6-1-2010

Rescued, Rehabilitated, Returned: Institutional Approaches to the Rehabilitation of Survivors of Sex Trafficking in India and Nepal

Robynne A. Locke

University of Denver

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.du.edu/etd

Part of the Social and Cultural Anthropology Commons

Recommended Citation


https://digitalcommons.du.edu/etd/378

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate Studies at Digital Commons @ DU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ DU. For more information, please contact jennifer.cox@du.edu,dig-commons@du.edu.
RESCUED, REHABILITATED, RETURNED:
INSTITUTIONAL APPROACHES TO THE REHABILITATION OF SURVIVORS OF
SEX TRAFFICKING IN INDIA AND NEPAL

A Thesis
Presented to
The Faculty of Social Sciences
University of Denver

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Arts

by
Robynne A. Locke

June 2010
Advisor: Richard Clemmer-Smith, PhD
Abstract

Despite participating in rehabilitation programs, many survivors of sex trafficking in India and Nepal are re-trafficked, ‘voluntarily’ re-enter the sex industry, or become traffickers or brothel managers themselves. This thesis discusses the challenges of institutional rehabilitation from a critical theory perspective. Drawing from three months of participant observation, interviews, and focus groups with rehabilitation professionals, this thesis will show that there has been a recent, positive shift in the discourse of survivor rehabilitation at the institutional level. However, a focus on individual rather than holistic change, the structure of the rehabilitation process, and a lack of assessment tools has made these theoretical changes difficult to implement, resulting in a gap between “rehabilitation in theory” and “rehabilitation in practice” and the persistence of the status quo.
Acknowledgements

First, I want to thank all the organizations included in this research for their participation, encouragement, hospitality, and most importantly, for all of the important work they do for survivors of trafficking. Specifically, I would like to thank Anwesha Sen, Ruchi Thapa, Daniel Robbins, and Cliff, Nicole, and Jailyn Lubitz, whose friendship, guidance, and support was so valuable to me throughout my research in India and Nepal.

Second, I would like to thank the people of my hometown, Seabrook, NH, who came together to raise over $2000 for survivors of trafficking during my time in the field, and my editor, Shir Haberman of the Hampton Union, who made it all happen. Thanks also to Seabrook Schools for your fundraising efforts, and John Anthony Simmons of WSCA 106.1 FM for allowing me to use your show to spread awareness of this issue.

Third, I must thank the people who first introduced me to the wider world and also inspired me to commit myself to making positive change whenever and however I can: Robert Fleming, Adrie Kusserow, Robert Lair, and all of the Saint Michael’s College community; you continue to inspire me, and I hope I have made you proud.

Fourth, I must thank the Anthropology Department at the University of Denver for providing me with this incredible opportunity. Specifically, I would want to thank my advisor, Richard Clemmer-Smith, who took time out of his much deserved sabbatical to support me throughout every step of my research, and Tracy Ehlers, for always finding the time to support me, and push me, when I needed it. Also, I would like to thank the Human Trafficking Clinic at the Korbel School of International Studies for its dedication
to ending modern slavery in all its forms. Thank you for your endless commitment to this cause.

Most importantly, I would like to thank my family and Andrew, who go into crisis every time I leave the country but still support me anyway. I can never express my gratitude for all you have given me and all the sacrifices you have made so that I could pursue this dream. Thank you for your constant support, encouragement, and faith in my decisions.

Finally, this thesis is dedicated to the people of Kolkata: Asha, Mona, Farita, Sarah, Masum, Michael, and Mohammad: I will never be able to give back what you have given me, but I will never give up trying.
# Table of Contents

Preface ......................................................................................................................... 1

Chapter One: Introduction .......................................................................................... 3
  Statement of the Problem ............................................................................................ 3
  Not Another Gita Story: The Context and Value of this Study ................................ 4
  Thesis Overview ......................................................................................................... 6

Chapter Two: Research Design and Theoretical Framework .................................... 8
  Research Design .......................................................................................................... 8
  Site Selection ................................................................................................................ 8
  Methodology ............................................................................................................... 11
  Methods ....................................................................................................................... 12
  Theoretical Framework ............................................................................................... 19
    The Political Economy of Sex Trafficking and the Feminism of Survival ............... 19
    Docile Bodies: The Survivor and the Institution ...................................................... 39

Chapter Three: Literature Review ............................................................................... 44
  A Situational Analysis of Nepal to India Trafficking ................................................. 44
    The Source ............................................................................................................... 44
    Procurement: Eight Case Studies ............................................................................ 52
    Destination ............................................................................................................... 61
    Pilgrims, Sailors, and Babus: Historical and Contemporary Observations of Kolkata’s Red Light Areas ................................................................. 65
    Rescue, Rehabilitation, Return ................................................................................ 77

Chapter Four: Findings and Analysis .......................................................................... 84
  Rehabilitation: In Theory and in Practice ................................................................. 84
  Gita Revisited ............................................................................................................. 107

Chapter Five: Problems and Recommendations ...................................................... 112
  Focus on the Individual: Local Socio-Cultural Contexts ......................................... 112
  Structure: Donor Dependency ................................................................................... 120
  Lack of Assessment and Measurement ..................................................................... 127
  Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 128

References Cited .......................................................................................................... 132

Appendix A: Glossary ................................................................................................. 137

Appendix B: Informed Consent Form ......................................................................... 139

Appendix C: Parent/Guardian Assent Form ............................................................... 140

Appendix D: Verbal Consent Script ............................................................................ 142
Figures

Figure 1: Sex Trafficking: Size and Growth Rate, 2006-2007 (Kara 2009: 18)

Figure 2: Sex Trafficking: Slave Trading Revenues and Profits, 2007 (Kara 2009: 20)

Figure 3: Regional Trafficking Roles and Economic and Gender Status Means, Listed in Order of Mean Regional Human Development Rank (Farr 2005: 149).

Figure 4: Exploitation Value of a Sex Slave, Brothels (2006 U.S. Dollars) (Kara 2009: 224)

Figure 5: Demand Curve for Sex Acts: Kamathipura Brothel (Kara 2009: 36)

Figure 6: Red light Areas in Kolkata (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 19)
PREFACE

The Bird Cage

For all Nepali girls sold into prostitution.

Whosoever sneaks out of the smoky hut long before the light has broken to wash her face in the brook, declining her mother’s offer of chai in favor of braiding and rebraiding her hair hard as a fossil against her skull, tight enough for the journey to Kathmandu, Delhi, and then Bombay,

She shall go to heaven.

Whosoever waits all morning for the man she met the week before and crawls on top of his heap of drugged girls thinking they are just sleepy from the journey, thinking they will work in a biscuit factory in the heart of Bombay, sending rupees home watching movie stars all night, and settles herself among the virgins as the rickshaw stumbles drunkenly down the road,

She shall go to heaven.

Whosoever shall crawl up through the thick paws of a cheap drug and find herself in a Bombay alley, tied to her boss like a goat, tin cans clanging from her ankles, five goondas lined up to break her in until she consents to life in a cage,

She shall go to heaven.

Whosoever has felt her mind wander off and inhabit
the ceiling, watching as her bangs against the wall
and the bedsprings wheeze,
his vodka burning her face
as he finishes his last round
and snores through the monsoon heat,

*She* shall go to heaven.

Whosoever shall lie awake
hearing the sitar whining and winding
across the alleys
through her cage
like a serpent in search of prey
until it rests its thin coil
of loneliness inside her,

*She* shall go to heaven.

Whosoever crawls into the corner
to quietly vomit, wiping her mouth with the tail of her sari,
plugging up the raw spots where her body still opens
to the world,

*She* shall go to heaven.

You there, Wake up.
Whosoever is in charge of pushing the soul
from one life to another,
of sliding the bolt across the door
once the lame have stumbled in,

Get here,
Now.
Let her in.

(Kusserow 2002: 37)
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION  
Statement of the Problem

According to the United Nations, over the last thirty years trafficking in women and children for sexual exploitation in Asia alone has victimized more than 30 million people (Kempadoo 2005:12). Of this number, substantial percentages are Nepalese women and girls trafficked into brothels in India for forced prostitution. Each year, up to twenty thousand Nepalese women and girls are trafficked into India, and up to thirty thousand of the 100,000 prostitutes in Mumbai are Nepalese (Kara 2009:50).

As the issue of Nepal-to-India sex trafficking continues to receive increased political and media attention, the region has seen a proliferation of anti-trafficking initiatives, coalitions, and activist networks. This intensified effort to prevent sex trafficking has led to increased police interventions and brothel raids to rescue survivors. In addition to survivors rescued by intervention, a substantial number more are “freed” by brothel owners due to being devalued by age or by having contracted HIV/AIDS. However, emancipation alone may not significantly improve the quality of life of a survivor of trafficking. Although survivors may no longer be physically confined to a brothel, many face significant cultural, economic, and psychosocial challenges that put them at continued risk for re-exploitation and that offer few better alternatives to continued work in the sex industry. The problem that remains is how to re-integrate survivors back into society in a way that improves their standard of living and limits the potential for continued exploitation.
Non-governmental organizations have attempted to address this problem through the creation of rehabilitation programs. These organizations have taken the primary responsibility of caring for the physical, psychological, and educational needs of survivors, as well as facilitating the process of community reintegration and independence. Unfortunately, many of these programs have seen limited success. After participating in rehabilitation programs, a significant number of survivors are re-trafficked or choose to re-enter the sex industry as paid prostitutes. Adding additional complexity to the issue, some survivors return to their villages to traffic other women and girls, or become gharwalis (brothel managers) themselves.

Not Another Gita Story: The Context and Value of this Study

In his article *The Myth of Nepal-to-India Sex Trafficking*, John Frederick explains how since the 1980s the discourse on Nepal-to-India sex trafficking has evolved into a trafficking “myth.” Frederick describes this myth as a “typifying narrative” and “consensus description” of sex trafficking, “woven from strands of solid data, conjecture, cultural assumptions, and organizational and political agendas” (Frederick 2005:128). This narrative typically describes a young, poor, low-caste girl named Gita, who is drugged and kidnapped from her village, sold to a brothel in Mumbai, and beaten and raped until she accepts her new life as a prostitute. The myth typically ends with this conclusion:

Now the saviors appear. An inspired NGO leader, aided by cops with humanitarian consciences, beats down the door of the brothel and finds Gita hidden away in a mattress. After a pleasant holiday in a government remand home, she’s repatriated to Kathmandu. But alas, she can’t go home anymore, as the song says, because she’s HIV positive. Luckily for her, there’s a room in a kind of barracks, where she learns to embroider placemats and lives her last days in dignity. [Frederick 2005:129]
Frederick points out that while many components of this myth are continually being reformulated based on new research, the “life after emancipation” scenario has not. He also notes that there is a lack of conceptual clarity about reintegration, and that interventions are almost entirely absent:

The myth cannot readily accommodate Gita living independently, as such it is not part of the South Asian norm…finding a husband and living happily ever after doesn’t fit the myth either, for although the rehabilitation scenario provides Gita penance for being a sex worker by casting her as psychologically damaged, she can never be the model of Nepali womanhood; the highly idealized wife. [Frederick 2005:136]

As a result, the myth of Gita is inconclusive, ending with her “recovering” in an institution. The myth does not account for whether the institution helps Gita overcome these challenges, if she able to reintegrate into society, if she becomes an anti-trafficking activist, or if she is re-trafficked or returns to the sex industry.

One objective of this study is to give increased attention to this underrepresented area of the trafficking narrative: rehabilitation. This study addresses the significant gap of knowledge around survivor rehabilitation and reintegration, for it is within this gap that the potential for re-victimization and the continuation of the cycle of exploitation occurs. To meet this objective, this study explores three central questions in relation to the concept of survivor rehabilitation in India and Nepal:

- How is the construct of “rehabilitation” defined in popular discourse? Where does this definition come from? How does this definition inform rehabilitation institutions’ goals and objectives? How have these definitions, goals, and objectives changed over time?
- What programs, activities, or initiatives are rehabilitation institutions currently implementing to meet these goals and objectives?
• How is rehabilitation, in theory and in practice, influencing the options available to survivors post-institutionalization?

Based on three months of participant observation, interviews, and focus groups with rehabilitation professionals, this thesis shows that there has been a recent, positive shift in the discourse of survivor rehabilitation at the institutional level. However, a focus on individual rather than structural change, a hierarchy amongst stakeholders, and a lack of effective assessment tools has made these theoretical changes difficult to implement. The result has been a gap between “rehabilitation in theory” and “rehabilitation in practice” and inevitably the persistence of the status quo.

**Thesis Overview**

Chapter Two is divided into two sub-sections: Research Design and Theoretical Framework. The first section introduces the research methodology, including site selection, methods, informed consent process, and the limitations of the fieldwork. The second section, Theoretical Framework, introduces the theory used throughout the analysis. First, “The Political Economy of Sex Trafficking and the Feminism of Survival” provides a “macro analysis” of the global sex trade from the lens of political economy. In this section, I introduce the political economy perspective as it relates to the issue of sex trafficking; the effect of economic globalization on the supply and demand of sex slaves; and changing trends in the global sex industry. Second, “Docile Bodies: The Survivor and the Institution” explores the relationship between the survivor, the rehabilitation institution, and political economy from a Foucauldian perspective. The concepts introduced in this section will be revisited and expanded upon in Chapter Four.
Chapter Three, “Literature Review: A Situational Analysis of Nepal-to-India Sex Trafficking” will provide a “micro analysis” of sex trafficking as it occurs in India and Nepal. This chapter will introduce the reader to challenges faced by survivors of trafficking through describing phases throughout the “cycle of exploitation,” including source area vulnerabilities, the procurement and transport of trafficking victims, conditions in red light area destinations, and institutional intervention through rescue, rehabilitation, and community reintegration.

Chapter Four, “Findings and Analysis,” moves from contextual background information to the findings of the original research. This chapter will discuss recent shifts in how institutions approach rehabilitation in “theory,” including a shift towards community-based programs, collaboration amongst stakeholders, and “empowerment” and “rights-based” approaches. In addition, Chapter Four will also discuss how these theoretical shifts have been difficult to implement, resulting in a gap between “theory” and “practice” and inevitably the perpetuation of the status quo. Finally, Chapter Four closes with a discussion of how these findings can be analyzed from a political economy perspective and how they are related to the broader anthropological issues of institutional power and control.

Chapter Five, “Problems and Recommendations,” will discuss how the gap between rehabilitation in theory and in practice can be attributed to three overarching issues: an emphasis on individual change; a hierarchy amongst stakeholders; and a lack of effective assessment tools. Finally, this thesis concludes by providing recommendations as to how these issues might be overcome.
CHAPTER TWO: RESEARCH DESIGN AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Research Design

Site Selection

Fieldwork was conducted at eight different anti-trafficking organizations in Kolkata, India and Kathmandu, Nepal from September-December 2009. Kolkata and Kathmandu were selected as research sites for the following reasons: First, a significant number of women and girls are trafficked for sexual exploitation from the source areas of rural Nepal, through the transit areas of Kathmandu, and on to the destination area of Kolkata; Second, both Kathmandu and Kolkata have a high concentration of anti-trafficking organizations providing rehabilitation services through institutional care; Third, the researcher has five years of experience working for a variety of human rights and development organizations in Kolkata; and Fourth, the proximity of the two sites allowed for maximum time spent in the field as opposed to travel.

Rehabilitation institutions were identified through secondary source research, including literature reviews of previous studies, referrals from key informants, and online searches. All identified anti-trafficking organizations in Kolkata and Kathmandu providing rehabilitation services through institutional care were invited to participate in the study. Of eight organizations contacted prior to the research, three sites self-selected to participate in the study. Once in the field, snowball sampling and in-person inquiries expanded this number from three to eight. Sites selected for the study include:
Apne Aap (Kolkata, India)

Apne Aap is an organization that prevents trafficking by providing women and girls in red light areas with education, safe housing, and alternative livelihood opportunities. Apne Aap has programs in Bihar, Delhi, Maharashtra, and West Bengal, India. This research was conducted at Apne Aap’s Kolkata program in the right light area of Khidderpore.

Sanlaap (Kolkata, India)

Sanlaap is an organization that combats trafficking in women and children for the purposes of commercial sexual exploitation, sexual abuse, and prostitution. Sanlaap has four shelter homes for survivors of trafficking in and around Kolkata, as well as numerous drop in centers in red light areas. This research was conducted at the Narenrdrapur shelter home just outside of Kolkata.

Terre des Hommes (Kolkata, India)

Terre des Hommes is an international federation of eleven national organizations working to protect the rights of children. This research was conducted at Terre des Hommes’ Kolkata office, which focuses specifically on the child trafficking issue. This office collaborates with local NGOs through providing funding and strengthening institutional capacity.
**Maiti Nepal (Kathmandu, Nepal)**

Maiti Nepal is an NGO working in trafficking prevention, rescue, rehabilitation, and community reintegration. Maiti Nepal is the largest rehabilitation shelter included in this study, with over 300 survivors in its main shelter home.

**ABC/Nepal (Kathmandu, Nepal)**

ABC/Nepal is an organization that works for the rights of women and children with a special focus on the prevention of violence and human trafficking for sexual exploitation. ABC/Nepal has a small rehabilitation home in Kathmandu, as well as several transit centers and community halls in several districts throughout Nepal.

**CWIN (Child Workers in Nepal Concerned Center) (Kathmandu, Nepal)**

CWIN is a child rights organization that focuses specifically on the issues of child labor, street children, child marriage, bonded labor, children in conflict with law, and the trafficking of children for sexual exploitation. CWIN has shelter homes for child survivors of human rights abuses, including survivors of trafficking.

**WOREC (Women’s Rehabilitation Center) (Kathmandu, Nepal)**

WOREC is an organization that works to prevent human trafficking from a human rights perspective. WOREC operates a transit home/safehouse for survivors of trafficking, and also engages in research, advocacy, and awareness-raising.

**Shakti Samuha (Kathmandu, Nepal)**

Shakti Samuha is the world’s first anti-trafficking organization founded by survivors of trafficking. Shakti Samuha runs a small, short term shelter home that
provides legal aid, vocational training, and counseling to survivors of trafficking, as well as community-based Adolescent Girls’ Groups in poor districts throughout Nepal.

Methodology

The research design, methods, and analysis of this study all evolved from a critical theory approach. Critical theory is an effective tool for addressing issues of power, knowledge, and domination. A central principle of critical theory is that the production of “knowledge” is historically situated, and tends to reflect the interests and objectives of powerful groups over dominated groups (McDavid 1997: 117). While critical theory is derived from Marxist thought and thus has historically focused on economic domination, the principles of critical theory can also be applied to forms of sexual, political, social domination (McDavid 1997: 117). In order to overcome issues of power and domination in the production of knowledge, the critical theory approach critiques dominant ideology and attempts to develop counter-hegemonic discourse through the participation and representation of historically marginalized groups (Denzin and Lincoln 2008: 8).

Issues of power, domination, and the production of knowledge were carefully considered throughout the research process. In keeping with the critical theory perspective that knowledge is dialectical and relational, I attempted to include a broad range of respondents with differing levels of power in my analysis. This approach was valuable in several ways. Perhaps the most obvious value was the sense of inclusivity that was created. Each person’s perspective, whether they were a young survivor or the head of an international aid organization, was valued equally in the research. In
addition, each actor was given the opportunity to define what can and should be included in the research, creating a space where researcher and researched could collaborate toward mutually beneficial goals (Denzin and Lincoln 2008: 5). This inclusive approach also revealed extremely valuable information about the relationships between different actors in the rehabilitation process. The hierarchy of power, voice, and representation between funders, NGOs, and survivors emerged as a central focus of my final analysis, as it appears to be a considerable variable in shaping rehabilitation efforts in theory and in practice.

A final aspect of critical theory is that it offers a plan for social action and emancipation (McDavid 1997: 118). Rather than simply analyzing the causes and effects of power and domination in the rehabilitation process, this paper provides recommendations as to how these issues might be overcome. This is the most significant aspect of this thesis, for it is part of a greater movement towards more relevant, action-oriented anthropological research.

Methods

Research methods included participant observation, semi-structured interviews with rehabilitation institution staff and survivors, semi-structured interviews with expert key informants, and focus groups with various stakeholders.

*Participant Observation*

Participant observation focused on rehabilitation programming, rehabilitation policy, level of input and collaboration between survivors and the institution, and interactions between survivors and staff. The objective of this method was to gain firsthand knowledge of each institution’s mission, objectives, rehabilitation model, and
mode of implementation. Opportunities to participate and observe a variety of programs and activities arose throughout the three months of fieldwork. Examples of field experiences include:

- Observation of six shelter homes in India and Nepal
- Observation of income-generating projects by women in prostitution and survivors of trafficking
- Observation and immersion in Kolkata’s red light areas of Kalighat and Khidderpore
- Observation of community-based protection and prevention programs in the slum area of Topsia, Kolkata
- Observation of an overnight shelter home and feeding program for the children of prostitutes in a red light area of Kolkata
- Participation in an international conference of anti-trafficking institutions from India, Nepal, and Bangladesh
- Participation in a workshop on HIV/AIDS and migrant laborers in Kathmandu
- Observation of street drama performances by survivors of trafficking in Kathmandu

Through participant observation in these various programs, activities, and communities, I was able to ascertain a more comprehensive understanding of each organization’s ideology and how this is implemented in practice. This includes different core priorities, such as ending prostitution, creating legal accountability through activism and policy work, participating in broader development goals through education, job skills
training, and empowerment, or the provision of direct care; different levels of engagement in the local community; and different levels of collaboration with various stakeholders. It also allowed me to include perspectives from a variety of stakeholders, from international consultants to executive directors to the survivors themselves. In short, participant observation provided the opportunity to observe how different actors in the rehabilitation process attempt to meet their various goals.

**Semi-Structured Interviews**

Semi-structured interviews were held with experts in the fields of sex trafficking prevention and rehabilitation, including academics, activists, and rehabilitation program staff and leadership. The objective of this method was to obtain an understanding of what experts perceive to be the best practices of rehabilitating survivors, as well as what is not being accomplished and what should be improved. The intent behind using semi-structured interviews as opposed to structured interviews is to give respondents more freedom to express their views of the rehabilitation process in ways that may or may not depart from the institutional mission, in order to achieve a deeper, truer understanding of their perceptions of survivor rehabilitation.

Twenty anti-trafficking staff members were interviewed from the eight sites included in the study sample. All respondents were informed of the research through either a community meeting with the organization or a personal introduction from an initial contact person, typically a junior staff at the organization. Respondents then self selected to participate in the research according to their individual availability. From these initial interviews, snowball sampling provided referrals for other potential
respondents both inside and outside the organization. Despite the challenges of achieving appropriate representation through the methods of self-selection and snowball sampling, a variety of respondents representing different roles and backgrounds were included in the sample. Staff interviews included:

- 1 Youth Empowerment Coordinator
- 2 Mental Health Counselors
- 1 Trafficking Documentation Staff
- 1 Community-Based Organization Coordinator
- 8 Coordinators of Anti-Trafficking Programs
- 1 Researcher
- 1 Formal/Informal Education Teacher
- 1 Information Officer
- 1 Anti-Violence Coordinator
- 2 Executive Directors

**Key Informant Interviews**

In addition to rehabilitation staff interviews, seven expert key informants were interviewed. The objective of including expert key informants in the research design was to include an “outside” or “etic” perspective of the challenges faced by rehabilitation institutions. Expert key informants included: anti-trafficking program officers for governmental funding agencies; international consultants on trafficking and exploitation in South Asia; researchers and authors of several books on sex trafficking, prostitution, and survivor rehabilitation; representatives from international anti-trafficking
organizations; investigative journalists focused on the issue of sex trafficking in South Asia; documentary filmmakers focused on sex trafficking in South Asia; and the executive directors of several anti-trafficking NGOs in India and Nepal.

