Police Violence in Brazil

Kyra Moon

Police Violence in Brazil

Abstract

"This was just the beginning. They want war, and they"ll get war. The problem of trafficking will only be resolved with blood. It is the only language they understand." This was the response of Mario Azevedo, chief delegate of the 21st police precinct in the Bonsucsso neighborhood in Rio de Janeiro, after drug traffickers killed three police officers. Three days after that assault, one hundred and twenty heavily armed police officers stormed into the Nova Brasilia favela (the Brazilian term for slum or shantytown) and killed thirteen residents, four of which were minors. Press reports initially described this incident in the favela as one between the police and drug traffickers. However, further investigation found that it was a massacre characterized by cruelty and that the police were not even specifically targeting suspected drug traffickers. Fighting violence with violence is not the correct way to decrease instances of crime. Police reform is desperately needed in Brazil to ensure that the crime problem does not continue to increase.

Keywords

Human rights, Brazil, Police violence, Police reform

Copyright Statement / License for Reuse

Publication Statement

Police Violence in Brazil
By Kyra Moon

Incidences of Police Violence in Brazil

"This was just the beginning. They want war, and they'll get war. The problem of trafficking will only be resolved with blood. It is the only language they understand." This was the response of Mario Azevedo, chief delegate of the 21st police precinct in the Bonsucsso neighborhood in Rio de Janeiro, after drug traffickers killed three police officers. Three days after that assault, one hundred and twenty heavily armed police officers stormed into the Nova Brasilia *favela* (the Brazilian term for slum or shantytown) and killed thirteen residents, four of which were minors. Press reports initially described this incident in the *favela* as one between the police and drug traffickers. However, further investigation found that it was a massacre characterized by cruelty and that the police were not even specifically targeting suspected drug traffickers. Fighting violence with violence is not the correct way to decrease instances of crime. Police reform is desperately needed in Brazil to ensure that the crime problem does not continue to increase.

In 1992, the Sao Paulo police killed more people than the last military dictatorship did in all of Brazil during its many years of rule (Brinks 2003: 1). In the last twenty years, the police in Sao Paulo have killed at least 11,692 people (Caldeira 2002: 236). In Rio de Janeiro, police killings have increased substantially since 1999. In 2006, police killings made up fourteen percent of all 7,594 killings in Rio de Janeiro. Since 2000, thousands of people in Brazil have been killed annually by police in situations reported as "resistance followed by death." This term provides a way for the police to hide the fact that their aggression may be unwarranted. Most of these cases have not been investigated and, thus, it is hard to adequately distinguish which instances were unjustifiable (Amnesty International 2008: 4).

Factors Contributing to the High Occurrence of Police Violence

The question of why there is such a high incidence of police violence in Brazil is an often-asked, complex question that requires a multifaceted answer. The high occurrence of police violence seems contrary to the fact that Brazil is a democratic state and is seen as having progressive human rights laws. For example, Brazil was one of the first countries to draw up a National Human Rights Plan, has cooperated with international human rights organizations, and extends open invitations to Special Rapporteurs. However, there is a large gap between what the human rights laws represent and their implementation. Although Brazil is a democracy, there are numerous factors that may contribute to increased police violence.

I. Brazil's Transition from an Authoritarian to a Democratic State

The problems affecting the police and institutions of police governance in Brazil are a result of the country's history, in which both the civilian and military regimes have relied upon the police as a means of social and political oppression. The democratic constitution of 1988 left police institutions unchanged. The economic stagnation that accompanied the transition to democracy led to deepening social inequalities and increasing criminality, which, in turn, created a social climate that promoted the excessive use of police force.

116

Human rights violations such as police violence have increased in Brazil, not in spite of the transition but partly because of it. First, opportunities available to the marginalized class under democratic rule may provide incentives to the middle and upper classes to repress the lower class, and to try to prevent certain opportunities from becoming available to them. Secondly, increasing rates of crime and violence may encourage citizens to vote for leaders who would reestablish order through any means possible, even by the use of repression. Additionally, civil society in newer democracies may not be well established and, thus, has less power to promote governmental accountability.

II. Inequality and Discrimination

Police violence continues to reinforce the high prevalence of inequality in Brazil. The victims of police violence are usually poor, black, or mixed-race youth, most of whom have no criminal record. In part, the police target this group of marginalized people because its members fit the criminal stereotype. Police can usually get away with oppression, as the victims are afraid of the police and, therefore, do not report them. In fact, many people who live in the *favelas* do not report crimes because they believe that the criminals and police work together.

An underlying theme in much of the literature on police violence in Brazil is that the police work for the good of the upper class. By taking action against the marginalized, the upper class may feel like the police are doing their duty and protecting them. This idea perpetuates the crime problem and class conflict, as the upper class wants to feel protected and the lower class notices that its members are being unfairly discriminated against. As a result, people that live in *favelas* may actually commit crimes against upper class citizens, contributing further to the fear of the marginalized. This, in turn, empowers the police to continue to stereotype the marginalized as criminals and to use any means possible to protect the upper class from them.

