Beyond Donors and Dollars: an Ethnographic Case Study of International Aid and its Agents in Mozambique

Carly Amanda Santoro
University of Denver

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.du.edu/etd

Recommended Citation
Santoro, Carly Amanda, "Beyond Donors and Dollars: an Ethnographic Case Study of International Aid and its Agents in Mozambique" (2014). Electronic Theses and Dissertations. 575.
https://digitalcommons.du.edu/etd/575
Abstract

In Mozambique, international non-governmental organizations (INGOs) work mainly in Mozambique’s rural areas, with programs dedicated to the prevention of infectious diseases, education, access to food and clean water, gender equity, and many other concerns. Yet despite these efforts, Mozambican populations are critical of NGOs’ missions and practices, and Mozambique remains one of the poorest countries in the world. To explore these issues concerning contradictions in aid in Mozambique, I employ the concept of cultural capital, which refers to cultural practices, perspectives, and beliefs in relation to one’s ability to access symbolic and material goods. My thesis examines the degree to which three classes of agents (rural Mozambicans, urban Mozambicans, and Western expatriates) utilize cultural capital by examining the perceptions, behaviors, and cultural trends within the groups as they relate to international development.


Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been possible without the assistance and support of a variety of people. Firstly I’d like to thank my informants who are working on the front lines of development, and thinking critically about the issues I discuss herein. I would also like to express my gratitude to the Irmãs Concepcionistas who opened their home to us and provided a wealth of hospitality, the district administration in Manjacaze and the local administrators, the Institute of Socio-Cultural Research of Mozambique (ARPAC) and Dr. Fernando Dava, director of ARPAC. The completion of this thesis also greatly benefitted from funding from the Office of Internationalization and Humanities Institute Student Travel and Research Grant given by the University of Denver, the faculty research grant given to Dr. Cruz, and colleagues at the Department of Anthropology and Archaeology at the University Eduardo Mondlane, with whom I discussed the project.

I would like to express my special appreciation and thanks to my advisors. Dr. Cruz, as my project is part of your broader research in Mozambique, concentrating particularly in Manjacaze, this thesis would not have been possible without your guidance. For your support in providing me with this research opportunity, networking, and going above and beyond the call of duty to assist in this task, I owe you a great deal of thanks. Dr. Clemmer-Smith, thank you for always being encouraging and insightful; I consistently felt a renewed zeal for my research after thesis meetings with you. Thank you to my other committee members, Dr. Renee Botta and Dr. Alejandro Cerón for taking time to read my thesis and for your much appreciated contributions. Thank you.
# Table of Contents

Chapter One: Introduction ................................................................. 1  
Mozambique: The Darling of Development? ........................................ 1  
Bourdieu and Cultural Production .................................................... 9  

Chapter Two: Historical and Cultural Background ............................... 19  
Manjacaze and Colonialism .............................................................. 24  

Chapter Three: Theoretical Context and Literature Review ..................... 56  
Social and Cultural Capital .............................................................. 57  

Chapter Four: The Dusty Road to Manjacaze ..................................... 94  
On the Trail of Development: Investigative Fieldwork in Manjacaze ....... 99  

Chapter Five: An Urban Mozambican Perspective ............................... 151  
“Poverty is a Big Business in Mozambique” ....................................... 159  

Chapter Six: Espresso and Expatriates .............................................. 191  
“An NGO is like a Seagull” ............................................................. 192  

Chapter Seven: Conclusion .............................................................. 225  

References ...................................................................................... 248
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

Mozambique: The Darling of Development?

A gust of wind greets me at the corner of Avenida Eduardo Mondlane and Avenida Julius Nyerere as I examine my tattered map one last time. After winding my way through streets named after various heroes of socialist and communist persuasion in Maputo, the capital of Mozambique, I am tantalizingly close to my destination. The vague directions I am following have instructed me to go two blocks up on Avenida Eduardo Mondlane, named for the hero of Mozambique’s liberation struggle; the apartment I am looking for is somewhere on that block. A few passersby curiously glance my way, no doubt intrigued by the American-looking woman seemingly engrossed in an annotated map of their city. This is my first week in Maputo without the guidance of my advisor, Dr. Dores Cruz and my first venture into fieldwork researching expatriates living in the country. My fieldwork until now has mostly taken place in Manjacaze¹, a rural town vastly different from the bustling city life of Maputo.

Feeling nostalgic for the relative simplicity of Manjacaze’s town layout, I put my Maputo map away as the wind picks up yet again. Discarded trash swirls in the air before settling on the opposite side of the street. The Maputo air smells faintly of ocean breeze, seafood, and refuse all rolled into one. The city is situated on the Indian Ocean, and an

---

¹ I am using the Portuguese spelling for Manjacaze. The Changaan term is Mandlazaki. Despite the recognition of the Changaan term and its use by Changaan speakers, the interviews in this region were conducted in Portuguese and Manjacaze is generally used when speaking Portuguese or English.
array of seafood restaurants offering the famous “LM [Lourenço Marques\(^2\)] Prawns” dot the coast. The apartment I’m looking for is merely a few hundred meters away from the sea, and the breeze and ocean air are constant reminders of the vast expanse of the nearby Indian Ocean. The area of Maputo along the ocean front is the wealthier part of the city, where most of the expatriates live, but where there are very few Mozambicans. After several more minutes of searching for the elusive residence, I hear a voice behind me call out in English, “Looking for Elliott’s apartment?” The voice belongs to a young white man standing next to a red Toyota truck, hauling cases of Laurentina beer from the back seat along with an assortment of mismatched lawn chairs. Initially startled by his English greeting and American appearance, I answer in the affirmative.

“You here for the party at Elliott’s?” he asks again with a smile as he drags a large cooler from the bed of the pickup. After establishing that I am indeed there for the party, he introduces himself as Alex, one of Elliott’s friends from the international school they both attended in Maputo. Despite his Billabong sweatshirt and hemp choker, both of which I identify as being uniquely American, Alex is a young man who has lived in Mozambique for over twenty years, a child of Italian parents who moved to the country for work. Elliott, whose apartment I had been searching for, works as a Program Coordinator for Save the Children, one of the hundreds of international non-governmental organizations (INGOs) currently operating in Mozambique. I was given Elliott’s contact information by an American intern who had passed through Manjacaze and who had suggested that he might be a good resource for expatriate contacts in Mozambique.

---

\(^2\) Lourenço Marques was the colonial name of the capital before being renamed Maputo in 1976.

\(^3\) For the purpose of confidentiality, I will be using pseudonyms for informants.
Maputo. As it turned out, the intern was quite right. Luckily for me on this particular Saturday afternoon, I had managed to obtain an invite to his party, and I was anxious to meet him and gather more contacts to further my research.

Grateful to have a guide for the next part of this endeavor, I follow Alex up the winding stairs leading to Elliott’s apartment. Along the way, Alex identifies an open space filled with paint cans and construction gear as Elliott’s new apartment. It is currently being renovated; the party is on the rooftop. We continue to the roof, beers and lawn chairs in hand. The scene that greets us takes me by surprise. Upon subsequent reflection, however, I realize that it is not at all unusual. The gathering could have easily been mistaken for a typical party in any American city. There are about twenty or thirty young people milling about, American music is blasting on the stereo, and an array of Mexican food is laid out on a table. To make the picture complete, bottles of Trader Joe’s hot sauce are scattered around the food, and a game of Beer Pong, a typical American drinking game, is being set up off to the side. Most of the people in attendance are American, with a few Europeans mixed in the crowd. Portuguese as the dominant language has disappeared, replaced by animated discussions and abounding jokes in English. Coming from Manjacaze, a town where rarely anybody speaks English, the familiarity of this scene is jarring and seems out of place to me.

As I mill about and begin introductory conversations with various individuals gathered at the party, I slowly begin to realize that the majority of the people here are employed by INGOs in one capacity or another. There are interns, program coordinators, project leaders, and Peace Corps volunteers working with INGOs, among various other
titles. Most of the interns or Peace Corps volunteers expressed intentions to return to Mozambique to work at an INGO sometime in the near future. At one point I became involved in a conversation with an intern at an INGO – who also happened to be a graduate student at Columbia – and he asked me what my thesis research focused on. When I replied that it concerned INGOs in Mozambique he threw back his head in laughter and exclaimed, “Well, you’ve come to the right place!” As the night wore on, I realized that he was quite right.

Symbolically, this party represents both the physical and metaphorical separation of wealthy INGO staff members from the rest of Mozambique. These individuals are elevated above the rest of the city on an isolated rooftop, enjoying the fantastic views of the ocean and sunset, unmindful of the bustling and often difficult life below. They are able to easily recreate the amusements of home, while at the same time enjoy the prestige and exoticism of working abroad. In fact, the majority of expatriates associated with INGOs in Maputo can enjoy a more privileged life than they would otherwise in the United States (e.g., see Hanlon 1991, 1996; Pfeiffer 2004). One of the conversations I overheard at the party involved a debate over whether a male or female empregada/o provided the best daily service for one’s cooking and cleaning needs. While some households in the US most certainly employ cleaning services of one kind or another, in Maputo, and especially for foreign INGO staff members, this seems to be the rule rather than the exception. In addition, the scope of the empregada/o’s skills are much more extensive than typical maids or cleaning ladies in the US. The revelation that I was living

---

4 An empregada/o is a maid that cleans, cooks, shops, and provides general household chores. Empregada is the feminine word and empregado the masculine. An empregado/a can be a live-in person or someone who travels from places as far as Matola or even Manhiça, more than 80 km away and more than 3 hours by chapa..
at a boarding school managed by a group of nuns, who neither did my laundry, provided
daily maid services, or cooked for me, was met with great surprise and looks of
confusion.

This particular anecdote conveys just one distinct advantage of the lifestyle of an
expatriate living abroad and the ability to easily distinguish oneself from the Mozambican
masses. Indeed, these types of gatherings are not the only leisurely activities that
foreigners relegate themselves to; in the nice sections of Maputo there are cafés,
restaurants, bars, clubs, and even gyms that are notorious for their almost exclusively
expatriate clientele. At these locations one is almost certain to encounter not only English
being spoken most often, but also discussions of aid and government work dominating
the conversations.

The presence of INGOs and associated expatriates is manifested in parties like
Elliott’s and in Maputo in general, as well as throughout the countryside, where these
individuals usually visit for a few days and less often for weeks at a time. Beginning in
the mid 1980s and then increasing in the mid1990s, INGOs have grown in number and
influence in Mozambique due to changes in national policies and the pressure from
organizations like the IMF and World Bank to adopt structural adjustment and neoliberal
positive impact of international aid on Mozambique has been questioned by scholars in
al. 2010; Hanlon and Smart 2008; Pitcher 2002; Pfeiffer 2002, 2004), leading to a debate
on the economic consequences of foreign aid. In addition to the questionable economic
impact, with more foreigners moving to the country every year there is an emerging INGO world that has taken on a social, cultural, and professional life of its own (for another analysis of the life of expatriate aid workers abroad see Pfeiffer 2004). My research shows that as these INGOs and their staff members attempt to navigate the dominant aid world in Mozambique, native Mozambicans in turn mold their behaviors and motivations to accommodate for the demands of these powerful organizations. Local populations, particularly individuals in rural areas who are typically on the receiving end of international aid, are duly affected and seem to consider the efforts of INGOs to be both ineffective and unreliable. Despite the aid recipients’ often skeptical perceptions of these organizations, their motivations, behavior, and discourse are also shaped by the INGOs and the expatriates who work for them. For Mozambicans in Maputo, working for an international NGO is extremely attractive, but in order to work for these organizations, Mozambicans must adjust to the INGOs and expats’ Western standards and expectations of behavior. Thus the relationship between INGOs and local populations is a complex one, as each attempt to operate within their own cultural schemas and towards their particular best interests.

I was first introduced to these ideas during ethnographic fieldwork done in Mozambique from July through late October 2012. Half of my time was spent in Maputo, and half was spent in the rural town of Manjacaze (Gaza Province). In each location, I interviewed, observed, and participated in activities pertaining to individuals working for and with international NGOs and their associated local organizations. As I was to learn, the rural aspect of this phenomenon described above is currently unfolding within the
town and district of Manjacaze, about 300 kilometers from Maputo. Here, several INGOs have established both a permanent as well as transient presence in the community. The INGOs provide a plethora of aid services covering everything from building wells for clean drinking water, HIV/AIDS prevention programs, training in microfinance, support for community gardens (machambas) and building schools and libraries. Mozambicans, mostly young men born and raised in Maputo, make up the majority of these organizations’ contracted staff in Manjacaze. For a Mozambican, working for an INGO is an extremely attractive prospect as the salary and prestige associated with these positions are higher than other available jobs. This has been the case since the 1990s when, after the end of the civil war, commercial activity continued to be feeble and employment with a foreign aid agency became the best way to earn a substantial salary (Pfeiffer 2004:364). According to my data this is still the case, with one individual conveying to me that obtaining a job with an INGO is like winning the lottery for Mozambicans. The added income of an INGO position allows for the purchase of items that convey success, such as a new car, new home, or brand name clothes. My impression from living and researching in Manjacaze seems to be that the INGO staff members fell in line with that standard. Staff working for World Vision often showcased their gold jewelry, brand name shoes and clothes, and expressed longing for the more affluent lifestyle that they had left behind in Maputo.

One of the main activities of the Mozambican staff members and INGOS in Manjacaze is to provide support for the creation and continuation of local associations (associações) with the goal of having a locally staffed organization carry out sustainable

---

5 Machamba is the local term used for cultivated plots of land.
aid work in the community. The idea of local associations was first generated by FRELIMO (*Frente de Libertação de Moçambique;* Liberation Front of Mozambique), the leading political party, in an attempt to politicize and develop the country in the years immediately after independence (Saul 2005:313). Taking the form of *grupos dinamizadores* (dynamising groups)\(^6\), women’s groups, youth groups, and *associações* in urban neighborhoods, rural villages, and in workplaces (Saul 2005:313), these organizations were part of FRELIMO’s Marxist-Leninist development policies (Newitt 1995:543). From these origins, international NGOs make use of local associations to administer their aid programs. There are many such local associations in Manjacaze. While conducting fieldwork in the district, I was able to identify at least 13 various local associations in the first few weeks of my research simply by speaking with leaders in the community and following up on suggestions for individuals to interview. While this was not an exhaustive count, the impression I gained was that there were perhaps dozens of such organizations in the district of Manjacaze alone, and maybe hundreds in the Gaza province, all vying for funding and support from international NGOs.

With experiences from both a rural and an urban perspective, I developed a distinct set of research questions that focus on the relationships between the various actors involved in international development that I encountered in Mozambique. I draw upon Bourdieu’s theoretical model of cultural production to describe how three different classes of agents (Bourdieu 1993) employ their various forms of cultural capital. The three classes of agents I identify are rural Mozambicans working with local associations

---

\(^6\) *Grupos dinamizadores* (dynamising groups) are socially based organizations created by FRELIMO after independence with the intention of mobilizing the population to support the policies of the new government (Newitt 1995:543).
affiliated with INGOs, urban Mozambicans working for INGOs in Maputo, and expatriate INGO employees. All these groups attempt to navigate the development field using the cultural capital generated from their individual *habitus* (Bourdieu 1980), each group having varying degrees of success. In addition, different motivations, perspectives, and perceptions indicate broader cultural expectations that may result in conflict of interests and cultural misunderstandings. It is these motivations, perspectives, and perceptions that I examine from an ethnographic perspective.

