

TRANSPORTATION LAW JOURNAL

INDUSTRY LEADER IN MULTI-MODAL LAW, ECONOMICS & POLICY

UNIVERSITY OF DENVER • COLLEGE OF LAW

SYMPOSIUM: THE STATE OF THE LAW IN THE RAILROAD INDUSTRY

ARTICLES

Injecting Competition in the Railroad Industry
Through Access

Salvatore Massa

Use of Freight Rail Lines for Commuter Operations:
Public Interest, Private Property

*Charles A. Spitulnik
Jamie Palter Rennert*

The Future of Railroad Labor-Management Relations as
an Industry of Five, or Three, or Two Mega-Railroads
Enter the Next Millennium

William G. Mahoney

To Hell On the Railroads: Why Our Technology and Law
Encourage a Degrading Culture

Daniel M. Warner

INDEX

Subject Index to Volume 25
Case Name Index to Volume 25

VOLUME 26 • NUMBER 3 • SUMMER 1999





UNIVERSITY OF DENVER COLLEGE OF LAW
TRANSPORTATION LAW JOURNAL

The *Transportation Law Journal* is a major professional publication in the field of transportation law, and is dedicated to maintaining its position as a valuable working tool for the practicing bar, government, and the academic community. It addresses both domestic and international developments of legal, regulatory, economic and political interest in all modes of transportation—aviation/airports, motor, rail, maritime, aerospace, and pipelines, freight forwarders, and brokers.

The *Transportation Law Journal* is sponsored jointly by the Transportation Law Program of the University of Denver College of Law and the Transportation Lawyers Association, the largest bar association of its kind in the United States and Canada.

The *Transportation Law Journal* is published three times a year, summer, fall, and spring, by the students of the University of Denver College of Law. Fourth class postage paid at Lincoln, Nebraska, and at additional mailing offices.

Correspondence should be addressed to *Transportation Law Journal*, University of Denver College of Law, 7039 East 18th Avenue, Denver, Colorado 80220; (303) 871-6162. FAX: (303) 871-6165. E-mail: tlj@student.law.du.edu. Advertising rates are available on request.

Inquiries regarding submission of manuscripts for publication should be addressed to the Editor in Chief. All manuscripts are carefully considered by the Board of Editors, which reserves the right to make final publication decisions. Manuscript preparation instructions are available on request.

The opinions expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the views of the *Transportation Law Journal*, the University of Denver, or the Transportation Lawyers Association.

Cover design by Lee Corbin

TRANSPORTATION LAW JOURNAL

Volume 26

1999

No. 3

Copyright © 1998 by the Transportation Law Journal

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SYMPOSIUM: THE STATE OF THE LAW IN THE RAILROAD INDUSTRY

Injecting Competition in the Railroad Industry Through Access <i>Salvatore Massa</i>	283
Use of Freight Rail Lines for Commuter Operations: Public Interest, Private Property <i>Charles A. Spitulnik</i>	319
<i>Jamie Palter Rennert</i>	
The Future of Railroad Labor-Management Relations as an Industry of Five, or Three, or Two Mega-Railroads Enter the Next Millennium <i>William G. Mahoney</i>	341
To Hell On the Railroads: Why Our Technology and Law Encourage a Degrading Culture <i>Daniel M. Warner</i>	361

INDEX

Subject Index to Volume 25	417
Case Name Index to Volume 25	421



UNIVERSITY OF DENVER COLLEGE OF LAW

ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS

DANIEL L. RITCHIE, M.A., M.B.A., *Chancellor*
WILLIAM F. ZARANKA, Ph.D., *Provost, Dean of Faculty*
NELL JESSUP NEWTON, B.A., J.D., *Dean, College of Law*
CRAIG WOODY, *Vice Chancellor for Financial Affairs/Treasurer*
CAROL FARNSWORTH, *Vice Chancellor for Communication*
KEITH M. HARRISON, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs*
GARY L. ALEXANDER, B.A., M.L.L., J.D., *Director, Westminster Law Library*
ANNE STARK WALKER, J.D., *Director of Career Services*