**Focus Groups**

In addition to staff and key informant interviews, four focus groups were conducted as part of the study. The focus group sample includes:

- Red light area youth participating in an empowerment program (9 participants, Kolkata, India)
- Formal/informal education teachers at a rehabilitation home for survivors of sex trafficking (4 participants, Kolkata, India)
- Income generation project leaders/survivors of trafficking (3 participants, Kolkata, India)
- Red light area youth participating in informal education classes (5 participants, Kolkata, India)

**Informed Consent Process**

This research was designed to meet the guidelines of the American Anthropological Association Code of Ethics. Every precaution was taken to respect the dignity and privacy of participants throughout the study. All informants representing organizations were asked if they would like these organizations to be identified by name in the study. Although all organizations agreed to disclose their participation in the study, names, positions, images, statements and other indicators that may trace specific information back to an individual and organization have not been included.
In accordance with ethical guidelines, all participants were asked to acknowledge their informed consent before being interviewed or participating in focus groups. Respondents were informed that their participation is completely voluntary, that they may refuse to answer questions that make them uncomfortable, and that they may discontinue the interview at any time.

Several informed consent protocols were developed in order to meet the specific needs of different groups of respondents. Written consent forms were available in English, Bengali, and Nepali, and included a signature page as well as a tear off informational page with researcher and IRB contact information. For respondents unable or unwilling to give written consent, a verbal consent script was created in the above three languages. Respondents were also asked for their consent to be audio taped. Those respondents who agreed to be audio taped were shown how to operate the digital voice recorder, and were given the freedom to turn the device on and off at will. The participation of respondents under the age of 18 required the written assent of a guardian in addition to the respondent’s own written or verbal consent. In addition, all interviews conducted with the aid of a translator required a written signature on a Translator Confidentiality Form. All forms related to informed consent and confidentiality were approved by University of Denver’s Institutional Review Board for the Protection of Human Subjects and can be found in the Appendices of this thesis. In addition, all interview transcripts and notes have been coded to insure the confidentiality of respondents and research sites.
I took extreme precaution to not disrupt current rehabilitation efforts during the research process through encouraging respondents to self select and schedule their own appointments for interviews. In addition, I asked each participating organization to identify an organizational need that could be addressed in the process of research to insure reciprocity. Finally, I will provide the opportunity for participants to assess the findings of the research and to comment and critique the ethical conduct of the study. Electronic copies of the final thesis will be distributed to all participating organizations and feedback will be encouraged.

Limitations

Due to the limited time frame of the fieldwork and the frequent strikes, protests, and disruptions by Maoist groups in India and Nepal at the time of this research, fieldwork was restricted to Kolkata and Kathmandu. Future studies with additional time and funding might expand the research to include rehabilitation institutions in border areas, community-based rehabilitation institutions in the source/reintegration areas, as well as in areas throughout Bangladesh, where a significant number of women and girls are trafficked, rehabilitated, and reintegrated.

Although the method of self-selection of institutions may introduce some bias in the data, the sample nonetheless includes a variety of organizations that are representative of different sizes, levels of funding, and survivor involvement. Third party expert key informants attested that the organizations interviewed represent wide spectrum of approaches, capabilities, and levels of success. However, there is an unbalanced representation of some organizations due to differing levels of interest in the research,
different levels of availability, and external events (particularly festivals and political disruptions) that interfered with planned interviews and time at each organization. For example, one institution in India provided the majority of interviews and field experiences for that country, as the others were closed for many days at a time due to religious holidays.

The voice of survivors is underrepresented in this study. This is due to the issues of language, the sensitivity of the research, the young age of most of the survivors, and the unequal power relationships between survivors and staff that appeared to influence the responses of survivors. Future research should include adult survivors who are no longer living in rehabilitation institutions, although this population is very difficult to access.

**Theoretical Framework**

The Political Economy of Sex Trafficking and the Feminism of Survival

In his book, *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy* (1999), Kevin Bales points out that while many people think of slavery as an outdated institution outlawed over a hundred years ago, there are in actuality more slaves alive today than at any other time in history (Bales 1999: 9). Despite century-old global abolitionist movements, universal declarations of human rights, and the outlawing of slavery in every country in the world, the institution of slavery continues to persist, and even thrive, in the modern global economy.
In addition, in the new slavery today, as in the old slavery of the past, slavery is not a fringe economic activity relegated to small populations of the least developed countries, but is a well developed, international business generating billions of dollars in profits annually and providing the goods that many of us appreciate in our daily lives. According to the US Department of State Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report…This ‘industry’ is not only thriving, but also growing. Recent estimates of this illegal global trade are as high as $32 billion if both the sale of individuals and the value of their exploited labor or services are taken into account. The money generated by sex trafficking alone is conservatively estimated at $7 billion per year, although Interpol has given a higher estimate of $19 billion annually. In 2005, the International Labor Organization (ILO) issued a report that estimates profits from sex trafficking at $217.8 billion a year or $23,000 per victim (US Department of State, 2008).

Of the many forms of slavery that exist in the world today, sex trafficking is by far the most lucrative subset of the slave industry. According to Siddharth Kara, author of

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Estimated Trafficked Sex Slaves, end of 2006</th>
<th>Estimated Sex Trafficking Victims, 2007</th>
<th>Estimated Sex Slaves Escaped, Freed, or Deceased</th>
<th>Implied Sex Trafficking Slaves, end of 2007 (mean)</th>
<th>Percent Growth (mean)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Asia</td>
<td>335,000</td>
<td>120,000-150,000</td>
<td>110,000-135,000</td>
<td>347,500</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast Asia</td>
<td>315,000</td>
<td>125,000-145,000</td>
<td>113,000-135,000</td>
<td>326,000</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Europe</td>
<td>180,000</td>
<td>82,500-96,000</td>
<td>78,000-88,000</td>
<td>186,250</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central and Eastern Europe</td>
<td>125,000</td>
<td>62,500-74,000</td>
<td>60,000-66,500</td>
<td>130,000</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America</td>
<td>90,000</td>
<td>40,000-50,000</td>
<td>40,000-44,000</td>
<td>93,000</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>80,000</td>
<td>40,000-50,000</td>
<td>40,000-43,500</td>
<td>83,250</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>65,000</td>
<td>25,000-30,000</td>
<td>24,000-27,000</td>
<td>67,000</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North America</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>4,700-5,200</td>
<td>10,050</td>
<td>.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>1,200,000</td>
<td>500,000-600,000</td>
<td>470,000-544,000</td>
<td>1,243,050</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 1 Sex Trafficking Size and Growth Rate (Kara 2009: 18)**
Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery (2009), “The acquisition, movement, and exploitation of sex slaves form an industry that generates a profit margin greater than almost any industry in the world, illicit or otherwise (Kara 2009: 16). While only 4.2% of the world’s slaves are trafficked sex slaves, they generate 39.1% of slaveholders’ profits, and the sex trafficking industry’s global weighted net average profit margin of almost 70 percent makes it one of the most profitable enterprises in the world (Kara 2009: 19).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Weighted Average Purchase Price per Slave (U.S. dollars)</th>
<th>Revenues from Slave Trading (Millions of U.S. dollars)</th>
<th>Estimated Slave-Trading Profit Margin (percent)</th>
<th>Profits from Slave Trading (millions of U.S. dollars)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Asia</td>
<td>660</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>57.6</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast Asia</td>
<td>750</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>58.7</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Europe</td>
<td>4,800</td>
<td>428</td>
<td>56.7</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central and Eastern Europe</td>
<td>2,600</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>60.8</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America</td>
<td>1,500</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>57.9</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East</td>
<td>3,000</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>57.0</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>630</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>58.1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North America</td>
<td>5,250</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>45.0</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,895</td>
<td>1,042</td>
<td></td>
<td>599</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2 Sex Trafficking Trade Revenues and Profits, 2007 (Kara 2009: 20)

Consequently, anthropological research on sex trafficking should include both a “macro-level” analysis of how this issue is embedded in global economic institutions, as well as a “micro-level” analysis of how this issue is affecting communities, families, and individuals are directly impacted.
This chapter will focus on a “macro-level” analysis of sex trafficking. Through a discussion of Marxist theory, political economy, and economic globalization, this chapter will illustrate how sex trafficking is a global phenomenon driven primarily by material factors, and the global economic system in particular. Specifically, this chapter will address how under conditions of extreme economic disparity, and in conjunction with social factors such as gender, ethnic, and religious discrimination, political instability, corruption, and conflict, the supply and demand for sex slaves continues to grow at an alarming rate.

Political Economy: A Brief Introduction

Political economy is a theoretical framework that examines the impact of economics on human lives. In contrast to mainstream economics, political economy is more concerned with the relationships of economic systems and their supporting institutions to the rest of society and social development. In addition, political economy is sensitive to the influence of non-economic factors such as political and social institutions, morality, and ideology in determining economic events (Sackrey and Schneider 2002: vii). As a result, political economy is a paradigm often employed by anthropologists seeking to examine the impact of broader institutions, such as political and economic systems, on human behavior and culture. This theoretical framework employs a materialist perspective of human behavior and culture. That is, a perspective that assumes culture is shaped primarily by the material conditions and lived experiences of human beings.
The origins of political economy can be traced to Marxist theory. According to Marxist thought, economics is the basis of all historical change, social organization, and ideology. In addition, Marxism is also critical of the capitalist economic system, which Marxists perceive as inherently exploitative and rooted in inequality and class conflict. According to the Marxist view,

Over the past 400 years, through its drive to accumulate profits, the capitalist class – by … murder (wars against and systematic impoverishment of Third World nations), and domination (of workers, consumers, and the political process) – has come to own the resources, factories, and other capital equipment needed to produce goods and services needed by all. [Sackrey and Schneider 2002: 3]

This monopoly over the means of production by a wealthy minority enables the capitalist class to take advantage of the less fortunate majority. This leads to one of Marxism’s most serious criticisms of the capitalist system: its dehumanization of the working class, referred to by Marx as the proletariat, by the owners of the means of production, referred to by Marx as the bourgeoisie. In a process referred to as commodification, workers under the capitalist system are exploited, demeaned, and devalued in the quest for economic profit that they themselves are never able to enjoy:

Competitive pressures, along with generating the dynamic energy of the system, (1) force capitalists to treat their workers as things, into commodities that can be bought and sold like steel ingots or sheets of plywood, and (2) shape many capitalists into predators working against the best interests of the larger society. [Sackrey and Schneider 2002: 3]

This commodification of workers persists through the maintenance of an industrial reserve army, or class of unemployed, impoverished proletariat who are willing to work harder, longer, and for less in order to survive. In this way, capitalists are able to keep their labor costs low and continue to maximize their own profit.
Finally, early Marxist thought predicted that the highest form of capitalism would evolve into economic imperialism. Under this system, countries would be divided into two groups: Those who have a monopoly on capital, and their colonies, from whom they extract goods, services, and labor. Later political economists influenced by Marxist thought, such as Andre Gunder Frank and Immanuel Wallerstein, continued to develop theories as they saw these earlier predictions come to fruition. World Systems Theory, developed by Wallerstein, defines the current global economic system as one where developed, industrialized countries, referred to as the core, extract resources from less developed periphery countries. In addition to a deepening dichotomy between periphery and core countries, an increasing divide between rich and poor within countries is created throughout the process of “internal colonization.” The effect is that the world’s poor become increasingly dominated by and dependent upon a system that perpetuates their marginalization through continuously exploiting their resources (Mosse 1993: 16). The argument that capitalist forms of development increase dichotomies within and between societies is known as “dependency theory,” and has become increasingly important as political economists across disciplines have focused in on a process that is changing the world’s political, economic, technological, and cultural landscapes: the process of globalization (Mosse 1993: 16).

Many definitions of globalization can be found. However, for this discussion, Thomas Friedman’s definition in *The Lexus and the Olive Tree* (2000), is most appropriate:

It is the inexorable integration of markets, nation states and technologies to a degree never witnessed before – in a way that is enabling individuals,
corporations and nation-states to reach around the world farther, faster, and deeper than ever before, and in a way that is enabling the world to reach into individuals, corporations, and nation-states farther, faster, cheaper than ever before…The driving idea behind globalization is free market capitalism – the more you let market forces rule and the more you open your economy to free trade and competition, the more efficient and flourishing your economy will be. [Friedman 2000: 9]

In the words of Kara,

As the process of economic globalization unfolded, it essentially manifested a singular dynamic: the net transfer of wealth, raw materials, commodities, and other assets from newly opened, developing nations into richer, developed ones. The resulting social strife and economic collapse, coupled with the same advances that promoted the freer exchange of goods, services, capital, knowledge, and people, catalyzed the ascent of human trafficking and contemporary slavery (Kara 2009: 24).

In discussing the impact of a more fully integrated, globalized world, Friedman points out many positives, such as the democratization of technology, the democratization of finance, and the democratization of information (Friedman 2000: 45-72). The result is, according to author and activist David Batstone, that criminal agents make handsome profits off unpaid labor: it is cheaper to produce goods, or, in the case of sex slavery and domestic servitude, to offer valued human services. Due to these financial advantages, slaveholders can compete successfully in almost any market. The profit margins will rise as high as the demand will bear. [Batstone 2007: 9]

Critics such as Kara (2009) and Aguilar and Cavada (2002) point to a number of negative consequences of economic globalization, including: Growth in poverty and inequality; a greater concentration of income amongst the wealthy; an explosion of consumption and exclusion; an increase in unemployment and growth in the informal sector; the loss of labor rights and double exploitation of women; environmental degradation; lack of participation of poor countries in world trade; economic domination by transnational companies; financial crises; and a decrease of international assistance
and increase in foreign debt (Aguilar and Cavada 2002: 5-72). While there are many academics and activists on either side of the globalization debate, most of those involved in anti-sex trafficking work and research agree that the capitalist system, accelerated over the past three decades by the process of globalization, has played a significant role in the creation of the new global sex industry. Just as other successful capitalist industries follow the economic rules of supply and demand and compete globally for the lowest labor costs and highest profit, so does the global sex industry. Consequently, in order to understand how an industry like the global sex trade can continue to persist despite universal illegality and widespread moral condemnation, it is helpful to explore the issue through the lens of political economy and the economic laws of supply and demand.

The Political Economy of Supply and Demand in the Sex Industry

*Supply: The Industrial Reserve Army of Vulnerable Women*

According to David Batstone, widespread poverty and social inequality insure a pool of recruits “as deep as the ocean” (Batstone 2007:10). As the gap between the rich and poor continues to widen and developing countries are left further behind, individuals from rural, non-industrialized areas are left with fewer and fewer options, creating an increased supply of people vulnerable to trafficking and enslavement. Anti-slavery activist Kevin Bales speaks to this point in his book *Disposable People* (1999), and also stresses that the transfer of wealth, resources and labor from developing to developed countries is structural in nature, and has been developed and supported by a wealthy minority for their personal gain with little consideration for the impoverished majority:

> Although modernization can have good effects, bringing improvements in health care and education, the concentration of land in the hands of the elite and its use
of land to produce cash crops for profit have made the poor more vulnerable. Because the political elites in the developing world focus on economic growth, which is not just in their collective self interest but required by global financial institutions, little attention is paid to sustainable livelihoods for the majority. So while the rich in the developing world have grown richer, the poor have fewer and fewer options. Amid the disruption of rapid social change, one of these options is slavery. [Bales 1999:13]

In the above paragraph, Bales is speaking to the decreased ability for individuals to provide for themselves and their families as they did in the past. In order to make it in the new global economy, the most vulnerable, marginalized, and disadvantaged groups (ethnic or religious minorities, women, and children), are often pressured to abandon traditional methods of livelihood (such as subsistence agriculture) for work in the industrial sector (such as factory work) or the informal sector (such as prostitution). And, as developing countries on the periphery of the global economy lose out to the increasingly prosperous core, finding work often means migrating internally or across national borders from rural to urban areas. One example of this widespread response to the new global economy can be found in Thailand, where in a three year period from 1993-1995, 10% of the population of the country moved from rural areas to industrialized centers (Batstone 2007: 23).

Consequently, the major human trafficking routes that exist in the world today mirror other trends in the movement of resources, wealth, and labor caused by the process of globalization. “Source” countries, or the countries that provide the supply of trafficked sex slaves, tend to be poor, developing, “periphery” countries (such as Nepal, Burma, Bangladesh, and Moldova), while “destination” countries, or the countries where trafficked persons are enslaved, tend to be wealthier, industrialized, “core” countries (such as Italy, Japan, Saudi Arabia, and the United States). In addition, countries with
vast economic disparities between rural and urban areas, such as India, may have both core and periphery areas within their national borders, and thus serve as both source and destination countries. According to Kathryn Farr, author of *Sex Trafficking: The Global Market in Women and Children* (2005), source and destination countries meet one of the following regional types:

**Destination Countries:**

1. Very affluent Westernized nations, with relatively high rates of female employment and female political representation, but with levels of internal inequality similar to those in other regions;
2. Very affluent east and southeast Asian countries, where women’s employment and political representation are on the moderate to low side; and
3. Affluent Middle Eastern countries with very poor female employment and political representation (Farr 2005: 154).

**Source Countries:**

1. Poor, developing countries with notable gender inequality, or
2. Economically depressed, transitional countries, but with a history of high female unemployment (Farr 2005: 154).
In countries where there is a vast disparity of wealth between rural and urban areas (such as India and Thailand), disturbingly high numbers of persons are also internally trafficked from smaller villages to more prosperous urban centers. In *Global Woman*, Saskia Sassen refers to these urban industrialized areas as “global cities,” the centers of the global economy where the demand for highly paid professionals opens up jobs for unskilled, low-paid labor. Sassen explains that these “global cities” are a part of
newly emerging “survival circuits” that have developed as increased numbers of migrants leave home in search of economic opportunity (Sassen 2004: 225).

As mentioned, participants in these survival circuits typically belong to the most impoverished and disenfranchised groups in society. In developing countries with deeply rooted gender biases, women facing extreme disadvantage in economic opportunity, education, and health care are often the ones who migrate in search of a better life for themselves and their families (Ehrenreich and Hochschild 2002: 3-5). According to one UN report, of the 115 million children in the world who are not enrolled in school, 70 million are girls, and a substantial percentage of these are in South Asia and Eastern Europe (Kara 2009: 30). In addition, 70% of the 985 million people living in extreme poverty are women (Kara 2009: 31). What is particularly troubling about these statistics is that a lack of education and economic opportunity is highly correlated with other risk factors, including HIV infection and vulnerability to exploitation and trafficking (Kara 2009: 31). In addition to systemic discrimination, women in countries with a high gender bias are extremely likely to experience violence, including sexual abuse, rape, domestic violence, murder, and female infanticide and abortion (Kristof and WuDunn 2009).

Despite the fact that women’s work often goes unrecognized, women contribute greatly to the global economy. For example, it has been estimated that female farmers produce 50% of the world’s food for direct consumption (Farr 2005: 136). However, women in developing countries tend to work in the informal sector of the labor market, in which work tends to be underpaid, or not paid at all, and without regulation of any sort (Farr 2005: 135). In addition, this work tends to be labor intensive, isolated,
unrecognized, and expensive, in that costs, such as equipment, space, utilities, and inventory, are paid for by the worker rather than by an employer (Farr 2005: 135). According to Farr, “With such poor working conditions, even women who are working are vulnerable to recruitment for seemingly better jobs in a large city or a foreign country” (Farr 2005: 135). This population of vulnerable workers has been beneficial for the industrial sector, where “The drive for maximizing profit under a competitive economic regime fields a demand for workers who are the most vulnerable and therefore the most exploitable and controllable” (Kempadoo 2005: 7). Consequently, of those individuals extracted out of impoverished countries and trafficked across international borders, 80% are female and 50% are children (Batstone 2007: 9).

Seemingly paradoxically, the political economy of developing countries actually supports this transfer of women workers from the periphery to the core. It helps developing countries in their battle against poverty and debt, since those women who are able to make money often send remittances to their families at home and thus contribute to the revenue of deeply indebted countries. Thus in ”third world economies on the periphery of the global system … increasingly build survival circuits on the backs of women –whether these be trafficked low wage workers and prostitutes or migrant workers sending remittances back home (Sassen 2004: 256). This economic dependence on women at the household, community, national, and transnational level has led to a phenomenon Sassen refers to as the “feminization of survival.” That is, as the above institutions become reliant on the exploitability of vulnerable women, the migration and
trafficking of women has become encouraged and promoted as economic strategy (Sassen 2004: 264-265).

*Demand: Owners, Consumers, and Commodities in the Sex Industry*

While the deepening poverty of rural, developing countries may explain the substantial increase in the supply of vulnerable women and children to be trafficked for sexual exploitation, poverty may not be the only factor. According to the anti-trafficking organization *Polaris Project*,

While poverty and inequality are important factors in making certain populations more vulnerable to being trafficked, they are not the primary cause of trafficking. Trafficking is a criminal industry driven by 1) the ability to make large profits due to high demand, and 2) negligible-to-low risk of prosecution. As long as demand is unchecked and the risks for traffickers are low, trafficking will exist regardless of other contributing factors. [www.polarisproject.org, 2009]

In other words, while poverty and inequality resulting from globalization can help explain the supply of sex slaves; it is the high demand for sex slaves that continues to perpetuate the global industry. In *Sex Trafficking*, Kara was able to identify three market forces driving the demand side of the sex industry: Male sexual demand, profit, and the elasticity of demand (Kara 2009: 33).

Kara calculates that .5 percent of males over the age of 18 are required to purchase sex on a given day in order to maximize the capacity of today’s 1.2 million trafficked sex slaves, and that anywhere from 6 to 9 percent of males in the world purchase sex from slaves at some point each year (Kara 2009: 33). While men have been purchasing sex from establishments for centuries, it is only in recent decades that such establishments have been increasingly filled with slaves. Kara attributes this directly to
the forces of economic globalization and the fact that “sex slavery is the profit-maximizing version of prostitution” (Kara 2009: 33).

### Table: Exploitation Value of a Sex Slave: Brothels (2006 U.S. dollars)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monthly Unit Economics</th>
<th>South Asia</th>
<th>East and Pacific</th>
<th>Western Europe</th>
<th>Central and Eastern Europe</th>
<th>Latin America</th>
<th>Middle East</th>
<th>Africa</th>
<th>North America</th>
<th>Global Weighted Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Revenues</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sale of sex</td>
<td>1,350</td>
<td>1,629</td>
<td>10,080</td>
<td>5,040</td>
<td>3,200</td>
<td>6,510</td>
<td>1,300</td>
<td>9,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>202</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condoms</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cigars, snacks, other</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Revenues</strong></td>
<td>1,452</td>
<td>1,778</td>
<td>10,570</td>
<td>5,293</td>
<td>3,370</td>
<td>6,637</td>
<td>1,420</td>
<td>9,060</td>
<td>3,831</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Variable Costs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food and beverage for slaves</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>540</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police bribe</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rent</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>380</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>263</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clothing, makeup, grooming</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>240</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organized crime payment</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>504</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bouncers/guards</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>720</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>345</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>900</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madam/cashier</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>380</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of retail products</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>274</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bail</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>300</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occasional payment/“tip”</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>252</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>225</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing/advertising</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 4 (Kara 2009: 224)**

In describing the role of profit in creating demand, Kara explains that the labor costs of the commercial sex industry are almost non-existent when the “laborers” are sex slaves. As a result, the demand for sex slaves has increased significantly as they have
become increasingly available to those seeking to make a substantial profit with little overhead (Kara 2009: 34).

