

University of Denver

Digital Commons @ DU

Musicology and Ethnomusicology: Student
Scholarship

Musicology and Ethnomusicology

11-2022

“For the Orchestra Musicians: Conducting on the Beat Is Effective or Too Late?”

University of Denver

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.du.edu/musicology_student



Part of the [Musicology Commons](#), [Music Theory Commons](#), and the [Other Music Commons](#)



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](#).

“For the Orchestra Musicians: Conducting on the Beat Is Effective or Too Late?”

Publication Statement

Copyright is held by the author. User is responsible for all copyright compliance.

Publication Statement

Copyright is held by the author. User is responsible for all copyright compliance.

“For the Orchestra Musicians: Conducting on the Beat is Effective or Too Late?”

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

ABSTRACT: There are a lot of conductors, and every conductor is different. There are as many conducting techniques as well. But one of the most famous approaches in conducting an ensemble, whether a wind ensemble, orchestra, or chorus, is to deliver the beat and expecting the ensemble for an immediate ‘attack’ of the note. An instant reciprocation and reaction at the same exact time as the ‘ictus’ of the conductor. Basically, doing it exactly together. The other notion is that the conductor beating should be beating ahead of time (almost a beat ahead) to give the ensemble some time to prepare and eventually react to the gestures of the one who’s standing on the podium. Esa-Pekka Salonen, the then chief conductor of the LA Philharmonic, is an ambassador of the approach of expecting music on the beat. While Daniele Gatti, the former chief conductor of the Concertgebouw Orchestra, gives the beat ahead and seem to be as effective as the method of Salonen. Both conducting two of the best orchestras in the world. In this annotated bibliography are the resource materials that will serve as important tools, both technical and historical perspectives from the great conductors of the past and the conductors of today, that would help to arrive with the conclusion of which method is actually better to

produce a more reactive, pleasant, or particular sound.

1.

Battisti, Frank, and Robert Garofalo. *Guide to Score Study for the Wind Band Conductor*. USA: Meredith Music Publications, 1990.

This book concentrates on the technical aspects that surrounds the practices of effective conducting from score orientation, score reading and analysis, to its full interpretation. It also features concrete materials for practicing, tools on how to mark scores, and transpositions. Battisti and Garofalo also focuses on proficiency for music history, literature, music theory and ear training. Actual scores are also printed inside the book, which would help the reader have a full understanding of score reading and what a conductor should have inside his or her mind. This is relevant for the research because of the substantial information with regards to the nature of score study and score interpretation, which would be very useful in the physical execution of conducting.

Robert Garofalo is a Emeritus Professor and conductor at the Catholic University of America in Washington D.C. and has directed bands, orchestras, and operas for more than 40 years, while Frank Battisti is the director of the New England Conservatory wind ensemble since 1969, and have established himself as one of the most influential champions of music for winds in America through performing throughout the world and premiering new works for band.

2.

Bamberger, Carl. *The Conductor's Art*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1965.

Carl Bamberger, a former student of Heinrich Schenker at the University of Vienna and a former teacher of orchestra and opera at the Mannes School of Music (1939), presents a collection of essays about the mysterious art of conducting in the lens of different conductors. It lays down different perspectives of how conductors approach the scores, their tools, how they select repertoire, and all other issues that may arise to the mind of a conductor. This great resource book features great conductors and composers of the past such as Carl Maria Von Weber on the interpretation of *Euryanthe*, Hector Berlioz on his point of view in conducting, Robert Schumann, Liszt, Wagner to William Steinberg on whether conducting is overestimated or underestimated. On the last few pages, Bamberger featured many comments on conducting from the great conductors from Verdi to Toscanini. It is also mentioned that although different methods and techniques were applied by these experts, they all agreed the skill of conducting can be learned but not the art of it. This material provides clear distinction between a conductor and a mere time beater which would be very helpful for this research paper with regards to effective conducting. Although Bamberger is not considered to be a famous conductor, he is best known for writing this book, which has helped a lot of students who are learning conducting.

3.

Dart, Thurston. *The Interpretation of Music*. London: Hutchinson & Co. 1954.