FACULTY

DAVID W. BARNES, A.B., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law*
ARTHUR BEST, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
JEROME BORISON, B.S., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Professor of Law*
BURTON F. BRODY, B.S.C., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*
J. ROBERT BROWN, JR., B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law*
PENELOPE BRYAN, B.S., J.D., M.A., *Professor of Law*
FEDERICO CHEEVER, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*
ALAN K. CHEN, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*
ROBERTO L. CORRADA, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
EDWARD A. DAUER, A.B., LL.B., *Dean Emeritus and Professor of Law*
PAUL STEPHEN DEMPSEY, A.B.J., J.D., LL.M., D.C.L., *Professor of Law and Director, Transportation Law Program*
NANCY S. EHRENREICH, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Assistant Professor of Law*
MARTHA M. ERTMAN, A.B., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*
ROBERT M. HARDAWAY, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
KEITH M. HARRISON, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law and Associate Dean for Academic Affairs*
JEFFREY H. HARTJE, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
SHEILA K. HYATT, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
FRANCIS W. JAMISON, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law and Internship/Externship Coordinator*
JAN G. LAITOS, B.A., J.D., S.J.D., *Professor of Law and Director, Natural Resources Program*
HARRY O. LAWSON, B.A., M.S., *Professor of Judicial Administration Emeritus*
NEIL O. LITTLEFIELD, B.S., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., *Professor of Law Emeritus*
LUCY A. MARSH, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
VED P. NANDA, B.A., M.A., LL.B., LL.M., *Thompson G. Marsh Professor of Law and Director of the International Legal Studies Program*
JULIE A. NICE, B.S., B.S., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*
STEPHEN L. PEPPER, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law*
GEORGE W. PRING, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
JOHN H. REESE, B.B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., *Professor of Law*
PAULA R. RHODES, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*
EDWARD J. ROCHE, JR., B.B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
HOWARD I. ROSENBERG, B.A., LL.B., *Professor of Law*
JOHN T. SOMA, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*
JOYCE S. STERLING, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*
CELIA R. TAYLOR, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*
MARK A. VOGEL, B.B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Professor of Law and Director, Graduate Tax Program*
TIMOTHY B. WALKER, A.B., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*
JAMES L. WINOKUR, B.A., LL.B., *Professor of Law*
ROBERT B. YEGGE, A.B., M.A., J.D., *Dean Emeritus and Professor of Law*
EDWARD H. ZIEGLER, JR., B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*

SPECIAL ADJUNCT FACULTY

- J. WADINE GEHRKE, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Clinical Law and Internship Liaison*.
JACQUELINE ST. JOAN, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Visiting Professor and Director, Mediation Arbitration Center*.
ROBERTA J. STEINHARDT, B.A., J.D., *Clinical Visiting Professor*.
MARGARET E. WALKER, B.S., M.Ed., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Clinical Law and Director, Student Law Office Civil Clinical Project*.

ADJUNCT FACULTY

- HAROLD O. BLOOMENTHAL, B.S., J.D., J.S.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
WALTER C. BRAUER III, B.S., A.M., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
WILLIAM T. DISS, B.S., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
THE HONORABLE WILLIAM F. DRESSSEL, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law and Judge, 8th Judicial District Court, Colorado*.
DANIEL W. EDWARDS, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
THE HONORABLE DAVID M. EBEL, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law and Judge, Tenth Circuit Court of Appeals*.
RICHARD D. GREENGARD, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
THE HONORABLE JOHN L. KANE, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law and Senior Judge, United States District Court, Colorado*.
DAVID S. KAPLAN, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
THE HONORABLE HOWARD M. KIRSHBAUM, *Justice, Supreme Court of Colorado & Adjunct Professor of Law*.
BRUCE MARKS, B.S., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
THE HONORABLE DONALD W. MARSHALL, B.S., M.S.J.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor and Judge, 17th Judicial District Court, Colorado*.
STEPHEN L. PEVAR, A.B., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
THOMAS RAGONETTI, A.B., M.R.P., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
KAREN STEINHAUSER, B.A., J.D., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.
THE HONORABLE DANA U. WAKEFIELD, B.A., J.D., *Judge, Denver Juvenile Court & Adjunct Professor of Law*.
MICHAEL O. WIRTH, B.S., M.A., Ph.D., *Chair, Mass Communications, University of Denver & Professor*.
BROOKE WUNNICKE, B.A., LL.B., *Adjunct Professor of Law*.