In his research in the brothels of India Kara also explored the relationship between the price of sex and the demand for sex services from clients. Through constructing a basic sex-service demand curve, Kara found that the demand for sex services is highly elastic: That is, the demand for sex slaves is correlated with the price for purchasing sex. In the red light areas he visited, Kara procured evidence that the average price of a sex act is decreasing over time due to the increased use of slaves:

These decreasing prices opened the market to low-wage consumers, such as day laborers and tuk-tuk (rickshaw) drivers. Such men could not previously afford sex with a prostitute, but as prices in some parts of Asia and Europe dropped by half, new consumers entered the market, and traditional consumers returned more often. The drop in the retail price of a sex act functions exactly the same as an increase in a consumer’s disposable income…[Kara 2009: 34]

Figure 5 Demand Curve for Sex Acts: Kamathipura Brothel (Kara 2009: 36)
In other words, the higher the poverty rate, the higher the potential supply of exploitable people; the higher the supply of exploitable people, the increased ability of traffickers to traffic them; the higher the ability of brothels to procure trafficked sex slaves, the lower the price of sex; the lower the price for sex, the higher is the number of people who can purchase sex. It is this cycle, driven by the economic laws of supply and demand, which has turned human beings in cheap commodities for sexual consumption, and into the term famously coined by Kevin Bales: *disposable people* (Bales 1999).

**The Changing Global Sex Trade**

They know their business inside and out and respond to changes in the market with a speed unmatched by even the most competitive corporations. Their expertise and ability to exploit the market are surpassed only by their disregard for human life. Women are bought, sold, and hired out by any other product. The bottom line is profit.

> -Anna Diamantopoulou, EU Commissioner for Employment and Social Affairs  
[Batstone 2007: 173]

In addition to working within the economic principles of supply and demand, the global sex industry is just like any other industry in that it responds to political, economic, and technological changes and the influences these changes have on the market. Through examining the recent history of the global sex trade, it becomes apparent that not only is this industry massive, widespread, and profitable, but it is also dynamic and innovative in its pursuit of maximum human exploitation.

In the 1970s, the primary source countries for human trafficking and sexual slavery were in Southeast Asia, and in Thailand, Vietnam, and the Philippines in particular. But after about ten years, traffickers shifted their focus from Southeast Asia to Africa, and began to traffic women and girls from places like Nigeria, Uganda, and
Ghana. By the 1980s, Latin America became the largest source of trafficked sex slaves, especially in the countries of Brazil, Mexico, the Dominican Republic, El Salvador, and Guatemala (Batstone 2007: 172).

With the collapse of the Soviet Union, sex traffickers were provided with a new bottomless supply of vulnerable women and girls. Even within the 1990s in Eastern Europe, traffickers shifted their focus three times to different areas where they could capitalize most off of political and economic instability. In the early 1990s, most trafficked persons came from Poland, Romania, Hungary, and Czechoslovakia. During the mid 1990s, this shifted to the countries of Russia, Ukraine, Bulgaria, and Moldova. By the turn of the century, traffickers focused on central Asia, including Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Georgia. According to the International Organization for Migration (IOM), an estimated quarter of a million women and girls have been trafficked from Eastern to Western Europe since 1991 (Batstone 2007: 172).

Perhaps the biggest change in the global sex industry is the extent to which it has truly gone “global” over the past decade as advances in technology have allowed people to communicate, travel, and purchase goods and services faster, easier, and cheaper than ever. Unfortunately, like many other benefits of modernization, these conveniences have benefitted the sex industry as well. According to Batstone, “In the modern slave trade, the glut of slaves and the capacity to move them at greater distances in a relatively short period of time drastically alters the economics of slave ownership (Batstone 2007: 11). While in the past transporting a trafficked person around the world may have been prohibitively expensive, women and girls can now be procured in Eastern Europe, sold in
Saudi Arabia, and then transferred again to India, profiting each slave owner along the way. Such cases have been documented by anthropologist Susan Dewey in her book, *Hollow Bodies*, which describes the visible presence of trafficked Russian prostitutes in Goa, India (Dewey, 2008).

In addition to the cheap and easy transport of trafficked persons, today’s globalized world also allows purchasers of sex to travel in search of women and children to exploit. While the majority of men who purchase sex continue to be local, a new trend in the global sex industry is to advertise services on the internet to foreign customers, or “sex tourists.” In the opening chapter of his book *A Crime So Monstrous*, journalist E. Benjamin Skinner tells the disturbing story of how an American could travel 600 miles in 5 hours from New York to Haiti and purchase a child for labor and sex for the price of the cab fare to JFK (Skinner 2008: 12). The central message of Skinner’s story is that in today’s globalized world, it is easier than ever for anyone, anywhere, to purchase a sex slave. In *Sex Traffic: Prostitution, Crime, and Exploitation* (2005), Paola Monzini describes how “the internet offers fast consultation of market guides to prostitution of all kinds and in every country” (Monzini 2005: 28). According to Monzini,

The internet has thus become the main place for the exchange of information among consumers: there are numerous sites where men swap and update reports, especially about the networks of so-called ‘sex tourism’, and this gives rise to a veritable culture of commodification of the female body. [Monzini 2005: 28]

In addition, Monzini describes how “special markets products” seem to be taking advantage of racial stereotypes (Monzini 2005: 28). The sex tourism industry has been successful in marketing women in the developing world to western men as “exotic” “savage” “submissive” “passionate” and “docile,” and the “internet and subscription
television channels allow them to refine and diversify their tastes” (Monzini 2005: 19, 29). According to Batstone, “Specialized travel agencies around the globe promote “exotic sexual adventures” with Asian women “who know how to please a man.” After sex tourists experience firsthand how easy it is to buy young girls, they frequently make their own arrangements for return visits” (Batstone 2007: 60).

In *Sex Traffic,* Monzini also describes how sex tourism allows men to live out their fantasies of power and control, as “travel to faraway places may greatly assist the search for ‘island’ in which men can defend – or at least have the illusion of defending -- the status of male superiority in the face of women’s social skills and growing qualifications (Monzini 2005:13):

To buy sexual services from someone who does not speak your language, and who has a lower social status and therefore less contractual power, is different from contracting the same services from skilled professionals… it is easier to have a degree of control over them which offers a good ‘return’ for the money. [Monzini 2005: 13]

While such relationships greatly exploit the unequal relationship between men and women of developed and developing countries, “international and business travel has turned prostitution into quite a rewarding business in many poor countries” (Monzini 2005: 29). Prostitution is often the fastest expanding sector of the economy in countries that rely heavily on the tourism industry as it continues to attract investment and provide incomes for those who work in prostitution circuits (Monzini 2005: 29). And, in the case of human trafficking and sex slavery, this income is almost entirely profit.

As mentioned by Sassen (2002), the financial benefits of prostitution have led to an acceptance, and perhaps even promotion, of the sex industry as a survival tactic for governments, communities, and families in the developing world (Monzini 2005:13).
Thus, efforts to eradicate the sex trade must first address the root cause of the problem. According to Kara, “The conditions that first gave rise to the crime must be remedied; these conditions are primarily the structural crime of poverty and the inimical asymmetries spread by the current process and governance of economic globalization, which in turn exacerbates poverty levels” (Kara 2009: 41). Until economic globalization is perceived as a system that can only be legitimized through the social, political, and economic well-being of all members of humanity, and until extreme poverty and global inequality is eradicated, sex trafficking and other forms of contemporary slavery will continue to thrive (Kara 2009: 41).

With an anthropological perspective, critical Marxism offers the most productive set of concepts for understanding and analyzing sex trafficking. A critical Marxist perspective enables the following identification of the “macro” factors in the sex trafficking industry: (1) The political economy of the class struggle between the rich and poor that leads to the ongoing commodification of human bodies in the pursuit of profit in poor and developing countries; (2) Globalization and modernization that lead to an increased global interconnectedness that has allowed industries, including the sex industry, to conduct business further, faster, and cheaper than ever before; And (3), as will be further discussed in Chapter Three, cultural perceptions of gender, ethnicity, and sexuality impact the survival strategies women may employ in order to cope with changing economic environments.

Docile Bodies: The Survivor and the Institution

In addition to being impacted by global political and economic forces, women and girls are also impacted by institutions that mediate their experiences with the larger
world. Now more than ever, these institutions tend to take the form of international funding organizations (such as UN agencies, the World Bank, CARE, etc.) and their local implementing partners, non-governmental organizations (NGOs). In the context of Nepal to India sex trafficking, NGOs have taken on a variety of roles in the lives of women and girls. In their preventative role, NGOs have established a variety of anti-trafficking interventions such as safe migration programs, anti-child labor and child marriage campaigns, and formal and informal education programs. When these interventions are ineffective and women and girls are still trafficked into the sex industry, NGOs intervene through rescuing, rehabilitating, and reintegrating survivors into their community. While these interventions are intended to improve the lives of survivors and limit their potential for re-exploitation, the relationship between the individual survivor and rehabilitation institution are often complicated by issues of power and control.

The work of Michel Foucault often focuses on this complex relationship between the individual and institution. In *Madness and Civilization* and *The Birth of the Asylum*, Foucault describes a cultural shift in the way society approaches individuals outside of mainstream (Rabinow 1984). The change represents a shift from the repression, punishment, and physical torture of the body to the manipulation, improvement, and control of the body *and* soul. Foucault attributed this change to the rise of the capitalism, and thus the increased incentive to transform non-productive or “docile” bodies into “improved” and “capacitated” individuals that adhere to the norms of capitalist society (Foucault *in* Rabinow 1984: 8, 17, 182). Although Foucault discussed this shift in a historical context, his theories are still relevant to the issues faced by survivors of sex trafficking.
trafficking in institutions today. As discussed in Chapter Four of this thesis, rehabilitation institutions have also experienced a shift away from the “repression” of survivors (through long term institutionalization and confinement) to the “improvement” of survivors (through skills building, education, and leadership training). Often, “improving” or “capacitating” survivors means training them to become productive members of capitalist society through the provision of income generating trainings and the development of entrepreneurial skills. Because the activities of NGOs are often funded by international donor agencies, these “capacitating” activities are often directly or indirectly tied to larger development agendas.

According to Foucault, institutions provide effective ways for society to transform individuals through “disciplinary technologies” and the intersection of knowledge and power. Foucault defines disciplinary technologies as the methods by which institutions subject, use, transform, and improve docile bodies (Foucault in Rabinow 1984: 67). For example, as illustrated in Chapter Four, “Gita Revisited,” counseling, medical care, education, and empowerment trainings may all be considered forms of “disciplinary technologies” in rehabilitation institutions. For Foucault, knowledge refers to the scientific study, codification and classification of certain dominated groups (Foucault in Rabinow 1984: 67). In rehabilitation institutions, survivors of sex trafficking are often considered to be subjects of study as much as they are beneficiaries of services. As discussed in Chapter Five, the focus of this research by institutions tends to be on the individual survivor and their capabilities and deficiencies, rather than the larger structural, cultural, or relational conditions impacting their life choices. Finally, power
refers to access to individuals’ bodies, acts, attitudes, and modes of everyday behavior, such as what services survivors receive, what values should be instilled with them, and what tasks they need to accomplish before they are permitted to leave the institution (Foucault in Rabinow 1984: 67).

Through the intersection of power and knowledge and the utilization of disciplinary technologies, institutions work to eliminate social irregularities (Foucault in Rabinow 1984: 149). In the rehabilitation process, international donor agencies and rehabilitation institutions are the holders differing levels of “knowledge and power” and thus are awarded reputational authority over the needs of survivors and how these needs should be met. Under the “rhetoric of reform and progress,” rehabilitation institutions apply their knowledge of the dominated group (survivors) through their procedures of power (monitoring their time, space, and movement) in an effort to “normalize” them so that they may be eventually reintegrated into their home communities (Foucault in Rabinow 1984: 8, 20, 181).

Foucault stresses that although the relationship between the institution and the individual does have attributes of repression, the relationship should not be defined in such narrow and negative terms. In fact, the relationship is not only repressive (a negative power) but also productive (a positive power), and its practitioners (psychiatrists, social workers, etc.) see their profession as one of charity, philanthropy, and social service (Foucault in Rabinow 1984: 61, 66). Rather than simply punishing social deviants, institutions shelter, feed, train, and rehabilitate them in exchange for their confinement, until they once again subscribe to the “ethical pact of human existence”
through their participation in the capitalist system (Foucault *in* Rabinow 1984: 130, 137).

Indeed, this is why a critical analysis of the roles of international funding agencies, NGOs, and survivors in the rehabilitation process is an important component of this study. Rather than simply pointing to the differing agendas of each actor, this research seeks to reveal how issues of power and control may be limiting the ability of each actor to reach common, humanitarian goals.
CHAPTER THREE: LITERATURE REVIEW  
A Situational Analysis of Nepal to India Trafficking

The following chapter will draw from existing literature, research, and other secondary sources to explore a “micro” analysis of how sex trafficking is conducted on the ground in individual countries. Because sex trafficking is an issue situated in economic, political, and cultural context, the following chapter will explore all three of these areas in the countries of India and Nepal. In addition, because sex trafficking is not a single, isolated issue but a collection of interconnected issues, the following chapter will attempt to summarize different points along the “cycle” of sex trafficking.

The Source

_Causal Factors and Vulnerabilities in South Asia_

According to the anti-trafficking organization Apne Aap, “Trafficking in India is fueled by relative deprivations caused by deep seated poverty, the low status of women and the growing demand for the exploitation of trafficked people, especially women and children for sexual exploitation” (Apne Aap 2007: 46). While Apne Aap maintains that poverty is the predisposing factor in the trafficking issue, poverty by itself is not a sufficient driver of trafficking. Rather, the male demand for a supply of women and children is the root cause of prostitution and trafficking whereas gender inequality, globalization, poverty, racism, migration, and the collapse of women’s economic stability are global factors which create the conditions driving women into prostitution (Apne Aap 2007: 46). Reviews of literature and interviews with key informants revealed the
following social, cultural, and economic conditions as major factors that increase the vulnerability of women and children to prostitution and trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation:

_Gender Inequality and Poverty_

According to Indrani Sinha of Sanlaap, arguments that point simply to poverty as the cause of human trafficking fail to recognize the ways in which people’s need are strongly influenced by their gender. In South Asian societies characterized by patriarchal values, such as in India and Nepal, male control is exerted over both female labor and female sexuality, separating men and women into domains where the women’s work and needs are unrecognized and undervalued (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 2-3). In male-dominated, patriarchal societies, men tend to have more productive economic skills and access to jobs, land and income, whereas women are traditionally dependent on men (fathers, then husbands, then sons) for their safety, security, and economic wellbeing. With limited options for survival outside of family and marriage, a woman rendered independent is left with few options for survival other than to enter the sex industry (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 3).

In addition, male control over female sexuality has created a tradition of “gendered morality,” or a double standard in what is considered sexually moral. In India and Nepal, where a women’s honor is strongly linked to pre-marital chastity and faithfulness during and after marriage (should she outlive her husband), sexual deviations from the norm are severely punished, and a woman or girl child may find herself stigmatized, ostracized, without economic support, the preparedness to survive on her
own, and the awareness and education to protect herself from various forms of exploitation (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 4). Consequently, anti-trafficking interventions have identified the following groups as particularly vulnerable to sex trafficking:

**Deserted Women:** In both India and Nepal, women and girls traditionally enter marriage through the dowry system. Under this practice, the family of the bride gives a sum of money to the family of the groom. If a marriage fails, it is the woman who is forced to leave the home. These women are often at the mercy of their families to take them back, but in a resource scarce environment families who have already paid a dowry are often reluctant to take back a married daughter as a dependent. There is significant pressure for a woman to reconcile with her husband, despite what mistreatment or abuse she may be facing at home (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 22). According to one study by Sanlaap, 13% of interviewed sex workers joined prostitution after leaving or being abandoned by violent husbands (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 22).

**Victims of Child Marriage:** Child brides are predominantly from families who could not afford to continue supporting them as dependents. In India, over 25 million girls and 10 million boys between the ages of 10-14 are married. In addition, 250,000 girls in India between the ages of 10-14 are divorced, widowed, separated, or have fled from their husbands. Due to their vulnerable situation, these girls are often intercepted, tricked, or lured by traffickers or pimps into commercial sexual exploitation (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 24). In one National Human Rights Commission
A study of survivors of trafficking, 71.8% of respondents stated that they were married as children (Apne Aap 2007: 56).

**Widows:** There are approximately 33 million widows in India, accounting for 8% of the population of the country. According to a study by Mary Chen of the Harvard Institute for International Development, 62% of widows were living on their own without any support from family members, and only 26% were living in their son’s household (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 24). According to Hindu tradition, middle and upper caste widows are expected to never marry and to live restrictive lives. Because they are considered inauspicious, widows are not invited to participate in community functions. Although legally women are entitled to a pension, maintenance from their father in law, land and property rights, these are seldom guaranteed in practice (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 23).

**Survivors of Incest and Physical and Sexual Abuse:** Due to the cultural importance placed on a woman or girl’s virginity, survivors of sexual abuse are often considered “immoral,” “unmarriageable,” or “damaged goods” (Apne Aap 2007: 56; Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 27). Facing rejection from their families, and under social or customary pressures, many survivors pursue prostitution on their own, are induced by lack of options, or are forced by others. According to Apne Aap, 69.8% of victims of trafficking had their first sexual experience below the age of 18, and this sexual experience was forced on them by someone they knew (Apne Aap 2007: 56). According to another study by Sanlaap, of homeless youth living in Sealdah Train Station in Kolkata, 90% of girls and 25% of boys had experienced sexual abuse and/or rape by
older children. Many of these young girls were forcibly raped and then given money as their first introduction to prostitution (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 27).

**Daughters of Sex Workers:** Anti-trafficking organizations have begun to focus on red light areas not only as destination areas, but also as source areas in the sex trafficking cycle. Daughters of sex workers face a series of challenges that make them vulnerable to trafficking and prostitution. School drop out rates for children from red light areas are high due to a poor home environment and stigmatization at school (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 27). Many daughters of sex workers have been exposed to sex as a commodity at an early age, are familiar with the brothel system, have personal relationships with various actors (*machis*, *gharwalis*, traffickers, pimps, clients), and are desensitized by violence (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 27). Some mothers, recognizing the risks of the brothel environment, marry their daughters off at a young age in order to get them out of the red light area. These girls are susceptible to being trafficked or joining prostitution later in life after failed marriages leave them with few livelihood options (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 27). Other women in prostitution, however, expect their daughters to join prostitution so that they might retire and be supported in their old age (Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 29). Generally, Sanlaap and Apne Aap have found that most women in prostitution have a strong desire to protect their daughters from the sex industry, and safe homes and hostel accommodations for children are in great demand by women living in red light areas (Resp. 7; Resp.1).

**Women and Girls lacking Literacy and Education:** One NHRC study found that 70.7% of survivors of trafficking were either illiterate or barely literate. Of these,
only 13.6% of the survivors had received primary education, 15% received education beyond the primary stage, and only .4% were school graduates. A lack of education eliminates opportunities to earn income, as well as increases a person’s vulnerability to various forms of exploitation.

Women and Girls from Marginalized Groups

In addition to the factors of gender inequality and poverty, women and girls from marginalized cultural groups are particularly vulnerable to sex trafficking. This is especially true of women and girls from scheduled castes and tribes, who often face the combined challenges of gender and social discrimination. According to Apne Aap, “In India, where the caste system and similar forms of social stratification still prevails, families and children from the Dalits and other sections considered as low castes are still found in relationships of bondage to the brothel madams, landowners and to the upper castes despite of existing laws that prohibit slavery” (Apne Aap 2007: 40).

In a study on the socio-religious background of survivors of trafficking, the NHRC found that 32.3% of victims were from Schedules Castes, 5.8% were from Scheduled Tribes, 21.9% from the “Other Backward Classes,” and 17.4% were from other castes. Thus, 60% of the respondents identified themselves as belonging to traditionally subjugated and marginalized social groups (Apne Aap 2007: 55).

At particular risk are women and girls from the Bedia, Devadasi, and Nat castes in India, and the Deuki and Badini castes in Nepal, which traditionally dedicate young girls to ritualized prostitution in temples. In the past, teenage girls dedicated to temples occupied a high status in society. Elaborate public ceremonies and feasting occurred to
legitimize their dedication to the temple and marriage to God, and their role as caretaker of the temple was valued and respected. For their service, women were granted a parcel of temple property and accumulated wealth through donations to the God. Eventually, as patronage of the temples declined and women lost their income, the system gradually disappeared and many of the women resorted to commercial prostitution. Unlike temple marriage, commercial prostitution was not protected by religious sanction, and these women suffered a significant decline in status in their community. Currently, women and girls of ritualized prostitution castes occupy low social status, and are often tricked and lured into commercial sexual exploitation (Pande 2008: 107).

Women and Girls from Countries in Crisis

It is well documented that the majority of trafficked persons are women and girls from developing countries, countries whose economies are either unstable or in transition, or countries which are facing long-term violent conflict. In such countries, the alienation and isolation of internally displaced people from conflict, natural disaster, or development projects increases vulnerability to trafficking (Apne Aap 2007: 46). In countries with weak law enforcement and high levels of corruption, organized criminal syndicates are often able to institutionalize human trafficking. These linkages lead to hefty profits from trafficking, which according to estimates are third only to the underground narcotics and arms trade (Apne Aap 2007: 45).

Nepal: A Source Country

In examining the above “vulnerability” factors, it is clear how Nepal has become a source country providing substantial supply of women and girls to the global sex trade.
Nepal has been called one of the poorest countries in South Asia. In 2008, The Human Development Index ranked the country 145th out of 177, indicating a very low quality of life for the majority of its agricultural population (UNDP 2008). Issues of poverty and unemployment in Nepal have been exacerbated over the past ten years due to forced migration resulting from the violent Maoist insurgency that ended with the overthrow of the monarchy in 2008. According to Kara, this insurgency is one of the primary drivers of human trafficking from Nepal (Kara 2009: 75).

In addition, although more than 90% of Nepalis live in isolated villages and depend on traditional agricultural practices for survival, more than 75% of the country’s total area is not suitable for agriculture (ABC Nepal 1994: 4). This lack of productive land has been worsened with the introduction of large-scale agro-based industries, which has contributed to the phasing out of small-scale subsistence farming. Although Nepalis have a long history of migrating to India for supplemental income, now more than ever families are forced to migrate in order to explore other sources of livelihood for survival (Samarasinghe 2008: 68).

These issues disproportionately affect Nepal’s female population, who, due to the dominant Indo-Aryan culture and Hindu religion, has a subordinate societal status. Male dominance is typically maintained through the institution of early and arranged marriage, where girls are passed from their fathers to their husbands at a young age to insure sexual purity. Patrilocal residence, patrilineal descent, and the prohibition against women inheriting property tend to enforce the social norm that women are dependent on men from birth until death (Samarasinghe 2008: 64).
As second-class citizens, many women suffer from extremely low literacy rates (in 2001, 34.9.5% for females vs. 62.7% for males), high infant and child mortality rates, high maternal mortality rates due to lack of access to maternal health care, and very little bargaining power for resources and benefits at the household level (CIA 2008; Samarasinghe 2008: 64). In addition, as men are forced to leave home to find alternative means of income, women are often forced to subsistence farm for household survival. According to a 2004 UNDP Kathmandu report, this “feminization of agriculture” has led to women in Nepal working an estimated 16 hours a day, which is significantly higher than the global average (Samarasinghe 2008: 67). Although 92% of the female working population is engaged in agriculture, those who work in carpet factories or other industrial sector jobs are often subjected to low-skilled, menial, and repetitive jobs for unequal pay (Samarasinghe 2008: 68).

According to the anti-trafficking organization Shakti Samuha, the combination of poverty, gender inequality, lack of education, domestic violence, loss of livelihoods and political instability have created a situation where women and children in Nepal are extremely vulnerable to trafficking (Shakti Samuha 2008: 3).

