# TRANS OF Rable of Contents ON LAW **JOURNAL**

Industry Leader in Multi-Modal Law, Economics & Policy

### ARTICLES

Preemption is Not Dead: the Continued Vitality of Preemption Under the Federal Railroad Safety Act Following the 2007 Amendment to 49 U.S.C. § 20106

The Employment Classification Issue in the Motor Carrier Industry

Forget What You Intended: Surprisingly Strict Liability and COGSA versus Carmack

Frank J. Mastro

James C. Hardman

Matthew K. Bell



Sturm College of Law



**VOLUME 37** 



# UNIVERSITY OF DENVER COLLEGE OF LAW TRANSPORTATION LAW JOURNAL

The *Transportation Law Journal* is a major professional publication in the field of transportation law, and is dedicated to maintaining its position as a valuable working tool for the practicing bar, government, and the academic community. It addresses both domestic and international developments of legal, regulatory, economic, and political interest in all modes of passenger and freight transportation –aviation/airports, passenger rail, transit, cycling, freight rail, motor carrier, maritime, aerospace, and pipelines, freight forwarders, and brokers.

The students of the University of Denver Sturm College of Law publish the *Transportation Law Journal* three times a year -summer, winter, and spring. Fourth-class postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, and at additional mailing offices.

Correspondence should be addressed to *Transportation Law Journal*, University of Denver Sturm College of Law, 2255 E. Evans Avenue, Room 448, Denver, Colorado, 80208; (303) 871 – 6162, FAX (303) 871 0 6165. Email: <u>tli@law.du.edu</u>. Advertising rates are available on request.

Inquiries regarding submission of manuscripts for publication should be addressed to the Editor-in-Chief. All manuscripts are carefully considered by the executive board, which reserves the right to make final publication decisions. Manuscript preparation instructions are available on request.

The opinions expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the views of the *Transportation Law Journal* or the University of Denver.

### TRANSPORTATION LAW JOURNAL

Volume 37

2010

No. 1

Copyright © 2010 by the Transportation Law Journal

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

- Preemption is Not Dead: The Continued Vitality of Preemption Under the Federal Railroad Safety Act Following the 2007 Amendment to 49 U.S.C. § 20106
  - Frank J. Mastro .....
- The Employment Classification Issue in the Motor Carrier Industry
- Forget What You Intended: Surprisingly Strict Liability and COGSA versus Carmack
  - Matthew K. Bell ...... 57





### Dear Reader:

The articles featured in the Spring 2010 issue of the Transportation Law Journal (TLJ) analyze rail safety, motor carrier employment, and cargo liability.

First, Frank Mastro examines state tort liability causes of action when federal law governs interstate rail safety. Federal law extensively regulates interstate rail activities from hours of service to newly promulgated Positive Train Control regulations. Should the railroad industry also be subjected to state tort law? Mr. Mastro examines this issue thoroughly and convincingly.

Veteran TLJ author, James Hardman, contributes once again to the TLJ with an article covering employment and the motor carrier industry. Mr. Hardman explores the disparate tests courts utilize to determine whether a motor carrier driver is an employee or an independent contractor. This issue seems particularly timely as our nation climbs out of the "Great Recession." If recession-weary employers choose to utilize contract drivers to save on employee-related overhead costs, courts and lawmakers will face increased pressure to simplify the definition of an employee and an independent contractor. The TLJ appreciates Mr. Hardman for his scholarship and continued support of the Journal.

Finally, Matt Bell provides his insight on the ever-complex issue of cargo liability. Cargo liability is a familiar issue to the TLJ due to the legal ambiguity surrounding cargo claims. Mr. Bell considers strict liability and COGSA versus CARMACK.

This journal is only published thanks to the diligent work of our student editors. I would like to recognize our Executive Article Editors: Paul Rupprecht, Amy Lopez, and Jason Alleman.

Also, special thanks to our Business Editor, Andrew Welch. Andrew works behind the scenes to keep the business affairs of the journal in order. Without Andrew's great organizational skills and attention to detail, the TLJ issues would not make to it your mailbox.

Please enjoy the issue.

Justin Marks 2009-2010 Editor in Chief

### TRANSPORTATION LAW JOURNAL

Volume 37

2010

No. 1

### Editorial Board (2009-10)

Editor-in-Chief Justin Marks

Managing Editor Jay M. Sim Executive Articles Editors
Paul Rupprecht
Jason Alleman
Amy Lopez

Business Editor Andrew Welch

Review Editor Patrick Freeman Executive Editor Kristen Wiest Technology Editor
Aaron Pratt

Candidacy Editor
Justin Robbins

Technical Editors
Jamie Berglund
Sarah Coleman
David Hatch
Justin Loyola
Nicoal Miller
Tyson Wilde

Articles Review Board Andrea Christman Sean Leventhal

Staff Editors

Keri Angus Cody Barela Allison Blemberg Andrea Christman Amanda Duty Max Gad Danielle Hagen Blake Hansen Frank Herbst
Joshua Hillyard
Jin Kim
Jason Lantagne
Trent Lauridson
Sean Leventhal
Karina Magistad
Gregory Nielsen
Aaron Pratt

Justin Robbins Brandon Roper Sidhartha Singh Martine Tariot Austin Thies Kent Wahlquist Eileen Whipple Jennifer Wirkus