In the following section, I expand on Bourdieu’s theoretical model, stressing the relationship and usefulness between this model and the topic of my research. His analytical framework assists in developing a better understanding of the data and helps to structure my analysis of the action of INGOs in Mozambique and the social and cultural behaviors related to them.

**Bourdieu and Cultural Production**

To restate, in order to analyze the data collected in the field I use Bourdieu’s theoretical model of cultural production, which assists in determining the ethnographic significance of my findings. This model allows us to think in terms of classes of social agents, whose actions, perceptions, and perspectives are generated by their *habitus*. Bourdieu defines *habitus* as

…durable, transposable dispositions, structured structures predisposed to function as structuring structures, that is, as principles which generate and organize practices and representations that can be objectively adapted to their outcomes without presupposing a conscious aiming at ends or an express mastery of the operations necessary in order to attain them…[*habitus* is] embodied history, internalized as a second nature and so forgotten as history. (Bourdieu 1980:493, 497)
According to Bourdieu, habitus comes as second nature, formed in early childhood, and generates practices whose motivations are ingrained in the nature of the agents’ and thus unconsciously enacted. Classes of agents, however, do not act alone or in a vacuum, but instead within a set of social situations, which Bourdieu defines as “fields.” An agent’s habitus either predisposes or disallows them to enter a certain field, which in turn structures social formations along with other fields (the economic field, the educational field, the political field, the cultural field, and in this case, the development field). The field, according to Bourdieu, is a structured space with its own laws of functioning. Each field is relatively autonomous, but structurally homologous with the others and its structure is determined by the position agents occupy in a field and their relationship to other agents (Bourdieu 1993:5).

In my thesis, what I refer to as the development field includes the positions of three classes of agents. These are: a) rural Mozambicans receiving aid; b) Mozambican employees of INGOs; and c) expatriates working for INGOs. By development I mean the implementation of programs funded by foreign aid and enacted by aid agencies for the purpose of improving the well-being, living standards, and opportunities for Mozambique’s human population. According to the United Nations Development Program’s Human Development Index, indicators such as health, life expectancy, literacy, formal education, political participation, and access to resources (Edelman and Haugerud 2005; “United Nations Development Programme’s Human Development Index” 2001:14) can be gauged in order to determine the level of “development” in a country (“United Nation’s Millennium Development Goals” 2000). This conventional
perception of development as equated with progress and well-being are employed in terms of the development field for the purpose of this thesis.

Although the agents’ habitus predisposes access to the field in the first place, agents’ cultural capital allows one to derive maximum benefit from the field. Cultural capital, defined in Bourdieu’s terms, refers to forms of cultural knowledge, competences, or dispositions (Bourdieu 1984). Bourdieu defines cultural capital as an internalized code that equips the classes of agents with skills and cultural competencies that act as an adaptive resource, and which represents the agents’ ability to access symbolic and material goods (Bourdieu 1980, 1984). Habitus, then, helps to shape the cultural capital of the agents, which in turn determines the agents’ ability to access social capital.

Social capital refers to one’s ability to access systems of networks that allow for maximum profit for the classes of agents. According to Bourdieu, social capital is:

The aggregate of the actual or potential resources which are linked to possession of a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition – or in other words, to membership in a group which provides each of its members with the backing of the collectivity-owned capital, a ‘credential’ which entitles them to credit, in the various senses of the word….The volume of the social capital possessed by a given agent thus depends on the size of the network of connections he can effectively mobilize and on the volume of the capital [economic, cultural or symbolic] possessed in his own right by each of those to whom he is connected. (Bourdieu 1986:250)

Thus, social capital can be described as the ability to access resources, which derives from mutually beneficial acquaintance and recognition. The volume of social capital depends on the size of the network that provides this recognition. In turn, the profits accrued from membership in a group and its social capital provides the basis of their cohesion, which makes the existence of the group possible (Bourdieu 1986:250).
Equipped with an understanding of the terms class of agent, field, *habitus*, cultural, and social capital, we can more easily comprehend the data pertaining to the Mozambican case study. In my thesis, I examine three classes of agents who are all attempting to derive maximum benefits from the development field. I have found that certain cultural traits deriving from *habitus* and various levels of cultural capital indicate whether or not agents can access the social capital in that field, and thus be included in the benefits of those networks. Certain characteristics involving the perceptions, perspectives, and motivations of agents are described in order to determine identity and varying types of relationships to the development field and to other agents. These descriptors are characteristic of the groups of agents involved and also determine their positions in the field, which in turn structure the field itself.

In my study, I use a range of descriptors that are included within the groups of agents and which are indicative of the agents’ relationship to the development field and the other agents acting within it. Bourdieu’s theoretical model, utilized as a framework for my analysis, becomes essential to understand my specific research questions, which are developed in the following section.

**Research Questions and Methods**

This project was implemented as part of Professor Dores Cruz’s broader project in Mozambique, where she has been working since 2004. Thus, this research is a part of Professor Cruz’s long-term study. My fieldwork, completed between July 2012 and October 2012, aimed to investigate the perspectives, perceptions, and motivations of
individuals involved in international aid work in Mozambique. One of my goals was to examine how local, rural populations view aid agencies and employees, and how urban populations working for INGOs view their roles within these organizations and perceive development in their country. The investigation of perspectives and cultural behaviors of expatriates working for INGOs in Maputo is also vital in order to understand the complex relationships between these groups.

The total number of informants in Manjacaze reached more than 20, which included individuals working for World Vision, the sisters at Irmãs Concepcionistas, local administrators, and people working with and leading local associations. Portuguese was the main language used in interviews, with Professor Cruz translating. In Maputo, I interviewed over 25 people, including Western expatriate INGO staff, Mozambican INGO staff, and individuals who had made a career out of development projects in Mozambique. English was the language used for interviews in Maputo. At both sites the informant selection strategy was the snowball effect, with informants at the onset of research providing names of other individuals who they believed would be knowledgeable participants. While in Maputo, I met informants through social means as well, and then used the snowball effect to concentrate on informants who fit the profile of individuals pertinent to this research. I use pseudonyms for all informants discussed in this thesis.

While in Manjacaze my work concentrated on the relationship between local associations and INGOs, how rural Mozambicans view INGOs, and cultural misunderstandings by the urban-centered and Western-oriented INGOs that affect
sustainable development. In Maputo, I focused on the motivations and perspectives of the Mozambican and expatriates involved in development. I examined the burgeoning new socio-economic class of young Mozambicans who have gained status and moved up economically and socially by working for these INGOs and how they negotiate between the vastly different worlds of Western-oriented development and their Mozambican culture. I also investigated foreigners involved in the development field in order to ascertain their relationship to the development field, their perspectives on their Mozambican colleagues and on the recipients of aid. My main research questions were: a) how do these three agents interact and perceive each other; b) what are the cultural traits or pointers that are indicative of each of these groups; and; c) how do these perspectives and traits affect development missions and practice. To determine the perspectives of these groups, I employed several methodologies. Participant observation was useful to examine Mozambican-lead activities, such as workshops run by local associations and Mozambican NGOs. I also observed and participated in the daily pursuits of the nuns in whose house I was staying and who provide aid to the community in Manjacaze, in a contrast to INGO activities. I explored the landscape of Maputo and Manjacaze in order to grasp the cultural divisions of the city (i.e., where wealthier Mozambican and expatriates live as opposed to poor Mozambicans), and I gathered a great deal of data pertaining to the cultural perspectives and motivations of Mozambicans. Invited to observe several local association meetings, I was allowed access to the basic functioning of these organizations and was permitted to observe the individuals involved and their interactions with the development field. I was also able to
participate in the activities of World Vision, an international NGO operating in the district of Manjacaze. World Vision offered to take me along on one of their field days in the district of Manjacaze where they showcased various projects they were involved on and individuals they had assisted, thus providing a specific example of how development is carried out by an aid agency.

Participant observation was useful not only in Manjacaze, but in Maputo as well. While in the capital, I was involved in events such as Elliott’s party and in smaller social gatherings with expatriates. At one point during my research, I was asked to house-sit for an expatriate couple who were traveling to South Africa for the weekend, so I was able to gather essential observational data while staying at their upscale home in Maputo. I frequented cafés and restaurants in the central area of Maputo where I observed the interactions, appearances, and actions of both Mozambicans and expatriates. In this sense, I was able to more clearly understand the incentives and cultural schemas at work within several groups in Mozambique.

Interviews were also instrumental to my research. I interviewed native Mozambicans who were involved in development (either local associations, Mozambican NGOs, or international NGOs) and also expatriates working for international NGOs. Including fieldwork in both Manjacaze and Maputo, I conducted more than 45 formal and informal interviews over three and a half months to ascertain specific cultural characteristics of these groups. I collected life histories to garner more detailed information on individual lives and motivations. This life history data comes from two Mozambican young men who had either previously worked for INGOs or were currently
employed, and several American expats working for international NGOs at the time. The majority of the individuals who participated in these interviews were eager to discuss this phenomenon and relay their unique perspectives. To sum up, the data that I gathered over the time I spent in Mozambique using classic ethnographic methodologies is substantial. Using this data, I was able to determine specific cultural traits indicative of classes of agents and their ability to access the maximum benefits of the development field.

**Thesis Structure**

With my research goals in mind and ethnographic methodologies mapped, I can examine these perspectives and cultural traits gathered from both interviews and observations to analyze the data from an ethnographic and theoretical standpoint. The results and data gained upon investigation are presented in the following chapters, along with the historical background and anthropological theory that frames it. Chapter Two contextualizes the historical, regional, and cultural background of Mozambique and, specifically, of Manjacaze. This chapter includes a brief overview of the Portuguese colonial period, the struggle for independence, and the violent 16-year civil war. I also examine the structural adjustment period after the end of the civil war and the subsequent rise of NGOs, which directly shaped the cultural landscape in which my research took place. Furthermore, I explore the historical and cultural background of Manjacaze and its significance in Mozambique’s history. The different phases of Mozambique’s history contributed to the overall identity construction of local populations, affecting both their perceptions of their own identity and their relations with outsiders.
Chapter Three outlines the anthropological literature that is paramount to understanding the context of the research. I examine globalization theory, development discourse and theory, the anthropology of development, postcolonial theory, and works specifically focused on Mozambique. This theoretical framing provides a backdrop for the analysis chapters that follow.

Chapters Four, Five, and Six focus on data collected in both Manjacaze and Maputo. Chapter Four analyzes data collected in Manjacaze, as well as the process by which I first became aware of the significance of local associations and their negotiations with the development world in Mozambique. Chapters Four examines data collected in Maputo and the cultural trends of Mozambicans working for international NGOs in Mozambique. I describe how these individuals conform and adjust to a Westernized lifestyle and ideology in order to succeed within the development sector. Chapter Six analyzes data from Maputo as well and delves into the culture of expatriates working for international NGOs in Mozambique, and how they influence and are influenced by the other two groups.

As the chapters unfold, I discuss how informants unveil cultural traits that contribute to the composition of their particular group. The Conclusion provides an analysis of the various agents in highlighting some of the complex perceptions and motivations that comprise these groups of people. I also draw theoretical conclusions pertaining to Bourdieu’s model and relevant theories in order to understand the anthropological significance of this work and of the classes of agents.
Returning once again to the image of Elliott’s rooftop party with its literal and metaphorical separation from the rest of Maputo, we can see that the cultural dynamic it represents may have enormous effects on the perceptions and activities of the Mozambicans who are disconnected from it. As I left the party that night, I walked from the central and wealthy neighborhood where Elliott lived and made my way back to the other side of town, which is comprised almost completely of Mozambicans. My lodgings are located at the edge of Malhangalene, not terribly far away from the neighborhood of Mafalala, one of the poorest areas of the city. As I walked, I pondered how vastly disparate cultural worlds and paradigms can exist within the same city yet simultaneously significantly influence each other.
CHAPTER TWO: HISTORICAL AND CULTURAL BACKGROUND

Throughout development circles, Mozambique has been hailed as a shining example of a successful transition from war to peace, post-war recovery, and economic growth, all under the influence and financial support of a wide range of aid agencies and nongovernmental organizations (“Not Quite as Stellar as it Looks” 2007). In recent years, however, the number of dissent voices questioning this popular success story has grown, citing gross inequalities between populations who have benefited from development and populations who have been left behind (Hanlon and Cunguara 2012; Pitcher 2002). The influx of international aid agencies and the ensuing debate concerning the effectiveness of development programs is central to my thesis. The implementation of INGO programs goes hand in hand with the arrival of expatriate employees, the increase in the number of Mozambicans working for these agencies, along with larger numbers of people in rural areas receiving aid from INGOs (Hanlon 1991, 1996; Pfeiffer 2004). This aid delivery includes the rural town of Manjacaze in Gaza Province, one of the sites that is the focus of my study (Figure 2). This phenomenon needs to be understood within the historical context of Mozambique in order to understand the specific circumstances in which international NGOs become such a prominent fixture on the Mozambican landscape.

In this chapter, I briefly outline historical and social contexts relevant to my thesis and the processes by which international NGOs became a prominent fixture on the Mozambican landscape. Although the implementation of nongovernmental forms has
been the trademark of neoliberal and humanitarian governance (Ferguson and Gupta 2002), nongovernmental rule is not new to Mozambique (McKay 2012:290). The Portuguese relied on forced labor, labor migration, foreign corporations, and traditional authorities to sustain and administer their territory during the colonial era (Isaacman 1996; McKay 2012:290; Newitt 1995). With independence from Portugal in 1975, the ruling FRELIMO movement adopted a Marxist-Leninist political agenda that promoted the construction of communal villages and farms (McKay 2012:290), used grupos dinamizadores (workplace facilitators) as a social base and defended the ideology of progress tied to modernization. After a civil war between FRELIMO and RENAMO (Resistência Nacional Moçambicana; Mozambican National Resistance) that resulted in the displacement of more than four million people (McKay 2012:290), over one million dead, and the destruction of infrastructures, the country was in need of aid and recovery. Thus, with the implementation of structural adjustment programs by then president Joaquim Chissano, the era of nongovernmental governance began (for a timeline of major events in Mozambican history, see Figure 3).

The impact of colonialism, as well as the historical and cultural contexts of populations referred to in my thesis, helps us to examine how and why agents in the development field have acquired particular cultural traits that are indicative of their position in the field. What were the historical processes by which expatriates are now able to live affluent lives in Maputo while working for INGOs? Why are urban Mozambicans so eager to work for INGOs and live according to a European style? Where do some of the cultural conflicts and misunderstandings between rural Mozambicans and
INGOs come from? With the information provided in this chapter, we can understand the context from which we can examine the answers to these questions and the data presented in subsequent chapters.

Figure 1 Mozambique on the Map, www.freeworldmaps.net
Figure 2 Location of Manjacaze (Map. M. D. Cruz)
Timeline of Events: 19th and 20th Centuries

1821: Establishment of the Gaza Empire

1884-84: The Berlin Conference regulates European colonization and trade in Africa

1891: Portugal and Britain define Mozambique’s western and southern borders


1896: Exiled activists opposed to Portuguese colonial power meet in Tanzania to form Mozambique’s Liberation Front (FRELIMO) headed by Eduardo Mondlane.