Procurement: Eight Case Studies

They build up contacts in places where they know there is poverty and deprivation, where parents cannot afford to be cautious and girls are easily tempted or are desperate for work...The majority of sex workers who come to Calcutta via trafficking are not kidnapped but are lured, coaxed, and cajoled with false promises or some offer of help out of a dead end or a crisis situation. [Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 38]

Women and girls in Nepal are trafficked by means of deceit, sale by family, abduction, seduction or romance, or recruitment by former slaves (Kara 2009: 7).
Although cases of blatant violence are most often covered by the mainstream media, it is far more common for traffickers to trick or lure women and children into the sex industry by capitalizing on their vulnerability and offering false promises of a better life (Apne Aap 2007: 41). Although methods of trafficking vary, below are some case studies that illustrate major trends in the procurement of sex slaves.

**Deceit:** Traffickers often obtain victims through making a false offer of a job, travel, or other income generating opportunity (Kara 2009: 7). Often times, the trafficker will offer a job in a carpet factory in Kathmandu or in a hotel, restaurant, or the film industry in India. Other times, traffickers offer shelter to girls who have run away or are street children, and then sell them into the sex industry (Apne Aap 2007: 76). According to the anti-trafficking organization Sanlaap, 35% of the total number of women and girls trafficked into India were lured by the false promise of marriage or a good job (Sanlaap and Terre des Hommes 10: 2009).

**Case Study One: False Job Offer**

Suntali’s family was very poor. Her two brothers earned their own livings but never gave any support to their two sisters. So Suntali asked her mother if it would be all right if she went to Kathmandu to find a job. Her mother agreed to this idea...In the city she hunted for some sort of job in shops and hotels but no one wanted to employ someone with little education. Eventually she found a job working in a carpet factory. She worked day and night, even working on Saturdays and holidays so she could send money and clothes to her mother. Then she heard there was another factory nearby, which paid higher wages than the factory she was currently working at. So she went to the other factory to ask them if they had a job for her. “You’re in luck,” said the manager. “I need someone to accompany me and my wife to Hetauda, to collect wools for weaving. It will pay very well.” Suntali immediately took this job. She did not think anything strange about it. Especially since he would be traveling with the young wife of the manager. After a long journey the two girls found themselves in Bombay. They had been sold to two different brothels for Rs 35,000 by the manager. [ABC Nepal 1998: 26-27]
An increasingly common method of luring Nepali women and girls into the sex industry is through the false promise of marriage. According to Kara,

In countries where marriage is the only way for a female to secure social acceptance, basic rights, and avoid a lifetime of persecution, false marriage offers are a particularly effective way to acquire new slaves…in Nepal, such offers have become highly sophisticated, as slave traders recruit Indian men to act as prospective grooms, provide testimonials, have phone conversations, and offer pledges of a fairy tale life. [Kara 2009: 7]

Case Study Two: False Marriage Proposal

When I was fifteen years old I was married to a farmer…I was sixteen years old when I became pregnant. I could not work well, therefore my husband did not treat me kindly and so again I returned back to my mother…my husband did not come to find me even though he knew he now had a son, so I stayed with my mother…when my son was four years old I learned that my husband had remarried…My relative introduced me to a man and asked me if I would marry him…”Don’t be silly,” I said. “I can’t get married. I have a son. Besides, I hardly know that man.” But my relative kept insisting. “Come on,” He replied to me. “At least think about it. He lives in Hetauda and is a great person. You should not worry about your son.” I did think about it, and the idea of remarrying gave me hope that perhaps happy days would come again. So I went to a shop with him and after this I cannot remember anything else. When I awoke I found myself in the world of brothels. I had been sold for Rs 30,000. [ABC Nepal 1998: 29]

Case Study Three: False Marriage Proposal

It was Mane’s wife who lured me. She told me about the wealth and comfortable life of the Indian man who was staying with her. “He is very rich,” she told me in a hushed voice. “He even has his own chain of shops in India. He would make a very good husband.” Then she added something that totally shocked me. “He thinks that you are very pretty. Why don’t you marry him? He’s looking for a wife, he told me himself.” I thought she must be joking. A rich Indian man wanted to marry me. I could hardly believe my luck…at last I felt that something good was going to happen in my life again…We made plans to elope…At his home I met his sister. She seemed very friendly and we all chatted together for about fifteen minutes. Then the two men left, telling me that they would come back later and that I should wait here for them. I waited for a long time but they did not come back. It was then that things started to become clear. I was in a brothel, the woman was a brothel-keeper and I had been sold for Rs 35,000. [ABC Nepal 1998: 49-50]
**Sale by Family:** Under conditions of extreme poverty and desperation, some families resort to selling their wives or daughters in the sex industry. Traffickers in Nepal identify the most despondent individuals and make job offers for a child in exchange for a payment that may be as little as twenty or thirty dollars (Kara 2009: 8). Although this may seem like a small amount, in some parts of the world this sum represents one or two month’s income in addition to the monthly remittances the job is meant to provide (Kara 2009: 8).

**Case Study Four: Sale by Family**

Sangeeta lived in the Chitwan District with her mother, stepfather, stepsister, and two brothers...Sangeeta was only eight years old when she was sold by her stepsister into the hands of a brothel keeper in Bombay. As she was too young to work as a prostitute the pimp made her work in a Chinese house as a child-minder. She was brought up well and even taken to China for two years. When she was about twelve years old she was brought back to the brothel and told that from then on she would be working as a prostitute (ABC Nepal 1998: 23)

**Abduction:** Abduction is not as frequent a means of acquiring slaves as the mainstream media portrays it to be (Kara 2009: 8). As mentioned, tricking or luring a women or girl into the sex industry is a far more common method of acquiring slaves than blatant violence. However, the rape and sexual abuse of women as a means to devalue them is also another method to facilitate the trafficking process, and is one way traffickers assert their control of victims (Apne Aap 2007: 41). In addition, the use of sedatives and other drugs in the process of trafficking girls under the pretence of work or marriage has been widely documented.

**Case Study Five: Abduction**

...I met a woman who lived with her husband and a child in a rented house in the village. She told me how she could get more work for me...On the night I went with them they took me to see a movie. During the interval the couple bought me
some juice which I drank. Soon after drinking the juice I started feeling dizzy and I could not watch the movie. I could not remember what happened next. When I awoke I found myself in a big house, I was told that I had been sick and so had been brought to this house…the couple told me to rest and said that they would return soon. But they never came back. Later I was told by the house owner that I had been sold for Rs 35,000. [ABC Nepal 1998: 7]

**Seduction or Romance:** Seducing or romancing women and girls is a very common method utilized by traffickers to obtain sex slaves. After winning their affection and trust, traffickers are more easily able to convince women and girls to accompany them to India or border areas.

CASE STUDY SIX: SEDUCTION OR ROMANCE

I thought he must be the one, the person that I had been looking for my whole life. My heart melted with the affection he showed me…I was so much in love with him that I immediately accepted his proposal of marriage. I went with him to meet his mother and sister in Hetauda…they told us we should go to Birgunj and get married at a temple there…from the border we got a train. I was a bit surprised by this and so I spoke with him, “Where are we going?” I asked. “Oh sorry, “ he replied. “I should have told you. We are just going to Bombay to visit my other sister. We will get married there”…When we reached Bombay we went to a hotel…We got into a taxi and traveled a short distance to his sister’s house. My fiancé then left, saying that he would return later…I stayed up the whole night waiting for that man to return, but he did not come. The next day I asked the woman if she knew where her brother was. The woman laughed, “You stupid girl, “ she said, “That man is not really my brother. Neither is he really going to marry you. You have been sold for Rs 50,000. You are going to stay here and work for me as a prostitute. [ABC Nepal 1998: 37]

**RECRUITMENT BY FORMER SLAVES:** Often times, brothel owners send formerly trafficked women back to their villages in order to recruit other women. These recruiters may be offered a discounts on their debt or even given their freedom for a successful recruit. Others who may have been in slavery for years believe that they can no longer get any other type of work, and so instead work their way up in the business to become traffickers or managers of brothels. Some become recruiters, seeking out women and girls
who have escaped or recently been freed from brothels, promising to find them legitimate work, and then re-trafficking them into the industry. Others go on to create their own successful trafficking rings, and become kingpins themselves (Farr 2005: 26-27). In addition to the financial incentives of become a survivor-turned-trafficker, there are also psychological factors that play into this transition. According to Kara,

Sex slaves employ numerous adaptive mechanisms to survive their ordeals, including drug and alcohol abuse and the morose acceptance that the life of a slave is the best they deserve…I met several slaves who had spent years in sexual enslavement and eventually became allies of the slave owners…I also met former slaves who returned to their home villages to recruit new slaves. These women were dressed in the finest clothes, given a great deal of money, and promised commissions for each new slave they recruited. [Kara 2009: 9]

Case Study Seven: Recruitment by Former Slaves

A few years ago parents of two girls from Murshidabad came to the Bowbazaar red light area in search of their daughters who had gone missing just the day before. They were quickly put in touch with the local club boys and some activists (local residents and leaders who also work for NGOs), who helped them to find out who had recently returned from a trip to Murshidabad. They were finally put in touch with an elderly mashī. The local activists, along with the parents, went to the mashī’s house and found that the two girls were indeed there. They were quickly and quietly handed over. [Sleightholme and Sinha 2002: 39]

Case Study Eight: Trafficking Victim turned Brothel Owner

Urmila was the eighth female from Sindhupalchowk whom I had met inside a Mumbai brothel, and each one of them spoke of hundreds being trafficked from the region…the woman I met right before Urmila was also from Sindhupalchowk, and she opened a rare vista into the lives of Nepalese sex slaves. Her name was Silpa…she had been in Kamathipura for sixteen years and was the gharwali of Urmila’s brothel…“I was given a marriage proposal when I was sixteen…after we were married, my husband sent me with a man who brought me here.” Silpa explained that after working fourteen years in Kamathipura brothels, she was promoted to gharwali by the brothel owner. [Kara 2009: 51-52]
Actors and Stakeholders

Once a trafficker has identified a victim and utilized one of the methods of procurement listed above, s/he will need to transport the victim from the source to the destination area. This is not an action that can be accomplished by one individual trafficker, but rather by a well-established network of stakeholders who profit from the trafficking process along the way. This network including buyers, brothel keepers, moneylenders, transporters, border officials, pimps, hoteliers, and corrupt officials. In fact, in one NHRC study three quarters of the survivors spoke of the active involvement of more than one person in the trafficking ring (Apne Aap 2007: 76). In *Sex Trafficking*, Farr describes the roles of different actors and stakeholders in the trafficking process:

**Recruiter:** Finds and brings women and girls into the industry and sells recruits to brokers or directly to employers, such as a brothel or bar owners or managers;

**Broker (agent):** A go-between or middleman. Brokers typically buy women from a recruiter and then sell them to an employer. There may be more than one broker in the process of one trafficking;

**Contracter:** Organizes and oversees the entire trafficking transaction or transactions, usually a role played by a relatively professional criminal organization or group;

**Employment/Travel Agent:** Arranges for the trip and the alleged purpose (job, tourism, etc). Creates travel plans and descriptions to look legitimate;
**Document thief/Forger:** Arranges for and obtains “legitimate” documentation for travel to another country. This is less common in the case of Nepal-to-India trafficking, where an open border does not require travel documents;

**Transporter (escort, “jockey”):** Accompanies women and girls on the trip to their destination. Transporters may take the woman or girl through one or more transit cities or countries. They usually deliver the woman to a broker at a border or inside a destination country, but sometimes the delivery is directly to the employer;

**Employer:** Purchases and then sells the woman or girl to the customer, and then provides the place of business for sex;

**Enforcer (guard, “roof”):** Provides protection for the place of business from other criminal gangs, from extortionists, and from police or immigration raids. They see that women and girls follow the house rules and do not escape (Farr 2005: 63).

**Transport**

As mentioned, the movement of slaves is typically from poor, rural source areas to wealthier, urban destination areas. Often times, traffickers will make stops along the way at different urban areas or border towns before reaching the final destination.

According to Kara, a more recent trafficking trend is a two-step process in which victims are moved from a rural area to an urban center within the same country, followed by the transportation of a select number of slaves to international destinations. Along the way, women and girls are often raped, tortured, starved, humiliated, and drugged, both for the pleasure of the traffickers and to make them more submissive upon sale (Kara 2009: 12).
The border between India and Nepal consists of 1,850 kilometers of remote forests, plains, and hills, as well as formal border crossings. Since the 1950 Open Border Agreement, individuals with a Nepalese or Indian identity card are able to freely pass between the two countries without passports, visas, or other forms of documentation. As a result, tens of thousands of people pass through the open border for work on a daily basis (Kara 2009: 59, 67).

While this freedom of movement between the two countries is beneficial in terms of labor migration, it also creates a situation where traffickers can easily transport sex slaves across the border. In his research on sex trafficking, Kara describes one formal border crossing as “nothing more than a twenty foot bridge over a shallow stream guarded by dust and cows” (Kara 2009: 68). According to Kara’s informants, *dalals*, or traffickers, frequently cross the border through this bridge. If *dalals* want to avoid “noncomplicit” police officers or avoid paying tribes, they easily pass through unguarded forests or plains or take *chorbatos* (thief roads), secretive routes deep in the forest where it is impossible to patrol. *Dalals* also frequently change their routes in order to keep law enforcement off their trails (Kara 2009: 67-68).

If a *dalal* needs to cross a formal checkpoint to maintain their cover as a legitimate travel or employment agent, they simply pay a bribe to the border official. According to Kara, a seasoned *dalal* pays two hundred fifty rupees ($5.50) for an older woman (not a teenager) and up to one thousand rupees ($22) for a younger one. Due to the frequency of such bribes on the Nepal/India border, bribes have been normalized to 2
percent to 5 percent of the final price of a slave, depending on the experience of the slave trader (Kara 2009: 68).

Formal border towns such as Biratnagar, Bagdora, Birganj, have their own mini red light districts consisting of a few hotels. On a daily basis, Indians and Nepalese are trafficked to either side of the border on a daily basis to work in the hotels (Kara 2009: 68). As a result, many anti-trafficking organizations, such as Maiti Nepal, have created transit shelters and intervention programs at these borders.

Once over the border, victims are taken to Varanasi or Gorakpur, where they were often passed to local *dalals* who then distribute them to other major Indian cities (Kara 2009: 59). As mentioned, the purpose of stopping in a transit center such as Varanasi is to further break the spirit of the trafficked person, reducing the likelihood that the person will fight back or try to escape once they have reached their final destination. *Dalals* can charge up to 20% more for women and girls who have already gone through this “initiation period” and been “broken” (Kara 2009: 59).

Destination

After being tricked, lured, or abducted from their communities and transported to “initiation” locations in Kathmandu, border towns, or abroad, victims of trafficking often find themselves in red light areas in Mumbai, New Delhi, Kolkata, or Chennai. Because this research included work with rehabilitation institutions in Kolkata, the following section will focus on the historical and contemporary trends of prostitution in this city.

*The Changing Face of Kolkata’s Red Light Areas*

Traditionally, prostitution occupied a ritualistic space in Bengali culture. Specific religious festivals and rituals (some of which are still practiced today) cannot be
completed without the participation of a prostitute. For example, during the Hindu festival of Durga Puja, sculptors of the goddess Durga must ask permission of a prostitute to collect a pinch of sacred earth (called punnimati) from her doorstep (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 24). Prostitution was viewed as a legitimate business as well as a ritual necessity, and the relationship between a prostitute and a client was viewed as a legally binding contract. As a result, courts routinely heard tort and breach of contact cases issues by prostitutes against their clients. In addition, there was traditionally little stigma attached to doing business with the prostitute community, and individuals in high society, such as Nobel Laureate Rabindranath Tagore’s father, rented houses and rooms to prostitutes without issue. Overall, while prostitution was not an occupation that was socially celebrated, prostitutes occupied an accepted space as contributing members of mainstream Bengali society (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 24).

In the 19th century, the demand for prostitutes by the British military and administrators and Bengali gentry and tradesman grew rapidly. Kolkata gained a reputation as a city where women without male protectors could find work, and widows, deserted wives, victims of family violence, and women living in poverty began to flock to the city in search of opportunity. Although their services were welcomed by the British and wealthy Bengalis, clientele from both groups had a vested interest in asserting their control over prostitutes. According to Sinha and Dasgupta, “Each had a different reason to sequester and control prostitution – the British to civilize the natives and shield its military from sexually transmitted diseases and the Bengali gentry to indicate superior moral principles of the nation and to refute the charges maltreatment of women in the
family” (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 26). As each group asserted their control, the view that prostitutes were legitimate members of mainstream society began to dramatically change (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 25-26).

In the mid 19th century, prostitution existed throughout the city of Kolkata with the women grouping themselves in certain areas by religion and ethnicity. For example, European and Anglo-Indian prostitutes lived and worked in central Kolkata in the areas of Free School Street and Elliot Road, the original British settlement area known as “White Town” (Chattopadhyay 2006: 9). However, the concern by the British that the “naturally diseased bodies” of the native population were infecting British troops with syphilis and gonorrhea caused them to attempt to quarantine certain classes of prostitutes in specific areas. A series of regulations, including the Cantonment Act and the Contagious Diseases Act pushed prostitution out of middle class neighborhoods and into localized areas to prevent the spread of venereal disease to the British military and Bengali gentry (Sinha and DasGupta 2009: 12-13). According to Sinha and Dasgupta, “By the turn of the twentieth century, prostitutes had all but lost their rights to seek legal recourse and attend public functions. Slowly but surely, they had been turned into perverts, sinners, and criminals” (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 26).

After independence, many male migrants were able to find work in industry, while women were relegated to work in the informal sector in small industries or as domestic workers. Due to the lack of work opportunities for women, the sex ratio became highly unbalanced, with 580 women to every 1,000 men. This created an even
larger demand for prostitution, both on the part of men seeking sexual partners and women seeking alternative work for survival (Sinha 2002: 17-18).

In addition, the 1947 Partition of India and the creation of West Pakistan (modern day Pakistan) and East Pakistan (modern day Bangladesh) created a massive population of displaced communities who were also in desperate need of work. Although Kolkata itself is known for its massive widespread poverty (today an estimated 1 million people live in slums, and approximately 100,000 children live on the street), it became, and remained, the destination for impoverished migrants from the neighboring rural states of Bihar, Orissa, and Madhya Pradesh, as well as from the neighboring countries of Nepal and Bangladesh (Sinha 2002: 17-18).

According to Sinha and Dasgupta, the majority of visible and street level prostitutes are from rural and suburban areas. These migrants from surrounding areas compete with established brothels through offering less expensive street based prostitution. Such street based prostitutes are often homeless and destitute, and are willing to serve clients for very small exchanges. This competition has led to a significant drop in income for brothel-based sex workers, who comprise the majority of sex workers in Kolkata. As a result, the increasing number of women migrating to Kolkata for work and eventually falling into the sex industry has driven down the price of sex, making it less possible for women to survive off of income from sex work alone. Whereas in the past prostitution may have offered a level of security and a path out of poverty, with the exception of the very young and very beautiful who are in high demand from wealthy clientele, women in prostitution in Kolkata today are often destitute.
Many of Kolkata’s Red Light Areas have existed for hundreds of years. Unlike other rapidly expanding cities with significant red light districts, such as Mumbai, modern times have not changed the location or practices of Kolkata’s oldest brothels, and many operate today as they did at the time of their founding hundreds of years ago (Terre des Hommes 2005: 15).
**Sonagachi:** Sonagachi is by far the largest (and possibly most notorious and well known) red light area of Kolkata. With an estimated 9,000-19,000 sex workers living and working permanently in the area, it is one of the busiest red light areas in the city, and having been founded over 200 years ago, it is also one of Kolkata’s oldest (Terre des Hommes 2005:13). By the 1830s, Sonagachi had grown into the dominant red light district it is today, mainly by servicing Bengali gentry, soldiers, and administrators of the British Raj. During the 1800s, patronizing prostitutes was a popular pastime of the wealthy, and a way for men to assert their dominant masculinity (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 13)

Located in the north of Kolkata, Sonagachi is surrounded by a predominately Muslim population. The area consists of numerous small lanes winding among old buildings, and most of these buildings have small shops on the ground floor and brothels on the first and second floors. Prostitution is more visible in Sonagachi than in other red light districts in the city, and pimps can often be seen standing in the doorways of brothels at night. Sonagachi is the most expensive and highly organized red light district in Kolkata, and women are only allowed to reside in the area if they are brought in by pimps. These pimps bring customers to prostitutes and receive a commission for their work.

Sex workers in Sonagachi are free to move throughout the area and socialize when they are not working, and prostitution is evident during both in the day and in the evening (Terre des Hommes 2005: 19). The majority of sex workers in Sonagachi are poor women and girls who wait in the streets to attract customers, but there are also
prominent houses, such as Neelkamal and Nandarani, who have indoor prostitutes and stable renters. Many of these homes are owned by wealthy, influential, and “respectable” Kolkata citizens, who in addition to owning legitimate retail and transport businesses, are kingpin traffickers of women and girls from Uttar Pradesh to Sonagachi (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 14).

Currently, women from Bengal, Bangladesh, Uttar Pradesh, Bihar, Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan, Gujarat, Andhra Pradesh and Tamil Nadu are living and working as sex workers in Sonagachi. In addition, despite community-based intervention efforts, Sonagachi has the highest concentration of chhukris, or under-age, debt-bonded, enslaved and/or trafficked girls, in Kolkata.

Kalighat: At over 200 years old, Kalighat is also one of the oldest red light districts in Kolkata (Terre des Hommes 2005: 19). The red light area was originally established to service visiting pilgrims to the nearby Kali Ma temple, the goddess of power and destruction and Kolkata’s most important deity and namesake. The red light area is located in a few lanes of old city streets leading up to the temple, and is imbedded in a traditional Bengali neighborhood. In order to show respect to Kali Ma and visiting pilgrims, sex workers at Kalighat are only allowed to wear saris. As a result, they are indistinguishable from the larger local population (Terre des Hommes 2005:25).

There are very few chhukri sex workers in Kalighat, and this is due to the difficulty of hiding such persons from the police (Terre des Hommes 2005: 25,36). Of the underage sex workers that do reside in Kalighat, many are runaways from the more restricted and brutal red light area of Khidderpore (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 30).
addition, focus groups conducted by the organization Sanlaap revealed that adult sex
workers in Kalighat are vigilant in protecting young girls from prostitution, and have
organized to eliminate exploitative practices such as the chhukri system and human
trafficking in the area. Despite their relative success, these practices continue to exist on
a small scale (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 89).

Women and girls become involved in sex work in Kalighat in a number of ways. The Kali temple is a popular location for young couples to elope, and many girls are
lured away from home by traffickers offering a quick marriage. After conducting a mock
wedding ceremony, traffickers then promptly sell women and girls to local brothels. In
addition, some legitimate marriages often lead to sex work when the husband, fearful of
confronting his family after the elopement, promptly abandons his wife at the temple.
Due to the cultural stigma of running away from home and losing one’s virginity, women
and girls may not have the option of returning home to their families, and may turn to sex
work our of economic necessity. Sex workers in Kalighat receive the lowest income of
all red light districts in Kolkata (Sinha and Dasgupta 2005: 76).

**Khidderpore:** Khidderpore is located in south Kolkata between the area of
Munshigunj and Watgunj, and is a few hundred yards from the Hoogly River.
Khidderpore was originally established to service sailors and merchant seaman at the
nearby docks, but the closing of these docks and the opening of the new port of Haldiya
has led to a decline of prostitution in this area. Khidderpore is in a relaxed, quiet area and
consists mainly of small one-story pinjaras (small, relatively open working class
brothels) (Terre des Hommes 2005: 19). The area was once known for its high
concentration of child prostitutes, and focus groups conducted by the organization Sanlaap revealed that child prostitutes in Khidderpore lived in harsher conditions than other red light areas in Kolkata, mainly due to their treatment by malkins (the owners of the brothel) and the demands of clients (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009:67). Due to increased police vigilance, the existence of chhukris in Khidderpore has dramatically decreased over the years to the point of virtual nonexistence.

