

9-1-2006

John T. Scholz & Bruce Stiftel, eds., Adaptive Governance and Water Conflict: New Institutions for Collaborative Planning, Resources for the Future

Kathleen Potter

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.du.edu/wlr>



Part of the [Law Commons](#)

Custom Citation

Kathleen Potter, Book Note, John T. Scholz & Bruce Stiftel, eds., Adaptive Governance and Water Conflict: New Institutions for Collaborative Planning, Resources for the Future, 10 U. Denv. Water L. Rev. 161 (2006).

This Book Notes is brought to you for free and open access by the University of Denver Sturm College of Law at Digital Commons @ DU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Water Law Review by an authorized editor of Digital Commons @ DU. For more information, please contact jennifer.cox@du.edu, dig-commons@du.edu.

**John T. Scholz & Bruce Stiftel, eds., Adaptive Governance and Water Conflict:
New Institutions for Collaborative Planning, Resources for the Future**

This book is a “must have” reference for anyone with an interest in water law.

Roger Lucas

John T. Scholz & Bruce Stiftel, eds., Adaptive Governance and Water Conflict: New Institutions for Collaborative Planning, Resources for the Future, RFF Press, Washington, D.C. (2005); 274pp; \$29.95; ISBN 1-933115-19-X, softcover.

A. OVERVIEW/AUTHOR'S GOALS/SUMMARY OF INTRODUCTION/DEDICATION

As a starting point, Scholz and Stiftel note that water policy is in a state of perpetual crisis throughout the United States, and they argue that structural deficiencies are in part to blame for these crises. They suggest that the rise and success of specialized authorities at the local, state, and federal level, created to address first-order collective action problems, have caused second-order collective action conflicts. Increasingly, they acknowledge, decisions by one authority impact other authorities and the users they govern. Thus, in their search for collaborative processes that will adequately address complex collective action problems, Scholz and Stiftel present adaptive governance. Adaptive governance processes provide “systematic adaptive capabilities that lie somewhere between those of markets and those of democratic institutions.”

Scholz and Stiftel maintain that the successful governance of water and other natural resources depends on the creation of adaptive institutions. There are five major challenges to adaptive governance: (1) representation (who should be involved?); (2) decision process (how can authorities and involved stakeholders reach policy agreements that serve them well?); (3) scientific learning (how can policy makers develop and use knowledge effectively?); (4) public learning (how can resource users and the relevant public develop common understandings as a foundation for consensual policies and policy processes?); and (5) problem responsiveness (how well do decisions achieve natural resource management goals, including sustainability, equity, and efficiency?).

B. CASE STUDIES & ANALYSES

Part One consists of nine short chapters. The first chapter provides an overview of Florida's water management framework while the subsequent chapters offer cases studies on conflicts over water quality, water supply, and quantity, quality, and habitat. In chapter two, Ay in Dedekorkut considers the “Suwannee River Partnership: Representation Instead of Regulation” and acknowledges the success of a government-led voluntary effort by agricultural producers and conservative

groups to avert a water crisis through incentive-based reductions of nutrient discharges. Detracting from the Partnership's overall success, Dedekorkut notes that environmentalists did not join the Partnership, viewing it as a loophole for farmers to avoid pollution limits. In fact, environmentalists brought suit against Florida's Department of Environmental Protection for its participation in the Partnership. The second case study, "Fenholloway River Evaluation Initiative: Collaborative Problem Solving Within the Permit System," by Simon A. Andrew, highlights ways in which this Initiative created processes for investigating options based on mutually agreed upon procedures and criteria, instead of fighting over individual preferred options. Here, because the actors involved in the Initiative considered the design process as important as the end product, and all had a chance to express their concerns, the actors had great confidence in the decision-making structure. In "Tampa Bay Water Wars: From Conflict to Collaboration?," Ay in Dedekorkut identifies the following factors as instrumental in creating and resolving Tampa Bay's water conflicts: lack of binding authority, reluctance to give up existing advantages and independence from other local governments, nature of representation on the West Coast board, loss of institutional memory, threat of an imposed solution by the legislature, financial incentives, change of personalities, and the threat of a deadline. In "The East Central Florida Regional Water Supply Planning Initiative: Creating Collaboration," Ramiro Berardo analyzes the collective action problems that arise when multiple users share a finite source of groundwater and their objectives, as well as incentives for cooperation, vary greatly.