1964: FRELIMO instigates war for independence

1969: Eduardo Mondlane is assassinated in Tanzania

1974: Military coup in Portugal, end of the Estado Novo regime. New government supports independence for colonies

1975: Mozambique becomes independent, with FRELIMO as the ruling power, and Samora Machel its first president

1976: Formation of RENAMO as anti-FRELIMO resistance group with the support of Rhodesia

1977: Beginning of the civil war: RENAMO initiates activities inside Mozambique to destabilize the FRELIMO’s government; FRELIMO officially/formally adopts a Marxist-Leninist doctrine

1986: President Machel is killed in a plane crash, Joaquim Chissano becomes president.

1987: RENAMO attack in Manjacaze

1989: FRELIMO renounces Marxist-Leninist doctrine and adopts structural adjustment policies, ushering in the NGO era

1992: President Chissano and RENAMO leader Afonso Dhaklama sign peace treaty in Rome

1994: Elections

1997: Foreign aid constitutes about 60% of the Mozambican national budget.

2000: February - Devastating floods sweep through south of country, forcing tens of thousands to flee and leaving trail of destruction.

2008: Clashes between police and rioters over rising food prices left at least four people dead and more than 100 injured

2010: September – more food price protests. Several people killed when police open fire

Figure 3 Timeline of Major Events in Mozambican History, 1800-Present (“Chronology of Mozambique” 2012; “Mozambique Profile” 2012)
Manjacaze and Colonialism

Mozambique is located in Southeast Africa, and is bordered by the Indian Ocean to the east, Tanzania to the north, Malawi and Zambia to the northwest, Zimbabwe to the West, and South Africa to the South (Figure 1). The town of Manjacaze, the rural site of my research, is situated in the southern region of Gaza Province, about 300 kilometers north of Maputo. Despite its modest appearance, the area surrounding Manjacaze and the town itself are prominent locations in the history of the country. By weaving the specific history of Manjacaze and the colonial history of the country as a whole, we can more easily understand the pertinent historical colonial context related to this study.

Manjacaze (Xichangana\(^7\): Mandlakazi) was the last capital of the 19\(^{th}\) century Nguni Gaza empire, with Ngungunyane its last emperor (Cruz forthcoming; Liesegang 1970). The Nguni, initially located in the region of today’s Swaziland, came to dominate the southern part of Mozambique as a direct consequence of the Mfecane/Difacane migrations (Cruz forthcoming; Newitt 1995:256). The Mfecane were a series of wars and population movements that took place over much of southern Africa from the 1810s to the 1830s and were related to the movement of state building started by Shaka Zulu (Hamilton 1995:7;“Mfecane” 2004). The Nguni of the 19\(^{th}\) century were patrilineal farmers whose lineages were largely based on cattle surpluses and exchange (Newitt 1995:257). Driven by drought, increasing pressure from European traders who were demanding cattle in return for their manufactured items, and the rise of the Zulu state, Nguni warbands headed north into Mozambican territory in the first part of the 19\(^{th}\) century (Hamilton 1995:8; Liesgang 1970; Newitt 1995:256).

\(^7\) Xichangana is the major local language spoken in Manjacaze.
In the early 1800s before the Nguni invasion, southern Mozambique was characterized by paramount chieftancies in which heads of families ruled within a non-stratified social organization (Cruz forthcoming:12). The Nguni armies were easily able to raid and dominate these rural communities, thus incorporating the region into the vast, powerful, and centralized Gaza state that was established around 1821 (Cruz forthcoming:12; Newitt 1995:258). The legacy of this struggle persists today; the pre-Nguni families construct their identities around resistance to the Nguni invaders, as illustrated by modern Chopi narratives that describe acts of resistance by Chopi chief Mahoho Bahule and his dependants against the foreign Nguni (Cruz 2011). Thus, in the late 19th century, as Portuguese attempts at colonial domination of southern Mozambique increased, they proved to be at odds with the powerful Gaza state that was already in existence.

In the late 1800s, European powers were vying for control of the African continent (see Carter and Harlowe 2003 for an expanded analysis) and Portugal was increasing their involvement in trade and politics in their territories. The Berlin conference of 1884-85 regulated European colonization and trade in Africa and ushered in a period of heightened colonial activity by European powers. Essentially, the result of the Berlin Conference and the subsequent Scramble for Africa was the formation of distinct colonial states that were allocated to European nations (Carter and Harlowe 2003:14; Figure 4).
In line with the increased activity and control of Africa by European empires, Portugal took a stronger hold on their Africa colonies (Shillington 2005:301). Mozambique, of course, was no exception, and Manjacaze became one of the centers where the struggle for power and Portuguese domination occurred, as a powerful and sizeable state such as the Gaza Empire prevented the Portuguese from complete domination of the interior. In 1895, Gaza regiments and the last Gaza emperor Ngungunyane were defeated by the Portuguese at the battle of Coolela (Cruz 2011; Newitt 1995:375), and Manjacaze was conquered and burned, with the Portuguese
exiling Ngungunyane to the Azores archipelago (Newitt 1995:376). This episode is important to understanding the historical context of the region both to showcase the depth of history before the colonial administration, and the complex historical relations between foreigners and native Mozambicans in the country. As we shall see in the data analysis chapters, the activities of the Portuguese colonial administration described in the following section have had enormous consequences on the state of modern day Mozambique and perspectives towards expatriates.

**The Colonial Administration and Systematic Inequalities**

In the early 20th century, much of the administration of Mozambique was regulated by large private companies such as the Mozambique Company, the Zambezia Company, and the Niassa Company (Clarence-Smith 1985:100). Despite the abolition of slavery in Mozambique in 1842, the turn of the century saw the rise of a forced labor policy or *chibalo* by the chartered companies that supplied cheap labor to the mines and plantations of British colonies and South Africa (Clarence-Smith 1985:100). From 1860 through 1920 the creation of migration corridors from southern Mozambique (particularly in the Gaza Province, where modern day Manjacaze is located) to South African mines in Kimberly and Witwatersrand saw the southern migration of thousands of Mozambicans. In fact, by 1920 there were 77,921 Mozambican migrants working in South African mines (Crush et al. 2005:3).

In Mozambique, the miners’ absence was met with criticism from white employers concerned with meeting their own labor requirements, despite the considerable
profit for the state. The government’s solution was to resort to chibalo, forcing certain Mozambicans to fill the gap of the missing migrant workers (Newitt 1995:482). This forced labor came in two forms: it was either enforced directly upon the general Mozambican population, with the laborers earning a small living wage, or it took the form of penal labor which often included no compensation at all (Isaacman 1996; Newitt 1995:483). Although under the pretense of penalization, these laborers frequently had committed no offense. The practice of chibalo thus created an environment of systematic discrimination, kept laborers and their families in a perpetually poor economic state (Isaacman 1996:25), and affected perceptions of self-worth amongst Mozambican populations (Pitcher 1996:10).

In rural areas in the late 19th and early 20th centuries, the Portuguese now required means by which to control and exploit southern Mozambique while placating local populations in rural areas. Following the policy of indirect rule, the Portuguese administration created the administrative position of régulos, which means “small kings” in Portuguese, and régulados, their geographical area of jurisdiction (Convery 2006; Cruz forthcoming:15). The régulos were instituted at the local level and were meant to be representative of existing lineage structures in an attempt to incorporate traditional authority (Convery 2006; Newitt 1995:484). This imposition was rationalized by the Portuguese, who equated régulo with mwene (chief) and régulado with musha (chiefdom), but in actuality these systems were based upon specific lineage structures as opposed to spatial boundaries (Convery 2006; Isaacman and Isaacman 1983; Newitt 1995). However, the Portuguese administration gave the position of régulos to members
of Nguni or local families that were integrated into the Nguni empire and who already occupied positions of power (Cruz forthcoming:15), thus reinforcing customary governance that ignore local populations. Despite the problematic nature of the delineation of régulos and their territories, their instatement represents an attempt by the Portuguese to uphold some of the traditional systems and impose indirect rule.

_Régulos_ were at the purely local level, but at the district level the Portuguese instituted _chefs de posto_, who were white administrators from the metropole, representative of colonial authority, and who had the ability to recruit _chibalo_ labor (forced labor) for the police and for the armed forces (Convery 2006; Newitt 1995:485). In 1895, the Portuguese high commissioner Antonio Ennes divided the territory of the District of Lourenco Marques (the area around what is now Maputo) into five distinct territories each with its own _administrador_, and this set the pattern for the administrative development of the entire country (Newitt 1995:382), with Manjacaze as the capital of the district of the Muchopes. Thus, the realities of native Mozambicans were being altered in dramatic ways with the imposition of highly bureaucratic bounded colonial territories and their governing administrators, which still resonates in the bureaucratic structure of the country today. As we can see the imposition of foreign governance in Mozambique is nothing new.

In 1933, Prime Minister of Portugal António de Oliveira Salazar implemented the _Estado Novo_ (New State) regime⁸ (Clarence-Smith 1985:100), an authoritarian regime which sought to preserve Portuguese colonies as a multi-continental empire. _Chibalo_

---

⁸ The New State is the period from 1926 to 1974, but was only labeled as such after Salazar came to power as prime minister in 1933; he was instrumental in the new indigenous legislation as finance minister. In political terms, the _Estado Novo_ was one of the longest-surviving right-wing dictatorships in Europe.
continued under Salazar’s *Estado Novo* regime. Used mostly to grow cotton, all adult males had to work in the cotton fields, which was a detriment to food production and lead to hunger and malnourishment (Seddon 2002:201). Forced labor to the mines continued to be a form of *chibalo* that had a significant impact on southern Mozambican and Manjacaze (see above).

In addition, there were other Portuguese colonial practices during Salazar’s regime that altered the political landscape of Mozambique and worked to put European and Portuguese populations in power while simultaneously preventing native Mozambicans from accessing the same resources (Newitt 1995:445; Pitcher 1996:5). Besides *chibalo*, there were both formal and informal economic restrictions on Africans as well. There were several systemic restrictions in place that prevented Africans from acquiring posts in the administration, in private firms, or developing businesses (Cruz 2007; Newitt 1995; Vail and White 1980). These restrictions had to do with legislation designated *Estatuto do Indígena* (Indigenous Status), enforced by Portuguese colonial rule. Enacted in 1933 and remaining in effect until 1962, the *Estatuto* split official racial classifications into three categories: white settlers, indigenous (*indígenas*), and assimilated (*assimilados*; Cruz 2007; Errante 1998:285). By becoming *assimilados*, Mozambicans could qualify for Portuguese status, which exempted them from *chibalo* and gave them some privileges of Portuguese immigrants. *Assimilado* was a legal assimilation process by which “natives could acquire the full privileges of Portuguese citizenship if they could prove that they could walk, talk (Portuguese), eat (with cutlery on a table), read, sleep (on a mattress), and dress like a Portuguese” (Errante 1998:285).
This legislation greatly impacted Mozambicans, as business activities required licenses for native Mozambicans, promotion required the support of prominent Portuguese immigrants, and almost all jobs in the “modern sector” were filled by the Portuguese (Newitt 1995:477). With this type of discrimination, native Mozambicans found it quite difficult to advance economically unless considered an assimilado, and the gap between the privileged colonial class and the disadvantaged Africans was substantial, particularly in urban areas (Isaacman 1983:3). As we shall see in the following chapters, although the official discriminatory legislation concerning assimilados ended in 1962, a recreation of these colonial-era power structures is still occurring today and has enormous consequences for how Mozambicans and expatriates interact and perceive each other in the development field.

In addition, these legal distinctions and social hierarchies helped to shape the educational system in Mozambique, which was a main contributor to the limit of job opportunities available to Mozambicans. Education was divided into two categories: official government schools (escolas de ensino oficial) for the Portuguese and assimilados, and rudimentary schools (escolas de ensino rudimentar) for indigenous populations, which were often under the patronage of the Catholic Church (Errante 1998:285) and protestant missions. The number of schools available to Mozambicans was limited, with the institutions spread sporadically throughout the country. The majority of these schools did not offer education beyond the primary level (Errante 1998:286). Thus, educational resources were severely limited for native Mozambicans during the height of colonial rule.
Catholicism, the established state religion under the Portuguese and the sponsor of the rudimentary schools, was oftentimes a requirement in order to further one’s education. The situation was the same in Portugal during the *Estado Novo* (New State; 1926-1974), where there was a close relationship between education and mandatory Catholicism (Cruz 2007:395-396). This policy of excluding non-Catholic academics upon provision of conversion presented little incentive for Mozambicans other than practicing Catholics to achieve educational status.

One exception to Catholicism’s grip on the educational system, however, was the Presbyterian Swiss Mission’s work in education. Through its programs of informal education, the Swiss Mission promoted access to secondary and university education by preparing African leadership for the church (Silva 1998:223). Their programs eventually contributed to the emergence of Mozambican nationalist leadership, including the fostering of Eduardo Mondlane’s education, the nationalist hero of Mozambique during the independence struggle period (Mondlane 1969:58; Silva 1998:223). Despite the efforts of Swiss Missionaries, however, at the time of independence, Mozambique was a country with limited educational resources and hierarchy of education designed to separate Portuguese populations from native Mozambicans.

**The Independence Struggle and African Socialism**

As a result of these systemic inequalities, unrest and whispers of discontent abounded until violence eventually erupted in September of 1964 (Adam 1996:25; Rupiya 1998). The independence movement was led by FRELIMO, founded in 1962, in

Eduardo Mondlane, perhaps the most emblematic figure in Mozambican history, plays an important role in the identity construction of people living in and around Manjacaze and is also important for understanding the context of Mozambique’s liberation struggle. Mondlane hailed from the Manjac region, tracing his lineages through
the Khambane-Mondlane family, a pre-Nguni lineage (Cruz 2011; Henriksen 1973:40; Rupiya 1998:11). He attended government and Swiss Presbyterian schools before going to university in South Africa at Witwatersrand University (Henriksen 1973:39) and went on to study in the US at Oberlin and Northwestern University, where he obtained his Ph.D. in Anthropology (“Eduardo Mondlane” 2013). Remembered and honored as a national hero throughout the country, the fact that Mondlane is from the district of Manjacaze is a point of high pride for its residents. Thus, at the onset of the liberation struggle, Mondlane was equipped with an education and background that helped him to guide FRELIMO, as well as a rural background that allowed him insight into the inequalities of the Portuguese regime.

After attempts at a peaceful independence movement, the armed struggle was launched in 1964 in northern Mozambique with the support of radical African, Arab, Eastern European, and Chinese aid (Meyns 1981:56; Newitt 1995:518; Rupiya 1998:11). In the following years the conflict spread to surrounding provinces, and by 1974 FRELIMO controlled about 20-25% of Mozambican territory (Meyns 1981:56), calling these areas “liberated zones” in which FRELIMO constituted the civil authority (Basto 2012:22). While administering these zones, FRELIMO attempted to improve the conditions of rural Mozambicans; it abolished the Portuguese-appointed régulos, established cooperative forms of agriculture, and made attempts to increase access to education and health care (Basto 2012:23).