Baghbazaar: Located in central Kolkata, Baghbazaar grew in response to the wealthy Bengali gentry of the late 19th century. Many of these clients were absentee landlords who accumulated their wealth through renting farmland in surrounding rural areas. Through spending exorbitant amount of money on lavish sprawling homes, drinking, and the purchase of prostitutes, these wealthy men created what came to be known as “babu culture.” These men often patronized the same prostitutes and provided for them financially to ensure an exclusive relationship. Today, sex workers refer to men who are their returning customers and who support them financially as their babu (Sinha and Dasgupta 2005: 25).

Prostitution in Kolkata Today

In addition to driving down the price of sex, the influx of women and girls from surrounding areas has created an ethnic hierarchy amongst sex workers. In Kolkata, agrawalis, or women and girls from the Indian state of Uttar Pradesh, are considered the most desirable by clients and are offered at the highest price. Nepalis and West Bengalis are typically priced in the middle, and women and girls from other Indian states and Bangladesh comprise the majority of lower-priced sex workers. Currently, women and
girls from West Bengal and Bangladesh comprise the majority of sex workers in Kolkata, followed by those from Nepal, followed by those from nearby Indian states, including Orissa, Madhya Pradesh, and Bihar (Terre des Hommes 2005: 16).

According to Prajna Paramita Dutta Ray Chaudari, in 2000 an estimated 23,000 sex workers resided in Kolkata, not including “college girls” or “flying prostitutes” who occasionally and independently sell sex for additional income. However, the Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee (DMSC), an activist organization founded by and for sex workers, claimed in 2002 that it had 60,000 members who were sex workers in Kolkata. These sex workers live in different locations throughout Kolkata, have different work environments, pay structures and rates, degrees of freedom and autonomy, and ethnic, religious, and socioeconomic backgrounds. Because sex work is not a uniform occupation but a variety of practices carried out in a multitude of contexts, there is no one description of the experiences and lifestyle of a “typical” Kolkata sex worker. However, the following sections attempt to describe the major trends of sex work occurring in contemporary Kolkata, in order to provide a better picture of the experiences of many trafficked women and girls in Kolkata’s red light districts.

**Brothel Typology: Tenancies, Bungalows, and Pinjaras**

There are generally three types of brothels that exist in Kolkata today: bungalows, pinjaras, and tenancies. A bungalow refers to a brothel on the first or second floor of a flat, typically with a shop located on the ground floor. Bungalows can be distinguished from other brothel types based on their emphasis on security, which usually indicates the presence of confined chhukris. Bungalows are typically locked during all hours of the
day, and often times only known customers are allowed within the “channel gate,” or sliding iron accordion gate located at the entrance (Terre des Hommes 2005: 17).

Bungalows typically serve middle class clients. The layout often includes a sitting room with couches, chairs, and a TV, and drinks are available for purchase. When a client arrives, women and girls line up for selection. According to Terre des Hommes, the atmosphere of a bungalow is one of security and control attributable to the illegality of under-age and forced prostitution (Terre des Hommes 2005:17).

The second brothel type, the pinjara, is named after the Hindi word for “cage.” The name does not refer to the confinement of sex workers, but rather to the thief protection bars in the windows. In fact, women and girls in pinjaras enjoy relatively more freedom than their counterparts in bungalows. Pinjaras primarily serve working class clientele, and may range from one or two room huts with mud walls and tin roofs, to old British Raj buildings, to ground floor flats of modern buildings. Pinjaras are distinguishable from bungalows in that there is a lack of security and control. Women are often free agents, and spend their free time socializing in the local community and with clients (Terre des Hommes 2005: 16-17). Terre des Hommes describes the atmosphere of pinjaras as “relaxed, casual, and efficient” (Terre des Hommes 2005: 17). Women solicit from open doors, and clients enter their rooms directly. Often times these rooms are not actually separate spaces, but are divided from other workers and clients only by curtains. In contrast to bungalows, little time is spent conversing with and selecting sex workers, the sex act is brief (10-15 minutes), and the prices are low.
Pinjaras also serve as a social location, and clients and local men pass time in pinjaras eating and chatting when they are not purchasing sex (Terre des Hommes 2005: 17).

The third system, tenancy, refers to a system where free-agent sex workers use the facilities of an established brothel by paying the brothel owner fixed daily or monthly fees for room rent, utilities, and payments to the police (Terre des Hommes 2005: 16). These establishments are often simple pinjaras with older, independent women. In recent years, some brothel areas that traditionally kept chhukris (such as Kolkata's Kidderpore) have scaled down to the tenancy system due to police raids and pressure from other local organizations (Terre des Hommes 2005: 31).

Although there can be significant variation in these brothel types, generally speaking bungalows are more expensive and have chhukris and young free agents sex workers, and pinjaras have older, inexpensive, free agent sex workers (Terre des Hommes 2005: 17). As women and girls transition from bungalows to pinjaras to tenancies, they experience greater autonomy and ownership over their earnings.

Sex Work Typology: Chhukris, Adhiyas, Shadhins, and Second Generation Prostitution

Generally speaking, three types of sex workers exist in Kolkata today: chhukris, adhiyas, and shadhins. Each of these sex worker types are grouped according to their pay structure and their relationships with the larger sex work community, including brothel managers, property owners, clients, pimps, and traffickers. In addition, over time many sex workers move from one category to the next as they grow older and earn increased autonomy. Consequently, while the focus of this thesis is on the experiences of
rescued and rehabilitated chhukris, it is important to include an in-depth description of other prostitution types as well.

Many trafficked girls are not rescued or released from red light areas before the age of 18. While there is now a general social consensus that underage prostitution is unacceptable, a shift in the perception of a trafficking victim occurs on the day of a woman’s 18th birthday. At this juncture, it no longer matters whether a woman was trafficked against her will at the age of 5: She is a legal adult, and in the eyes of the law and of society her participation in prostitution does not involve coercion. She has survived to reach the legal age of consent, and her involvement in prostitution in now perceived as her choice.

Often times, trafficked women and girls give birth to children in the red light areas. In my interviews with anti-trafficking professionals, many respondents mentioned that the daughters of women in prostitution face a number of risks associated with living in a red light area, including an increased risk of rape, sexual abuse, and the stigma associated with pre-marital sex. These experiences, coupled with the lack of exposure to other forms of livelihood, create a high possibility that she will eventually join the sex industry herself. In addition, sons of women in prostitution “learn the trade” at a very early age, and aspire to become pimps, traffickers, or dasas (local thugs) themselves. In this way, the system of trafficking can be understood as self-perpetuating, and not only includes underage trafficked girls, but also adult women in prostitution and sons and daughters born in red light areas. While in legal terms it is important to not conflate a
trafficked 10 year old with an adult woman in prostitution, successful interventions should consider the entire lifecycle of the trafficking industry.

**Chhukris:** The Bengali word *chhukri* (*tsukri* in Hindi) can be translated in English as “girl at one's bidding” (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 11). The term refers to a child or young woman in slavery and debt bondage, and is the typical entry point for trafficked women and girls into Kolkata's sex industry (Terre des Hommes 2005:3; Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 11). Typically, a *malkin* or *mashi* (brothel manager), buys a *chhukri* from traffickers, “prepares” them for the trade, and confiscate all the *chhukri’s* earnings until she has paid back the price of her purchase, as well as other fees incurred during her presence in the brothel (such as food, clothing, police bribes, etc.) (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 11). Due to these additional expenses incurred, a *chhukri* may have to repay 2 to 3 times her purchase price in order to secure her release (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 11).

From the standpoint of a brothel owner, the *chhukri* system is the most profitable system of prostitution. Brothel owners can earn 4 to 20 times the purchase price of a *chhukri*, depending on the length of servitude, amount of overhead, and number of clients served per day. According to one study by Terre des Hommes, the price of purchasing a Nepali *chhukri* is 60,000-70,000 Indian Rupees (approximately $1,360-$1,590). However, a *chhukri* serving 4 clients a day at RS 200 each will make RS 24,000 a month, recovering their purchase price in just 5 ½ months (Terre des Hommes 2005:25). In addition, brothel owners and managers are able to sell the virginity of a *chhukri* for several thousand rupees, can ask for extra money from “special clients” who prefer girls
under the age 14, and can force a *chhukri* to have anal, oral, and unprotected sex for an extra fee to the customer (Terre des Hommes 2005: 29).

In order to break them into submission, new *chhukris* are often subjected to extreme mental, physical, and sexual abuse. Women and girls in the *chuukri* system have reported being beaten, starved, and having chilli powder or harsh objects put in their vaginas, a typical punishment for women and girls in prostitution in Kolkata. Brothel owners and managers also may invite local thugs, or *dadas*, to beat and sexual assault a new *chhukri* into subservience (Sinha and Dasgupta 2009: 190).

Although increased vigilance and organization by adult women in prostitution has decreased the use of *chhukris* in Kolkata's brothels, the practice still exists. The *chhukri* system is almost extinct in the Kalighat red light district, and there is no evidence of *chhukris* in Kheridore any longer, although they were quite prevalent in this area just 10 years ago. However, the existence of *chhukris* in Sonagachi and other red light areas is common knowledge. Although adult sex workers have organized interventions to prevent the prostitution of *chhukris* under 15, chhukris ages 16 and up have not been the target of such interventions. Often times, these *chhukris* are either kept in confinement, or dressed in clothes and makeup and given fake papers to pass as 18 in order to avoid police intervention (Terre des Hommes 2005: 25-27).

The majority of sex workers in Kolkata today are not *chhukris*, but this is less due to intervention efforts and more due to sex workers moving up out of the *chhukri* system and into other systems of prostitution. In one study by Sanlaap, 29% of adults and 43% of girls under 18 interviewed stated that they began sex work as a *chhukri*, however, only
1% of the adults and 14.8% of the girls under 18 were still *chhukris* at the time of the study. According to Terre des Hommes, a *chhukri* in Kolkata spends an average of 2-8 years in bonded labor, but after 7-8 years they are less desirable to customers, provide less income to brothel owners, and may be a burden due to HIV/AIDS. At this time, a *chhukri* is usually given her freedom. But, as mentioned, a former *chhukri* rarely has the ability or will to return home, and instead seeks greater autonomy and control over income through moving into a more independent form of sex work: the *adhiya* system (Terre des Hommes 2005: 26-29).

**Adhiyas:** In Hindi, the word *adhiya* means “one half.” Under the *adhiya* system of prostitution, free agent sex workers pay half of their fees to brothel owners for use of the facilities (Terre des Hommes 2005: 4). As mentioned, *adhiyas* are often former *chhukris* who have earned their freedom, and thus control over their mobility, income, and ability to negotiate fees and sex practices. Because *adhiyas* are often older, they typically charge lower fees and have working class clients. However, *adhiyas* often supplement their income by taking on *chhukris* of their own (Terre des Hommes 2005: 30, 31). According to one study by Sanlaap, of 600 adult sex workers interviewed, 32% kept *chhukris* or *adhiyas* of their own. According to Terre des Hommes, “For many sex workers and *tsukris*, 'having a few girls' is a hope for the future, when age reduces client demand, return home is unwelcome, and other work options are generally limited to becoming a servant in a brothel, begging, and minor peddling” (Terre des Hommes 2005: 28). If *adhiyas* want more control over their income or are less saleable to brothel owners, they may enter the tenancy situation describes above.
**Shadhins:** A final type of sex work can be described as “flying” “free agent” or “independent” sex work, or in Bengali, *shadhin*. *Shadhins* are sex workers who commute to and from their homes to work in rented rooms and brothels. Like *adhiyas*, if *shadhins* are able to save enough money or secure a loan, they often purchase *chhukris* for their own profits (Terre des Hommes 2005: 31).

Rescue, Rehabilitation, Return

**Rescue**

Once trafficked into red light areas, women and girls are rarely able to ever leave prostitution. Escape is an extremely rare occurrence, since trafficked persons are often confined both physically and psychologically. Physically, they are often guarded by older prostituted women and girls, pimps, *gharwalis*, *dadas*, or local boys and are often put behind barred gates and windows. Psychologically, they have witnessed or heard of punishments dealt to others who attempted to escape and failed, or have been threatened that their family will be punished if they succeed in escaping (Kara 2009: 15; Terre des Hommes 2005: 39-40). In addition, trafficked women and girls may not know where they, how to speak the local language, or where to go to find help. Of those who do escape, many become lost and voluntarily return. According to Terre des Hommes, many of the girls who return state that they could not go to the police because they believed that they would be arrested and returned to the brothel (Terre des Hommes 2005: 39). Consequently, there are only a few ways that young women escape sex slavery: They can be released on the condition that they return home to recruit new victims; they can transition out of *chukkri* status and become an *adhiya* or eventually a *gharwali*; or they may be evicted to the streets if they are no longer profitable (Kara 2009: 55).
According to one study by Terre des Hommes, using formerly trafficked women and girls as recruiters for new trafficked girls is a fairly common occurrence. According to respondents, some survivors are given a significant amount of money, Rs. 7,000-20,000 or $160-$450 as well as gold, and told to return to Nepal. Upon arrival, survivors are expected to use this money to entice other young girls to join them in the city (Terre des Hommes 2005: 40). Kara also observed this phenomenon in his own research.

According to Kara,

I also met former slaves who returned to their home villages to recruit new slaves. These women were dressed in their finest clothes, given a great deal of money, and promised commissions for each new slave they recruited. After extolling to their prospective targets the benefits of working as an entertainer in Mumbai or Bangkok, they often returned with several new slaves. [Kara 2009: 9]

As mentioned, some survivors are encouraged to move up in the prostitution system after paying off their “debt” by becoming adhiyas, and eventually gharwalis (Terre des Hommes 2005: 41). According to Dewey and Kara, this move can be interpreted as a survival strategy on the part of trafficked women. In order to cope with situations of extreme abuse and exploitation, some trafficked women and girls adopt the belief that prostitution is either all that they deserve or preferable to other options available to them. According to Kara, many trafficked women and girls after years of exploitation, eventually become allies with traffickers and slaveholders (Kara 2009: 9). For example, Silpa, a former slave and current gharwali told Kara, “These girls are safer here than their homes where their father will beat them and their uncle will make sex with them. Here, no harm can come to them unless they misbehave. You see, men are weak. We can take what we want if we give them the prize in our legs. This is the lesson I teach my girls” (Kara 2009: 52).
The decision to become a part of the trafficking cycle may not only be a psychological coping mechanism, but also a strong economic incentive. According to Dewey, nearly all gharwalis were sex workers at one point in their lives, and were able to leave prostitution only by protecting their own self interests, staying in the industry long enough to make social connections, and eventually procuring their own group of trafficked girls (Dewey 2008: 134). As gharwalis, formerly trafficked women are not only able to enjoy a position of relative power but are able to provide security for their old age when they are no longer able to survive off of prostitution (Dewey 2008: 134).

Another way trafficked women and girls leave the brothel is through eviction. If a trafficked woman or girl is unattractive, unwilling or unable to satisfy customers, or if she becomes HIV positive, she will often be evicted from the brothel (Terre des Hommes 2005: 40). As mentioned, because the cost of trafficking a sex slave is so cheap brothels have little incentive to take care of their investment through medical care or STD preventative measures. According to Bales, “After that, most of the profit has been drained from the girl and it is more cost effective to discard her and replace her with someone fresh. No brothel wants to take on the responsibility of a sick and dying girl” (Bales 2002: 220).

Rehabilitation

A more recent phenomenon has been the rescue of underage trafficked girls through brothel raids conducted by local police and NGOs. By and large, these are the girls that who are eventually placed in rehabilitation homes. When an underage survivor is rescued from a brothel, she is considered a “child in need of protection” under India’s
Juvenile Justice Act. According to Indian law, rescued survivors are put in police custody until they can be brought in front of a judicial magistrate, who then decides whether she should be returned home or brought to a rehabilitation home. Often times, survivors are directed to a rehabilitation home so that they can be held long enough to testify against their traffickers. In this case, a Child Welfare Committee manages the survivor’s case and decides where she should be held (Site 1, Resp. 3).

The policy requiring at least one Child Welfare Committees per state was established in 2003. Child Welfare Committees are required to have at least some women members and people qualified in child protection. However, one respondent, who sits on a Child Welfare Committee, mentioned that Committee members are often elected by politicians and are typically unqualified and inexperienced. Although Committees are intended to be “child friendly,” a lack of compensation for committee members and a lack of infrastructure (such as a safe, accessible meeting place) means that Child Welfare Committees are rarely able or willing to meet the best interests of the child. In addition, although Child Welfare Committees were mandated in 2003, no Committees had actually been established until 2008. With the assistance of local NGOs, 18 Child Welfare Committees are now operating in West Bengal and are working to improve existing flaws in the system. For example, one NGO has provided space for Committees to meet in their rehabilitation home so that survivors will not have to be continuously transported long distances (Site 1, Resp. 3).

Once a survivor enters a rehabilitation home, her experiences vary greatly depending on her own personal circumstances (such as if her family can be identified or
Rehabilitation organizations vary greatly in the kinds of services they offer survivors, the amount of time they require (or can permit) a survivor to stay in the institution, as well as the extent to which they involve the survivor, her family, and her community in her long term plan. For example, some organizations have a family identification process, where NGO workers travel to a survivor’s home to assess her family’s income level, occupation, and level of support. Rehabilitation organizations then produce a report that is presented to the child’s Child Welfare Committee, who then determines whether she and her family are eligible for reintegration. However, at any point the court may order a survivor to be sent home to her family, regardless of the position of the Child Welfare Committee or the findings of the NGO (Site 1, Resp. 3).

Even after rehabilitation, the incidence of survivors reintegrating with their families and home communities has been low due, mainly due to stigma and discrimination and a lack of income generating options (Kempadoo 2005: 18; Terre des Hommes 2005: 6). Due to the strong stigma against sex workers in South Asia, returning survivors of trafficking often face rejection from their families and communities, as well as harassment and possibly rape (Kempadoo 2005: 136). Formerly trafficked women and girls have reported that they have been forbidden to enter their family’s house or to share food with their neighbors (Terre des Hommes 2005: vii). The involuntary nature of the survivor’s entry into prostitution does not lessen this stigma, nor does the involvement of family or community member in the recruitment process (Samarasingh 2008: 82).
An unintended consequence of increased HIV/AIDS awareness is that now returning survivors of sex trafficking are stigmatized twice: First for being a prostitute, and second for the assumption that they have HIV/AIDS (Samarasingh 2008: 82). Currently, the association of HIV with women and girls in prostitution is so significant that any Nepali woman returning from India runs the risk of being stigmatized as HIV positive, regardless of whether or not she was engaged in the sex industry in India (Samarasingh 2008: 83). In addition, a lack of information and preponderance of misinformation has resulted in the misconception that HIV/AIDS can be spread by the touch, sneeze, or stare of an infected person (Kara 2005: 76). Consequently, survivors of trafficking are often driven out of their home communities out of fear that they might infect other residents (Samarasingh 2008: 82).

Due to this double stigma, many survivors of trafficking find that they must hide their past in order to move on with their lives. For example, some Nepali survivors in the Terre des Hommes study were able to convince their communities that they had worked in beauty parlors, factories, or shops in India, and thus were able to reintegrate with their families and communities and get married. However, some of these women were eventually thrown out of their homes when their husbands discovered the truth about their past (Terre des Hommes 2005: 41).

Even if survivors are welcomed back into their home communities, they still face significant reintegration challenges. Most often, the conditions of poverty that initially pressured survivors to leave home have remained unchanged. When survivors return home without means of economic support, they may find themselves in the situation
where they once again must migrate for survival (Kempadoo 2005: xvii). In the process, many survivors of trafficking are re-trafficked. According to Kara,

The fates of an increasing number of sex slaves involve re-trafficking two, three, or more times. Because most victims that escape are forced to return to the same conditions of poverty, domestic violence, social bias, or lack of economic opportunity that precipitated their initial trafficking, many return to the slave traders who originally deceived them in search of a better deal the second time around. Alternatively, many repatriated victims are recruited, deceived, seduced, or abducted into a second or third round of slavery, each time by a different slave trader. [Kara 2009: 16]

Alternatively, other survivors of trafficking may enter prostitution voluntarily as a consequence of economic necessity combined with the lowered inhibitions they have toward sex work (Dewey 2008: 159)

When faced with the above challenges of community reintegration, many survivors of trafficking choose not to return home. According to Kara, virtually no survivors of trafficking from Sindhupalchok (a significant source area of trafficked girls in Nepal) ever return to their home villages. While some eventually make their way back to Kathmandu, the majority remain in the sex industry for the remainder of their lives (Kara 2005: 76). The Terre des Hommes study revealed similar trends in survivors’ attitudes towards reintegration. While the majority of the Nepali survivors of trafficking in the study stated that they maintained a strong love for Nepal, they were realistic that it was not possible for them to ever return home due to exclusion from their families, stigmatization by their communities, and their inability to earn a living (Terre des Hommes 2005: 45).
CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

Rehabilitation: In Theory and in Practice

While there is a general consensus that survivors should receive rehabilitation services, definitions of rehabilitation tend to be subjective, and best practices of facilitating the process of rehabilitation continue to be contested. There is continued debate over where to draw the line between providing assistance and creating dependency, providing mandatory care and violating rights and privacy, and creating protective environments and inhibiting freedom and autonomy.

The issues related to survivor rehabilitation and repatriation gained widespread attention in 1996, when a police raid in a red light area of Mumbai led to the arrest of 538 minor girls (under 17) working in brothels. Two hundred and eighteen of the girls were from Nepal, and the rest were from various states in India. NGOs in Nepal received word that the girls were being held in remand homes and rehabilitation centers run by NGOs throughout Maharashtra. In response, seventeen Nepalese NGOs met with the Prime Minister of Nepal and demanded that the girls be repatriated to their home country. The Prime Minister verbally committed to the return of the girls within one week, but after one month no action by the government had been taken.

Meanwhile, NGOs in Nepal continued to receive reports that some Nepalese girls had died in remand homes and about thirty girls had broken windows and run away. Taking matters into their own hands, the Nepalese NGOs contacted Indian NGOs and independently negotiated the return of 124 Nepalese girls to Nepal (Ghimire 13-15).
Nearly half of the remaining girls refused to return to Nepal due to the belief that they would be rejected by their families (McGirk, 1997). The remaining girls were distributed amongst 7 rehabilitation homes, including ABC/Nepal, CWIN, Maiti Nepal, and WOREC, all included in this study.

This event raised several concerns from a human rights perspective: first, the fact that survivors had died in and escaped from remand and rehabilitation homes raised serious concerns over the level of care being provided; second, the fact that survivors were being held against their will in homes for criminals was widely criticized as “re-victimization”; and third, the fact that so many of the survivors did not want to return home due to the fear of rejection raised the issue of whether the rehabilitation process should stop at the level of the victim. As NGOs, social activists, and academics looked closer into the issue of the rehabilitation of survivors of sex trafficking, other serious criticisms arose. These include:

- Rehabilitation institutions were typically providing little more than craft activities, residence and food;
- Few institutions questioned the social and psychological problems resulting from prolonged institutionalization;
- Survivors were being held without their permission and/or the permission of their families;
- Participation by survivors was minimal and their voices concerning their rehabilitation were unheard;
• Institutions lacked confidentiality or privacy policies, and survivors were being observed by donors or experts and photographed by media without their permission;

• The focus of institutions was on psychosocial rehabilitation, and did not address the primary challenges of community reintegration; mainly, social stigma and a lack of livelihood opportunities (Frederick 2005: 141-142).