III. High Incidence of Crime

In recent years, there has been a sharp rise in violent crime, due in large part to frustration with the state of Brazilian society, and to the inability of the government to improve living conditions. At the root of this violence is the lack of a functioning justice system and law enforcement structure. Bribery and corruption also plague the system and delegitimize the police; people believe that government officials accept money as an exchange for silence.

The high levels of crime in many parts of Brazil promote police violence because the police are not held accountable for their violent actions, if the actions are deemed appropriate in order to control crime. Many citizens, including those in the marginalized groups, believe that police officers should not have to obey the law in order to uphold it. Police violence continues because of the ambivalent attitudes of citizens who live in constant fear of both criminals and the police, and who do not have an adequate outlet for reporting crimes.

IV. Lack of Accountability and Reporting Mechanisms

117

The lack of accountability and sizeable discretion given to police officers encourage police violence, as do low levels of training and professionalism, weak internal and external control mechanisms, and low police salaries. An Amnesty International report identifies the flaws in the criminal justice system that contribute to police violence. The report identifies the lack of independent bodies to receive complaints. It also points out the limited protection for victims or witnesses of human rights violations, as well as limited access to justice. Since the majority of victims come from the marginalized class, they have difficulty accessing the justice system; even if they succeed, the process is very slow and the victims are highly unlikely to win their cases.

Attempts at Reform

The increased awareness of human rights among Brazilian citizens, along with the international pressure that has been put on Brazil to prevent police violence, has resulted in some ideas for reform. Unfortunately, none of these ideas have resulted in decreasing occurrences of police violence and it is becoming increasingly apparent that policies that have worked effectively in other regions have not worked in the same manner in Brazil. One of the main reasons that tested models have not worked in Brazil is the lack of accurate information available regarding police violence and the workings of state institutions in relation to the criminal justice system.

Even though people are aware of the problem of police violence and there is a large amount of literature on the subject, there has not been much—if any—progress made relating to the criminal justice system during the last twenty years. The greatest challenge for police reformers is to make sure that all people are treated equally. Another problem is the quick-fix policies that are often recommended; policy makers must set their sights on the long term so that the policy itself is not dependent on the administration at the time that it is implemented.

Conclusion: How to Decrease Instances of Police Violence

There is a need for a second transition to democracy in Brazil in order to restructure state institutions and civil society and, thus, close the gap between the stated democratic laws and what has actually been implemented. The initial transition had dilemmas because of the country's history, institutions, and culture—all of which are complex issues that need to be addressed more thoroughly than they have been. State institutions need to assume responsibility for monitoring the police forces and implementing appropriate oversight mechanisms. It is the responsibility of the citizens and communities to mobilize their energy to make sure that the crime problem is controlled and to insist that government programs that assist them in doing this work appropriately.

Annotations

"Getting Away with Murder." 2003. *Economist* 366 (8312): 14-15.

> Annotation: The article first introduces the idea of community policing as a possible way to reduce police corruption and violence in Brazil, and then explains the idea's inherent weaknesses and why it has not worked. It is noted that although poverty has declined in parts of Brazil, crime has continued to rise. While there is a lack of leadership and cooperation

118

among government associations, crime gangs are becoming highly organized and professional. Critics of community policing believe that, even though the programs may cut violence, they do not prevent crimes such as drug dealing; drug dealers have realized that if there is no violence in an area, they will not be highly sought after by the police.

"Urban Police Violence in Brazil: Torture and Police Killings in Sao Paulo and Rio de Janeiro after Five Years." 1993. *Human Rights Watch / Americas* 5 (5): 1-26.

Annotation: This article is an update to a similar report that was completed in 1987. The update states that Brazilians have become more aware of human rights violations since the time of the first report. Human Rights Watch compares and contrasts police violence in Sao Paulo to that found in Rio de Janeiro. One of the recommendations made is to have the two police forces (civil and military) "check" each other. This article uses case studies and then lays out some general recommendations/conclusions. The article concludes strongly by stating that if state governments will not take action on this issue, then the national government should.

Ahnen, Ronald E. 2007. "The Politics of Police Violence in Democratic Brazil." *Latin American Politics and Society* 49 (1): 141-164.

Annotation: In this article, Ahnen examines police killings in nineteen Brazilian states from 1994-2001. Ahnen discusses why human rights violations, in particular police violence, have increased since re-democratization in Brazil. The author hypothesizes that the partisanship of government leaders is a key determinant of the rate of police violence. Ahnen focuses on the thought that democracy may lead to or increase human rights violations. Overall, the author concludes that police violence can be decreased if politicians can find political support for the policies needed to implement change.

Ames, Barry. 1999. "Approaches to the Study of Institutions in Latin American Politics." *Latin American Research Review* 34 (1): 221-236.