Despite FRELIMO’s efforts at overthrowing Portuguese colonial rule, it was Portugal’s own instability that eventually led to Mozambique’s independence. Dictator
António de Oliveira Salazar was incapacitated by a stroke in 1968, but by that time the foundations of the Estado Novo dictatorship created by him in the 1930s were already crumbling (Amaral 1999; “Portuguese Revolution (1974-1976)” 1999). This was partly due to the dramatic economic and social changes of the 1960s, but above all to Portugal's colonial wars, including the conflicts taking place not only in Mozambique but also in Angola and Guinea-Bissau (Amaral 1999:120; “Portuguese Revolution (1974-1976)” 1999). Unrest escalated until a coup d’état took place in Portugal on April 25th, 1974, overthrowing the Estado Novo regime (Amaral 1999:122). A group of mainly left-wing military officers seized power in a bloodless coup, ending dictatorial rule and instating a new democratic regime (Amaral 1999:122; Errante 1998). After the revolution, Portugal negotiated independence with FRELIMO in 1975, making Mozambique an independent nation on June 25th of that year (Ndege 2007:iv; Rupiya 1998:15).

During the independence movement, what Samora Machel would later deem “the values we gained during the national liberation struggle” were beginning to take form, namely the socialist ideology of collective effort of the masses (Meyns 1981:42-48). These values were underlined by an attempt to take the rural and poor masses and transform them into active participants in the formation of a national independent Mozambique (Meyns 1981:42; Sumich 2010:685). After independence, FRELIMO’s attempts to harness the power of the masses included the creation of grupos dinamizadores (workplace facilitators), women’s groups, youth groups, and other associações (associations; Saul 2005:313). During the liberation movement, women also acquired significant leadership and political roles. For example, Josina Machel, first wife
of Samora Machel, led OMM (*Organização da Mulher Moçambicana*; Mozambican Women’s Organization), one of the first FRELIMO associations established in 1973 to encourage a high level of political involvement for women (Arnfred 2011:120). This empowerment continued post-independence and is seen in the positions of power that women in Mozambique hold today. There is no doubt that the movements during the liberation movement were essential in shaping Mozambican ideology and future political aspirations. One prominent Mozambican at the time of liberation, Senhor Macamo recalled with nostalgia the liberation struggle’s collective efforts to mobilize the masses:

The liberation struggle itself created tremendous social mobility and also regional, as many of these people came from the north. It was the struggle that brought peasants to the fore for the first time really… We created a situation where something that would normally take generations happened in just a decade or so. (in Sumich 2010: 3)

Thus, FRELIMO sponsored collective organizations and the movement towards liberation was beginning to form post-independence Mozambican identity, with a brand of African socialism taking hold in FRELIMO’s discourse.

In the 1960s and 1970s, as many former African colonies were gaining their independence, a search for a national identity to consolidate and unite the masses was needed. One of the discourses taking place was one that promoted a unique form of African Socialism, which became a mobilizing slogan to unite Africans around the challenge of development in their postcolonial societies (“African Socialism” 2010; Walker 2007:119). Based on the idea that socialism, communal living, and the absence of private property were the foundations of most African pre-colonial societies, many African leaders believed African Socialism would connect Africans to their indigenous

Assassinated in 1969 by a parcel bomb, Eduardo Mondlane was not able to see the fruition of the liberation movement’s struggle. Instead, Samora Machel was left to lead the country in its socialist experiment (Rupiya 1998:13; Saul 2005:309). As the first president of Mozambique, Samora Machel helped to institute a socialist regime in the whole country, adhering to the idea that a unique brand of socialism could set Africa apart from their Western and Soviet counterparts. After independence, the “Economic and Social Directives” adopted by FRELIMO’s III Congress in 1977 reviewed the experiences gained in the areas liberated by FRELIMO during the independence struggle and used them as guidelines for development for the newly independent nation. The directives emphasized the importance of organizing production in collective forms, and the power of the masses of Mozambique to act as that collective entity. Although Mozambique officially declared itself a Marxist-Leninist political system in 1977, this was a post-facto declaration as the country’s policies were already established as such (Meyns 1981:59). Mozambique was identifying itself along with its African brethren as a socialist African nation, hoping that this distinction would inspire nationalistic pride in moving forward after independence.
The Civil War

Peace in Mozambique, however, did not last long. The factors leading to the outbreak of the civil war in 1977 are complex, as the conflict essentially became a proxy war for foreign nations intent on controlling the political leanings of the African continent (Pitcher 2002:102). On the surface, however, the cause of the war was the conflict between two political entities: FRELIMO and RENAMO. FRELIMO, leader of the one-party socialist state that Mozambique had become post-independence (Saul 2005:311), was pitted against RENAMO, the forces rebelling against the government. RENAMO was created with the support of the Ian Smith, prime minister of Rhodesia and the Rhodesian Central Intelligence Organization (Rupiya 1998:13). FRELIMO was later supported by the apartheid regime of South Africa and the US Regan administration (Hanlon 1991:5; Pitcher 2002:105). Although the U.S. was eventually involved in the reconciliation between the warring factions and they did not support RENAMO with military aid, there was U.S. support to help Rhodesia and South Africa against FRELIMO (Hall and Young 1997; “McCain urged Reagan Admin to Meet Terror Groups Without Preconditions” 2008; Saul 2005:315).

The geopolitical alliances between South Africa and Rhodesia were due to the major social and political changes in sub-Saharan African taking place at the time. Liberation wars and the struggle for majority rule in South Africa contributed to a climate of political uncertainty (Ferraz and Munslow 2000:xiv), fostering alliances between nations. Engaged in their own war with national liberation forces in what was to become
Zimbabwe, Rhodesia helped to support a group of discontented Mozambicans and former Portuguese colonizers to create RENAMO within its nation’s borders (Ferraz and Munslow 2000:xv; Manning 2002:10). After independence, Mozambique became a safe haven for ANC (African National Congress) anti-apartheid activists, furthering resentment between FRELIMO and South Africa (Ferraz and Munslow 2000:xiv). For example, South African activists such as Ruth First and Albie Sachs lived for periods of time in Mozambique while supporting the ANC armed struggle against the apartheid regime (Marks 1983:128). In the early 1980s, South Africa became key to RENAMO’s strength.

Gross atrocities were committed on both sides during the conflict, with rape, indiscriminate killing, forced participation in respective military efforts, and other war crimes featured as tactics. In the case of FRELIMO, however, these crimes against humanity were far less frequent and institutionalized than RENAMO’s efforts, which led to some of the darkest moments in any African nation (Hanlon 1991:3; Newitt 1995:545). In order to be any kind of a threat to FRELIMO, which had far superior numbers and was the established regime, RENAMO chose to utilize guerilla strategies. They mainly operated out of a few remote areas, carrying out raids against towns and important infrastructure, and terrorizing the rural population through use of child soldiers and forced participation (Igreja 2007:17). As a result of the extreme violence, by 1990 close to 1,000,000 people had perished and more than four million were internally displaced (Hanlon 1991:3; Newitt 1995:545; Rupiya 1998:15).
Manjacaze and its surrounding areas were by no means immune to the destructive and violent forces of the civil war. In August 1987, violence in Gaza province escalated quickly with the invasion of RENAMO troops in early August and culminating in several massacres by the end of the month, one of them occurring in Manjacaze. A mass grave in Manjacaze indicates that 111 people are buried there. However, local populations assure that many more may have been killed and that the people buried in the mass grave were only the bodies of people killed in town and that were not claimed by families. According to Sr. Fernando Manhique many more were killed, “more than 300 people,” when heavy fighting took place near the hospital. Others were killed in the surrounding villages and compounds (pers. comm to Cruz, 2010). This massacre is the bloodiest event that occurred in Manjacaze over the 16-year period of the civil war. Various accounts from international news agencies illustrate that both Manjacaze’s massacre and Mozambique’s prolonged civil war attracted the attention of the international news media (“‘Mozambique Battles Rebels’ 1987; “86 Mozambicans die in rebel attack” 1987; “Mozambique Rebels Kill 72” 1987).
Manjacaze’s relationship to the civil war as a place of intense violence still resonates in the collective identity of its residents as well, as illustrated in the memorial to the August 10th massacre and the memorial services that mark the anniversary of the event. Despite the horrific nature of this violent episode in the history of Manjacaze, the memorialization of the massacre demonstrates that the peoples in and around Manjacaze value the memory of this event as being central to their identity.

Added to the human loss, Mozambique’s infrastructures were destroyed by systematic attacks by RENAMO, and its transport, education and health systems were in ruins (“A Faltering Phoenix” 2010; Hanlon 1991:4). Thus, the country was in shambles and in need of extensive recovery by the time of the peace agreement in 1992. The stage was set for NGOs to intervene in Mozambique’s revitalization. After several rounds of discussions, FRELIMO and RENAMO signed a General Peace Agreement (GPA) in Rome on October 4th, 1992. The Italian government and the Saint Edigio Catholic community had hosted the talks and the United States, Great Britain, France, Portugal,
and the United Nations had provided political and technical backing to ensure that the agreement would have international support (“End in Sight for Mozambican Civil War” 1992; Rupiya 1998:15). With the end of the war, Mozambique was primed for the acceptance and implementation of structural adjustment policies offered by the IMF and the World Bank, which were intended to assist the country in post-war recovery.

**Structural Adjustment and the NGO Era**

The transition from socialist policies to privatization began in the late 1980s, when former Prime Minister Joaquim Chissano ascended to the presidency in 1986 after a fatal plane crash brought about the demise of Mozambique’s first president Samora Machel (Ndege 2007:iv). In 1987-88, Chissano initiated a review of FRELIMO’s economic, foreign, and civil rights policies, which opened the way to reform. At FRELIMO’s V Congress in July 1989, the Marxist-Leninist doctrine was officially abandoned as the party’s ideology (Rupiya 1998:14). With Chissano’s lead, the country increasingly adopted extensive structural reform and abandoned socialist doctrines, leading to the democratization of Mozambican politics (Belluci 2002:13).

After the civil war, Mozambique’s infrastructure was in shambles and the loss of human life was enormous ("Mozambique: historical demographical data of the whole country" 2013); the country was in dire need of intervention. Institutions such as the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund, the UN, and major aid organizations were willing and able to lend a hand – at a cost. These institutions made flows of aid available to countries on the condition that changes in policy were implemented, usually of a type
that reduced the level of government intervention in the economy (Harrigan, et al. 1991:23; Pitcher 2002:6). This brand of policy-based lending was first developed after the international recession of the early 1980s, which left many less developed countries in unstable economic positions. Major aid donors, and specifically the World Bank, responded by implementing key changes in aid lending policy and the introduction of structural adjustment lending (Harrigan et al. 1991:23). Backed by Western capitalist countries, these donors favored policies that decreased government intervention and increased foreign investment. In the case of Mozambique, the World Bank and other donors exerted their dominance by offering much-needed aid on the condition that the country adopt economic policies that suited the ideological paradigm of the West. Thus, in order to get Mozambique on the road to recovery, President Joaquim Chissano implemented policies that led to sweeping economic changes and an acceptance of large sums of foreign aid, allowing for the emphasis of increased privatization into the country’s political paradigm (Belluci 2002:15; Pitcher 2002:7). These policies had significant macroeconomic effects on employment, economic growth, inflation, and exchange rates (Hanlon and Cunguara 2012:5). Thus, this link between aid and political power had an enormous impact of the future of Mozambican governmental policies.

Since the end of the war, NGOs had been working with great sums of funding in order to provide relief efforts for the populations displaced and affected by the violence. As the country picked up the pieces in the early 1990s, NGOs assumed a key role in providing humanitarian assistance as necessary for stabilization and reconciliation (Barnes 1998:310). From October 1992 to December 1994, $663 million US dollars were
committed to these programs by the international community, and $180.2 million were
designated to be channeled through NGOs (Barnes 1998:311). By the mid 1990s NGOs
had grown vastly in number and power (Belluci 2002:13). By 2001, there were 145
international NGOs and 465 national NGOs operating in the country (Pfeiffer 2004:360).
The amount of aid pouring in intensified in the first decade of the 21st century; in 2010
international aid totaled a staggering $1.6 Billion, worth more than half the total state
budget (“A Faltering Phoenix” 2010).

The presence of NGOs and privatization have only increased hand in hand in
recent years, leading to a dramatic transition from an emphasis on state-run companies,
institutions, and programs to prioritizing privately owned and operated businesses and
development programs (Pitcher 2002:5). The Millennium Development Goals, eight
international development goals that were established following the Millennium Summit
of the United Nations in 2000, have greatly increased the aid to developing countries and
also increased the number of Westerners involved in development (“United Nations
Millennium Development Goals” 2000). The vastness and relative speed of these changes
have had an enormous effect on how Mozambicans perceive both themselves and their
relationships with international and national NGOs.

The vast majority of the NGOs have their headquarters in Maputo, the country’s
capital. Despite their urban location, however, these NGOS have as their mission to
change and impact Mozambique’s rural populations on a variety of issues. These
concerns include halting the spread of infectious diseases (HIV/AIDS, malaria, and
cholera), increase education, access to food and clean water, gender equity, and training
in midwifery (“Worldwide NGO Directory” 2012). The sheer number and size of international and national NGOs in Mozambique has been hailed as an example of a successful neoliberal transition from a socialist state and effectual development. Mozambique as a shining example of the power of neoliberal development, however, has come into question (Hanlon and Cunguara 2012; Pitcher 2007). The country still has a long way to go. Despite a much-cited fall in the poverty rate from 69% in 1997 to 54% in 2003, the percentage of people living in poverty has not significantly decreased since 2003, with about 54% of the population still living in poverty (“Mozambique” 2009). According to the World Bank, Mozambique’s rural population is 61% of the total population, with 56.9% of the rural population living under the poverty line (“World Bank Indicators” 2010). These rural inhabitants mostly depend on small-scale farming, drifting in and out of poverty, with the income gap growing (Hanlon 2012:5; “Not Quite as Stellar as it Looks” 2007). Considering the continuing presence of extreme poverty and pressing humanitarian aid issues in Mozambique, it is necessary to examine the relationship between NGOs and the concerns they are attempting to address, Understanding the history of ethnography in Mozambique, as discussed below, is also important as it goes hand in hand with the historical trends in the country and illustrates anthropology’s role colonial-era Mozambique.

**Ethnography in Mozambique**

Throughout the modern history of Mozambique there have been several prominent ethnographers who have done fieldwork in the country. This is significant not

---

9 The rate of 56.9%, although cited throughout IMF and World Bank sources, is up for debate. According to informants and eyewitness accounts, the number of rural Mozambicans living in poverty may be as high as 70%.
only because these individuals have contributed greatly to our understanding of Mozambique past and present, but also because they help us understand the broader developments in anthropology as related to Mozambique and this case study.

Historically, the colonial connection to ethnography is related to the attempt to record a culture in order to facilitate their dominance by colonial powers. Traditional colonial ethnographies typically aimed to capture a complete picture of a culture, describing in detail their traditions, language, belief systems, kinship structures, rituals, and so on. These works were often closely tied with missionaries, who were usually included in the first wave of colonization (Eriksen and Nielsen 2001). Henri A. Junod, the author of “The Life of a South African Tribe” (1912,1927), was one such ethnographer who focused on Mozambican subjects. The Tsonga became the subject of his seminal work “The Life of a South African Tribe” (“Henri Alexandre Junod” 2004), which provided a functional analysis of Tsonga culture (Junod 1912). The term Tsonga classifies a series of groups that have a shared language and ethnic background; the Shangaan and Chopi peoples, who live in the Manjacaze area, are both considered Tsonga. Junod was first appointed at the Rikatla mission in southern Mozambique, where he collected a large amount of his data. Rikatla is located in the outskirts of Maputo, about 260 kms south of Manjacaze10 (“Henri Alexandre Junod” 2004). Junod recorded in great detail the rituals, rites of passage, kinship structures, marriage patterns, war songs, and many other cultural elements of the Tsonga people at the time (Junod 1912, 1927).