Chapters six through nine focus on water conflicts over quantity, quality, and habitat. In "Apalachicola-Chattahoochee-Flint Basin: Tri-state Negotiations of a Water Allocation Formula," Steven Leitman addresses the Apalachicola-Chattahoochee-Flint Basin Compact ("ACF Compact"), which is the first Interstate Water Compact in the United States since the passage of major federal environmental laws in the 1970s. Leitman questions what caused the Allocation Formula negotiations to falter and result in no agreement and a termination of the ACF Compact. Ultimately, he contends that an answer existed, but "the failure was in the negotiation and political processes." In "Everglades Restoration and the South Florida Ecosystem," Michael R. Boswell discusses the Comprehensive Everglades Restoration Plan, one of the largest ecosystem restoration projects in the human history, which is expected to be completed in 2025 at a cost of 7.8 billion dollars. Boswell recognizes that the successes of representation did not include individual citizens, especially those who might have had latent interests. Thus, Boswell recommends that institutions in South Florida do more to ensure public values and opinions be objectively measured. In "Ocklawaha River Restoration: The Fate of the Rodman Reservoir," Mellini Sloan analyzes a conflict where the two main stakeholders pos-

sess mutually exclusive visions for the ecosystem. Sloan suggests that resolution of the conflict might be feasible if the geographical scope of problem were expanded. In the last case study of Part One, Eberhard Roeder presents "Aquifer Storage and Recovery: Technology and Public Learning." Roeder considers ways that environmental groups defeated proposed legislation by opening processes up to public scrutiny through introduction of regulatory failures and timely reports on scientific uncertainties.

Part Two addresses practitioners' perspectives and consists of four short articles. In "Adaptability and Stability: A Manager's Perspective," Donald J. Polmann reiterates the important of completing projects in an ordered and productive fashion so as to minimize the disruption of vital public service. Polmann states that "even as adaptive governance is effectuated, conditions must be stable until the chapter is closed and the shift complete." In "The Power of the Status Quo," Richard Hamann questions whether

Florida's legal, administrative, and political institutions have the capability to learn from science and experience to make necessary changes in policy. In "Representation, Scientific Learning, and the Public Interest," B. Suzi Ruhl begins by acknowledging the looming threats facing human and natural systems that depend on water for life. Ruhl agrees with the editors that Florida's current water problems are due in large part to the growth of first-order institutions whose "myopic specialization has too often blinded them to the external effects of their decisions." Ruhl asserts that representation and scientific learning are the key challenges preventing the adoption of adaptive governance. In the final article of Part Two, "Adaptive Challenges Facing Agriculture," Martha Rhodes Roberts argues that agriculture has significantly shifted towards adaptive strategies though both desire and necessity.

Part Three contains eight articles from researchers' perspectives. In "Resource Planning, Dispute Resolution, and Adaptive Governance," Lawrence Susskind makes the case that Florida should apply professional dispute resolution to water conflicts. Further, he argues that, at a minimum, state legislation should mandate that all agencies involved in water resource management make a commitment to involve all stakeholders in adaptive governance. In "Policy Analysts Can Learn from Mediators," John Forester explores citizens' difficulties in learning about one another's interests and in devising adaptive policy measures in response. He also addresses ways that policy analysts can learn to design better adaptive governance processes from public dispute mediators and practitioners who routinely work with conflicting parties who may misrepresent their goals. In "Leadership and Public Learning," Robert M. Jones discusses the need for leadership strategies and skills that will make the most of public learning and bring forth solutions on water conflicts. In "Public Learning and Grassroots Co-

operation,” Mark Lubell focuses on two aspects of public learning: factors that determine stakeholders’ views on the effectiveness of water management policies, as well as factors that determine participation in water management activities. Connie P. Ozawa, in “Putting Science in its Place,” addresses the fact that what qualifies as the *best* science is often contested and that even the best science will not end disputes. Further, Ozawa suggests ways to incorporate science that hold promise for sustainable decision-making. In “Linking Science and Public Learning: An Advocacy Coalition Perspective,” Paul Sabatier considers the challenges of scientific learning, the design process, and the critical link between scientific and public learning. Notably, Sabatier cautions that “while the propositions supporting collaborative conflict resolution institutions may be intuitively appealing, the scientific analysis of those propositions is still in its infancy.” In “Restructuring State Institutions: The Limits of Adaptive Leadership,” Paul J. Quirk argues that state leaders have overlooked limitations of the ad hoc deliberative processes. Quirk asserts that “Florida’s water governance system has come to depend on extraordinary feats of negotiation,” and thus, the state has not established the necessary policy and administrative conditions for local and regional water managers to design effective decision processes. In the final article of Part Three, “Incentives and Adaptation,” Lawrence S. Rothenberg adds two significant insights. The first is that when adaptive governance depends on adding or amending bureaucratic administrative structures, public policy will likely change only incrementally, as institutional and statutory systems are constraining. Second, when adaptive governance relies on conventional administrative structures as engines of change, thought must be given to what will keep relevant stakeholders committed to the process.

C. CONCLUSION

Scholz and Stiftel realize that adaptive governance processes will not fully resolve all conflicts, but “where they work well, these processes create spaces where adversaries can explore together and develop agreements that leave them better off.” This book is ideal for those who enjoy interdisciplinary works and are interested in learning more about the role and promise of collaboration and adaptive governance in resolving complex water conflicts.

Kathleen Potter

Douglas S. Kenney, Ed., In Search of Sustainable Water Management: International Lessons for the American West and Beyond, Edward Elgar Publishing Limited, Cheltenham, UK (2005); 185pp; \$85.00; ISBN 1-84376-944-1; hardcover.