Annotation: This is a review article of the following seven sources: "Building Democracy in Brazil: The Politics of Constitutional Change" by Javier Martinez-Lara; "Electoral Laws and the Survival of Presidential Democracies" by Marc P. Jones; "Federalismos Latino Americanos: Mexico, Brasil, Argentina" edited by Marcello Carmagnani; "The Global Resurgence of Democracy" edited by Larry Diamond and Marc F. Plattner; "Local Government in Latin America" by Andrew Nickson; "Presidencialismo Ou Parlamentarismo" edited by Bolivar Lamounier and Dieter Nohlen; and "Term Limits and Legislative Representation" by John Carey. The main issue underlying much of the institutional literature is the consolidation of democracies. Overall, Ames believes that the literature on institutions in Latin America is pretty thorough, yet still explores possible directions that future research on state institutions can take and suggests that it needs to address institutions in both horizontal and vertical terms.

Amnesty International. 2005. "Brazil: 'They Came in Shooting': Policing Socially Excluded

119

Communities: Facts and Figures and Case Studies." (December 2)
http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/AMR19/033/2005/en/dom-AMR190332005en.html.

Annotation: In this press release, Amnesty International discusses the facts and figures relating to violence and crime in Brazil. The social disparities in Brazil are noted. For example, in 1998 the richest 20 percent of the population received over 64 percent of the income, and the poorest 20 percent only received 2 percent. Between 1998 and 2004, police forces in Rio de Janeiro and San Paulo killed 9,889 people; the deaths were registered as "resistance followed by death." The end of the report is comprised of a couple of case studies, but does not make any recommendations.

Amnesty International. 2008. "Brazil: Submission to the UN Universal Periodic Review: First Session of the UPR Working Group, 7-11 April 2008,"
http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/AMR19/023/2007/en/dom-AMR190232007en.html.

Annotation: In this report, Amnesty International discusses human rights legislation in Brazil and the impacts—or lack thereof—it has had on police violence. Amnesty International lays out the following flaws in the criminal justice system: lack of independent bodies; lack of independent and properly resourced forensic investigation units; limited protection for victims or witnesses of human rights violations; limited access to justice. State and federal governments have ignored the area of public security policy due to short-term political interests, corrupt practices, and a lack of civic duty. The report concludes that the government must take part in reducing police killings by making sure that investigations take place for every allegation, by making the findings public, and by making sure fair trials are conducted.

Arias, Enrique Desmond. 2006. Drugs & Democracy in Rio de Janeiro: Trafficking, Social Networks & Public Security. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press.

Annotation: Enrique Desmond Arias, assistant professor of government at the John Jay College of Criminal Justice at the City University of New York, interviewed and observed people in three *favelas* in Rio de Janeiro over a period of nine years. In this book, the author discusses how the rise in crime, in particular that related to drugs, leads to oppressive policing and institutional corruption. The author points out that the breakup of class structure—divisions between the rich and poor—contributes largely to this repression. Overall, Arias concludes that to stop (or at least minimize) the crime and corruption, change must be made at the local level, as well as at the national level.

Bailey, John, and Lucia Dammert (eds.). 2006. Public Security and Police Reform in the Americas. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press.

Annotation: The authors in this collection argue that generic models of police reform, applied to emerging democracies in Latin America, will not necessarily work in the same manner as they have in other regions. One of the main challenges in Brazil is the lack of accurate

120

information, which, in turn, has a negative effect on policy making. The contributors in this book believe that to truly understand the issue of police violence, political corruption, and possible resolutions, more research needs to be done on the composition of state institutions, and interviews of public officials need to be conducted. Also, it is important for research and suggested programs to set measurable, concrete goals.

Bayley, David H., and Clifford D. Shearing. 1996. "The Future of Policing." *Law & Society Review* 30 (3): 585-606.

Annotation: The authors examine the restructuring of policing currently taking place in developed democratic societies. Police in democratic states have increasingly been questioning their role, and whether or not they are actually reducing crime. Community policing, which suggests that police cannot prevent crime without public participation, is one possible way to restructure. However, many police officers still believe that traditional, crime-fighting policing is more effective than community policing. The authors pose the following question: Can modern democratic, individualistic societies provide humane policing equitably for their members? The authors believe that the answer to this question is yes, if the following two policies are adopted: first, they believe it is necessary to enable poor people to participate in markets for security; second, they think that community policing should become the organizing model for public policing.

Brinks, Daniel M. 2003. "Informal Institutions and the Rule of Law: The Judicial Response to State Killings in Buenos Aires and Sao Paulo in the 1990s." *Comparative Politics* 36 (1): 1-19.

Annotation: Brinks' main point is that informal institutions impact the operation of formal institutions. State killings and corruption in Brazil are not related to an absence of rules, but rather to the presence of unofficial rules, which are often labeled "informal institutions." In relation to policing, it is noted that police continue to follow informal rules, but there is little evidence that the informal rules penetrate the formal structure of the judiciary institution; therefore, the informal rules are said to work only if it is not detected that they have been used. Overall, Brinks concludes that it is essential for specialized organizations and procedures to be created in order to extract information from the police, as well as citizens.