LECTURERS IN LAW

- STEPHEN D. ALFERS, B.A., J.D.
GARRY R. APPEL, B.A., J.D.
ANGELA R. ARKIN, B.A., J.D.
STEVE ARMSTRONG, B.S., J.D.
PATRICIA S. BANGERT, B.A., J.D.
SETH J. BENEZRA, B.A., J.D.
WILLIAM P. BETHKE, B.A., J.D.
THEODORE A. BORRILLO, B.B.A., J.D., J.S.D.
MARK H. BOSCOE, B.A., J.D.
CONSTANCE E. BROOKS, B.A., J.D.
LAIRD CAMPBELL, A.B., LL.B.
THOMAS E. CARBONNEAU, B.A., M.A., J.D.
PHILIP A. CHERNER, B.S., J.D.
WILLIAM M. COHEN, B.S.M.E., J.D., LL.M.
DAVID COX, B.S.B.A., M.S.B.A., J.D.
DAVID R. DEMIRO, A.B., J.D.
LINDA DONNELLY, B.A., J.D.
JOSEPH M. EPSTEIN, B.A., J.D.
THOMAS C. FOLSOM, B.S., J.D.
ALAN J. GILBERT, SCB., J.D.
MONICA S. GLICKMAN, B.A., J.D.
HAROLD GOLZ, B.A., J.D.
SETH A. GROB, B.A., J.D.
J. SCOTT HAMILTON, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
CAROL J. HARMON, B.A., M.A., J.D.
ROBERT G. HEISERMAN, JR., B.A., J.D.
NED HEPPENSTALL, B.A., J.D.
GREGORY B. KANAN, B.A., J.D.
ROBERT R. KEATINGE, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
GLENN E. KELLER, JR., B.S., J.D.
EUGENE KOZLOWSKI, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.
SCOTTY P. KROB, B.A., J.D.
DAVID A. LANE, B.A., M.B.A.
RICHARD W. LAUGESSEN, B.A., J.D.
RICK LEAMAN, B.A., M.B.A.
HERRICK K. LIDSTONE, JR., A.B., J.D.
DAVID LOCKWOOD, B.A., J.D.
J. TRIPLETT MACKINTOSH, B.A., M.A., J.D.
THE HONORABLE LAWRENCE A. MANZANARES, B.A., J.D., *Judge, Denver County Court*.
DAVID MAZZARELLA, B.S., M.A., J.D., LL.M.
JOAN H. MCWILLIAMS, B.S., M.S.J.A., J.D.
GLENN W. MERRICK, B.A., J.D.
ROBERT D. MILLER, B.S., M.D., Ph.D.
RICHARD L. NATHAN, B.A., J.D.
MYRON H. NORDQUIST, B.S., J.D., J.S.D.
TERRY O'NEILL, B.A., J.D.
WILLIAM O'QUINN, B.S., J.D.
LARRY S. POZNER, B.S., J.D.
MICHAEL S. QUINN, B.A., J.D.
GERALD J. RAFFERTY, B.S., J.D.
MARCELINA RIVERA, B.A., J.D.
GILBERT M. ROMAN, B.A., J.D.
DONALD SALCITO, B.A., J.D.
GORDON E. SCHEMAN, B.S., B.A., J.D., LL.M.
JAMES SERVEN, B.A., B.S., M.B.A., J.D.
J. ALISON SHELTON, B.A., J.D.
JOHN F. SHEPHERD, A.B., J.D.
SHARI SHINK, B.S., J.D.

JAMES W. SPENSLEY, B.S., J.D.
JOHN D. STERNBERG, B.A., J.D.
BARRY J. SWANSON, B.A., Ph.D., J.D.
CRAIG L. TRUMAN, B.A., J.D.

LECTURERS IN LEGAL ADMINISTRATION

CYNTHIA L. ACREE, B.A., M.S.J.A.
TERI P. CAMPBELL, B.B.A., M.S.J.A.
KIMBERLY L. CURTIS, B.S., M.S.J.A.

EMERITUS LAW FACULTY

WILLIAM A. ALTONIN, A.B., J.D., LL.M.
WILLIAM M. BEANEY, A.B., LL.B., Ph.D.
MURRAY BLUMENTHAL, B.M.E., M.A.,
Ph.D.
JOHN A. CARVER, JR., A.B., LL.B., LL.D.
ALFRED J. COCO, B.A., J.D., M.L.L.
DANIEL S. HOFFMAN, B.A., LL.B.
JOHN PHILLIP LINN, A.B., M.A., J.D.

GAYLORD A. VIRDEN, B.A., M.A., J.D.
ARNOLD C. WEGHER, B.M.E., LL.B., LL.M.
JOHN F. WELBORN, B.A., J.D.
ROBERT A. ZUPKUS, A.B., J.D.

