font size, OR topic statement and summary missing, OR publication agreement not completed and submitted.	3
Written Expression	All annotations are written in complete sentences without grammatical errors.	Half or more of the annotations are written in complete sentences without grammatical errors.	Fewer than half of the annotations are written in complete sentences without grammatical errors.	3
Source Engagement	All annotations describe source content with clarity and precision, using examples to illustrate points.	Half or more of the annotations describe source content with clarity and precision, using examples to illustrate points.	Fewer than half of the annotations describe source content with clarity and precision, using examples to illustrate points.	3
Source Contextualization	All annotations describe the relevance of sources to the topic, contextualize sources in relation to each other, and are addressed to future researchers studying this topic.	Half or more of the annotations describe the relevance of sources to the topic, contextualize sources in relation to each other, and are addressed to future researchers studying this topic.	Fewer than half of the annotations describe the relevance of sources to the topic, contextualize sources in relation to each other, and are addressed to future researchers studying this topic.	3
Evaluation of Authority	All annotations assess authority of authors and/or publishers by referencing specific information.	Half or more of the annotations assess authority of authors and/or publishers by referencing specific information.	Fewer than half of the annotations assess authority of authors and/or publishers by referencing specific information.	3

Why you scored each criterion as you did:

I have completed citations with all of the recommended corrections from assignment three. I have used the correct line spacing and font requests. The publication agreement is included below. I have strong written communication. I feel I have combined source engagement, contextualisation and authority as concisely as possible while still giving the summation of the article and addressing how it relates to the research paper that will be written. I feel I have written addressing the reader as much as is appropriate.