Within the context of colonialism, Junod traveled to Mozambique just after the Berlin conference. At the onset of the ethnography, Junod includes justifications for

---

10 Junod collected data among different groups of Tsonga, but mostly in Mozambique, and his book is a collection of this data (Chidester 1997:408).
pursuing his work, which includes providing useful information for the native commissioners, administrators, and the missionaries (Junod 1927:8). He feels strongly that in order for these individuals to pursue their work successfully, they must be aware of the cultural customs of native African tribes. Junod explains “To govern savages, you must study them thoroughly in order both to recognize the wrong ideas against which you have to contend and to avoid hurting their feelings unnecessarily” and Junod also suggests that,

...in each field a thorough investigation be undertaken, in order that the message of the Gospel may be presented in such a way as will appeal to those aspirations after the truth which reveal themselves in the religion and social rites of the Natives. (Junod 1927:8-9)

Junod is hoping that with his work he will further the knowledge of individuals who govern and proselytize to native Africans in order to improve their moral standing both religiously and among the governing colonial forces. Thus, Junod’s early work on the Tsongas is rooted in a colonial and missionary standpoint, with the goal of providing the means by which to subvert and overtake Tsonga cultural practices. Junod’s anthropological perspective is biased by colonialist practice that is consistent with other ethnographies of African cultures in the early 20th century. Within the context of anthropology, Junod’s work is an example of how conceptual assumptions by the West of the non-West have contributed to unequal power dynamics between the two (Asad 1973).

Later, anthropologists like Talad Asad (1973), George Stocking (1991), and Peter Pels (1997) reevaluated anthropology’s role in colonialism and its relationship between the emergence of the discipline. Stocking suggests, “although colonialism threatened to destroy (by transformation) the object of anthropological inquiry, it was at the same time
a condition *sine qua non* of ethnographic fieldwork” (Stocking 1991:10), highlighting the symbiotic relationship between the two. In this sense, Stocking describes how after anthropology’s early days of emphasizing racial classification systems to justify the dominance of colonized peoples:

…with the establishment of European colonial power, what was required was no longer simply the justification of dominance in terms of difference, but the more detailed knowledge of functioning societies that would facilitate and maintain an economical and trouble-free colonial administration. (Stocking 1991:4)

Junod’s work exemplifies that relationship, along with other southeast African ethnographers of his time such as missionary E. Dora Earthy, author of “Valenge Women” (1933), and P. Armando Ribeiro, who wrote a grammar book of the Tsonga language (1965). Ethnographers of this era, such as Junod, were part and parcel of the movement to describe and record colonized cultures in great detail for the purpose expediting, as Stocking would describe, an economical and trouble-free colonial administration.

Though “The Life of a South African Tribe” is still one of the most thorough ethnographies of the Tsonga and Southern Mozambique, it can be argued that *Os Macondes de Moçambique*, written by Jorge Dias and his research team comprising his wife Margot Dias, and Manuel Viegas Guerreiro (Dias 1964; Dias and Dias 1964; Guerreiro 1966) is the first Portuguese-language ethnography of significance to an international audience (West 2004:55). Comprising four volumes and 1,168 pages, it is a detailed and comprehensive ethnographic study that is consistent with classical forms of ethnography (West 2004:55). Published from 1964 through 1970, the Dias team divided
their work into Historical and Economic Aspects (Dias 1964), Material Culture (Dias and Dias 1964), Social and Ritual Life (Dias and Dias 1970), and Knowledge, Language, Literature, and Games (Guerreiro 1966). The Dias’ volumes, can be contextualized within the ethnography of individuals like E.E. Evans-Pritchard and his work on the Azande and Nuer, which represents the traditional European ethnography of attempting to portray a complete picture of a single culture (Evans-Pritchard 1937). Although Os Macondes was written much later, it also hails from a colonial framework in which the complete picture of a culture should be preserved before irrevocably changed by modernization and progress.

The image of pristine cultures is a fallacy as both the Tsonga and the Maconde were contextualized in broader historical and political processes. Data for The Life of a South African Tribe was collected just after the Berlin Conference and during the wars between the Portuguese and the Gaza Empire, on the unset of the Portuguese administration. The region had experienced enormous social changes surrounding migration and colonial domination, and Os Macondes de Moçambique was firmly entrenched within the context of the Estado Novo and Estatuto do Indígena and as West (2004) clearly demonstrates the Dias’ informants and field assistants participated in the liberation struggle. Obviously, as was portrayed above, these cultures were highly influenced by outside forces and were not stuck in time, yet these works do not take into consideration the vast social and cultural changes occurring within Mozambique during that period. Therefore, they are emblematic of the colonial mindset and type of classical ethnography that ignored histories and social movements. Despite the critique that Os
Macondes de Moçambique ignores the impacts of social change and any outside influences on the Makonde culture (West 2004:56), the Dias’ documentation of the Makonde represents the most thorough and detailed colonial ethnography undertaken in a Portuguese colonial space (for a detailed critique see West 2004).

After independence ethnographers, sociologists, and historians began concentrating on social changes in the country. These include the impacts of colonialism, the independence movement, and growing civil unrest. Many scholars were coming from the pro-independence, pro-FRELIMO, activist perspective and include works such as “Capitalism and Colonialism in Mozambique” by Leroy Vail and Landeg White (1980), E.A. Alpers’ “Ivory and Slaves in East Central Africa” (1975), “Tradition of Resistance” by Alan Isaacman (1976), and “Revolution and Counterrevoltion” by Thomas Henriksen (1983). Other major thinkers writing about Mozambique at the time include John Saul (1985), Ruth First (1983), and David Webster (1977). Most of these writers were connected to the African Studies Department at the University of E. Mondlane and were activist-academics involved in the anti-colonial movement in Mozambique and the anti-apartheid struggle in South Africa. They contributed to the post-independence environment that was in place and were connected to the African Socialism movement described above.

“Capitalism and Colonialism in Mozambique” uses the Quelimane District as a case study to describe the colonial practices of the Portuguese in detail, paying attention to growing popular resistance. The authors also describe how the Quelimane District, as the base of the plantation economy that produced most of colonial Mozambique’s
commodity exports, contributed to the development of capitalism in the country (Vail and White 1980). As opposed to Vail and White’s more historical approach, Alan Isaacman’s “Tradition of Resistance” focuses on the culture of resistance, using both written records and oral history (1980). Isaacman sought to document the legacy of the anti-colonial struggle and to analyze the changing patterns of resistance to colonialism (Isaacman and Isaacman 1976:xxi,1980). The work of Vail, White, and Isaacman, along with the authors mentioned above, highlight the shifting trends in historical and ethnographic study in Mozambique, as they give a historical context to ethnographic issues. These analyses reflected the historical developments in the country at the time, written after independence from Portugal in the aftermath of colonialism, and the beginning stages of the civil war. In addition, they echo the shift in anthropology away from classical forms of ethnography that concentrated on the breakdown of specific cultural components to analyzing culture change and the impacts that the globalized world has on culture. Significantly, Eric Wolf’s major work *Europe and the People Without History* (1982) was published in this same era and also highlights the expanse of European powers, post-colonial dichotomies, and modes of production. In this sense, the authors discussed above fit into the context of trends within history and anthropology to focus on complex relationships between peoples and cultures instead of focusing on the seemingly unchanging and static nature of an entire culture like *Os Macondes de Moçambique*.

In the 1980s and 1990s, as the civil war gained momentum and subsequent structural adjustment programs were implemented before and after the peace accord, scholars began to document the affects of the civil war and efforts are rebuilding the
country. Joseph Hanlon, who was to become one of the preeminent scholars in Mozambique and whose works are discussed at length in the next chapter, began his research at the height of the civil war (see Hanlon 1984). In addition, James Pfeiffer, whose research is also explored further in Chapter Three, began ethnographic study as an employee of an international NGO in Mozambique in the late 1990s (see Pfeiffer 2004). Both Hanlon and Pfeiffer take a critical look at structural adjustment and international development programs while documenting cultural, economic, and political circumstances in the country. They represent the growing academic body of literature that critiqued the ever-growing presence of INGOs and the culture of aid in Mozambique.

Historian Malyn Newitt, author of *A History of Mozambique* (1995), provides us with a comprehensive volume of four centuries of Mozambican history, written contemporaneously with the growing numbers of scholarly work being done in the 1990s in Mozambique. Although a conventional history focusing on government, policy, and trade, Newitt’s work is an indispensible tool for any serious scholar doing research on Mozambique. *A History of Mozambique* is also representative of a specific time in Mozambican history, as his work was compiled during the mid-1990s when the civil war had come to an end and the country was looking towards the future. At this moment, it seems appropriate that a historian would want to contextualize the complex historical processes that led to that point.

During the 1990s and early 2000s a resurgence of ethnographies focused on various cultural trends and peoples was taking place, many with regards to how neoliberal policies and development have perceived and altered these cultures. Harry
West, one of the foremost anthropologists working in Mozambique, has done ethnographic research on the ways in which various social groups experienced and coped with violence during and after the civil war, colonialism and socialism and their impact on institutions of local authority, “revivals of tradition,” sorcery, and “traditional healers” in Mozambique (West 1998, 2005, 2008). In addition, Patrick Harries (1994) as a historian is fundamental for understanding southern Mozambique and migration. In connection to the missionary ethnographies of the colonial period, Harries addresses the formation of Mozambican migrant labor by combining 19th and 20th century missionary and anthropological accounts, archival records, and existing historical literatures to portray the profound impact of colonial capitalism on southern Africa (Harries 1994:xvii). Harries, then, uses existing accounts to form a postcolonial assessment of the context in which migrant labor in Mozambique took shape, which is important to understanding the framework of this study.

Western thinkers are not the only academics to study Mozambique. Yussuf Adam (1996), Alcinda Honwana (2011), and Victor Igreja (2007), are all Mozambican scholars who reflect on recent developments in Mozambican history and their impact on contemporary cultural and political states. Specifically, Yussuf Adam, a historian at University Eduardo Mondlane in Maputo, suggested in his dissertation that aid, destabilization, and government development policies in Mozambique from 1974 – 1990 were not independent factors but instead intertwined. Development and aid, he says, consisted not only in the transfer of resources but also of influences, pressures and sanctions (Adam 1996:vii). Moreover, as a result of the convergence of these three
factors, social structures and forces have been impacted in ways not previously considered. In this sense, Adam’s dissertation can be directly connected to my study, as I am suggesting that the sustained presence of aid and international development in Mozambique has resulted in a restructuring of some cultural paradigms pertaining to the individuals who work for and are influenced by aid agencies, due to a variety of historical and social contexts.

A far cry from the works of Junod and the Dias’ that attempted to provide detailed descriptions of an entire culture with a colonial framework, modern ethnographers in Mozambique focus more on the impacts of outside forces, the changing trends within cultures, and the impact of modern Mozambican history of today’s cultures and peoples. The breadth of ethnographic data that has been compiled over the last twenty years or so has been extensive, as ethnographers delve deeper into the complex influences of colonialism, neoliberalism, international development, and economic growth surrounded these historical processes. Understood within the framework of Mozambican history, these works represent broader scholarly trends that make an attempt to take complex relationship and histories into consideration. They are indicative of movements in anthropology that reject ideas of cultural evolution and embrace cultural fluidity and relativism as well as globalization and local histories.

Conclusion

The current state of affairs in Mozambique is due not only to modern occurrences but to an accumulation of political, economic, and historical events that have shaped
various populations in disparate ways. The context that I have provided helps us understand the complex relationships among the specific agents described in this thesis that occur today. The assimilado policy, which spanned from 1933-1962, had an enormous impact on Mozambican perspectives of Westerners and how they should achieve success in a Western-dominated world. Structural adjustment and the implementation of neoliberal policies in the 1980s and 1990s allowed for a large influx of expatriates living and working in Mozambique, thus establishing the cultural traits which compose that group. The local history in Manjacaze described help to shape modern identities and affect access to NGO funding. Portuguese colonialism, FRELIMO’s socialist state, the civil war, and neoliberalism have all impacted these agents and have influenced how they interact with the development field and each other. All of these events, in addition to the other historical circumstances described in this chapter, provide a context for the theoretical background presented in the next chapter and data analysis to follow.
The last chapter illustrated the complex historical processes that led to the high presence of international NGOs in Mozambique, and the cultural background from which Mozambicans today form their identities, particularly in terms of colonialism and its effects. In this chapter, I build upon this historical context and discuss several anthropological bodies of literature that further help to illustrate, from an academic and theoretical perspective, the perceptions and negotiations of the three groups. Specifically, I focus on descriptions of social and cultural capital, globalization theory, development discourse and theory, the anthropology of development, postcolonial theory, and works specifically addressing Mozambique. Here, this literature is considered through the lens of my Mozambican case study and the data presented in proceeding chapters.

Social capital and cultural capital are classic concepts, first discussed in the Introduction, that are used frequently throughout this text. Utilized by all three groups, various forms of cultural capital are essential to the agents’ ability to access the benefits of social capital involved in the development field. Disparate uses of cultural capital can also work to create misunderstandings, emphasizing the wide spectrum of cultural traits that are attributed to the three groups of agents. In addition, globalization theories and specific writers illustrate ideas relating to my research paradigm. This body of knowledge is useful in creating a common framework for the data discussed in chapters to follow.
These include different ways of viewing how globalized communities interact with and influence each other, the role of consumerism and capitalism in Africa and post-colonial nations in the new millennium, the role of the nation-state in our increasingly globalized world, the growth of autochthony as a reaction to globalization, and the role that international development has to play in these ideas. Main concepts concerning development discourse and the evolution of development theory are examined, as well as how anthropologists interact with such discourse. Specific works pertaining to Mozambique underline the theories in a Mozambican context. By providing a theoretical backdrop to my data analysis and conclusions, I hope to support my research by grounding it within the work of previously established academic literature concerning research in this area of inquiry.

**Social and Cultural Capital**

The concepts of social and cultural capital according to Pierre Bourdieu are highly significant to the interpretation of my thesis (see Chapter One), and it is important to keep them in mind throughout the following chapters. In addition to analyzing these concepts, I also examine explanations of these terms by other anthropologists in order to broaden our theoretical horizons.

The common meaning of social capital employed by anthropologists tends to refer to the system of networks found in culture that allow groups or individuals to access the resources needed to improve their own status and control (Bebbington and Perreault 1999:398). Norman Uphoff describes social capital as “expected to produce goods that
are more collective than just individual,” and furthermore that the “benefit that we find most generally associated with social capital is mutually beneficial collective action” (Uphoff 2000:1876). Thus, the evaluation of whether or not a particular culture has a high level of social capital is dependent on that population’s ability to access social networks, allowing for mutually beneficial access to resources and goods. Bourdieu’s definition of social capital includes the “aggregate of the actual or potential resources which are linked to possession of a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition” (1986:250). So, social capital connotes membership in a group that provides its members with access to that groups’ goods and social networks.