As international funding agencies became aware of these problematic practices, they demanded significant changes in the ways rehabilitation institutions approach their work. These shifts include:

• The phasing out of institutional approaches in favor of community-based programs;

• The shift from competition to collaboration amongst stakeholders, including governments and NGOs;

• Balancing psychosocial and mental health approaches with “empowerment” approaches;

• The rejection of charity-based approaches in favor of rights-based approaches;

However, my research with eight rehabilitation institutions has revealed that while organizations have fully adopted the discourse of the above shifts, implementing these shifts has been problematic in a number of ways. These gaps between theory and practice are described below.
Community-Based Programs: In Theory

I want to reintegrate them into the family and society so that people will accept them casually and slowly. It is better that they are reintegrated into their family so that they will have hope for the future and a positive attitude for society and their own life. Because whenever they stay in the organization they will have an inferiority complex and morality complex…because my family my society rejected me…because they have a stigmatized mind. They can do many things, but they won’t develop a positive attitude towards family and society. [Site 8, Resp. 1]

In theory, rehabilitation institutions have initiated a shift away from long-term institutionalization and towards community-based rehabilitation models. One of the primary reasons for initiating this shift is the high incidence of survivors being re-trafficked or returning to the sex industry due to stigma, rejection from family and community, and a lack of realistic livelihood options. A recent study by Sanlaap, entitled Real Life Real Options, stressed the importance of networking with community-based organizations in order to provide better follow up services and sustained community reintegration. According to one respondent from the organization,

For a while it was only long-term institutional care. Real Life Real Options reflected back on the children who had been restored in the past 4 or 5 years, and there were stark realities that came up during this. Most of the children could not be followed up. They weren’t there. We are trying to look into community based reintegration through the partnership of community based organizations, (CBOs)...We trying to develop a training manual for CBOs and we will be trained on reintegration and follow up practices. We are trying to look into how follow up can happen.

One institution stated that they have recently started to network with stakeholders in the community in order to insure that survivors do not face re-victimization after returning home. After listing the recent campaigns of the program, one project coordinator mentioned,
The last part is linking up all the stakeholders. There is [sic] the survivors, the CBO, police, health services, training institutes. So when our survivors are being restored back to the village we are tying build a network where the survivors can come and claim their rights. [Site 1 Resp. 4]

Other respondents echoed concerns that the rehabilitation practices of the past failed to look beyond institutional care, and that the abrupt transition from institution to community returned women and girls to situations of extreme vulnerability and risk. Through partnering with community-based programs, rehabilitation organizations hope to reduce this risk through not only facilitating the transition of the survivor into the community but also sensitizing the community at large. According to one respondent,

Civil society should educate the family members and the society that there should not be discrimination of the trafficked girl and woman. The whole society and the families are educated from one cultural perspective, one morality, one truth, and they do not accept the trafficked person. Rather than only giving counseling to the trafficked woman and girl the way is to educate the whole society, culture and the people and family members and civil society and ethnic groups. If they have a sort of common, round-table talk with this community...that will be good process. [Site 8, Resp. 1]

In addition to sensitization, organizations hope that community-based programs will help create ownership of the trafficking issue at the local level. Many respondents repeated the belief that their work will only be sustainable when it is taken out of the hands of institutions in Kolkata and Kathmandu and into the hands of local leaders. As stated by one respondent from Sanlaap,

Wherever we are working in the community, Sanlaap’s long-term goal is that the program will be taken on by the communities themselves... It is not enough that Sanlaap keeps on working. The community has to want the program as well, because they also have to generate their own safety net around their own children. So one day Sanlaap will be able to come back and leave the program in the hands of the community.
Overall, most respondents acknowledged the need to extend rehabilitation work outside of the institution and into the local communities. However, when asked how this could be done in practice, many of the organizations discussed more challenges than successes.

Community-Based Programs: In Practice

While in theory the shift from institutional to community-based programs should help facilitate the process of psychosocial rehabilitation, in practice this shift has been difficult to implement. One of the first challenges for rehabilitation professionals is letting go of the power and control they have over survivors’ lives in the institution. Indeed, the four walls of the institution create an environment that protects the survivor from the challenges of the outside world, creating a safe space where rehabilitation workers can focus on the work of healing and empowerment. Respondents working in community-based programs stated that in their work, the progress of the individual is often set back by the violence she may be experiencing at home. Consequently, the work often takes more time and patience:

The first challenge is community rehabilitation. In institutional rehabilitation we can keep the girl within the place. You can see them 24 hours and motivate them 24 hours. But the challenge is they are kept in one place behind a locked gate so they have lost their freedom…Community rehabilitation may take 3 months, 10 months, three years, because they are seeing the violence every day. So if you break your patience you will never reach that ultimate goal. [Site 2, Resp. 2]

A respondent from another organization also expressed frustration over the lack of control over survivors in community-based programs:

That whole process, rehabilitation, rescue…these are challenging situations. In institutional care you have a controlled situation, but in the community you don’t have control, even if you have CBOs. Maybe you have a police officer who is there or a panchayat member who is involved in the process and cares about the
protection of the child. Reintegration is the most challenging part of the process. [Site 3, Resp. 1]

In addressing the issue of control, it is necessary to raise the question as to what models are being promoted by whom, and for what purpose. As a former social worker who has worked in both institutional and community-based programs, I understood the professionals’ frustration with the slow progress of community rehabilitation, and the feeling of “work being undone” at the end of every day. However, I also witnessed the breakdown of the institutional system when my most successful clients leaving group homes almost immediately ended up in mental hospitals and juvenile justice facilities because of their inability to re-adjust to the outside world. Through observations and interviews, it appears that rehabilitation professionals prefer the institutional approach, which allows them to see the gratifying success of their work, even if this success is not sustainable in the outside world. This idea has been reinforced by one key informant who stated, “Homes feel good about the work they are doing. Ego is involved. So they keep the number of girls and do not community reintegrate.”

An additional challenge to the implementation of community-based programs is the environment of the local communities. Often times, the reintegration of a survivor back into her home community is considered to be the final step in a successful rehabilitation process. However, this view ignores the fact that the home environments of some survivors may be comparable to the red light areas in terms of violence, abuse, and exploitation. In addition, due to deeply held stigmas against prostitution and HIV/AIDS, the survivor may be even more vulnerable to violence than she was before trafficking and rehabilitation:
Those women who were trafficked had a lot of problems in society. They do not tolerate the violence in their family and in society so they are ready to go again to the brothels. They agree to go because it is a more tolerable trouble than to live in their home, their family, and society, because of the violence in society. And morally, now they cannot talk and they cannot go out of the home, so they are ready to go to the brothels...It is very difficult to reintegrate them because of our religious and caste morality, and culture too. Because the women who were trafficked are outcasted and people do not easily accept her as a family member. [Site 8, Resp. 1]

Other times, a loving and supportive family might not be able to accept the survivor back home due to the increased burden on other family members. According to one respondent,

The family is poor. When they go back to their families, the family is not able to support the children themselves because of poverty. That is the main thing actually. And you need to support not only the children but the family sometimes because of the condition. [Site 7, Resp. 1]

The above respondent also noted that some survivors prefer to stay in the institution rather than face the rejection, violence, and poverty described above.

A more logistical problem is the lack of resources, such as income generation, education opportunities, skills training, counseling and health services available to survivors in their home communities, which are often relatively isolated rural areas (Pearson 2004: 14). Rehabilitation programs originally developed in the urban areas close to red light districts, which means that they can usually take advantage of local institutions, such as schools and hospitals, as well as local professionals, such as therapists, lawyers, etc. This model is not easily replicable in rural areas with very few community resources.

In addition, as rehabilitation institutions grow in size and reputation, they are often able to receive funding to provide facilities on-site. As one respondent in an urban
center proudly noted, “We have every facility. We have a small clinic, hospice. School is here, and vocational training is here. If they are interested we can make the arrangements in the community” (Site 5, Resp. 1). The problem with this approach is twofold: first, as discussed earlier, providing all services on-site tends to further isolate the survivor from the broader community and complicates the mainstreaming process; and second, providing all facilities on-site, rather than networking with publicly subsidized or free facilities in the community, is extremely expensive and cost-ineffective for a non-profit organization. This is problematic in that it keeps all funding in urban centers rather than disbursing it to communities who really need it and where it could go significantly further. According to one key informant, some rehabilitation organizations have received extreme criticism for building impressive compounds with research libraries and impressive décor while claiming to not have enough money to expand community based programs and survivor follow up.

A last significant problem with the shift from institutional to community-based programs is that it ignores the needs of survivors who do not fit into these two categories. According to Pearson, there is a lack of alternatives for survivors beyond staying in a rehabilitation centre or returning to their home community (Pearson 2004: 18). As mentioned, many survivors choose not to return home. One key informant with an international aid agency stressed the need to provide living arrangements for women and girls who desire to live and work independently in urban centers. One organization has recognized this need and has recently started assessing what might be done:

When I say community-based reintegration, I don’t only mean in the village but also in Kolkata and those girls who do not want to return to their families in India
but want to live in the cities. There are many girls who have not gone back to
their villages. They are still in contact with their families but living in
Kolkata…So what has worked well with them, what has not worked well with
them, things like that. [Site 3, Resp. 1]

The reality of the situation is that many women and girls will return to the sex
industry. Because they have chosen to return to the sex industry, few organizations
recognize them as vulnerable to re-trafficking. As a result, women and girls who return
to red light areas are rarely considered as potential beneficiaries of community-based
rehabilitation programs. According to Pearson,

There is a lack of support (in terms of health care, protection from violence, safe
working conditions) for trafficked women re-entering prostitution as a survival
strategy. Without such support women are more vulnerable to situations of abuse,
exploitation and possibly situations of re-trafficking. [Pearson 2004: 19]

In summary, the most appropriate model of rehabilitation, whether institutional or
community-based, depends on the particular situation of the individual survivor. “One
size fits all” approaches will inevitably fail to address the reality that survivors represent
a diversity of backgrounds, needs, and desires for the future. In addition, according to
one key informant, the increased focus on community-based programs has undermined
the progress made in recent years in institutional care, such as the professional
development of staff, case management, and creation and implementation of child
protection policies.

Finally, while community-based programs are an essential element of any anti-
trafficking program, they cannot be effectively implemented without the support, both
financial and moral, of more established institutional programs in urban centers.
According to one key informant, due to the challenges of stigma and a lack of funding,
inrastructure, and enthusiasm by professionals in urban centers, many community-based
programs are largely inactive and exist in name only for the purpose of generating the support of funding agencies. While the organizations may be mobilized from time to time on a grant-by-grant basis, this has done little to strengthen their effectiveness and credibility with the community.

Collaborative Approach: In Theory

Most respondents stressed the importance of collaboration in their work to rehabilitate and restore survivors of trafficking. In resource poor areas, organizations found it more cost effective to network with other stakeholders for services, rather than trying to provide on-site health care, education, etc. In addition, many respondents asserted that past methods lacking collaboration further isolated the survivor and excluded them from the broader community. Through engaging various sectors of civil society, rehabilitation programs can take advantage of outside resources while raising awareness and sensitization and facilitating the process of community reintegration.

One important stakeholder in the process of rescue, rehabilitation, and community reintegration is law enforcement. Police officers have long been considered a part of the trafficking problem due to widespread corruption and stigma. In one Apne Aap study, survivors stated that police officers frequent brothels for sex as well as to extort money from brothel owners. When asked about the behavior of police during rescue and post-rescue operations, 43.3% of the respondents said that police were caring, 27.1% said they were uncaring, 10.5% spoke of abusive behavior by the police, and almost one fifth chose not to respond (Apne Aap 2007: 64-65).
In light of this problem, rehabilitation organizations have begun to network with local law enforcement in order to provide sensitization trainings on sex trafficking. One innovative approach involves partnering with the mothers of trafficked girls in order to give trainings to police officers in the community-based programs. Another involves the formation of a youth empowerment group in the red light areas, who, in addition to their own empowerment and life skills activities, serve as a “watch dog group” for newly arrived trafficked girls. One respondent used a recent case of a rescue operation to illustrate how this approach has created a productive working relationship between the NGOs, community members, and police:

She was rescued from Midnapur district and from a brothel. It is a very great achievement and very great cooperation between NGOs and police. When they get the information they inform us for our assistance. When we receive information from our youth group and other sources we are asking for their assistance. Because we know without police we can’t do it, and the police now are in a position that they can’t do it on their own. [Site 1, Resp. 6]

In addition to collaboration with police, rehabilitation program have also begun to collaborate with the local business community in order to provide livelihood options for survivors who chose to stay in urban destination areas rather than return home.

According to one respondent:

This networking and cooperation is not only through the stakeholders like police and judiciary, but also with the other organization who have expertise in this issue. We are very good in provider care and protection for those staying in the shelter home. But beyond that, in job placement we need others’ support. That’s why we have a MOU (Memorandum of Understanding) with Indian bank where the girls are working in the ATMs. [Site 1, Resp. 6]

Rehabilitation programs have also begun coordinating with government shelter homes in order to improve standards of care. Because of the lack of NGO shelter homes for survivors of trafficking, many women and girls end up in government shelter homes.
These programs have a reputation for being underfunded and understaffed, and thus provide very few quality services to the survivors. Recognizing the need to extend services to survivors outside their doors, rehabilitation institutions have attempted to extend their own popular programs, such as dance movement therapy and youth empowerment groups, to other shelters. Interestingly, one organization in this study is extending these services not only to survivors of trafficking, but also to other vulnerable groups, including boys shelter homes and government schools for “poor children and children from backward regions” as well.

I observed one example of collaboration with women in prostitution in Kalighat, Kolkata. The women approached an anti-trafficking and rehabilitation organization and asked for assistance finding supplemental forms of income. In response, the organization offered to help buy the initial raw materials for a spice-grinding income generation group for the women. The women are now grinding and packaging spices and selling them in the market in order to supplement what they earn from prostitution.

Collaborations such as these have helped organizations build positive relationships with red light communities, which has helped them extend their anti-trafficking programs to these difficult areas. The same organization that formed the income generation group also recently held a program in Bowbazaar, another Kolkata red light area. The program was held on June 12, 2009, World Day Against Child Labor, and included dramas on child labor and abuse and songs and performances by women and prostitution. Local political administrators and the local leader of the police who also
attended and participated in a show of solidarity with the women in prostitution and the NGOs in their fight against sex trafficking.

Increased attention has also been recently focused on the importance of collaboration amongst different anti-trafficking organizations in India and Nepal. In Nepal, rehabilitation institutions have formed a network of communication so that returning survivors can be quickly and efficiently placed in available shelter homes.

More importantly, partnerships have been established between rehabilitation institutions in India and Nepal, creating a more fluid process of international repatriation. Another consequence of these partnerships is that organizations are now learning from one another through the sharing of information and experience. One example of this is a recent partnership between Sanlaap, a rehabilitation organization based in Kolkata, and Shakti Samuha, a rehabilitation organization founded and managed by survivors of trafficking.

According to one funding agency,

There are a lot of learnings [sic] from Sanlaap that Shakti Samuha can adapt, but then again it is very interesting that Sanlaap has a lot of learning to get from Shakti Samuha, because Shakti Samuha is a survivors group. The kinds of issues that they can relate to from a survivor’s perspective can never be thought from us as outsiders looking into an issue. Shakti Samuha gets to learn from Sanlaap and gets to learn from Shakti Samuha. [Site 3, Resp. 1]
Collaborative Approach: In Practice

Although rehabilitation institutions are discussing the benefits of collaboration more than ever, putting the discourse into practice has been complicated by bureaucratic politics, especially in the context of a fierce competition for limited resources. According to one key informant, “Homes do not collaborate, they are competitive. There is a turf war.” This competition over resources was frequently referenced in interviews. Often times, there appeared to be a degree of resentment and suspicion towards larger, well-funded organizations. According to one respondent from a community-based program,

In my opinion, living in an institution is not positive. If you rescue one trafficked girl, in the name of her, the institution is begging money. They show that girl to the different organizations and international community and they collect money. I do not like that kind of a situation. [Site 8, Resp. 1]

Later in the same interview, this respondent again brought up the issue of institutions exploiting survivors for money, and this time named a particular large organization:

Sometimes the organization does not want to reintegrate the trafficked woman because they are taken on as resources. They want to show them to the donor agency and the international community so that they will get more funds...I have heard many stories about [organization]. They rescue the one girl and they again sell her, not to the brothel but to the donor agency. They are also taken on as resources. They are again victimized, once by the brothel and again by the institution. [Site 8, Resp. 1]

This issue of survivors being exploited by institutions has also been raised in previous studies of rehabilitation programs. In her book Hollow Bodies, anthropologist Susan Dewey describes an experience doing a “service day” with a group of upper class Indian women who had “adopted a group of girls in moral danger” (Dewey 2008:50). In a rehabilitation home for child prostitutes housed inside a Bombay prison, Dewey
describes her uneasy experience witnessing a “group of extremely underprivileged girls cater to the needs of twenty over-privileged women.” The upper class women had the young survivors cook them a large dinner, so that they may have the experience to one day be adopted as servants in a wealthy couple’s home. Dewey stated that the experience left her with the question of “how the girls could have been genuinely assisted rather than put on display for what was essentially the benefit of another group” (Dewey 2008:156).

Throughout my own fieldwork in rehabilitation institutions, I encountered numerous documentary filmmakers and journalists who were welcomed with dance and song performances by the survivors, as well as performances for local magistrates and community leaders. While such performances may indeed sensitize the local community members towards the issue of sex trafficking, they also displayed the “success” of a particular organization and generated much welcomed publicity, giving the NGO a competitive edge against other organizations in need of funding.

This competitiveness not only exists between NGOs competing for resources, but also between NGOs and governmental organizations competing for recognition and status. This became apparent in the research while conducting participant observation at an international meeting on Emerging Good Practices in Survivor Rehabilitation held by Sanlaap in Kolkata. During the conference, a significant amount of time was spent addressing the need for both governmental and non-governmental organizations to collaborate in their anti-trafficking work. However, halfway through the conference tensions rose as one NGO accused Indian government shelter homes of providing sub-standard care, evoking a situation from the previous year where a child died in a
government shelter home of malnutrition. Government officials in attendance became visibly agitated, contributed their own accusations towards NGOs, and eventually withdrew from the dialogue and held their own side conversation at the roundtable. Interestingly, while all presentations and roundtable discussions had been conducted in English or with an English translator, with the heightened tension the language quickly changed to Bengali, excluding the participation of organizations from other parts of India, as well as Nepali, British, and American participants.

Finally, while there have been significant strides in involving the government in trafficking initiatives, governmental support for anti-trafficking organizations in India and Nepal continues to be weak. According to one respondent in Nepal, “Social issues do not get as much priority as political issues. There is a lack of commitment. Verbal commitment is there but implementation is weak” (Site 5, Resp. 1). In addition, according to one key informant, criminals involved in trafficking continue to be politically protected.

Empowerment Model: In Theory

In the past, survivors of trafficking were merely considered “damaged” and “traumatized” and institutions focused almost exclusively on counseling as a primary intervention. Recently, this past approach (coined the “Damaged Gita Paradigm” by Frederick) has been rejected in favor of models that recognize the capabilities, strengths, and resiliency of survivors (Frederick 2005: 142-143). This empowerment model not only recognizes the potential of survivors to improve their own lives, but also places the responsibility of ending sex trafficking on their shoulders.
In rehabilitation, survivors are often encouraged or required to participate in a variety of awareness raising programs on topics such as child labor, gender discrimination, and HIV/AIDS. Because they have received more issue-related education than so-called “mainstream” youth, the girls are encouraged to become leaders in their community in the fight against various social problems (Site 1, FG 1). The quotes below, taken from interviews with staff from various rehabilitation institutions in India and Nepal, reveal their high hopes and expectations for the survivors in their care:

After they go back to the community they work for others women’s rights so they can become changers in the community. [Site 8, Resp. 2]

They get trainings, services, we teach them to be social activists. They finally become economically stable, emotionally powerful, socially alert, and they are transformed into social activists…The girls who are there take trainings and when they come out of the prevention home they become pillars against human trafficking they can fight against human trafficking. [Site 5, Resp. 1]

They are aware now. Some of them have a very clear vision that they want to work, and they want to work with an NGO. They want to be a social activist. They can see their future now, which was probably not there when they came in the shelter. [Site 3, Resp. 1]

As indicated by the above respondents, survivors in rehabilitation homes in India and Nepal are often considered to be responsible for more than their own safety and wellbeing. Indeed, rehabilitation programs often provide trainings with the expectation that survivors will extend their knowledge and skills to their communities after returning home. In this way, rehabilitation institutions attempt to place the individual and the institution at the center of larger community development goals.

Empowerment Model: In Practice

As indicated by the above statements, the practice of empowerment has mostly been directed towards training survivors of trafficking to become social activists.
However, while social activists may hold a degree of prestige in NGO circles, such trainings provide little social and economic security to women and girls returning to impoverished villages. While it is difficult to critique the importance of the skills learned by women and girls in empowerment programs, such as rights education and community organizing, if there is no funding or infrastructure for the survivor to utilize at home she may actually experience increased alienation and hardship. In addition, survivors may face even more stigma and social ostracism if upon returning home they begin to challenge the status quo. Even Shakti Samuha, a well-established organization that has received international recognition, continues to face difficulty because they are founded and managed by survivors of trafficking. According to Pearson, “There is a lack of organising of survivors groups, like Shakti Samuha, due to pervading stigmatisation, which makes it even more difficult to organise in the districts. Stigmatisation is still an obstacle for Shakti Samuha (Pearson 2004: 19).

The practice of empowerment has also been pursued through livelihood and income generating trainings. While such programs have been in place for some time, the shift towards empowerment has changed livelihood programs in two ways: first, survivors are now free to choose whatever occupations suit their individual interests and skills; and second, the opportunities available to them are now higher level, professional careers rather than stereotypical “women’s work” such as stitching and embroidery. While these two changes acknowledge and respect individual survivors’ strengths, interests, and capabilities, problems have been encountered in implementation.
When asked about their livelihood programs, most respondents emphasized the importance of providing options to survivors and empowering them to pursue their individual dreams. As one respondent proudly described her program, “If you want to be a sewing master you can, if you want to be a teacher you can too, if you want to be a dance movement therapist you can too” (Site 2, Resp. 1). Many respondents reported that they noted a very positive change in survivors’ self-confidence and social skills after receiving trainings, stating “We have seen the children after one year and there has been a sea change in them” (Site 1, Resp. 5). However, respondents also acknowledged that for most survivors the benefit of certain livelihood trainings is purely emotional, not economic:

If you are talking about block printing, I am sure she will not go to Nepal and take up block printing, but at least her vision have opened up. Otherwise, the block printing has helped her in a cathartic way. [Site 3, Resp. 1]

While some respondents defended certain livelihood trainings for their therapeutic benefit, other respondents were openly critical of programs that would not generate income for the survivor in her home community:

After we have completed rehabilitation, when we put them in their home, what is their ability that they got over the past three or four years? After three years or four years of learning block printing she has a skill in that, and when she returns to her home there is no option of block printing and she has no money to invest to start her own business, or to buy cloth. She is back at a big zero after three years of rehabilitation. And the same thing has happened before trafficking. There is no food, there is violence, and sometimes, they return. They are re-trafficked. [Site 2, Resp. 2]

The idea of “choice” is a western concept that is not easily transferrable in countries with widespread poverty and gender inequality. In the words of one respondent, “In Nepal, girls cannot choose whatever they want. The sole authority of the
daughter and the sister is in the hands of the father and the brother” (Site 8, Resp. 1).

While it is important to challenge gender inequality wherever it exists, often times rehabilitation institutions place this burden on the shoulders of girls already challenged with extreme adversity and stigma. When the sociopolitical goals and objectives of rehabilitation institutions supersede positive, realistic and sustainable options for the survivor, the question of whether survivors are being further exploited by rehabilitation institutions is again raised.