Burke, Roger Hopkins (ed.). 2004. Hard Cop, Soft Cop: Dilemmas and Debates in Contemporary Policing. Portland: Willan Publishing.

Annotation: This book is divided into three sections: policing contemporary communities; policing contemporary offenses; and democracy, accountability, and human rights. The book does not focus on any region in particular in relation to these topics, but rather discusses policing strategies broadly. One of the main themes of this compilation is the conflicting need for security versus the need for human rights. It is helpful to use this book to gather ideas about why Brazil may have problems with police violence, as well as how those problems may be resolved.

Caldeira, Teresa P.R. 2002. "The Paradox of Police Violence in Democratic Brazil." *Ethnography* 3 (3): 235-263.

> Annotation: The paradox that Caldeira refers to in this article is that the support of police violence coexists with negative thoughts about the police force and their victimization of the working-class. Caldeira bases this article on fieldwork completed in San Paulo, Brazil between 2001 and 2002. The author points out that public security and policing are two of the most problematic issues in Brazil today. Although some parts of the Brazilian society have been effectively democratized, other parts—such as civil rights, the justice system, and public security—continue to be evaluated based on privilege and police violence, therefore, continues to be considered an acceptable way to deal with crime.

Cavallaro, James. 1996. "Brazil: Fighting Violence with Violence: Human Rights Abuse and Criminality in Rio de Janeiro." *Human Rights Watch/Americas* 8 (2): 1-29.

> Annotation: Cavallaro's main points are that human rights abuses undermine the legitimacy of crime control efforts and that police in Brazil weaken the very rule of law that they set out to uphold. Overall, the author believes that to effectively combat crime in Brazil, the crimes committed by the police must be dealt with first and foremost. In this article, Cavallaro not only discusses case studies, but also includes a series of in-depth recommendations to supplement them.

Chevigny, Paul G. 1991. "Police Deadly Force as Social Control: Jamaica, Brazil, and Argentina." In Vigilantism and the State in Modern Latin America. Edited by M. K. Huggins. New York: Praeger Publishers.

> Annotation: Paul G. Chevigny is a professor of law at New York University School of Law. The portion of this article that focuses on Brazil predominantly discusses Sao Paulo and Rio de Janeiro. The large amount of vigilante violence in both cities can be found in the form of lynching and death squads. Chevigny cites an interesting study done in the early 1970s by Janice Perlman to help explain why these forms of violence may be considered acceptable. Perlman interviewed people living in the *favelas* regarding what they thought of as their rights. Their answers included "the right to respect the authorities" and "the right to obey the laws."

_____. 1995. Edge of the Knife: Police Violence in the Americas. New York: The New Press.

> Annotation: The author reports on police violence in six urban areas throughout the Americas: Los Angeles, New York, Sao Paulo, Buenos Aires, Jamaica, and Mexico City. The author points out that if similar cities display different levels of police violence, there may be hope for improving upon the problem. Another point for hope is seen in the impact that international norms have on police reform. Relatively new democracies, such as Brazil and many other Latin American countries, are pressured to adhere to these norms, in part because of the fear that press reports on human rights abuses and have a negative impact on their legitimacy.

122

Clark, Timothy W. 2008. "Structural Predictors of Brazilian Police Violence." *Deviant Behavior* 29 (2): 85-110.

Annotation: Timothy Clark reviews the following three structural theories of police violence, specifically in relation to the Sao Paulo area during the last two decades of the 20th century: the reaction-to-crime, the reaction-to-violence, and the threat models. The article begins by discussing the view of the elites that dark-skinned, poor, ill-educated, and rural immigrants are social threats, referring to them as "dangerous classes"; yet, even though elites tend to put pressure on the police, the author finds that police violence in Sao Paulo is a reaction to crimes such as robbery and assault, regardless of the levels of "dangerous classes." The idea is put forth that police violence is linked to short-term changes in social conditions rather than long-term ones. Overall, this article is well thought out and balanced.

Das, Dilip K., and Peter C. Kratcoski (eds.). 2007. <u>Police Education and Training in a Global Society</u>. Lanham: Lexington Books.

Annotation: The authors in this edited book explore the similarities and differences in police officer training around the world. In chapter thirteen, entitled "Police Training for Democracy," Otwin Marenin argues that while the idea of democratic policing is agreed upon and taught to police forces in democratic societies, actually converting international values into local police forces is much more complex. Marenin focuses the article on which principles and characteristics should be concentrated on when trying to create a truly democratic police force. In chapter fourteen, "Police Education and Training in a Global Society: A Brazilian Overview," Paulo Rogerio Lino states that international cooperation is needed to fight the criminals in Brazil, but, in order to do this, cultural, linguistic, legal, and bureaucratic barriers must be addressed and overcome.