In this case study, social capital comes into play when the agents described may or may not have access to the social capital in the development field. Certain agents are equipped with the cultural capital that allows easier access to this social capital, while others are not. For example, my data shows that urban Mozambican informants struggle with the ability to work within a Western timeframe, which includes adhering to deadlines, arriving on time to work, and completing projects on a strict time schedule. Expatriates, on the other hand, have the cultural capital to work within a Western timeframe with relative ease as they have been raised in a culture where this trait is encouraged. This allows many expatriate INGO employees to access the social capital within the development field, including being promoted, placement in positions with more responsibility and higher pay, and social acceptance amongst expatriate colleagues. In addition, conflict in perspectives and perceptions related to the agents’ ability to access
social capital often leads to misunderstandings and conflict. For example, my rural informants working for local associations expressed frustration that funding from international NGOs ceased after only a few years, and that it was difficult to secure more funding afterwards. They often felt unsure of how to go about getting funding again. In this case, those rural informants were unable to access the social capital available, as many of them did not have the proper education or training to know the avenues of obtaining additional support.

Varying degrees of cultural capital are based on *habitus*, the “structuring structures” and “embodied history, internalized as a second nature and so forgotten as history” that come to dominate cultural norms and mores (Bourdieu 1980:493,497). Cultural capital is a resource that is adaptive and represents one’s ability to access symbolic and material goods as related to social status, education, and the various other factors that contribute to the *habitus* of a group or individual (Bourdieu 1980, 1986). Cultural capital is related to a group’s cultural practices, perspectives, and beliefs whereas social capital is the social network that encourages and enables access to resources (Bourdieu 1986). Thus, cultural capital is related to social capital, but cultural capital has more to do with the skills, traits, educations, and *habitus* that allows one to access the social capital within a group. When describing the cultural traits or pointers in the data I gathered while in Mozambique, I will analyze trends that indicate how the three agents interact in the development field using cultural and social capital.
Globalization

My research focuses on the influence of international actors in Mozambique, and my objectives fit into the paradigm of globalization studies; the socio-cultural dynamics concerning NGOs and aid recipients are based on the impact of international policies, funds, and ideologies. Globalization theory, as outlined by anthropologists like Arjun Appadurai (1986), Jean and John Comaroff (2001), Charles Piot (2010), and James Ferguson (1999, 2006), emphasizes the fluidity and ever-changing nature of cultures as they influence and are influenced by other cultures they come in contact with. These authors and their works are important for this particular case study as they highlight the influence of globalization on the classes of agents analyzed in this study, which are impacted in one way or another by global cultural flows.

When examining how NGOs operate in Mozambique, globalization theory helps us to understand the effects of increasingly interconnected worlds, as I study how the wider forces of globalization have impacted local populations. I show these effects in Mozambique through the components that make up globalization theory, using theorists such as Appadurai. These components include the movement of people and culture, culture as a non autonomous entity that may or may not bind people together, and the negative aspects of globalization such as the concept of subaltern groups as related to specific populations that may have been subjugated due to the presence of great sums of international funding, and modes of production in terms of the accumulation of wealth and its effects on Mozambicans (Appadurai 1996; Engels and Marx 1955; Wolf 1982). Critics of globalization and neoliberalism see globalization as increasing inequality and
marginalization. Moreover, Appadurai’s work is useful in examining the relationship between social institutions and their effects on the people who participate in them, and for examining the complex disjunctures between economy, politics, and culture that apply to our understanding of how cultural groups of development-affiliated individuals have been created in Mozambique (Appadurai 1996). Appadurai is unique in his framework for attempting to explain this phenomenon, as he does so through various paradigms:

I propose that an elementary framework for exploring such disjunctures is to look at the relationship between five dimensions of global cultural flow which can be termed: (a) ethnoscapes; (b) mediascapes; (c) technoscapes; (d) financescapes; and (e) ideoscapes….These landscapes thus are the building blocks of what I would like to call imagined worlds, that is, the multiple worlds which are constituted by the historically situated imaginations of persons and groups spread around the globe. An important fact of the world we live in today is that many persons on the globe live in such imagined worlds (and not just in imagined communities) and thus are able to contest and sometimes even subvert the imagined worlds of the official mind and of the entrepreneurial mentality that surround them.” (Appadurai 1996; 328,329)

In this passage, Appadurai proposes alternate paradigms for viewing the effects of globalization, the ever-changing nature of the modern world, and the idea of “scapes” that affect the creation of imagined worlds. In this sense, my research can be seen through a similar lens of various global trends altering the culture and perceptions of individuals in Mozambique, particularly in the cultures of individuals involved in aid work who are impacted by the flows of these various “scapes.” Globalization in Mozambique has ushered in an era of displaced “scapes” in the form of NGOs implementing civil society, which help to create the imagined worlds that Appadurai describes in the passage above. He says that the imagined worlds are made up of the
“historically situated imaginations of persons and groups” (Appadurai 1996:329), and this idea is reflected in the cultural traits of agents that are situated in a historical context, but also affected by the flows of various “scapes.”

Specifically, I propose that for the three classes of agents described in this thesis, the cultural flows of globalization can be understood in terms of the relationship between Appadurai’s “ethnoscape” and “ideoscape.” Appadurai describes “ethnoscape” as the landscape of persons who constitute the shifting world in which we live: tourists, immigrants, refugees, exiles, guestworkers, and other moving groups and persons constitute an essential feature of the world, and appear to affect the politics of and between nations to a hitherto unprecedented degree…And as international capital shifts its needs, as production and technology generate different needs, as nation-states shift their policies on refugee populations, these moving groups can never afford to let their imaginations rest too long, even if they wished to. (Appadurai 1996:330)

In this passage, Appadurai refers to the physical shifting of cultures and peoples around the world that affect the politics of nations to a “hitherto unprecedented degree” (1996:330). It cannot be denied that the influx of expatriates working for international NGOs has affected the culture of Mozambicans to a degree that if not completely unprecedented (i.e., colonialism and the arrival of Portuguese nationals), is highly significant. This shifting of persons and their associated impact on the landscapes to which they travel is an essential aspect to understanding the cultural traits of the three agents inherent in this study.

As mentioned, the relationship between “ethnoscape” and “ideoscape” is significant as well. Appadurai describes “ideoscapes” as:

…often directly political and frequently have to do with the ideologies of states and the counter-ideologies of movements explicitly oriented to capturing state power or a piece of it. These
ideoscapes are composed of elements of the Enlightenment worldview, which consists of a concatenation of ideas, terms and images, including 'freedom', 'welfare', 'rights', 'sovereignty', 'representation' and the master-term 'democracy'... But their diaspora across the world, especially since the nineteenth century, has loosened the internal coherence which held these terms and images together in a Euro-American master-narrative, and provided instead a loosely structured synopticon of politics, in which different nation-states, as part of their evolution, have organized their political cultures around different 'keywords.' (Appadurai 1996:333)

Appadurai specifically references Enlightenment terminologies and worldviews, as these concepts have been utilized around the world to provide a basis for the master-narrative of nation-states. In turn, the concept of the ideoscape has direct implications for this research, particularly in the context of Mozambique’s political history. The ideology of Mozambique’s governing regimes has dramatically shifted in recent history, with the most current shift being the adoption of neoliberal and structural adjustment policies. This era has ushered in an embrace of INGO programs that promote Western-based perceptions of progress such as the encouragement of democracy in Mozambican parliament, the human rights of citizens, the bettering of the welfare of the Mozambican people, and an acceptance of World Bank and IMF pressures to adopt a neoliberal economy. This embrace has to do with the shifting political landscape in Mozambique, but also its relationship to the changing ethnoscapes, as expatriates working for INGOs provide incentives for Mozambicans to accept these programs as well. The relationship between these two “scapes” can be used to describe how global cultural flows affect the three agents. In addition, in my final analysis I will invoke the idea of the developscape (Loftsdóttir 2009) to put a name to the specific confluence of these scapes.
More recently, an emerging theme in anthropology has focused on globalization in the 21st century and the role Africa has to play in it, specifically in a postcolonial, post Cold War, and millennial age (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001, Ferguson 2006, Geschiere and Nyamnjoh 2001, Giddens 2000, Piot 2010). John and Jean Comaroff emphasize the shifting values of consumerism and capitalism in the new millennium, and of the Gucci-gloved fist that “animates the political impulses, the material imperatives, and the social forms of the Second Coming of Capitalism – of capitalism in its neoliberal, global manifestation” (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001:4). They argue that the invisible hand visualized as a brand and consumer-motivated force is what propels globalized forms of wealth accumulation and consumerism. This motivating force leads to speculative market investment, destabilization of labor, and the death of retail trade. They argue that at the Millennial moment there is a loss of human integrity, experienced in the spreading commodification of persons, bodies, cultures, and histories, in the substitution of quantity for quality, abstraction for substance (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001:25). In this sense, in the 21st century globalization is concerned mostly with the spread of consumerism and the invisible hand that dictates flows of capital.

This can be linked to the Mozambican case, as many urban Mozambicans working for INGOs in Maputo attempt to ascribe to a type of consumerism that is on par with their expatriate counterparts. Although I argue that this conspicuous consumption is motivated in part by an emulation of foreigners, it is also undoubtedly motivated by the invisible hand that dictates specific forms of wealth accumulation, which in turn influence the expatriates themselves.
John and Jean Comaroff also speak of the changing and increasingly ambiguous role of the nation and state in the 21st century:

In some places, as we all know, the state can hardly be said to perdure at all, or to perdure purely as a private resource, a family business, a convenient fiction; in others, the nation, as imagined community, is little more than a rhetorical figure of speech, the color of a soccer stripe, an airline without aircraft, a university rarely open. More complicatedly, there are many postcolonial, postrevolutionary polities, not least but not only in Africa and the former Society Union, in which there have developed deep fissures between state and government, this being a corollary of the transition from old to new regimes. (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001:35)

The authors imply that the state, nation, and government are not necessarily in compliance with each other, and can even carry disparate definitions depending on the groups of individuals who propagate varying discourses within one internationally defined nation-state. Also argued by authors like Ferguson and Gupta (2002), this concept is evident in certain African countries that have gone through several turbulent regime changes since independence, encompass a multitude of different cultures, and are dealing with international actors intervening in political affairs and development. This makes the distinction between government, state, and nation perplexing. Their observation is relevant to my project since international NGOs and their expatriate employees are often highly influential on the recipients of aid and Mozambican INGO employees; in-country programs that work directly towards improvements in health and human rights are designed almost exclusively by INGOs. Thus, it can be argued that international actors in Mozambique are playing a significant role in governing the country and often take the place of government entities in areas such as health care. This
has a large impact on the perspectives and cultural traits of the agents discussed in this thesis; the influencing and governing power of international NGOs is shown in the discourse of my informants as they conform to meet Western-oriented requirements.

Another inherent part of the globalization process, as argued by anthropologists such as Peter Geschiere and Francis Nyamnjoh, is an upsurge of autochthony not only in Africa but in many places in the world (2001). Autochthony can be defined as valuing the indigenous or local. The authors argue that as flows of people, goods and images accelerate around the globe what ensues is not only globalization, but a trend towards localization, or “Glocalization” as Roland Robertson (1992) puts it. So, as globalization opens up new horizons, an accompanying effort to make boundaries and define belonging is equally present:

If Globalization is to be understood in terms of a continuing “dialectic of flow and closure,” notions of autochthony, with their paradoxical combination of staggering plasticity and celebration of seemingly self-evident “natural givens,” become an almost inevitable outcome of such dialectical tensions. Their very plasticity keeps them geared to rapidly changing situations in which, indeed, even the Other is constantly becoming another. (Geschiere and Nyamnjoh 2001:184)

Apart from the typical conceptions and effects of globalization such as the spread of a certain kind of consumerism and capitalism, autochthony triggers a push toward the local and indigenous. This emphasis on the local, despite being controlled in actuality by international forces, underlines the growing trend towards valuing “native” tradition, or at least the importance of that perception. In Mozambique, as well as in many parts of Africa, traditional authorities often created by colonial powers played a role in the recruitment and control of laborers during the colonial period (Geschiere and Nyamnjoh
2001:183). In a similar fashion, international NGOs now use local and community based associations to recruit participants and maintain programs. An example of this can be seen in Manjacaze, where local individuals are responsible for local associations that are funded by international NGOs. On the surface, it appears that these associations have control over the types of programs they run, but in reality only programs that INGOs feel are worthy of funding will receive aid. The importance, however, lies in the appearance of autochthony to the INGO’s donor base.

Authors like James Ferguson and Achille Mbembe argue that conceptions of globalization pertaining to Africa are similar to historic Western interpretations of Africa as the Other; the foil of the West’s civilization and modernity. Mbembe suggests that “Africa as an idea, a concept, has historically served, and continues to serve, as a polemical argument for the West’s desperate desire to assert its difference from the rest of the world” (Mbembe 2001:228). In this sense, Africa is seen as a “metaphor of absence,” a continent that is described through a series of problems, failings, and upheavals (Ferguson 2006:2). Therefore, Ferguson argues, Africa is marginal to, and often completely absent from, dominant imaginations of “the global” and globalization (Ferguson 2006:6). Instead, only a selective few truly participate in a globally connected world; Africa’s participation in globalization has not been a matter of simply joining the world economy, but has included a highly selective and spatially bounded form of global connection (Ferguson 2006). These aftereffects of globalization are described by Jean and John Comaroff as the delinking of traditional domains of social production and reproduction, producing a crisis within these domains (2001). Globalization in Africa
often means a restructuring of social reproduction and kinship ties. Political entities like NGOs play a part in this process:

...[in Africa] global links connect in a selective, discontinuous, and point-to-point fashion. This is true not only of the economic connections of transnational capital, but also of the “global” networks of NGOs that increasingly dominate the space of politics on the continent. Such networks of political and economic connections do indeed “span the globe,” as is often claimed, but they do not cover it. Instead, they hop over (rather than flowing through) the territories inhabited by the vast majority of the African population. This leaves most Africans with only a tenuous and indirect connection to the global economy. (Ferguson 2006:14)

Thus, globalization is not the universalizing movement as some might claim, but instead makes most African populations marginalized or completely absent from the global world stage. This is a direct contradiction to much of the criticisms of globalization, which argue that it will necessarily lead to the homogenization of lifestyles with a global norm. Africans cannot feel that they are being dominated or forced to take on the goods of a homogenizing global culture when those goods are mostly unavailable to many populations (Ferguson 2006). Rather,

...it has brought an increasingly acute awareness of the semiotic and material goods of the global rich, even as economic pauperization and the loss of faith in the promises of development have made the chances of actually attaining such goods seem more remote than ever. (Ferguson 2006:21)

As a result, Africans across the continent try to achieve membership in the global world through other means, including attempts at participating in NGO programs. In this light, conceptions of globalization through an African lens should include a discussion of inequality, marginalization, membership, and aspirations to a globalized norm.
Anthropologist Charles Piot chronicles this phenomenon of marginalization in his descriptions of his fieldwork in Togo, and of the Togolese realization of their exclusion from the global world and their reaction to it:

Togolese, like others across the continent, are acutely aware of their position in the world today, of their “abjection” or expulsion from (or persistent non-inclusion in) European modernity – a modernity they see every night on the TV screen but cannot touch, a modernity they hear spoken but may never inhabit. (Piot 2010:166)

Similarly to how Ferguson interprets imitation of European style among Zambians as an attempt to claim the “rights of full membership in a wider society” (Ferguson 2006:161; also Weiss 2009), Piot describes the Togolese embrace of charismatic Christianity as a plea to establish their inclusion in a global society (Piot 2010:167). This idea relates to the topic of this thesis because it establishes yet another motivating force in the emulating consumerism of urban Mozambicans in Maputo, and their desire to live, dress, and act like expatriates. As the majority of Mozambicans are marginalized from the globalized world, it is a symbol of power for Mozambicans who can access the material things and lifestyle associated with global forces to do so. In addition, rural Mozambicans who compete for funding from international NGOs are also attempting to become a part of the global world from which they have been marginalized; by using the terminology of the INGOs in their programs they are seeking acceptance from those international organizations.