SUZANNE B. O'NEILL, B.A., J.D., LL.M.
RONALD L. SEIGNEUR, B.A., M.B.A.
THADDEUS J. SPACK, B.A., M.A., M.S.J.A.

THOMPSON G. MARSH, A.B., LL.B., M.A.,
LL.M., J.S.D.
CHRISTOPHER MUNCH, B.S., J.D.
EDWARD E. PRINGLE, J.D., LL.D.
THE HONORABLE GREGORY KELLAM SCOTT,
B.S., Ed.M., J.D., *Justice Colorado
Supreme Court*
JAMES E. WALLACE, A.B., LL.B., B.D.,
Ph.D.

ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF

BARBARA ALLEN, B.A., M.L.S.
DONNA S. ELLIS, B.S., *Financial Aid Director*
MARGARET FAIVER, *Office Administrator,
Student Services*
ANDREA FORREST, B.A., *Career Counselor*
SALLY FRY, B.A., *Chief Financial Officer*
SHEILA GREEN, B.A., M.A., *Reference
Librarian*
TANYA HAYNES, *Publications and Planning
Coordinator*
STEPHANIE HEAPS, *Computer Center
Supervisor*
HELEN JACOBSON, B.A., *Career Counselor*
JOHANNA E. KELLY, A.B., *Director of Devel-
opment, Major Gifts*
SUSAN K. MADISON, B.A., M.A.L.S., *Head,
Bibliographic Services*
SALLY J. MARESH, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Chief
Operating Officer*

LAURI A. MLINAR, *Director of Events*
NANCY P. NONES, B.A., *Administrator, Inter-
national Legal Studies*
CATHERINE PABLICH, B.A., M.L.S., *Head of
User Services*
JOANNA PATRICK, B.A., *Manager of Library
Operations*
ANN POLUMBUS, B.A., M.A.T., *Director of
Alumni Relations*
ROBIN A. RICKER, B.S., *Program Coordina-
tor, Graduate Tax Program*
NANCY ROPER, *Manager, Faculty Support
Manager*
CLAUDIA L. TOMLIN, B.A., *Director of
Admissions*
MARY KATHLEEN WILDER, B.A., M.A., J.D.,
Director of Legal Writing Program

STAFF AMICI UNIVERSITATIS

PHILIP E. GAUTHIER, *Director of Alumni
and Public Relations, University of Den-
ver College of Law, 1972-91.*
VELVIN GUIET, *Bookstore Manager, Univer-
sity of Denver College of Law, 1974-88*

CHARLIEN E. RYAN, *Assistant to Associate
Dean, 1977-1991*
IRMGARD K. VRAGEL, B.A., 1965, *Registrar,
University of Denver College of Law,
1981-87*

TRANSPORTATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEMBERS

OFFICERS

President	<i>Ann M. Pougiales</i>
President-Elect	<i>W. Robert Alderson</i>
First Vice President	<i>Kenneth R. Hoffman</i>
Second Vice President	<i>Fritz R. Damm</i>
Secretary-Treasurer	<i>Robert E. McFarland</i>
Immediate Past President	<i>James F. Flint</i>

Representatives-at-Large

William D. Bierman
Peter R. Corbin
Francis A. Courtenay, Jr.
William E. Davis
Kathleen C. Jeffries
Stephen T. Rudman
John R. Ruhl
Carolyn B. Witherspoon

Past Presidents

<i>Mark J. Andrews</i>	<i>James C. Hardman</i>
<i>Franklin Van Osdel</i>	<i>Robert D. Schuler</i>
<i>August W. Heckman</i>	<i>James M. Doherty</i>
<i>Carll V. Kretsinger</i>	<i>Harold D. Miller, Jr.</i>
<i>Truman A. Stockton, Jr.</i>	<i>Wilmer B. Hill</i>
<i>Harold G. Hernly</i>	<i>A. Charles Tell</i>
<i>Jack B. Josselson</i>	<i>Frank W. Taylor, Jr.</i>
<i>Ewell H. Muse, Jr.</i>	<i>Richard H. Champlin</i>
<i>Phineas Stevens</i>	<i>Michael J. Ogborn</i>
<i>John E. Jandera</i>	<i>Kim D. Mann</i>
<i>Leroy Hallman</i>	<i>Richard P. Kissinger</i>
<i>Walter N. Bieneman</i>	<i>David R. Parker</i>
<i>Alvin J. Meiklejohn, Jr.</i>	<i>Bertram S. Silver</i>
<i>James W. Hagar</i>	<i>John S. Fessenden</i>
<i>Edward J. Kiley</i>	<i>Alex M. Lewandowski</i>
<i>William J. Lippman</i>	<i>William D. Taylor</i>
<i>Thomas E. James</i>	<i>David B. Schneider</i>
<i>John A. Vuono</i>	<i>James F. Flint</i>
<i>Charles Ephraim</i>	