Rights Based Approach: In Theory

In the past, rehabilitation institutions operated under a charity model, that is, the attitude that they were providing a service or “favor” to survivors of trafficking, rather than providing them with what has been rightfully theirs all along. At present, rehabilitation organizations are stressing the importance of a “rights-based approach” rather than “charity” or “welfare” approaches:

What has changed is that we work with the children, not on a charity basis, but for the rights of the child. Government homes were established before, but it felt like charity. So what we feel is that it is not charity. It is their right to get education for their livelihood. [Site 7, Resp. 1]

According to another respondent:

In social welfare programs, many workers feel like they are doing the people a favor. You are not. It is your responsibility. We need to erase the word welfare, and the concept of charity will go away. [Site 1, Resp. 3]

For rehabilitation institutions, the adoption of a rights-based approach has been interpreted as the need to increase survivor voice and participation in the rehabilitation process. An important part of this is including the survivor’s individual wants and needs
in the restoration process, rather than institutionalizing or returning her to her community against her will:

The first important point is whether the child wants to go back to her country. We strongly advocate for the informed consent of the child. And I also believe that it is our responsibility to help the child make the decision. That is informed consent. I give her all the information and then she gives her consent if she wants to go back to her family or back to her country. [Site 3, Resp. 1]

Rights Based Approach in Practice

The “rights based approach,” although widely adopted in discourse, is a concept that has been developed and strongly encouraged by international funding agencies. This became apparent in a focus group of participants in a youth empowerment program:

Because our program is a funded program we are always in contact with ECPAT [End Child Prostitution Child Pornography and Trafficking of Children for Sexual Purposes]…Whatever plans we make, ECPAT guides us, and also gives us advice on new programs and new ideas, and also encourages us to bring up new ideas. Which is why this program is now running according to that philosophy of child rights and participation. [Site 1, FG 1]

However, a recent study by Pearson found that although most organizations profess their dedication to a rights-based approach, there is little conceptual clarity as to what this means and how it should be practiced. According to Pearson,

In asking respondents about a RBA (Rights Based Approach) it is clear that donors have been pressing this approach on anti trafficking organisations. Now many organizations are talking the language of human rights and say they are adopting a RBA but it mean very different things to different groups. What organisations say they are doing and what they actually do also seems to be different…People are not clear on what is a rights-based approach. It was also apparent that the representatives we spoke to from international agencies such as ILO and UNDP did not have a clear idea of what a RBA was or how to implement it in terms of trafficking. This raises questions then, how can NGOs be expected to adopt a RBA when it is not clear from their donors what a RBA entails? [Pearson 2004: 28-29]
As with other shifts discussed in this chapter, the shift from a welfare or charity approach to a rights-based approach has mostly been a shift in the language institutions use when speaking to an international audience. As suggested by the Pearson study, this gap between theory and practice has more to do with a lack of conceptual clarity, lack of meaningful assessment tools, and the pressure to obtain funding than with the unwillingness to increase the voice and participation of survivors.

While rehabilitation institutions have made significant shifts in the ways they discuss their goals, approaches, and relationships with survivors, these shifts have been difficult to implement. One result of this growing gap between “rehabilitation in theory” and “rehabilitation in practice” has been the perpetuation of the status quo, despite the concern of all stakeholders, including many of rehabilitation institutions themselves, that current practices are inadequate.

Analysis

In Chapter One of this thesis, the “myth of Gita,” or the “consensus description” of a typical survivor’s life after emancipation is introduced. According to Frederick, not only is this “myth” grounded in conjecture, cultural assumptions, and organizational and political agendas rather than actual research and documentation, but it also provides very little information about survivors’ lives after rescue and rehabilitation (Frederick 2005:128). A key objective of this study was to address the gap of knowledge around the process of rehabilitation, for it is an essential step in the process of increasing the opportunities available of survivors and limiting their potential for continued exploitation or return to the sex industry.
After three months of participant observation in various rehabilitation institutions throughout India and Nepal, I was able to construct my own narrative of the opportunities and challenges faced by many survivors of trafficking in rehabilitation institutions. Although every individual survivor’s experience is different, and although the specific policies or programs of each rehabilitation institution may also vary, the following description of Gita’s life in the institution is based on an amalgamation of stories and experiences that are representative of life in the institution today.

Gita Revisited

*Your name is Gita, and you are a young girl from rural Nepal. Three months ago, you were rescued from the Kolkata brothel to where you had been trafficked two years before at the age of 12.*

*When the NGO workers and police first arrived, you were afraid. You thought that they might arrest you and then sell you again to the brothel, adding to the debt you had almost paid off. At first you refused to go with them, but they promised you that they were there to rescue you, to help you, and to bring you home. Although you know that your family will never accept you now that you are ruined, you have a deep desire to return to Nepal and to be with people who share your language and culture. You want to return home, so you agree to go with them.*

*But instead of bringing you to the train station to return home, the NGO workers and police bring you to the police station. The next day, you go to court, where you tell the judge through a translator about your family, your village, how you were trafficked, your time in the brothel, and about how much you would like to go home. The translator tells you that the judge has denied this request, because you are not “ready” to return*
home and need to stay to testify against your trafficker. Instead, a committee has decided that you will be going to a home in a village outside of Kolkata until your family can be identified and assessed and the committee decides it is safe for you to return.

You feel as though you have been sold again.

When you arrive at the home the next day, you are given a bed in a room with other girls and a basket with some new clothes. A doctor comes and visits you and tests you for HIV. Although you are worried and do not want to have the test, the doctor says it is mandatory. The first day you are left alone to “adjust” to the new home, but after the first day you are expected to follow the same daily routine:

7:00 AM: You wake up, do your chores, and eat breakfast.

9:00 AM: You go to “school.” Because you don’t speak Bengali and never have been to school before, you can’t go to formal school like some of the other girls. Instead, you learn sewing and block printing. The home sells these products to foreigners on the internet to raise money for the school.

11:00 AM: You have dance movement therapy class.

12:00 PM: You have lunch.

1:00 PM: You have free time. This is when you can meet with the other Nepali girls and talk about home, although the counselors do not like it when you speak Nepali together.

2:00 PM: You have group counseling. You talk with the other girls about having HIV/AIDS, or your fears about being rejected by your family. Sometimes you talk about
the difficulty of being a girl in your community, and brainstorm how you might fix these
problems when you return home.

3:00 PM: You have life skills training. Sometimes you talk about the importance
of cleanliness, other times you learn about your rights and what to do if they are being
violated. Other times, you learn about leadership skills and how to become a community
organizer.

3:00-5:00: You have free time

5:00: You have dinner, do more chores, and then must return to your room.

The schedule only changes on the days when you have medical appointments,
counseling sessions, when you are expected to do a dance performance for a local
magistrate or foreigner volunteer group, when you have to testify in court, or when you
have to meet with your Child Welfare Committee. Today, after three months of
“progress,” you meet with the CWC, who inform you that they have identified your
family. Although your family has agreed to take you back, the CWC has decided that you
cannot yet return home because your family is too poor to care for you properly.

Devastated by this news, you meet with your Nepali friends and agree to escape
with them the following night. One of the girls managed to contact a man who agreed to
find you all jobs in Kathmandu if you can leave the home. You know it is a risk, but you
also know that you no longer want to be held against your will. If you can’t find your
family or they won’t take you back, you know you can always work in a dance bar in the
tourist district of Kathmandu. The next night, you scale the wall and make your escape...
According to the anti-trafficking organization Sanlaap, “‘Rehabilitation’ refers to the concept of restoration to a former state – in this context, enabling the victim/survivor to be free from the physical, psychological and social impact that she has been subjected to as a result of the abuse and exploitation” (Sanlaap and Terre Des Hommes 2009: 11). However, the current anti-trafficking discourse tends to not focus on “restoration to a former state” at all, but on the improvement and transformation of survivors of trafficking into empowered, capacitated community leaders.

A positive aspect of this shift is that survivors are no longer considered part of the “problem,” but part of the solution. Whereas in the past survivors were viewed as victims in need of long-term institutionalization, confinement, and isolation from the larger community, today survivors are considered to be potential change makers in their communities of origin. This shift from “victimhood” to “agency” is often facilitated through the creation of programs that seek to transform the survivor (the docile, non-productive body) into a productive member of capitalist society through a variety of training or education programs. Through the intersection Foucault’s categories of “knowledge” (or authority) and power (or control), survivors in institutions are a captive audience for implementing larger social, political, and economic goals.

These goals, however, are often not determined by the survivor, her family, her community, or even the rehabilitation institution itself, but by the donors who fund the rehabilitation process. Currently, rehabilitation is a top-down process: Donor agencies (who often operate in western, core countries or urban cores within developing countries) set the agendas and provide the funding; NGOs establish the programs and projects;
survivors participate in the programs and projects; and communities receive returned girls. While the position of donor agencies at the top of the rehabilitation hierarchy has helped promote western values of development and empowerment, these approaches may not easily translate into community reintegration and acceptance for the survivor. So while institutions know that the old model of long-term institutionalization hinders community reintegration and perpetuates dependency and vulnerability, new, western donor-driven approaches are met with similar trepidation and lack of implementation.

While the findings of this thesis have focused specifically on how rehabilitation is defined, how this definition informs rehabilitation activities, and how these activities affect the opportunities available to survivors post-institutionalization, these findings are related to much larger theories of power and control. Specifically, the above narrative illustrates how the rehabilitation process exists within the same political economic framework discussed earlier in this thesis. Within this framework, those with access to resources (such as donor agencies, and to a lesser degree rehabilitation institutions) are in a privileged position to define problems, design solutions, and promote agendas. Those at the periphery (survivors, their families, and their communities) are dependent upon the core, even as the core continues to marginalize their voice, power, and participation. Thus, donor agencies and rehabilitation institutions do not attempt to change the current capitalist structure that provides them with relative power and privilege, but instead attempt to empower and capacitate survivors to participate in and ultimately reinforce this structure.
CHAPTER FIVE: PROBLEMS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The findings of this study reveal that although rehabilitation organizations in India and Nepal have recently shifted their perceptions as to how the process of rehabilitation should be conducted, many of these shifts have been difficult to implement. Further analysis of the findings reveal that the gaps between theory and practice discussed in Chapter Four can be attributed to three overlapping problems in the rehabilitation process: an emphasis on individual change ignores the role of the relational and structural components of rehabilitation; the structure of the rehabilitation process has created problematic conditions of dependency and paternalism; and a lack of assessment tools limits the potential for organizations to critically evaluate and learn from their successes and shortcomings. The following chapter will provide a brief discussion of each of these problems, and provide recommendations as to how these problems might be addressed.

Focus on the Individual: Local Socio-Cultural Contexts

As mentioned, rehabilitation programs have attempted to shift from a welfare or charity model (where survivors are simply fed, clothed, and sheltered), to an “empowerment” model, where survivors participate in leadership programs, learn income generating skills, are provided formal and/or informal education, and are “made aware” of societal issues such as gender violence, child labor, and HIV/AIDS. Such
interventions emerge from the “girl-centered approached to development” advocated by economists such as Joseph Stiglitz, Jeffrey Sachs, and Amartya Sen.

As new research by the World Bank has shown that educating and empowering girls may offer the highest return on investment, international organizations have scrambled to include the untapped (and often undermined) resource of women and girls in their development activities (Kristof and WuDunn, 2009). Thus, international funding agencies now perceive empowerment programs as effective rehabilitation approaches that will increase survivors’ independence and limit their potential for re-victimization. As mentioned in the previous chapter, it is hoped that the survivors will take these lessons with them to their communities and serve as spokespersons and role models for women’s empowerment and gender equality. I encountered this trend throughout my time in the field, as I was asked to write, edit, or decipher numerous requests for proposals from international funding agencies that typically required some component of empowerment or leadership training.

However, while empirical research has shown the significant benefits of women and girls’ education and empowerment, these interventions alone may not be enough. For example, in her decade long research on women’s empowerment in India, Malaysia, Pakistan, the Philippines, and Thailand, Oppenheim Mason found that individual traits such as education, health, or paid employment may influence women’s empowerment, but they do not determine it. Instead, Oppenheim Mason found that the impact of individual capabilities and assets is mediated by community norms and ideologies that define the rights of women and men (Oppenheim Mason 2005: 89, 94). In other words,
empowerment is not a property of individual experiences or traits, such as education or leadership skills, but is a variable of social or cultural systems (Oppenheim Mason 2005: 90).

As discussed in the Findings section of this thesis, several gaps exist between rehabilitation in theory and rehabilitation in practice, especially in reference to the process of the community reintegration. One potential explanation for this gap is that rehabilitation institutions have been focused on the education, empowerment, and capacity building of the individual survivor in isolation, without addressing the larger societal issues of local power structures and poverty. Thus, the empowered, skilled, aware survivor may be unable to exercise her capabilities in her community of origin (Oppenheim Mason 2005: 90).

Local Power Structures

According to Oppenheim Mason, “People are not empowered or disempowered in a vacuum. Rather, they are empowered or disempowered relative to other people or groups whose lives intersect with theirs and whose interests differ from theirs, at least in part” (Oppenheim Mason: 2005: 90). In other words, a person’s power is not only determined by their own capabilities, skills, and traits, but by the value cultures assign to them in relation to other community members. Often times, this designation of power and status occurs at a very local level. For example, because women and girls who are successfully reintegrated into their home communities most often live in families, their decision making power, access to resources, labor responsibilities, and relationships outside of the family may all be decided by relations within the family (Mosse 1993: 7).
This is especially true with children and young people, who are often discouraged from taking leadership roles in deference to their elders (CARE 2009).

Generally, women and girls in developing countries pay a high risk when challenging patriarchal gender norms (CARE 2009). According to Pearson, “The existing social power structure in Nepal says that nothing can be challenged, including norms about gender, women's role in society, discrimination and violence” (Pearson 2004: 12). Perhaps this is why the first studies of reintegrated women and girls, such as the Real Lives, Real Options study conducted by Sanlaap, found that despite the fact that the organization encouraged individual “choice” in rehabilitation programming, most of the returned survivors had become housewives or were doing stereotypical “women’s work.” This underscores the point that although survivors may have had the opportunity to pursue the skills training of their “choice” in rehabilitation institutions, they are rarely provided a choice within the context of the traditional power structures of the home.

However, local environments cannot be entirely blamed for the lack of options presented to survivors of trafficking. Often times, this lack of “choice” is unintentionally perpetuated by the rehabilitation institutions themselves through their failure to pursue alternative reintegration strategies for survivors outside of the family. Many rehabilitation institutions still adhere to the traditional, patriarchal belief that women and girls can only be safe if they return to their home or stay within another familiar area, such as the institution (Pearson 2004: 9). Consequently, some rehabilitation institutions have begun to arrange marriages for survivors as a reintegration strategy, “without
investigating how marriage is simply reinforcing patriarchal norms and as a possible site of violence against women” (Pearson 2004).

*Poverty*

As mentioned in Chapter Two, “The Political Economy of Sex Trafficking and the Feminism of Survival,” and Chapter Three, “A Situational Analysis of Nepal to India Sex Trafficking,” poverty is a primary indicator of vulnerability to trafficking. Many women and girls in India and Nepal are trafficked in the process of escaping extreme poverty and seeking alternative forms of livelihood for themselves and their families. This point was mentioned in interviews as rehabilitation professionals explained that the home conditions of many survivors are “no better than a slum.” Consequently, many survivors’ families, even if they want to support them emotionally, cannot support them economically.

While survivors may have been taught income generating skills in the rehabilitation institution, often times these skills are irrelevant to the economic realities of the village. There may not be a local need for the skills of the survivor, she may not have the resources to pursue her skill, or pursuing this work may be outside the traditional gender division of labor and forbidden by her family. Consequently, the returned survivor may be a financial burden rather than an asset to her family. Under these conditions, the survivor may have no other option than to take the risk of migrating again for paid work, or may simply return to prostitution as a survival strategy.
Recommendations: Individual, Relational, Structural Change

According to CARE, “Program activities cannot stop at the individual change level of girls, instead, concerted efforts also have to be given to developing activities that seek changes in structure and promote supportive relationships for girls” (CARE 2009: 18). In order to achieve this goal, CARE has developed a Gender Empowerment Framework that highlights the three components of sustainable empowerment: Individual Change, Relational Change and Structural Change (CARE 2009: 18).

As mentioned, rehabilitation programs focus almost exclusively on individual change. CARE defines individual change as the ability of poor women and girls to become agents of their own development through gaining the ability to analyze their own lives, make their own decisions, and take their own actions (CARE 2009: 18). Interviews with rehabilitation staff indicate that this is where programs have seen the most recent success. Although no institutions in the study had developed precise tools for measuring individual change, staff reported that they had observed positive changes in the survivors’ self esteem and leadership potential through participation in empowerment programs. However, in order for survivors to continue to access their skills and capabilities outside of the institution, the larger context in which women and girls mediate their life choices must also be addressed through programs that target relational and structural change.

Relations change is defined by the ability of women to form new relationships with other social actors, form coalitions and develop mutual support in order to negotiate, be agents of change, alter structures, and thus be able to realize rights and livelihood security (CARE 2009: 18). The central idea behind relations change is that while the
individual woman or girl may be relatively powerless in the face of widespread gender
inequality or a lack of economic options, if women work together they can achieve power
in numbers. According to Oppenheim Mason, collective action is the best way to
overcome systemic inequality and achieve sustainable empowerment (Oppenheim Mason
2005: 94). Several examples from India illustrate the potential for women from
disadvantaged circumstances to overcome economic and gender inequality through
collective action. One example is the Velugu Program from Andhra Pradesh, a self-help
group that has successfully created multiple economic enterprises and social action
committees (Oppenheim Mason 2005: 94). Another is the Self Employed Women’s
Association (SEWA), an organization that has grown into a powerful labor union that
influences politics and promotes the economic livelihoods of its several million women
members and their families (Camerini 2007). A final example is Shakti Samuha, a
rehabilitation organization included in this study, which was founded and is managed by
a group of survivors of trafficking. These examples show that in order to create safe
spaces for women to join together to claim their rights, economic, organizational, and
human resources need to be redistributed from urban centers to local communities.
Otherwise, survivors will continue to remain isolated and without the institutional and
emotional support to capitalize off their individual skills and capacities.

The final component of CARE’s Gender Empowerment Framework is structural
change, or the ability of women, individually or collectively, to “challenge the routines,
conventions, laws, family forms, kinship structures, and taken for granted behaviours that
shape their lives” (CARE 2009: 18). Unless the surrounding cultural institutions creating
and perpetuating inequality are challenged, individual and relational empowerment will fail (Oppenheim Mason 2005: 98). While challenging traditional power structures can be a risky move for an “outside” organization to make, some rehabilitation organizations have explored innovative ways to promote structural change at the local level.

One way of doing this is through exploring how existing power structures might be used to promote positive change. For example, Sanlaap recently began meeting with *panchayats*, or local elected village leaders, in order to discuss ways to combat stigma and violence against survivors returning to the village. Although the success of this approach has not yet been evaluated, it is one example of an innovative way to promote the rights of women and girls without undermining the cultural rights of local authority. In addition, as actors and key stakeholders in any women’s empowerment program, men have both the right and responsibility to be included. Unless men are included in the process and are informed as to how they, too, benefit from women’s empowerment programs, it is unrealistic to assume that they will give up their male privilege.

Another way to promote structural change is through providing alternative living options for survivors of trafficking outside of traditional, patriarchal norms. Survivors should have more options available to them other than institutionalization, marriage, or return to the natal home. If survivors are willing and able to live independently and autonomously, this must be supported and encouraged. Many of the organizations researched have recently started to explore alternative living arrangements, such as subsidizing rent in “working girls hostels” for employed, older survivors who wish to remain in urban areas. However, alternative living arrangements for younger survivors
who do not wish to return home should also be explored, as well as services and support for women who chose to return to the sex industry as a survival strategy.

Structure: Donor Dependency

Although research on rehabilitation has tended to focus on the individual survivor, in reality there are several different stakeholders in the rehabilitation process. These stakeholders may include the international agencies that provide political, economic, and organizational resources, NGOs that design and implement rehabilitation programming, the families and communities that receive returned survivors of trafficking, and, of course, the survivors themselves. While each of these stakeholders may have their own specific needs and goals, their ability to promote these needs and goals differs according to their place within the rehabilitation hierarchy. Consequently, a top down approach to rehabilitation has led to issues of dependency and paternalism that have complicated the practice of rehabilitation.

Major donors to rehabilitation NGOs include national government agencies (USAID, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan, the Canadian International Development Agency, the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, the Development Cooperation High Commission for Australia, etc.); United Nations Agencies (UNDP, UNAID, UNHCR, UNESCO, etc.); International foundations (McArthur Foundation, Ford Foundation, etc.), and International development agencies (CARE, The World Bank, IMF, etc.). As donors, the above groups have significant power and ability to influence rehabilitation programming through deciding which organizations, programs, and projects to fund. This position of power is problematic for other stakeholders in the rehabilitation process in a number of ways.
First, despite a common commitment to the goal of survivor rehabilitation, donor organizations are in a position to privilege their own agendas. At times, donors’ agendas may be pitted against the needs of the rehabilitation NGO or the local community, creating a barrier to effective change or sustainable action (Pearson 2004: 10). Because donors are often responsive to larger economic, political, or development goals than the rehabilitation of individual survivors, they may require that rehabilitation programs initiate seemingly unrelated programs to continue to receive funding. In other words, “whatever their motives or ideologies, those who disperse the funds are likely to attach conditions to their dispersment” (Midgely et al., 1986: 156).

For example, while in the field I was asked to write a grant for a foreign embassy that wanted to create a women’s political education program in rural Nepal. While this appeared to be an important program, its connection with survivor rehabilitation was not clear to me. Moreover, I had been recently informed in an interview that due to a lack of funding this particular program rarely followed up on the survivors after reintegrating them into their communities. It appeared that important aspects of survivor rehabilitation, such as follow up case management, were being replaced by the agendas of larger donor organizations. When I posed this question to a respondent, she agreed and stated that “donor-driven programming” is indeed a significant problem faced by many rehabilitation programs.

Economic dependency has created a situation where rehabilitation NGOs are responsive and accountable to funding agencies rather than survivors and their home communities. According to one key informant, this means that rehabilitation programs
are funded “project-by-project” and based on whatever development initiatives are popular with the donor at that time rather the needs of the particular survivor or community. For example, one respondent offered the following hypothetical based on the grant mentioned above. If awarded, the grant may fund a women’s political education project for a three-year period. After three years, this funding may be ended, or the agency may shift their focus toward something new (such as income generating cooperatives, a literacy campaign, etc.), and the rehabilitation NGO will have to create a new program to re-apply for funds. Nowhere in this process are community members, or even local community organizations, asked about their needs, goals or objectives. In addition, the needs of the survivor remain unaddressed. Consequently, receiving generous grants from donor agencies may create conflicts of interest for rehabilitation NGOs. In exchange for the funding they need to implement their programs, they may lose a significant degree of flexibility and independence (Montgomery 1988: 78).

An additional issue with donor dependency is that a relatively large number of organizations end up competing for a limited number of resources. When discussing the movement towards collaboration with various stakeholders, one key informant laughed and described the current situation as being closer to a “turf war” than a collaborative effort. According to Midgely, dependence on donor agencies has created a situation where NGOs are “plagued by mal-coordination and the duplication of services” in their “attempt to dominate a service field” (Midgely et al., 1986: 156). A recent study by Pearson revealed that in rehabilitation organizations in Nepal, a lack of co-ordination and willingness to work together has resulted in a loss of opportunities for learning through
collaboration (Pearson 2004: 12). In addition, this competition for resources has also resulted in survivors being put on display for the benefit of funding agencies, as described in Chapter Four. And, as mentioned, some organizations have been accused of keeping survivors in institutions rather than rehabilitating them in order to receive funding.