Dos Santos, Jose Vicente Tavares. 2004. "The World Police Crisis and the Construction of Democratic Policing." *International Review of Sociology* 14 (1): 89-106.

Annotation: This article provides a general framework regarding reform of policing worldwide. It suggests that when policing is reduced to repressive social control, police start using violence, which, in turn, has led to gross violations of human rights. Even though this article is not about police violence in Brazil specifically, it is very interesting, as it lays out specific problems of policing and presents possible solutions.

Edelman, Lauren B., and Mark C. Suchman. 1999. "When the 'Haves' Hold Court: Speculations on the Organizational Internalization of Law." *Law & Society Review* 33 (4): 941-991.

Annotation: This article builds on Marc Galanter's 1974 essay "Why the 'Haves' Come Out Ahead," which portrays large, bureaucratic organizations as the typical players in the legal system. The authors hypothesize that the relationship between law and organizations has undergone the following four shifts in recent years: the legalization of organizational

123

governance; the expansion of private dispute resolution; the rise of in-house counsel; the reemergence of private policing. The authors state that while "have not" groups may gain some advantages from the introduction of citizenship norms into the workplace, the power of the elites may increase with the organizational takeover of law, which subtly distorts the balance between democratic and bureaucratic tendencies in society as a whole.

Foweraker, Joe, and Roman Krznaric. 2002. "The Uneven Performance of Third Wave Democracies: Electoral Politics and the Imperfect Rule of Law in Latin America." *Latin American Politics and Society* 44 (3): 29-60.

Annotation: Foweraker and Krznaric investigate the uneven quality of third-wave (1970-1998) democracies, specifically Brazil, Guatemala, and Colombia. The study shows that uneven quality and an imperfect rule of law are mostly a result of the nature of oligarchic power, as well as a failure to hold the military accountable. Although these countries are considered democracies because they have freely held elections, they are not truly democratic, as the citizens do not have adequate means to defend the rule of law or protect their rights. It is argued that this may just be part of the transition process and that eventually these governments will come to fit the more traditional definition of a democracy, but this is yet to be seen.

Goldsmith, Andrew. 2005. "Police Reform and the Problem of Trust." *Theoretical Criminology* 9 (4): 443-470.

Annotation: Goldsmith's main argument in this article is that public trust in police is essential to police effectiveness and legitimacy. Trust in police tends to be low in regions with social disorganization and high amounts of socio-economic inequality. Goldsmith has two goals in the article: to provide a better understanding of the factors that undermine public trust in police, and to ask how trust in police can be established and maintained. It is a complicated process to get people to trust police when they have historically been abused or neglected. To establish trust, it is essential that accountability mechanisms, both internal and external, be implemented.

Guyot, Dorothy. 1991. Policing as though People Matter. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Annotation: Guyot maintains that when police officers are treated as professionals, they will treat citizens in a professional manner as well. Although the author writes about a particular police department in Troy, New York, the focus is on general problems of policing and their possible solutions. The ideas discussed in this book can easily be applied to Brazil. The author lays out standards by which to judge police officers, as well as changes that can be made by setting specific goals for police departments. Guyot uses the Troy case study to display that changes can in fact be made with reorganization.

Hinton, Mercedes S. 2005. "A Distant Reality: Democratic Policing in Argentina and Brazil." *Criminal Justice: International Journal of Policy and Practice* 5 (1): 75-100.

124

Annotation: In this article, Mercedes Hinton discusses the similarities of policing in Argentina and Brazil. Both countries share common problems that have prevented them from establishing police institutions that benefit democracy; this is due, in large part, to the historical roots of militaristic dictatorships. Attempts at reform have not worked in the past due to the politicization of the police, which is effected by low levels of training and professionalism, weak controls, and low salaries. While policymakers try to enforce "quick-fix" reforms, they fail to address the existing problems and, therefore, the reforms do not work. Overall, Hinton believes that the federal government needs to take a bigger role in leading policy reform and sees police simply as the universal scapegoat for larger, institutional deficits.

Huggins, Martha K. 1998. Political Policing: The United States and Latin America. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Annotation: The author examines how the spread of U.S. security through such means as foreign police training affects Latin America, in particular Brazil. Huggins discusses once-classified records to help explain the impact of U.S. policy on police infringements on international human rights in Brazil. In many cases, the national state no longer has full control, as the police unit promotes the interest of the other state (i.e. the United States). The United States does this for selfish reasons, in order to protect and strengthen its position in the world, and to maintain a sense of control. Huggins does not give any definitive answers in this book, but uses it more as an outlet to discuss findings and to posit questions to the reader.

_____. 2000. "Modernity and Devolution: The Making of Police Death Squads in Modern Brazil." In Death Squads in Global Perspective. Edited by B. B. Campbell and A. D. Brenner. New York: St. Martin's Press.