In this great book, Dart engages into the dilemma that faces the temporal arts, which is to re-create them over and over every rehearsal and performance. As music is intangible, he describes music as something that can be interpreted in many different ways but there is a right way—as long as it is based on the performance practices of different periods and styles of the past. He also states that the notes written in the sheet is not the music and that there can be no cut and dried answers as to the questions raised in the performance of any music. This book's relevance to the research is to be able to execute the historically correct nuances of the music of the past. It is of great importance that conductors know how to perform period music in the closest interpretation based on the practices of the past. Dart is one of Britain's leading post war (World War II) musicologists. He himself is also a conductor and a keyboard/continuo player. He was a King Edward Professor of Music at University of London and a former assistant music lecturer at the University of Cambridge.

4.

Ewen, David. *Dictators of the Baton*. Chicago: Alliance Book Corporation, 1943.

For David Ewen's book called *Dictators of the Baton*, he supplements his prior book called *The Man with the Baton* which focused on the history of orchestral conducting. The goal of this book is for the reader to gain insight not only into this art, but to describe the state of orchestra and their conductor's effectivity especially in the context of the orchestras that are based here in the United States. Ewen described Stokowski and

Koussevitzky as showman conductors, while Frederick Stock and Damrosch as the leading American conductors of the past. Ewen considered Walter and Monteaux as the ambassadors of European style of conducting, and Arturo Toscanini as a musical celebrity in his own lifetime. These different conductors were described by Ewen as to how they deal with rehearsals, performances, and their approach to music in general. This book is relevant for the research to identify the different approaches in conducting that made the maestros of the 20th century. Ewen is an Austrian-born American writer known for his dozens of published books and was an author of different biographies about music and musicians including biographies from Joseph Haydn to George Gershwin.

5.

Galkin, Elliot W. *The History of Orchestral Conducting: In Theory and Practice*. London: Pendragon Press, 1988.

This book by Galkin is the most comprehensive resource for the history of orchestral conducting. From perspectives of time through the lens of a Kapellmeister, to the musical interpretations and effectivity of conductors such as Herbert von Karajan and Leonard Bernstein. The book is presented in a chronological pattern to present events in the artistic and historical manner. Collection of information were found by using autobiographies, letters, periodicals, and analysis of those writings which are directly concerned with conductors and their craft. The book is relevant to the research to formulate a history-based perspective in the development of orchestral conducting, particularly on the history of baton technique, such as rebound from the ictus and proper approaches in beat patterns. Galkin was the former director of the Peabody Institute from

1977-1982. He is well-known as a music instructor and conductor and was also a music critic for *The Baltimore Sun* in 1962 until 1977. Galkin also studied music under the guidance of Nadia Boulanger at the Paris Conservatory.

6.

Holden, Raymond. *The Virtuoso Conductors: The Central European Tradition from Wagner to Karajan*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2005.

Outlining only the conductors who exhibited considerable artistic power and conductors who are mainly based in Europe, Holden took the challenge of the daunting task of writing about Richard Wagner up to Herbert Von Karajan. This book explores on the conductor's principles, influences, both personal and work relationships, and the politics that comes with the nature of orchestral conducting. By engaging with different biographies of the mentioned maestros in the book, Holden established his credibility by studying their scores, diaries, and other archives of the conductors that is featured in the book. This book is relevant to the study with regards to the historical practices of conducting by the great conductors of the past. Holden has contributed extensively with the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* and has written chapters for the Cambridge University Press' *Companion to Conducting* and *Companion to Richard Strauss*. Holden also holds numerous lectures on his research interests at major universities and conservatories around the globe.

7.

Knight, John W. *The Golden Age of Conductors*. Chicago: Meredith Music Publications, 2010.

Knight interviews some of the great conductors such as Richard Hickox, Christoph Von Dohnanyi, and Kurt Masur among others. It provides valuable insights on how to be successful in the professional world and what it takes to achieve the highest quality of orchestral music interpretation as conductors. In the latter part of the book, Knight also features the orchestra members where they judge conductors based on beating precision, tempo, and even some of the distractions that conductors do that would irritate the orchestra. This is very relevant resource because we deep dive into the mind of the orchestra members with regards to their perspective towards the conductor. Interpretative analyses were featured through the works by 20 different famous conductors from the time of Arturo Toscanini up to Carlos Kleiber. John W. Knight was a former professor of conducting and music education at the Oberlin Conservatory in Ohio.