Through the theories of the above anthropologists, I hope to lay the foundations for how various aspects of the globalization process affect the transitory and complex cultural dynamics at work in Mozambique, and how various groups of individuals are
affected by and influence development in the country. Arjun Appadurai gives us the framework for this discussion, while academics such as John and Jean Comaroff, James Ferguson, Achille Mbembe, Charles Piot, Peter Geschiere, and Francis Nyamnjoh provide insights on the shifting trends in globalization in the new millennium. The cultural groups, which I describe in the following chapters, are composed of individuals who in one way or another are significantly impacted by the forces of globalization. Whether they are affected by the Gucci-gloved fist (Comaroff 2001) of consumerism or marginalized by globalization as a whole (Ferguson 2006; Mbembe 2001; ), individuals that encompass these cultures cannot escape international influences and are thus undeniably part and parcel of this process.

In the following sections, I will discuss more of the central theoretical concepts that are fundamental for my analysis of the Mozambican case study. The next section will outline postcolonial theory and its connection to this thesis, including utilization of the terms West and Western, notions of the Other, and usage of the concept of mimicry. The theories and literature behind these terms will provide a framework for understanding the relationship between the three agents and their position in the development field.

**Postcolonial Theory**

Postcolonialism is a theoretical framework that works to analyze, explain, and respond to the cultural legacies and human consequences of colonialism and of imperialism. Postcolonialism also analyzes the social and political powers that sustain colonialism and neocolonialism. Specifically in anthropology, postcolonial theory
analyzes the relationship between European nations and the lands and peoples they once ruled (Hiddleston 2009:1). Despite obtaining independence in 1975, in Mozambique the ripples of colonialism are still felt, specifically in how outside forces perceive and interact with local populations and vice versa. I argue that certain paradigms in which international NGOs view and interact with local populations are neocolonial in nature, as they can be seen as recreations of typical colonial behavior and social structures.

When interpreting certain relationships between previously colonized societies and the colonizer in a postcolonial sense, I use the term West or Western to describe an entity represented by a group of people who are not native to a previously colonized place, namely individuals of European descent who now adhere to certain paradigms in contrast to the East. To conceptualize this idea, I will be utilizing Edward Said’s definition of Orientalism as a foil to this so-called West. According to Said the construction of Orientalism includes the false assumptions of the Western world, therefore “as much as the West itself, the Orient is an idea that has a history and a tradition of thought, imagery and vocabulary that have given it reality and presence in and for the West. The two geographical entities thus support and to an extent reflect each other” (Said 1978:132). The West itself can only be defined in its perception of the East, and can be conceived of as having false assumptions as to the reality and complexities of Eastern culture. I will use the terms the West and Western to describe the individuals, ideas, and theories that reflect of the construction of the Orient. Along with previously mentioned Achille Mbembe, V.Y. Mudimbe speaks of this phenomenon specifically in Africa, calling it alterity as opposed to Orientalism (Mudimbe 1988:5) and describes how
the West has invented common incorrect perceptions of Africa when in reality the continent’s history is much more varied and complex (Mudimbe 1988:5). These ideas are useful when considering the terminology used in this study as well as interpreting certain data. For example, when speaking with Mozambicans who work for international NGOs, the assumption that expatriate INGO employees were favored as a result of their Western affiliation came up frequently. They spoke often of attempting to be more Western and less Mozambican in the eyes of their employers, enforcing the Western and Orientalism dichotomies.

Gayatri Spivak’s discussions are particularly useful in envisioning the dynamics at work in Mozambique. In her article “Can the Subaltern Speak?” (1988) Spivak addresses issues of representation useful when considering the relationship between international NGOs and Mozambicans. Spivak discusses the idea of *Vertreten* and *Darstellen*: *Darstellen* refers to the representation of a group of people by a member of their community, and *Vertreten* refers to representation of a group of people by an outsider, usually leading to misrepresentation (Spivak 1988:293). In the case of my research in Mozambique, this concept applies to the relationship between international NGOs and Mozambicans in the sense that international aid agencies attempt to be *Vertreten*, representative of a group of people by an outsider, for the communities where their programs are implemented. They represent these communities to the rest of the world through fundraising campaigns and represent their best interests to their multilateral donors. According to Spivak, however, this is not *Darstellen* representation but *Vertreten*, as outsiders are attempting to represent the Mozambicans. This form of
representation has an impact on how both Mozambicans and expatriates working for international NGOs view their role in Mozambique, and how their perspective influences the interactions between these groups.

In addition, Homi Bhabha’s concept of mimicry relates to postcolonial discussions concerning Mozambique. Although there are several distinct ways of thinking about mimicry, in this instance mimicry applies most aptly in reference to how international NGOs alter the habitus of some Mozambicans, namely urban Mozambicans emulating Western lifestyles and rural Mozambicans altering their discourse in order to receive INGO funding, as they modify their lives to fit within a Western framework. Mimicry is the idea that members in a colonial context (or neocolonial context, in this case) imitate certain aspects of the colonizing population in an attempt to replicate the persons in power so as to achieve that same power (Bhabha 1987:318). According to Bhabha,

…colonial mimicry is the desire for a reformed, recognizable Other, as a subject of a difference that is almost the same, but not quite…mimicry is constructed around an ambivalence; in order to be effective mimicry must continually produce its slippage, its excess, its difference” (Bhabha 1987:318)

In this light, mimicry is not only a replication of colonial behavior but it is an inexact replication; it is most effective as an aspect of colonial authority when mimicry is inexact and thus continues to differentiate between the colonizers and colonized. Since mimicry does not replicate the colonizing culture exactly, however, according to Bhabha it has the power to be subversive as well. Bhabha explains, “The menace of mimicry is its double vision which in disclosing the ambivalence of colonial discourse also disrupts its
authority” (Bhabha 1987:321). He then goes further, detailing the subversive nature of mimicry:

But they are also, as I have shown, the figures of a doubling, the part-objects of a metonymy of colonial desire which alienates the modality and the normality of these dominant discourses in which they emerge as “inappropriate” colonial subjects. A desire that, through the repetition of partial presence, which is the basis of mimicry, articulates those disturbances of cultural, racial, and historical difference that menace the narcissistic demand of colonial authority. (Bhabha 1987:321)

In this sense, mimicry’s power, or the menace of mimicry, comes in the guise of similarity. That is, the slight differences in the replication of colonial culture are directly in confrontation with the colonizers themselves. Examples of mimicry include young Mozambicans in Maputo working for international NGOs who purchase expensive cars, live in fancy houses, and wear expensive Western-style clothing in replication of their European counterparts, or in rural areas like Manjacaze where individuals are attempting to replicate Western-style aid organizations. Although this replication occurs frequently, it is never a completely accurate double; there are consistently slight differences. By mimicking the activities and lifestyle of international NGOs and their staff members, Mozambicans are attempting to access that power but at the same time make it their own. It is true, however, that in this Mozambican case mimicry is mostly seen as replication in an attempt to access power and as a form of authoritarian colonial discourse, as opposed to the subversive nature of mimicry as described by Bhabha. Most of my informants expressed their attempts to access social capital in the development field by mimicking the cultural behavior of INGOs, as opposed to attempting to subvert it.
Development and postdevelopment theory, which I examine in the next section, are also essential aspects in understanding the context of this research. My thesis relates directly to ideas concerning development and how it is approached in Mozambique, therefore I discuss various theories concerning the best ways to implement development. Knowledge of development theory provides a background from which to consider the implications of this thesis.

**Development and Postdevelopment Theory**

Broadly defined, development theory is a collection of theories concerning how positive change in society is best achieved, particularly in third world countries. Development is normally equated with modernity and the idea of progress, based on technology and Western concepts of economic development (Harrison 2006:97). In the 1990s, theorists were mostly in dispute over the means by which the goal of development was attained, and which metrics were best when measuring the success of development. As the world was swept into a new millennium, however, the validity and very meaning of development began to be contested (Rapley 2004:350; Sidaway 2007) alongside the continuation of a metrics based development goals such as the Millennium Development Goals (“United Nations Millennium Development Goals” 2000). A burgeoning group of theorists came to represent what was later referred to as postdevelopment theory, which proposes that development is itself an “arbitrary concept rooted in a meta-narrative which, in turn, reflects the interests of its practitioners” and is an “extension of the control of the Western world and its nationalist allies in the developing countries”
According to postdevelopment theorists, the goal of development is more hegemonic than altruistic, with the principal aim being the incorporation of marginal communities into the power of the nation-state; improvements in living standards are of less importance than these hegemonic goals (Rapley 2004:250; Sidaway 2007).

One academic who adheres more closely to conventional ideas of development theory and how best to go about improving societies is Lawrence E. Harrison. Harrison is a much-cited theorist who writes specifically on the relationship between culture and development and how culture is to be best utilized when developing program policies. He argues that development agencies must work to change the culture of the groups in which they hope to implement their policies if they want to be successful and promote progress. He encourages cultural change as the key to success (Harrison 2006:96) and also stresses that certain cultures are more progress-prone than others;

A “progress-prone” worldview nurtures rationality and achievement and the belief that a person can influence his destiny; it sees wealth as the product of human creativity and promotes a society where advancement is based on merit; it emphasizes the importance of the individual. “Progress-prone” values inculcate habits such as saving, planning for the future and trust. In contrast, the “progress-resistant” worldview nurtures irrationality and is prone either to fatalism or utopianism; wealth is a gift of fate, chance, or natural-resource endowment; and advancement comes through connections. (Harrison 2006:97)

Harrison is equating progress with the Western-style values of capitalism. In his view, progress and success equal saving and wealth, while failure equals inattention to these ideals. He does not take into consideration that different cultures can have varying ideas of exactly what consists of that progress and whether or not they hope to achieve it at all.
Harrison promotes the need to change local culture to suit the needs of development interests. Giving advice on how to best succeed at development he says, “Politics can change culture, enabling more rapid progress; societies can be substantially transformed within a generation” (Harrison 2006:100). Thus, Harrison represents one end of the spectrum concerning development theory, which is one of implementing cultural change in favor of more Western ideals of progress.

On the other end of the spectrum, critics of development such as Arturo Escobar are firmly in the postdevelopment camp and take a critical stance on the role of development and its effects on impoverished groups of peoples. Escobar, one of the most outspoken critics of international development and aid, criticizes authors like Harrison who, he believes, take a flippant attitude in considering the potential negative impact that development agencies may have on the societies that are working with. As a result he essentially advocates for a cessation of international development. Escobar describes how, in his view, massive poverty in the modern sense “appeared only when the spread of the market economy broke down community ties and deprived millions of people from access to land, water, and other resources” (Escobar 1995:89). He goes on to critique the idea that the Third World is synonymous with poverty and that the only logical step is the intervention of development and economic growth. Escobar questions the belief that industrialization and urbanization achieved by capital investment are the “inevitable and necessarily progressive routes to modernization” (Escobar 1995:90).

Escobar asserts that these ideas are akin to colonialism in the guise of development:
Development assumes a teleology to the extent that it proposes that the “natives” will sooner or later be reformed; at the same time, however, it reproduces endlessly the separation between reformers and those to be reformed by keeping alive the premise of the Third World as different and inferior, as having a limited humanity in relation to the accomplished European…The signifiers of “poverty,” illiteracy,” “hunger,” and so forth have already achieved a fixity as signifieds of “underdevelopment” which seems impossible to sunder. (Escobar 1995:90)

Escobar aligns development with neocolonialism and imperialism, as the values and signifiers of the imperial core are being imposed on the periphery, which in turn is infiltrated by development agents. Escobar sees development as one-sided and discriminatory, and in his ideal world international development would cease and international communities would fend for themselves. Although this is not what I am suggesting, his critical examination of development is useful to understanding the broader academic arguments of development theorists in relation to this research.

Development Discourse: Civil Society and Governance

According to development theorists who promote the bettering of society through interventionist development programs, there are several key indicators that are essential to introduce or improve within a group or culture. One of these indicators is the idea of civil society; in recent years, this concept has come to dominate the discourse concerning international humanitarian aid efforts and NGO policy implementation. According to the World Bank’s 2010 definition,

The term civil society refers to the wide array of non-governmental and not-for-profit organizations that have a presence in public life, expressing the interests and values of their members or others, based on ethical, cultural, political, scientific, religious or philanthropic considerations. Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) therefore refer to a wide of array of organizations: community groups, non-governmental organizations
(NGOs), labor unions, indigenous groups, charitable organizations, faith-based organizations, professional associations, and foundations. (The World Bank 2010)

As bearers of the torch of this all-encompassing term “civil society,” NGOs have been lauded, supported, and funded as one of the primary forces of positive change and development around the globe. In Mozambique, and according to James Pfeiffer, the growing power of this concept has “provided the logic for rechanneling major donor support over the last two decades away from the public sector to nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) cast as civil society actors” (2001:359). The proportion of bank-financed projects that included NGOs rose from 20 percent in 1989 to 52 percent in 1999, while the number of NGOs receiving funding from the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), increased from 18 in 1970 to 195 in 2000 (in Pfeiffer 2004:359). As of 2011, Mozambique relied on foreign aid to carry out 49% of its budget (“Mozambique still a foreign aid economy” 2011). This increasing reliance on NGOs to foster civil society throughout the world has effectively transferred monetary and social power over to institutions that are separate from traditional local and state governing forces, thus linking the ideology of civil society to the ideology of a free market economy in which privatization policy is key.

Critics of both the ideology and implementation of the term, specifically pertaining to Africa, warn of the theoretical implications of civil society especially when considering historical connotations of the word civil. John and Jean Comaroff argue that civil can be located amongst similar terms such as civilizing, civility, and nation-state, which may be connected to cultural imperialism;
For these terms, in their various modernist guises...have a highly charged history in a continent still struggling to extricate itself from a century of European rule; from a cultural imperialism styled, literally, as a civilizing mission, whose telos lingers on the paternalism of both the “charity business in Africa” (Monga 1996:156) and the ideologically saturated “development” industry (Ferguson 1994; Escobar 1994). (Comaroff and Comaroff 1999:2)

This growing obsession of civil society in Africa over the past twenty-five or so years (Comaroff and Comaroff 1999:16) has sprouted hand in hand with the implementation of neoliberal policies. Neoliberalism as an ideology places an emphasis on privatization and transfer of power away from state regulation. M. Anne Pitcher (2002) agrees with African academic William Munro that the practical application of neoliberal policies is concerning as it has encouraged a “marked tendency to de-privilege the state,” and thus has radical implications for how NGOs and Mozambican populations view their roles in determining policy, power, and civil society (Pitcher 2002:19-20). Thus, an examination of civil society as it relates to governance can clarify more of the complexities at work. According to the John and Jean Comaroff, for proponents of civil society in Africa the “sine qua non of development and democratization is a discrete civil sphere; a sphere that, ideally, acts in collaboration with the capital but, in view of a recent past of oppressive regimes, actually has to do battle against it” (Comaroff and Comaroff 1999:18). As a result, according to these advocates, “good governance” policies must also be implemented in order to ensure that the actors attempting to encourage civil society have a working relationship with formal state entities.