Annotation: Huggins discusses the strong connection between death squads and the state/criminal justice system. Each new death squad that is created has an increasingly distant relationship to the justice system, which creates a problem for the state, as the state loses the control it once had. One insight that is very important in this article is how the institutions under Brazilian democracy are not acting in democratic manners, thus de-legitimizing the state.

_____. 2000. "Urban Violence and Police Privatization in Brazil: Blended Invisibility." Social Justice 27 (2): 113-135.

Annotation: In this article, Huggins discusses the invisibility of many murders in Brazil due to the lower-class victims who are considered intrinsically deviant and socially evil. Other problems that are pointed out include the mixed status of police agents, as well as the distance that the state must maintain from police violence so that it is not apparent that it is partial to certain classes; this distance is important for the legitimacy of the state, but can also lead to a lack of control of its agents.

Huggins, Martha Knisely, Mika Haritos-Fatouros, and Philip G. Zimbardo. 2002. Violence Workers:

125

Police Torturers and Murderers Reconstruct Brazilian Atrocities. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Annotation: The authors interviewed twenty-three Brazilian policemen, fourteen of which either tortured of murdered people during the military regime (1964-1985). These interviews were conducted in order to get a feel for how men can be transformed when in the role of "police officer," how they justify their actions, and how these actions impact their lives. While this is an interesting sociological study, it may not accurately represent the police officer mindset and the information presented must be taken with a grain of salt.

Kaplan, David E. 2002. "The Law of the Jungle." *US News & World Report* 133 (14): 35.

Annotation: What the author depicts as "the law of the jungle" refers to the lack of government presence in *favelas* in Rio de Janeiro, which, in turn, are ruled by drug traffickers. There are 764 *favelas* in Rio de Janeiro, housing 1.2 million people (20 percent of the city's population). Recently, the media has been promoting awareness of the issues in the *favelas*. Unfortunately, to date, increased awareness has had little impact on the will of people to stop the violence. Overall, the author depicts how criminals and police rely on and protect each other, leading to increased violence in these areas. Although this article includes some useful facts and ideas, not much detail provided, and it lacks a clear conclusion.

Leeds, Elizabeth. 2007. "Serving States and Serving Citizens: Halting Steps Towards Police Reform in Brazil and Implications for Donor Intervention." *Policing & Society* 17 (1): 21-37.

Annotation: Elizabeth Leeds addresses the lack of progress made during the last 20 years regarding the criminal justice system in Brazil, and details what donors need to be aware of if they want to assist in decreasing the corruption. Leeds lays out the following three strategies for change, specifically for donors to follow: stimulate police-society relations that promote human rights and police effectiveness; promote police organization that could easily respond to community needs and crime-reduction in a proactive, rather than reactive, way; create a trusting relationship between the police and the community by creating police oversight mechanisms that foster public safety.

Loader, Ian. 2000. "Plural Policing and Democratic Governance." *Social & Legal Studies* 9 (3): 323-345.

Annotation: In this article, Ian Loader asks how people may best come to terms with the multiplicity of institutional forms that are now involved in the delivery of policing. Loader asks many questions such as, for example, how the public interest can be heard and taken into account when shaping the diverse network of policing that is emerging. Rather than answering these questions, Loader asks them in order to open up discussion about the problems of coordination and accountability in policing. The author does present a couple of ideas regarding how democracy might proceed in this type of environment.

_____. 2006. "Policing, Recognition, and Belonging." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political*

126

and Social Science 605 (1): 201-221.

Annotation: In this article, Loader develops the idea that policing is a social institution and, therefore, communicates authoritative meanings to citizens and groups regarding who they are, whether their voices are heard, and whether they belong to the community. Loader argues that it is essential to make security a clear ingredient in democracy. In order to do this, conditions must first exist so that individuals feel an attachment to the political community. The question that Loader poses in this article is how the cycles (or spirals, as he refers to them) that promote practices of pervasive security can be broken.

Loader, Ian, and Neil Walker. 2001. "Policing as a Public Good: Reconstituting the Connections between Policing and the State." *Theoretical Criminology* 5 (1): 9-35.

Annotation: The authors begin this article by pointing out that while the state is still important in the delivery and regulation of policing, it is no longer the only institutional actor involved in policing. Loader and Walker go on to discuss four means by which the state-policing nexus might be established: the monopoly of legitimate coercion, the delivery of civic governance, the guarantee of collective provision, and the symbolism of state and nation. The conclusion attempts to find a communal conception of policing as a public good by using the four means above to reconfigure the relationship of policing with the state.

Macaulay, Fiona. 2007. "Knowledge Production, Framing and Criminal Justice in Latin America." *Journal of Latin American Studies* 39 (3): 627-652.

Annotation: One of the main questions asked by the author is why, despite the crime problem in Brazil, policy to control crime has not been discussed by state institutions or external agencies. Macaulay ends the article with a hopeful note, observing that during the last few years more reliable data about violence and crime has become available. The Ministry of Justice is now backing increased research about the "best practice" in criminal justice, displaying that the government is, in fact, aware of the importance of empirical data. Overall, the lack of research in the past meant that policymakers made uninformed (or misinformed) decisions.