8.

Schonberg, Harold C. *The Great Conductors*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1967.

Schonberg dives deep into the studies the continuous evolution of conducting, the musical attitudes towards the art, and technical approaches to orchestral conducting of the greatest conductors who ever lived. Schoenberg emphasizes that his book is not a product of guesswork. Artists in orchestras consistently talk about conductors, and a comprehensive pattern emerges from these discussions. For the biographies of conductors, Schoenberg successfully gathered letters, criticisms, anecdotes, and recorded conversations, and therefore used these resources to put these conductors in their right place in musical history. From 1960 to 1980, Schonberg was the chief music critic of *The New York*

Times, and the first music critic to win the Pulitzer Prize for Criticism. He is also well known for being a harsh critic of the American Conductor, Leonard Bernstein. He has written numerous books about music and one book in chess.

9.

Shore, Bernard. *The Orchestra Speaks*. London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1938.

This book is a great resource for the research as it is written by then Principal Violist of the BBC Symphony Orchestra, Bernard Shore. He gives a very detailed idea and description as to how it is to collaborate under the baton of various great conductors such as Thomas Beecham, Sergei Koussevitzky, and Arturo Toscanini. In this book, we see the conductor through an actual lens of a vital orchestra member. True and loyal to the goals of the research, this material serves as one of the anchor resources to see things in an orchestra member point of view on how a conductor can really be effective especially with the reciprocation from the conductor's demands through his or her beating technique.

10.

Vermeil, Jean. *Conversations with Boulez: Thoughts on Conducting*. Portland: Amadeus Press, 1996.

In this book, we encounter Jean Vermeil and Pierre Boulez in actual casual interview or conversational setting. This compiled material mainly interacts with Boulez's opinion on conducting, how he started his career as conductor and not just a composer and his overall journey as an artist. Chapter 4, which is entitled "On Gestures" talks about how effective one conductor can be E.g., conducting without the baton, tempo, rhythm and attack, phrasing, and overall interpretation. Vermeil successfully dives deep into the other aspects of Boulez's life as a French artist as well. Boulez on conducting his own works, orchestral psychology, realism, and education of conductors, which is very crucial for an effective conductor. Although Vermeil is famous for publishing this book and being able to talk to Boulez, there is not enough evidence of his credibility as an author. This book presents an unconventional contemporary composer-conductor. And Boulez's ideas are out of the typical vain conductor of the 20th century.

11.

Williamon, Aaron. *Musical Excellence: Strategies and Techniques to Enhance Performance*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2004.

In this comprehensive guide to strategies and techniques to enhance performance, Williamon engages into different styles of approaches to maximize one's potential to deliver an excellent performance. Starting with how to acknowledge the artist's inner

strength, limits, expressivity, and practicing in general. Williamon emphasizes that it is through sustained positive experience in rehearsals can one achieve musical excellence. Williamon also informs the readers that to communicate effectively with their audience is a high form of musical excellence. This resource material is relevant because it also offers guidance for musicians on different kinds of preparations that has been proven to develop high quality performance by bringing together the findings of applied research on performance effectivity and enhancement. Williamon is a professor of Performance Science at the Royal College of Music. He is the founder of the International Symposium on Performance Science and a fellow of the Royal Society of Arts.

12.

Wagar, Jeanine. *Conductors in Conversation: Fifteen Contemporary Conductors Discuss Their Lives and Profession*. Boston: G.K. Hall & Co., 1991.

Wagar tries to unravel the mystique of the conductors in this book by getting in touch with famous conductors and have casual conversations with them. The conductors that were featured includes Blomstedt, Dutoit, Masur, and Slatkin among others. They were asked as to how they approach the scores, how they started their career, how they practice, and how to become efficient and effective with rehearsals. Wagar makes sure of her credibility by doing these actual live interviews with the biggest names of the podium. This is another relevant resource for the research to see the styles of different conductors on the podium. Jeannine is a conductor herself and the music director of North Arkansas Symphony and have studied in Stanford University. She has also published numerous scholarly works.