TRANSPORTATION LAW JOURNAL

Summer 1999

Editor in Chief
KEVIN P. AHEARN

Managing Editor
MICHAEL P. DULIN

Business Editor
AUDREY M. SIMON

Articles Editors
KEN MICHAEL BARKER
CHRISTIAN J. SCHMIDT

General Editor
CYNTHIA J. McNABB
MELINDA B. BARTON
JOSEPH A. GUERRIERO

Technical Editor
BRIAN K. FURGASON

Staff

KRISTIN R. ANDERSON
KEIRSTEN BECK
DAVID W. BECKER, JR.
KATHRYN A. CHANDLER
BRETT D. CHARDAVOYNE
STEVEN GAHLINGS
JONATHAN D. GANS
TODD IRWIN

MATTHEW J. KAVANAGH
SVETLANA S. MOSIN
MICHAEL J. SCHROEDER
VLADIMIR SHIFRIN
RICHARD SPILDE, JR.
CHRISTOPHER WALKER
ROBERT THOMAS ZENTNER

Faculty Advisor
PAUL STEPHEN DEMPSEY



UNIVERSITY of DENVER

College of Law
Transportation Law Program

To Prospective Law Students:

Transportation is an enormously important industry, an essential part of the nation's infrastructure of travel, communications and commerce.

Transportation is a vast industry, accounting for 16% of the Gross National Product, with networks of airlines, railroads, trucking companies, busses, pipelines, barge lines and ocean vessels linking the far corners of the nation and the world.

The evolution of public policy in transportation, moving from regulation to deregulation, has made the practice of transportation law a dynamic, challenging arena, integrating principles of law and economics. The transformation of the regulatory landscape creates new opportunities for lawyers as transportation firms transform themselves into lean and aggressive market driven companies.

Few industries offer a young lawyer such a dynamic landscape of shifting law and policy, one filled with challenge and opportunity. The pages of the *Transportation Law Journal* reflects these dynamics.

The University of Denver's Transportation Law Program is the premiere such program in the United States. If transportation law is what you want to do, the University of Denver is the place to do it. If you are a prospective law student, write me, and ask for our catalog.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Paul Stephen Dempsey".

Paul Stephen Dempsey
Professor of Law, and
Director, Transportation Law Program

1900 Olive Street, Denver, Colorado 80220 303-871-6269

The University of Denver is an equal opportunity/affirmative action institution.



UNIVERSITY of DENVER

College of Law

Transportation Law Journal

Dear Subscriber:

This symposium issue entitled "The State of the Law in the Railroad Industry" is dedicated to the recent legal and social trends in the railroad industry. Earlier this year, it was brought to the Transportation Law Journal's ("TLJ") attention that railroad law issues have recently spawned heated debates due to the recent mergers and changes in the industry. Therefore, the TLJ has responded with four poignant articles addressing various aspects of railroad law in an attempt to address these changes.

This symposium issue draws on the skills of distinguished practitioners in both the private and public sector as well as the academic community. The articles focus on injecting competition into the industry, using freight rail lines for commuter operations, railroad labor law, and the social policies underlying this country's failure to embrace the railroad system. We hope this collection of articles exceeds your expectations.

On a personal note, I would like to thank the board and staff members of the TLJ for their diligent work on this symposium issue and for all of their hard work during the past year. This issue would not have been possible without the assistance of an incredible staff!

The TLJ is proud to offer you this timely report on the status of the law in the railroad industry, and we hope that you enjoy this issue. As always, please feel free to share your comments or suggestions with me regarding this or any other TLJ issue.

Thank you for your continued support of the Transportation Law Journal!

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Kevin P. Ahearn".

Kevin P. Ahearn
Editor-in-Chief

7039 E. 18th Ave., Denver, Colorado 80220 303-871-6162

The University of Denver is an equal opportunity/affirmative action institution.