Faculty Advisors
Professor Robert Hardaway
Professor Teresa M. Bruce





# UNIVERSITY OF DENVER STURM COLLEGE OF LAW

### ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS

Robert Coombe, B.S., M.S., Ph.D., Chancellor

Gregg Kvistad, Ph.D., Provost

Craig Woody, B.A., Vice Chancellor for Financial Affairs/Treasurer

Carol Farnsworth, B.A., B.S., Vice Chancellor for Communications

Barbara Wilcots, B.A., M.A., M.A., Ph.D, Associate Provost for Graduate Studies

Paul Chan, B.A., J.D., University General Counsel

Martin Katz, A.B., J.D., Dean of the Sturm College of Law and Associate Professor of Law

Federico Cheever, B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law

Alan K. Chen, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Faculty Development and Professor of Law

Gary L. Alexander, B.A., M.L.L., J.D., Assistant Dean of Information Services and Library Director

Daniel Vigil, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student Affairs

Iain Davis, M.S., Assistant Dean of Student Financial Management and Admissions

Misae Nishikura, B.A., M.M., J.D., Assistant Dean of Career Development

James Van Hemert, AICP, Executive Director, Rocky Mountain Land Use Institute Mark A. Vogel, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M., Director, Graduate Tax Program and Associate Professor of Law

Julie Gordon, B.S., M.S.L.A, Registrar

Eric Lundstedt, B.A., Executive Director, Alumni and Development

Molly Rossi, B.A., Human Resources Manager

Lauri A. Mlinar, Director of Events

#### FACULTY

Rachel S. Arnow-Richman, B.A., J.D., LL.M, Associate Professor of Law

Robert Anderson, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Lawyering Process

Debra Austin, B.M.E., J.D., Ph.D., Lecturer, Lawyering Process

Rebecca Aviel, Assistant Professor, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

Tanya Bartholomew, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Lawyering Process

Arthur Best, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law

Jerome Borison, B.S., J.D., LL.M., Associate Professor of Law

J. (Jay) Robert Brown, Jr., B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law

Theresa Bruce, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Upper Level Writing

Phoenix Cai, B.A, J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

John A. Carver, Jr., A.B., LL.B., LL.D., Emeritus Professor of Law

Federico Cheever, B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law

Alan K. Chen, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Faculty Development and Professor of Law

Christine Cimini, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law and Director of Clinical Programs

Alfred J. Coco, B.A., J.D., M.L.L., Emeritus Professor of Law

Roberto L. Corrada, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law

Edward A. Dauer, A.B., LL.B., Dean Emeritus and Emeritus Professor of Law

Wendy Duong, B.S., J.D., LL.M., Assistant Professor of Law

### et al.: Vol. 37, no. 1: Table of Contents

K.K. DuVivier, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law and Director, Environmental and Natural Resources Program Nancy S. Ehrenreich, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law Valeria Elliot, M.A., J.D., LL.M., Lecturer, Lawyering in Spanish J. Wadine Gehrke, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law Rashmi Goel, B.A. Hons., LL.B., J.S.M., J.S.D in progress, Associate Professor of Law Robert M. Hardaway, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law Michael Harris, B.A., M.S.L., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law Jeffrey H. Hartje, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law Mark Hughes, A.B., J.D., Visiting Lecturer in Law Timothy M. Hurley, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Upper Level Writing Sheila K. Hvatt, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law Francis W. Jamison, B.A., J.D., Emeritus Professor of Law Scott Johns, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Academic Achievement Program José Roberto Juárez, Jr., A.B., J.D., Professor of Law Sam Kamin, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Law Martin Katz, A.B., J.D., Dean of the Sturm College of Law and Associate Professor of Tamara L. Kuennen, B.A., J.D., LL.M, Assistant Professor of Law Jan G. Laitos, B.A., J.D., S.J.D., John A. Carver, Jr. Chair and Professor of Law Neil O. Littlefield, B.S., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., Emeritus Professor of Law Justin Marceau, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law Lucy A. Marsh, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law Michael G. Massey, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Lawyering Process G. Kristian Miccio, B.A., M.A., J.D., LL. M., J.S.D., Associate Professor of Law Viva Moffat, B.A., M.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law Suzanna Moran, B.A., M.S., J.D., Lecturer, Lawyering Process Ved P. Nanda, B.A., M.A., LL.B., LL.M, Thompson G. Marsh Professor of Law Stephen L. Pepper, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law Susannah Pollvogt, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Academic Achievement Program George W. "Rock" Pring, B.A., J.D. Professor of Law Raja Raghunath, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law John H. Reese, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., Professor of Law Paula R. Rhodes, B.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law Edward J. Roche, Jr., B.B.A., J.D., Professor of Law Howard I. Rosenberg, B.A., LL.B., Professor of Law Laura L. Rovner, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Associate Professor of Law Thomas Russell, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law Nantiya Ruan, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Lawyering Process Ann C. Scales, B.A., J.D. Professor of Law Catherine E. Smith, B.A., M.P.A., J.D., Associate Professor of Law Don C. Smith, B.S., J.D., LL.M., Lecturer and Director, Advanced Degree Programs in Natural Resources and Environmental Law John T. Soma, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law Michael Sousa, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law Mary Steefel, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Lecturer, Director, Academic Achievement Program Joyce S. Sterling, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Professor of Law Celia R. Taylor, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law David Thomson, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Lawyering Process and Director, Lawyering Process Program Ann Vessels, B.A., J.D., Lecturer, Pioneer Internship Program Mark A. Vogel, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M., Associate Professor of Law and Director, Graduate Tax Program Eli Wald, B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., Associate Professor of Law Timothy B. Walker, A.B., M.A., J.D., Emeritus Professor of Law James E. Wallace, A.B., LL.B., B.D., Ph.D., Emeritus Professor of Law James L. Winokur, B.A., LL.B., Emeritus Professor of Law Edward H. Ziegler, Jr., B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law