Maguire, Edward M. 2003. <u>Organizational Structure in American Police Agencies: Context, Complexity, and Control</u>. Albany: State University of New York Press.

Annotation: The author recognizes that there is a problem with the idea that reorganizing police units will reduce their problems. It is important to define certain characteristics of police organizations that are unique to that organization in particular. It is noted that the structure of the organization is shaped by factors beyond human means. Even though this study focuses on police forces in the United States, it is still helpful, as it is presented in a broad manner to be able to think about the issue in an international context.

Marenin, Otwin (ed.). 1996. <u>Policing Change, Changing Police: International Perspectives</u>. New York:

127

Garland Publishing.

Annotation: This collection of twelve essays focuses on the changing patterns of policing in changing societies. An analysis of policing in Brazil displays how the political and cultural traditions have led to the legitimation of police violence. The Brazilian case emphasizes the difficulties, as well as the possibilities, of reducing police violence by changing the relationships between the police, the state, and the community. The other essays investigate the legal and police systems of three Arab countries, Hong Kong, Italy, and Great Britain in its use of security forces in Northern Ireland, South Africa, the former USSR, the newly independent countries of the former USSR, and the European Union.

Mitchell, Michael J., and Charles H. Wood. 1999. "Ironies of Citizenship: Skin Color, Police Brutality, and the Challenge to Democracy in Brazil." *Social Forces* 77 (3): 1001-1020.

Annotation: The authors discuss the process and problems that would be associated with a second transition to democracy in Brazil. The authors point out that police behavior is influenced by an institutional framework and culture that is prone to exercising power in a prejudiced manner. Overall, the authors suggest that an elected government alone is not enough for a country to be considered a true democracy. They propose that in Brazil the state institutions and civil society need to be reconstructed, as well as the overall culture, in order to move away from oppression of certain groups.

Paes-Machado, Eduardo, and Ceci Vilar Noronha. 2002. "Policing the Brazilian Poor: Resistance to and Acceptance of Police Brutality in Urban Popular Classes (Salvador, Brazil)." *International Criminal Justice Review* 12 (1): 53-76.

Annotation: Paes-Machado and Noronha observed and interviewed people in Novos Alagados, a suburb of Salvador, Brazil. The thesis of this article is that police violence in Brazil is justified, in large part, by the ambivalent attitudes of the citizens. The authors note that there have been cases of successful resistance when residents have come together to take action against police. Unfortunately, to date, these initiatives have been small and localized and have yet to spread to the entire city. The authors focus on the idea that communities must take responsibility; that they must mobilize their energy to control the violence and reformulate existing governmental programs.

Pereira, Anthony W. 2001. "Virtual Legality: Authoritarian Legacies and the Reform of Military Justice in Brazil, the Southern Cone, and Mexico." *Comparative Political Studies* 34 (5): 555-574.

Annotation: Anthony Pereira starts this article by stating that courts are very important to new democracies because they are the means by which citizens can defend their rights that are at the basis of democracy. Unfortunately, in much of Latin America, the courts do not embody the new democracies of the countries, but rather remain embedded in aspects of their previous authoritarian regimes. The author takes this idea and applies it to the following case studies: Brazil & Chile, Argentina, and Mexico. Overall, the author concludes that the process of transition is a part of larger historical processes that differ based on the issues and institutions.

128

Pinheiro, Paulo Sergio. 1991. "Police and Political Crisis: The Case of the Military Police." In
    Vigilantism and the State in Modern Latin America. Edited by M. K. Huggins. New York:
    Praeger Publishers.

    Annotation: In this article, Pinheiro notes that authoritarian police practices have continued to
    exist in Brazil, even when the focus of the police unit shifts. The author discusses the
    development of police in a historical context, in particular, noting that political crises have
    been used by those in power to create a sense of fear in citizens and, thus, to increase the
    power of the police. Pinheiro concludes that to have a truly democratic state, Brazil cannot
    allow its military police to survive. The problem is that many people in Brazil view the crime
    problem as a war and believe that the military form of police is needed to fight it.

_____. 1996. "Democracies without Citizenship." *NACLA Report on the Americas* 30 (2): 17-23.

    Annotation: In this article, Pinheiro focuses on the large gap between the democratic
    constitution and law enforcement in Brazil and how this compromises the legitimacy of the
    government. Even though Brazil is officially a democracy, the change of their political system
    has done little to eliminate the authoritarian practices of the society, police, and judicial units.
    The large class gap and lack of law enforcement make crime appealing to those that hope to
    clime the social ladder and have no other viable way of doing so. Additionally, police view the
    law as an obstacle, as they believe that they have the moral responsibility to protect society
    from its marginal elements.

Power, Timothy Joseph. 2000. The Political Right in Postauthoritarian Brazil: Elites, Institutions, and
    Democratization. University Park, PA: Penn State Press.