In addition to the gap between the agendas of donor agencies and rehabilitation NGOs, there is also a gap between NGOs and local communities. As mentioned, rehabilitation organizations are often located in urban centers rather than rural communities. Often times, rehabilitation professionals have had little “field experience” themselves, and tend to side with donor preference for hierarchical lines of authority rather than participatory styles of development. According to Montgomery, the power of the organization over the programs implemented in the community often creates a tension between the center and the field (Montgomery 1988: 105).

In addition, although many people begin their professional careers in community-based organizations, they tend to move toward urban centers and administrative positions as they advance in their careers (Montgomery 1988: 59). Because field workers tend to face more experiences outside of their control, are often isolated, have fewer resources at their disposal, and can suffer from a lack of guidance from the center, they are typically less satisfied with their careers and only work in communities on a temporary basis (Montgomery 1988: 69, 76). Consequently, relationships between central offices and communities remain weak, and community-based programs remain difficult to implement.
In addition, despite new discourses of participation and collaboration, many rehabilitation institutions still ascribe to a “hierarchical view of consciousness,” or the assumption that etic or “outside” views are best suited to assess the needs of the poor (Midgely et al., 1986: 103). This paternalistic attitude also assumes that the traditional power structures of poor communities are not useful tools for initiating positive change, and that external intervention is needed for “conscientiation,” or changing the attitudes and behaviors of the poor (Midgely et al., 1986: 28).

A first issue with this approach is that the values, beliefs, and perceptions of the NGO worker may conflict with the values, needs, and realities faced by the survivor and/or the local the community. For example, several of the rehabilitation organizations included in the study initiated massive “awareness campaigns” on issues such as child labor and child marriage as part of their prevention efforts. Such interventions, although well meaning, work under the assumption that the poor are either ignorant or apathetic and that education alone can make them “aware” of how these practices are harmful (Midgely et al., 1986: 157). Rather than exploring the structural basis of these practices, such as how they may or may not be employed as a survival strategy to cope with larger social issues, rehabilitation NGOs often assume that poor communities are simply “backward.” For example, when asked who is at risk for trafficking, one respondent from a well-respected NGO answered, “Indigenous groups, because they are backward. Ethnic groups because they are backward” (Site 5, Resp. 1).

According to Midgely, many NGOs are run by middle class individuals whose views are liberal and paternalistic rather than egalitarian or progressive (Midgely et al.,
Paternalism, by its very nature, excludes the possibility of authentic participation by other stakeholders, and thus limits the potential for interventions that are relevant to survivors and communities. And, as long as programs are imposed from above and do not address the needs and concerns of other stakeholders, they will be difficult to implement.

**Recommendation: A Top-Down and Bottom-Up Approach**

A survivor’s return to her community of origin is often the end of rehabilitation support and services, despite the fact that many rehabilitation professionals agree that this is often one of the significant events in the course of the survivor’s life and heavily influences her options for the future. Consequently, communities with high numbers of returning survivors must be recognized as important stakeholders in the rehabilitation process, and bottom-up approaches must exist alongside the current top-down approaches.

An important aspect of a bottom-up approach is participation. According to the UN Economic and Social Council Resolution, participation includes the active involvement of stakeholders in the effort, sharing equitably in the benefits derived from the effort, and decision making in respect to setting goals, formulating policies and planning and implementing programs (Midgely et al., 1986: 25). In order to insure that a community program is for the well being of all, it should start with the participation of the poorest members of the community (Mosse 1993: 20; Midgely et al., 1986: 26). In the case of rehabilitation and community reintegration, this includes the survivors and
their families, who have the most significant stake in the process and who are most likely to face stigma, social ostracism, and economic hardship if their needs are not met.

It is also important to distinguish between pseudo-participation, which limits community involvement to decisions already taken by external bodies, and authentic participation, which is not imposed from above but developed at the grassroots level (Midgely et al., 1986: 26). For authentic participation to take place, survivors, their families, and their communities should be actively involved in all aspects of the process, from setting the agenda to implementing the program, rather than simply being consulted or tagged on at the end (Midgely et al., 1986: 104; Mosse 1993: 28). For example, rather than deciding that the establishment of a women’s cooperative will assist survivors’ economic independence and therefore improve their status in the family in the community, survivors, their families, and community members should take part in identifying the issues related to community reintegration and finding solutions. While simply asking what people need may not be enough, this collaborative perspective is an important starting point that should not be overlooked. In addition to finding solutions that are more inclusive, practicing authentic participation heightens participants’ awareness of their own capabilities to make choices and influence outcomes; strengthens interpersonal relationships; fosters self confidence, improves material conditions; and reduces feelings of powerlessness and alienation (Midgely et al., 1986: 26).

In addition, participatory approaches are more likely to identify solutions whose benefits are immediate, tangible, and locally concentrated (Montgomery 1988: 35). In order to generate active and sustained participation, the benefits of a program, project, or
policy must be self-justifying. That is, they must be valuable enough to be worth the
time, resources and risk spent achieving them (Montgomery 1988: 75).

Finally, programs and projects should be implemented with decentralization in
mind. As mentioned, initiatives that are heavily dependent on external funding sources
are not sustainable beyond the project funding period. This is one reason why the UN
warns against project-based community organizing (Midgely et al., 1986: 32). Instead,
the capacities of local institutions should be strengthened so that local groups are
empowered to assume responsibility for programs and initiate their own programs as
needs arise (Midgely et al., 1986: 33). Creating linkages with larger decision bodies,
fostering grassroots participation, and cultivating the skills of community leaders who
represent the interests of marginalized groups are all ways that NGOs and donor agencies
can help break the cycles of hierarchy, dependency, and paternalism (Midgely et al.,
1986: 31-32). When participatory methods are used, when programs are desired and
utilized by the community, and when communities have the resources on hand to
continue their responsibilities, programs will be sustainable long after external support
has been phased out (Midgely et al., 1986: 27; Montgomery 1988: 24).

Lack of Assessment and Measurement

A final problem identified in this study is a lack of assessment and measurement.
Rather than developing programs, projects, and interventions based on shifts in theory
and in discourse, rehabilitation organizations have a responsibility to conduct
assessments of their current activities to evaluate what is and what isn’t working.

The current lack of assessment is correlated with the issue of donor dependency.
The competition between many organizations for limited resources discourages
organizations from critically evaluating the strengths and weaknesses of their programs. Consequently, rehabilitation organizations often present unscientific and greatly inflated statistics to donor agencies and the general public. For example, one information officer at a prominent NGO proudly informed me of the organization’s “100% success rate,” yet was not able to provide me with an operational definition of “success.” Without conceptual clarity as to what “success” means, organizations cannot develop assessment tools that evaluate what activities are most effective in meeting this target.

**Recommendation: Assessment Tools**

In order to achieve effective, sustainable results, rehabilitation organizations must be willing and able to critically evaluate their activities. Donors can play an important role in this process by providing additional funds for program monitoring and evaluation. These assessment activities should always be conducted by an outside organization in order to overcome any potential conflicts of interest. In addition, rehabilitation organizations need to have conceptual clarity as to what goals they are attempting to achieve, and collaborate in the development of assessment tools for measuring the extent to which these goals are being met.

**Conclusion**

The objective of this research was to address the phenomenon of survivor re-trafficking and return to the sex industry through a focus on the process of institutional rehabilitation. To meet this objective, this study posed three central questions in relation to the concept of survivor rehabilitation in India and Nepal:

- How is the construct of “rehabilitation” defined in popular discourse? Where does this definition come from? How does this definition inform rehabilitation
institutions’ goals and objectives? How have these definitions, goals, and objectives changed over time?

- What programs, activities, or initiatives are rehabilitation institutions currently implementing to meet these goals and objectives?

- How is rehabilitation, in theory and in practice, influencing the options available to survivors post-institutionalization?

Before entering the field, I conducted an extensive literature review that revealed numerous criticisms of “re-victimization” approaches to rehabilitation characterized by long-term institutionalization, “welfare” models, and a lack of programs that recognize survivors’ strengths and capacities. Based on this literature, I assumed that this non-recognition of survivor agency might be correlated with the low rates of community reintegration and high rates of re-trafficking and re-entry into the sex industry. Under this assumption, I posed the idea that rehabilitation programs that recognize and cultivate survivors’ strengths, rather than viewing them as “damaged” might create empowered, skilled individuals who would be in a better position to overcome the challenges of poverty, stigma, or social ostracism.

However, my time in the field quickly revealed that although it had not yet been documented or published, rehabilitation institutions had already adopted “empowerment” discourse. Rather than long term institutionalization and isolation, every organization in this study advocated for leadership training, formal and informal education, community-based work, and “rights-based approaches” to rehabilitation. However, participant observation and interviews with key informants revealed that while there has been a
significant shift in the discourse of rehabilitation, these shifts are rarely implemented in practice. Consequently, while the language and conceptualization of rehabilitation have changed significantly, these theoretical shifts appear to have little impact on actual rehabilitation programming and the opportunities available to survivors post-institutionalization.

The causes of this gap between theory and in practice became apparent early in the research. Again and again, each participating institution identified the same structural obstacles to meeting their goals of survivor rehabilitation and reintegration: dependency on outside international organizations for funding, a lack of control over external variables influencing the rehabilitation process, and a lack of tools for measuring the extent to which certain approaches are meeting their objectives. Based on participant observation, interviews, and focus groups, I concluded that the gap between rehabilitation in theory and rehabilitation in practice is related to three overarching problems: a focus on individual change rather than a more holistic approach to rehabilitation; a structure that fosters dependency and paternalism amongst stakeholders; and a lack of effective assessment tools for critical program evaluation.

Further analysis revealed that these problems relate back to issues of power and control amongst various stakeholders in the rehabilitation process. International funding organizations, NGOs, and survivors have differential access to the symbolic and hard capital necessary to meet their own needs and privilege their own agendas. At times, this hierarchy has had positive results. For example, the shift from “re-victimization” to “empowerment” or “rights-based” models was largely due to “top down” pressure from
outside international funding organizations. Other times, this hierarchy has been problematic. For example, through creating situations of financial dependency where NGOs are accountable to donors rather than survivors, or by using survivors in institutions as a captive audience for international organizations to implement their larger development goals or for NGOs to receive funding and recognition.

In the above situations, the question of what is being done for the benefit whom must continue to be raised. Who are the ultimate beneficiaries of the rehabilitation process? The survivors, who, armed with awareness, empowerment, and skills, are able to better overcome the challenges they may face after leaving the institution? The NGOs, who, through the numerous films, books, and dance, art, and theater performances, are able to raise funds and prestige while raising awareness? Or the international funding agencies who, through their power, influence, and access to resources are in the best position to privilege their own political, economic, or social interests? In order to insure that the roles, responsibilities and interests of each stakeholder are not superseding the ultimate goal of survivor rehabilitation, accountability mechanisms and assessment tools must be put in place. Specifically, funding agencies and NGOs must insure the rights, participation, and representation of survivors in all steps of the rehabilitation process, not just in theory, but also in practice.
REFERENCES CITED

ABC Nepal
1998 Life in Hell.

ABC Nepal

Aguilar, Jose Victor and Miguel Cavada Diez
2002 Ten Plagues of Globalization. EPICA.

Apne Aap

Bales, Kevin

Bales, Kevin

Bales, Kevin

Batstone, David B.

Camerini, Michael, Nilita Vachani, Paula Heredia, Karine Hrechdakian, Guy Van Duser, Cheryl Groff, Shireen Huq, and Documentary Educational Resources
2007; 1990 Kamala and Raji.

CARE
2009 The Power to Lead: A Leadership Model for Adolescent Girls.

Chattopadhyay, Swati
Crawford, Mary

Denzin, Norman K. and Yvonna S. Lincoln

Dewey, Susan
2008 Hollow Bodies: Institutional Responses to Sex Trafficking in Armenia, Bosnia, and India. Sterling, VA: Kumarian Press.

Ehrenreich, Barbara, and Arlie Russell Hochschild

Farr, Kathryn

Foucault, Michel, and Paul Rabinow

Frederick, John

Friedman, Thomas L.

Ghimire, Durga
Prevention, Care, Repatriation, Rehabilitation, and Reintegration of Rescued Girls (ABC/Nepal's Experience).

Kara, Siddharth

Kempadoo, Kamala, Jyoti Sanghera, and Bandana Pattanaik
Kristof, Nicholas D., and Sheryl WuDunn

Kusserow, Adrie

McDavid, Carol

McGirk, Tim
1997 Nepal’s Lost Daughters, India’s Soiled Goods. Time 149(4).

Midgley, James

Montgomery, John D.

Monzini, Paola

Mosse, Julia Cleves, and Oxfam

Oppenheim Mason, Karen

Pande, Rehka

Pearson, Elaine
2004 Gaps Analysis on Intervention Strategies Against Trafficking in Women in Nepal: Oxfam GB.
Polaris Project

Sackrey, Charles, Geoffrey Eugene Schneider, and Janet T. Knoedler

Samarasinghe, Vidyamali

Sanlaap
2009 The Sheltering Tree: Emerging Good Practices in Care and Protection.

Sanlaap and Terres des Hommes
2009 Real Lives...Real Options: A Study Exploring the Livelihood Options for Trafficked Survivors in Rural and Urban Areas.

Sassen, Saskia

Shakti Samuha

Sinha, Indrani and Shamita Das Dasgupta

Skinner, E. Benjamin

Sleightholme, Carolyn, and Indrani Sinha

Terre des Hommes
2005 Summary of Findings: A Study of Trafficked Nepalese Girls and Women in Mumbai and Kolkata, India.
U.S. Department of State

UNDP
APPENDIX A: GLOSSARY

Adhiya: -- (Hindi) “One half;” system of prostitution where a free agent sex worker pays half their fees to the brothel owner for use of the facilities.

Bubu -- word women in prostitution use to refer to men who are their returning customers and who support them financially.

Bengali -- language and cultural group of persons living in West Bengal, the eastern state of India where Kolkata is located.

Bungalow -- brothel located on a first or second floor above a shop or other business. Bungalows often house underage or trafficked girls, and thus are heavily secured by locked iron gates and only allow known customers.

Chhukri/Tsukri -- (Bengali/Hindi); underage, trafficked, or debt bonded girls in prostitution.

Dada -- a local thug or gangster, often employed to “break in” or punish new or troublesome trafficked girls. Sons born to women and girls trafficked into prostitution and raised in red light areas often aspire to become dadas.

Dalal -- trafficker.

Malkin -- Owner of a brothel.

Mashi/gharwali -- (Bengali/Hindi); manager of a brothel.

Pinjara -- (Hindi) “cage;” brothel serving working class clients, identified by bars on the windows, solicitation from open doors, and relative freedom of sex workers. Pinjaras are often areas where local men come to eat, drink, and socialize.

Red Light Area -- an area with a high concentration of brothels and women in prostitution. In Kolkata, Sonagachi, Khidderpore, Kalighat, and Baghbazaar are considered red light areas.

Rehabilitation -- Rehabilitation refers to the concept of restoration to a former state – in this context, enabling the victim/survivor to be free from the physical, psychological and social impact that she has been subjected to as a result of the abuse and exploitation (Sanlaap).

Ritualized Prostitution -- tradition of dedicating a daughter to temple prostitution, practiced by the Bedia, Devadasi, and Nat castes in India and the Deuki and Badini castes in Nepal.
Sex Trafficking -- Human trafficking is the recruitment and/or movement of someone within or across borders, through abuse of power/position, with the intent to forcibly exploit, commercially or otherwise (University of Denver Human Trafficking Clinic Definition, 2010)

Shadhin -- Bengali word for a “flying,” “free agent” or “independent” sex workers. Shadhins typically commute to rented rooms or brothels to meet customers

Tenancy -- brothel system where free-agent sex workers use the facilities of an established brothel by paying the brothel owner fixed daily or monthly fees for room rent, utilities, and payments to the police
APPENDIX B: INFORMED CONSENT FORM
For Program Staff and Volunteers

Rescued, Rehabilitated, Returned: Exploring Sustainable, Collaborative Approaches to the Rehabilitation of Survivors of Sex Trafficking in Nepal and India

You are invited to participate in a study that will explore different approaches to the rehabilitation of survivors of sex trafficking. In addition, this study is being conducted to fulfill the requirements of a MA Degree in Cultural Anthropology from the University of Denver. The study is being conducted by Robynne Locke. Results will be used to write a thesis for the completion of the graduate program. Robynne can be reached at rlocke@du.edu. This project is supervised by Dr. Richard Clemmer-Smith, Anthropology Department, University of Denver, Denver, CO 80208, rclemmer@du.edu.

Participation in interviews should take about 30 minutes to one hour of your time. Participation will involve responding to questions about the challenges faced by survivors of sex trafficking, and how rehabilitation institutions can best meet these challenges. Participation in this project is strictly voluntary. The risks associated with this project are minimal. If, however, you experience discomfort you may discontinue the interview at any time. We respect your right to choose not to answer any questions that may make you feel uncomfortable. Refusal to participate or withdrawal from participation will involve no penalty.

Your responses will be identified by code number only and will be kept separate from information that could identify you. This is done to protect the confidentiality of your responses. Only the researcher will have access to confidential information.

If you have any concerns or complaints about how you were treated during the interview, please contact Sylk Sotto-Santiago, Office of Research and Sponsored Programs at 303-871-4052 or call or write to the University of Denver, Office of Research and Sponsored Programs, 2199 S. University Blvd., Denver, CO 80208-2121, 303.871.2121, orsp@du.edu.

You may keep this page for your records. Please sign the next page if you understand and agree to the above. If you do not understand any part of the above statement, please ask the researcher any questions you have.

I have read and understood the foregoing descriptions of the study called Rescued, Rehabilitated, Returned: Exploring Sustainable, Collaborative Approaches to the Rehabilitation of Survivors of Sex Trafficking in Nepal and India. I have asked for and received a satisfactory explanation of any language that I did not fully understand. I agree to participate in this study, and I understand that I may withdraw my consent at any time. I have received a copy of this consent form.

Signature _____________________ Date _________________
___ I agree to be audiotaped. _____________________
___ I do not agree to be audiotaped. _____________________

Signature _____________________ Date _________________

_______________ I would like a summary of the results of this study to be mailed to me at the following postal or e-mail address:
APPENDIX C: PARENT/GUARDIAN ASSENT FORM

For the Participation of Minors under Age 18

Rescued, Rehabilitated, Returned: Exploring Sustainable, Collaborative Approaches to the Rehabilitation of Survivors of Sex Trafficking in Nepal and India

A minor under your guardianship has volunteered to participate in a study that will explore different approaches to the rehabilitation of survivors of sex trafficking. In addition, this study is being conducted to fulfill the requirements of a MA Degree in Cultural Anthropology from the University of Denver. The study is being conducted by Robynne Locke. Results will be used to write a thesis for the completion of the graduate program. Robynne can be reached at rlocke@du.edu. This project is supervised by Dr. Richard Clemmer-Smith, Anthropology Department, University of Denver, Denver, CO 80208, rcle@du.edu.

Participation in interviews should take about 30 minutes to one hour of the minor’s time. Participation will involve responding to questions about the challenges faced by survivors of sex trafficking, and how rehabilitation institutions can best meet these challenges. Participation in this project is strictly voluntary. The risks associated with this project are minimal. If, however, you or the minor experience discomfort participation may discontinue at any time. We respect the minor’s right to choose not to answer any questions that may make her feel uncomfortable. Refusal to participate or withdrawal from participation will involve no penalty.

The minor’s responses will be identified by code number only and will be kept separate from information that could identify her. This is done to protect the confidentiality of her responses. Only the researcher will have access to confidential information. However, should any information contained in this study be the subject of a court order or lawful subpoena, the University of Denver might not be able to avoid compliance with the order or subpoena. Although no questions in this interview address it, we are required by law to tell you that if information is revealed concerning suicide, homicide, or child abuse and neglect, it is required by law that this be reported to the proper authorities.

If you have any concerns or complaints about how the minor was treated during the interview, please contact Sylk Sotto-Santiago, Office of Research and Sponsored Programs at 303-871-4052 or call or write to the University of Denver, Office of Research and Sponsored Programs, 2199 S. University Blvd., Denver, CO 80208-2121, 303.871.2121, orsp@du.edu.

You may keep this page for your records. Please sign the next page if you and the minor under your guardianship understand and agree to the above. If you or the minor under your guardianship do not understand any part of the above statement, please ask the researcher any questions you have.

I have read and understood the foregoing descriptions of the study called Rescued, Rehabilitated, Returned: Exploring Sustainable, Collaborative Approaches to the Rehabilitation of Survivors of Sex Trafficking in Nepal and India. I have asked for and received a satisfactory explanation of any language that I did not fully understand. I agree to allow the participation of the minor under my guardianship in this study, and I understand that she or I may withdraw consent at any time. I have received a copy of this consent form.
Guardian: Signature _____________________ Date _________________

On Behalf of Participant________________________________

___ I agree to allow this minor to be audiotaped.

___ I do not agree to allow this minor to be audiotaped.

Signature _____________________ Date _________________

___________ I would like a summary of the results of this study to be mailed to me at the following postal or e-mail address:
APPENDIX D: VERBAL CONSENT SCRIPT

Hi, my name is Robynne Locke and I am a student from the University of Denver, USA, and I doing research on ways to help trafficked girls.

I am asking you to take part in a research study because I am trying to learn more about what your goals are for the future and how organizations like [name org] is helping you meet these goals. Also, if you feel comfortable telling me, I would like to hear about what problems you are facing and what worries or scares you about the future, and how organizations like [name org] is helping to overcome these problems.

If you would like to participate in an interview, it will last around 30 minutes. If you would like to be interviewed again, we can do this too. The interviews will be held at [organization] and you can decide where and when is best for you. If you are comfortable with this, I would like to audiotape your answers so I do not miss anything you have said. No one except myself and [translator] will hear these tapes, and they will be destroyed after we type what you have said. If you would like, you can listen to the tapes before I type your answers, and erase anything you would not like me to include. This research is confidential, which means that I am not allowed to let anyone know your name, what you look like, where you live or what you said. This research is low risk, which means that it should not put you in any danger.

If at any point you feel uncomfortable or do not want to participate any longer, you can turn off the tape recorder or end the interview at any time, and you will not face any consequences. This research is voluntary, which means that you only participate if you want to, and you only participate as much as you want. If you are upset or uncomfortable after the research, you can talk to [name of mental health contact] for support.

You will not benefit directly from this research project, but you will be helping other people learn how to best help girls who have been trafficked so that they may be able to solve problems in the future.

Do you have 30 minutes to participate in an interview? Would you like to participate now or at a later time?

By you answering the survey/interview questions that I will ask, this means you consent to participate in this research project. Do you have any questions? Do I have your permission to audiotape this interview?

If you have any questions or concerns about the research, please feel free to contact Robynne Locke, rlocke@du.edu, or Sylk Sotto-Santiago, Office of Research and Sponsored Programs at 303-871-4052 or call or write to the University of Denver, Office of Research and Sponsored Programs, 2199 S. University Blvd., Denver, CO 80208-2121, 303.871.2121, orsp@du.edu.
APPENDIX E: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

**Demographic**

Age:  
Sex:  
Education:  
Birthplace:  
Program:  
Role at Program:  
Time at Program:  

1. What is your definition of successful rehabilitation? How do you measure this success?  

2. Without names, can you describe cases of successful rehabilitation? Are these cases typical?  

3. What obstacles do survivors face after emancipation?  

4. How do survivors avoid these obstacles?  

5. Are there personal characteristics of survivors that make them more likely to return to the sex industry? If so, what are they?  

6. What kinds of preparation are most important for survivors to receive to be successfully rehabilitated?  

7. Can/should survivors participate in designing rehabilitation programs? Why or why not?  

8. What, if anything, is needed to improve [program]?