    Annotation: This book explores Brazil's conservative transition from an authoritarian state to a
    democratic one and the harmful consequences this has had on institution building. The term
    "conservative transition" refers to an old regime that still assumes a large role in the new one.
    The book is broken into the following eight sections: continuities in political democratization:
    politicians and institutions in postauthoritarian regimes; definitions and concepts:
    consolidation, institutions, and the right; ARENA and its ancestors: the Brazilian political
    right, 1946-1985; ARENA in the afterlife: a portrait of the political right in the new republic;
    the right in the party system: politicians against institutions; the right in congress: implications
    for legislative institutionalization; class reunions: collective action with the ARENA/PDS
    cohort, 1987-1999; and the impact of conservative democratization: legacies and lessons in the
    Brazilian case.

Silva, Jorge Da. 2000. "The Favelados in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil." *Policing & Society* 10 (1): 121-130.

    Annotation: Jorge Da Silva discusses the economic and racial divides in Brazil and how it is
    essential to take these divisions into account when proposing police reform. Silva notes that
    most proposals for reform are not well thought out and, therefore, lays out the following four

129

major problems that should be thought about before proposing reform: Brazil's myth of racial democracy; Rio's economic and racial division; the centralization of the police force; militarization. The article ends on a hopeful note, as the author states that more and more people are realizing that fighting violence with violence is not the answer and will simply create more violence.

Stenning, Philip C., and Clifford D. Shearing. 2005. "Reforming Police: Opportunities, Drivers and Challenges." *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Criminology* 38 (2): 167-180.

> Annotation: This article serves as an introduction to an entire journal issue on police reform, namely the opportunities and challenges facing police reform worldwide in the 21st century. The focus on policing has been shifting from an emphasis on crime control and law enforcement to an emphasis on broader goals of security, safety, and harm reduction/prevention. The authors lay out the challenges for police reform, such as the enduring culture and history of corruption and dominance of partisan interests. To adequately reform policing, there must be ongoing political will and commitment. The authors see the beginning of the 21st century as a time with unprecedented opportunities for reform.

Stewart, Jay. 1991. "Portrait of Brazil: A Society Out of Control." *Harvard International Review* 14 (1): 47-49.

> Annotation: The author suggests that frustration with the Brazilian government, in particular the poor police infrastructure and justice system, has led to increased violence; when the police do not enforce the law, many people seek to enforce it themselves. Most citizens are either too scared or too detached to do anything about changing their current situation. Stewart also discusses how difficult it will be for the government to implement changes due to the citizens' lack of faith in state institutions. A few suggestions are made as to how this problem can be resolved, although the suggestions lack details.

Vincent, Isabel. 2008. "Where Even the Good are Bad." *Maclean's* 121 (4/5): 33-35.

> Annotation: The focus of this article is the problem of crime and violence in Rio de Janeiro. A UNESCO report mentioned in the article states that the death rate from gunshots in Brazil over the last decade is higher than the death rate in most war zones. The film *Elite Squad*, which is about a Brazilian police officer that tortures and kills drug dealers in an attempt to stem violence, is the main point of discussion in this article. The author relates how the film is associated with reality in Brazil. All in all, the article is filled with useful facts and observations, but does not go beyond that.

Wacquant, Loic. 2003. "Toward a Dictatorship Over the Poor." *Punishment & Society* 5 (2): 197-205.

> Annotation: This article is very short and to the point. The author brings up a good question and something to start thinking about in regards to the violence problem in Brazil: Why will the US "zero-tolerance" system and policy control not work in Brazil? The answers to this

question refer to the many differences between the two countries that cannot be oversimplified, including: the depths and scale of poverty; the amount of violent crime; the history and economy of the country; and the make-up of the police force, court system, and prisons.

Wampler, Brian, and Leonardo Avritzer. 2004. "Participatory Publics: Civil Society and New Institutions in Democratic Brazil." *Comparative Politics* 36 (3): 291-312.

Annotation: In this article, Wampler and Avritzer address the impact of civil society on institutional redesign in Brazil. The authors define participatory publics as "organized citizens who seek to overcome social and political exclusion through public deliberation, the promotion of accountability, and the implementation of their policy preferences." Overall, this concept of participatory publics has displayed how changes in civil society can lead to institutional rejuvenation. Although this article does not directly address the problem of police violence in Brazil, it allows the reader to understand that civil society does affect the state and could possibly help bring about reform in policing.

Zaluar, Alba. 2001. "Violence, Easy Money, and Justice in Brazil: 1980-1995." *International Social Science Journal* 53 (169): 435-441.

Annotation: In this article, Alba Zaluar presents and interprets the findings of field research done in Rio de Janeiro between 1998 and 2000. Zaluar concludes that crime is part of all social classes and cannot survive without the corruption of the state institutions that are supposed to be combating crime. The author also discusses how the justice system endorses this corruption. No solutions are suggested and, overall, the article has an apathetic tone.

131