Governance, as defined by UNESCO’s Informal Network on Governance (GovNet) found in Stefano Belluci’s paper presented to UNESCO entitled “‘Governance,
Civil Society and NGOs in Mozambique” (2002) has been defined as follows:

Governance is a complex and continuous process through which self-organizing networks, mechanisms and institutions are created in order to protect local, national and global public goods. These networks, mechanisms and institutions are formal and informal settings that create regimes and reinforce allegiances among and within state and non-state actors. Therefore Governance recognises [sic] the interdependence of organizations, as well as the interactive relationship between and within governmental and non-governmental forces in the public realm, which is broader than the traditional political system. (in Belluci 2002:17)

UNESCO’s definition of governance, while broad, provides us with a basic understanding of the concept; essentially, governance from a socio-political perspective refers to how well a polity “is able to administrate, mobilize, etc. its own social capital, so as to bolster the civic public realm” (Belluci 2002:16). Belluci argues that as powerful institutions that produce civil society policies, NGOs play a major role in implementing these good governance foundations, and thus it is essential to understand the complex relationship between NGOs, the state, and their constituents. In Mozambique, NGOs do indeed represent these aforementioned polities that have the capacity to influence and shape “good governance structures” (Belluci 2002:17). Thus, the power of NGOs to help maintain, create, and shape political culture and an organized tradition of civil society should not be overlooked.

Furthermore, this relationship between traditional policy-makers and the more informal interference of entities such as NGOs should be examined further to emphasize the naturalizing and cultural power of NGOs. According to James Ferguson and Akhil Gupta (2002), NGOs represent a burgeoning form of transnational governmentality as a way of grasping how new practices of government and new forms of ‘grassroots’ politics
may call into question the principles of verticality and encompassment that have long
helped to legitimate and naturalize states’ authority over ‘the local!’” (Ferguson and Gupta
2002:981). As NGOs are welcomed into the functioning and stabilizing processes of the
state, and as they promote good governance and civil society policies, they increasingly
come to confuse the role of the state that has historically been understood as the vertical
imposition of paternalistic policies with the role of the civil society promoting NGOs.
Ferguson and Gupta cite Mozambique as a noteworthy example of this phenomenon:

> When such organizations (NGOs) begin to take over the most basic
functions and powers of the state, as they very significantly did, for
instance, in Mozambique, it becomes only too clear that NGOs are not as
‘NG’ as they might wish us to believe. Indeed, the World Bank baldly
refers to what they call BONGOS (bank-organized NGOs) and even
GONGOs (government-organized NGOs). (Ferguson and Gupta 2002:
993)

Thus, NGOs are inextricably linked to government forces, which have previously
been the naturalizing and governing entities but which now relinquish some of that
cultural power over to the “non-governmental,” civil society forces (see also Comaroff
and Comaroff 2001). The various theoretical paradigms invoked throughout development
discourses will help inform my research and analysis of Mozambican NGOs and their
impacted populations. Ferguson and Gupta’s work helps us understand why international
NGOs have the ability to naturalize their ideology and activities. In the case of
Mozambique, development discourse can clarify the impact on the agents involved, while
the anthropology of development provides a critique of development and its impact on
culture.
The Anthropology of Development

As aid agencies gain stronger footholds on the continent, their influence and impact becomes more noticeable and extensive. The anthropological body of literature examining this phenomenon has expanded starting from a relatively early period in modern development history (Edelman and Haugerud 2005; Ferguson 1999; Gow 1996; Hobart 1993; Murphy 2011; Patch and McMorrow 1977; Rubin 1961). The anthropology of development is a term applied to anthropological work, which considers development from a critical perspective. David Gow (1996) suggests questions that garner information using this critical approach including asking why poverty is increasing if a development goal is to reduce poverty, why there is a gap between strategic plans and outcomes, why those working in development are so willing to disregard history and the lessons it might offer, why development is so externally driven rather than having an internal basis, and why so much planned development fails (Gow 1996:165). Gow also distinguishes between the “Anthropology of Development” and “Development Anthropology,” with the difference described as the critique of development versus the participation in it (Gow 1996:166).

William F. Fisher has advocated for a novel approach to the anthropology of development. His work lays the foundation for the theoretical perspectives on NGOs and includes suggestions for the potential of anthropologists to research within that theoretical framework:

The growth of a multicentric world and the practices of growing numbers of nonstate national and transnational actors have had significant impact on the sites and communities that have been the focus of anthropological research…Community-based organizations may be close to the traditional sites of anthropological concerns, but the networks and alliances they
increasingly have come to form open up new sites for ethnographic research, and the wide cast of these networks...as researchers, we need to reconsider how to approach problems located in or flowing through multiple sites. (Fisher 2000:459)

Despite being published in 2000, Fisher’s article continues to be relevant as these “nonstate national and transnational actors” continue to have a significant impact on communities around the world. The full implications of this impact may not be revealed for many years, and anthropologists can continue to provide insight into anthropological conceptions of communities, local and translocal networks, and technologies of control (Fisher 2000).

Fisher emphasizes the potential impact that the rise of NGOs will have on history and the Third World in particular, saying that they are being swept up by a “nongovernmental, associational, or ‘quiet’ revolution that at least one analyst believes may ‘prove to be as significant to the latter twentieth century as the rise of the nation-state was to the latter nineteenth century’” (Fisher 2000:440). Considering nation-states are one of the preeminent forces in shaping recent modern history, Fisher implies the vital need for anthropologists to examine this phenomenon and recognize its significance to local and global populations.

As a follow up to Fisher, David Moss (2013) provides a review on how international development has been studied by anthropologists in the first part of the 21st century, advocates for the ethnography of development, and suggests that the discipline’s engagement with international development has encouraged reflection on the practice of anthropology itself (Moss 2013:227). Specifically pertinent for this thesis, Moss outlines the current shift to engage with ethnographic meanings of development as a category of
practice, rather than a category of analysis; in other words, to understand the way in which development “becomes produced as a common sense part of people’s understanding of the world and their place within it” and how “the delineation of [development] emerges from, and produces, particular circumstances, particular cultural logics, and finally, particular subjectivities (Curtis and Curtis 2012:179; Moss 2013:230). Moss’s observations concerning this shift relates to my thesis, as I emphasize the hegemonic and naturalizing qualities of international NGOs and how the cultural capitals valued by these aid organizations produce particular cultural understandings of the world and of development. In this sense, my thesis fits into the framework of an ethnographic engagement with development as a category of practice.

In addition, there have been critiques of development buzzwords such as participation, partnership, sustainability, empowerment, and good governance, which showcase an attempt to respond to current crises, earlier failures, and shortcomings in development practice (Edelman and Haugerud 2005:49). Development anthropologists evaluate these terms as simply being the same practice cloaked in new language (Edelman and Haugerud 2005:49), noting how supposed empowerment can become subjection, and how participatory rural development practice can in fact override the power structures of local communities (see Cooke, Kothari 2001:12). Some anthropologists suggest instead for scholars to look beyond development as the answer to eradicating hardships such as poverty, hunger, and oppression and instead shift the focus to examine these issues more broadly (Gardner and Lewis 1996:158). These anthropologists promote investigatory blends of cultural, historical, and political
economy and emphasize new conceptual apparatuses that take on these problems (Ferguson 1999:249). The agendas proposed by development anthropologists encourage anthropological engagement within the public arena, and open up new possibilities for anthropological research and study. In this vein, the case study presented here aims to take a culturally and historically informed approach to development issues in Mozambique.

**Mozambique in Focus**

Specific studies on similar dynamics at work in Mozambique have been published over the past twenty years, ever since international aid became a permanent presence in the country. These works utilize the described theories, critiques, and concepts to discuss phenomenon related to development, aid, and culture in Mozambique. There are several prominent authors of this topic, first and foremost of which is Joseph Hanlon, who has written about international aid and the changes occurring in Mozambique since before the end of the civil war. His work “Mozambique: Who Calls the Shots?” (1991) is a seminal piece written before the civil war had officially ended and focuses on international intervention and the violent 16 year struggle. Hanlon is not shy about his criticisms of entities such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund. His introductory chapter entitled “Aid and Recolonization” implies that international aid is simply a new form of colonialism (Hanlon 1991:1). He argues, however, that the replication of colonial tendencies is too similar to actual colonialism to be neocolonialism:

> European doctors fly out to minister to rural peasants, in a modern version of the colonial mission hospitals. In Maputo, foreign white men issue orders in many ministries. They come from the World Bank and donor
agencies, but they are little different from colonial administrators. And the Portuguese are coming back. They or their children are reclaiming businesses and houses that they abandoned 15 years ago....This is not neocolonialism; it is the recolonization of Mozambique...If history does not repeat itself exactly, the similarities with the colonial era are nevertheless striking. (Hanlon 1991:1)

While certainly much has changed over the past twenty or so years since “Who Calls the Shots?” was published, Hanlon sets the stage for an early critique on the intervention of foreign humanitarian and economic aid, arguing that this intervention is just another form of control, simulating colonial activity. He argues that the Mozambican state was so weakened from destabilization that it had no choice but to accept the assistance of multilateral bodies such as the IMF, bilateral donors, and NGOs (Hanlon 1991), and that this has caused and will continue to cause almost complete dependence on these agencies.

Hanlon has continued to be one of the most consistent sources on political, economic, and cultural happenings in Mozambique, as well as a critique of international NGOs in the country. Published in 1996, “Peace Without Profit: How the IMF Blocks Rebuilding in Mozambique” is a follow-up to “Who Calls the Shots” and covers the initial postwar recovery period and the role that international entities play in rebuilding the nation. Once again, Hanlon takes a critical perspective in examining the role of organizations like the IMF and World Bank, arguing that they are responsible for slow economic growth and stagnation of poverty levels (Hanlon 1996). He uses quotes from interviews with Mozambicans, which supplement his arguments, giving them credibility:

Mozambique gained its independence from colonialism in 1975, but no independence is real without economic independence. Our independence is fictitious; we are just servants of the rich countries. We have gone from one colonialism to a much stronger one – economic colonialism. And the new colonizers use immoral means to do their colonization – war and corruption. (Don Manuel Vieira Pinto, Bishop of Nampula, cited in Hanlon 1996:1)
Once again the theme of recolonization comes through strongly. Hanlon sees foreign intervention and control over Mozambican economic affairs to be just as immoral, if not more so, than historical colonialism.

Hanlon has published more recent works as well, chronicling Mozambique’s continuing relationship with development efforts. “Do Bicycles Equal Development in Mozambique?” (Hanlon and Smart 2008) takes a critical look at development efforts in Mozambique through the lens of the bicycle. As a much-used signifier of progress in development efforts, the bicycle is used as a symbol to analyze the disparities between international and governmental development initiatives, actual results, and local perceptions. The authors propose alternative development models and ultimately focus on demand-driven ways to increase income and achieve job creation, particularly in rural areas (Hanlon and Smart 2008). This approach, they claim, is in contradiction to the “overly supply-driven neo-liberal” agenda of the World Bank and the IMF in Mozambique (Hanlon and Smart 2008:202). Their perspective is that too many aid organizations follow this line of thinking, accepting false proxies for successful development (bicycles) and ignoring on the ground results.

Hanlon’s article “Whose Wealth is it Anyways?: Mozambique’s Outstanding Economic Growth with Worsening Rural Poverty,” (2012) coauthored with Benedito Cunguara, takes another critical perspective on development in Mozambique. Acknowledging that the economic growth of Mozambique is promising, he argues that this growth is for a select few individuals and that poverty in some areas is actually increasing (Cunguara and Hanlon 2012). Citing the idea that in recent years Mozambique
has become a “Darling of Development” for aid donors, he argues, “a robust GDP growth and lack of progress in poverty reduction in the last decade suggest that most of the benefits of economic growth accrue to wealthier households. As a result, inequality levels would increase over time” (Cunguara and Hanlon 2012:626). Although Hanlon relinquishes his recolonization argument slightly for this particular article, the tone of his argument is clear; the success of international development in Mozambique is questionable at best. Hanlon forces us to call into question the recent economic statistics pertaining to Mozambique’s economic growth rate and GDP, and instead look at the lives of the majority of Mozambicans, those who live in the rural areas. According to Hanlon, their lives are not improving as quickly as some development circles would like to suggest. This observation is expounded upon in “Just Give Money to the Poor: The Development Revolution from the Global South,” (Hanlon et al. 2010) which argues for a radical approach to development. Hanlon advocates for bypassing international NGOs and governments and letting the recipients of aid decide how they will use the money given to them (Hanlon et al. 2010). This alternative to traditional development methods raises thought-provoking questions for the situation in Mozambique.

As one of the leading scholars on economic and political activity in Mozambique, Hanlon’s works have contributed greatly to development studies related to the country, and his influence on these topics is undeniable. With “Who Calls the Shots?” published just before the end of Mozambique’s civil war, to his recent continuing publications, Hanlon has continued to take a critical and analytical stance on the effects of development through various political and nongovernmental entities. While his research
focused more specifically on the pitfalls of IMF and World Bank intervention in his early work, as the presence of international NGOs has increased over the past twenty years his work now examines more of their actions as well. As a writer, researcher, observer, and participant in Mozambican affairs during this time, he has had the ability to witness the long-term effects of INGO activities. Specifically for my research, Hanlon is incredibly useful in conceptualizing both past and present impacts of international aid and the complex history behind current perceptions of NGOs in the country. In light of the complicated history with development in the country that Hanlon has analyzed, his work also lends insight into how international NGOs have perhaps either altered or maintained the nature of their protocols over time, influencing their relationship with local populations and vice versa.

James Pfeiffer is an anthropologist who has spent much of his academic career focusing on Mozambique and on the role of international aid agencies. Pfeiffer, as opposed to Hanlon, concentrates mostly on the health care side of international NGOs, as well as the complexities of religion and their impact on health care and gender roles (Pfeiffer 2002). In his article “International NGOs and primary health care in Mozambique: the need for a new model of collaboration,” Pfeiffer argues that the enormous amount of international NGOs working in the health sector has undermined local control of health programs while at the same time contributing to local social inequality by introducing high salaries of NGO employees unattainable by the majority of the population (2002). As a staff member at an international NGO in a central provide in Mozambique, Pfeiffer has a unique insider perspective of the relationship between
INGOs and local populations. Importantly for my research, he also focuses specifically on the presence of expatriates in Mozambique and the cultural motivators that impact their interactions with local populations. He describes the culture of aid workers and provides a profile of middle or upper-middle class European and American INGO staff members who came to work in the same province as Pfeiffer in the late 1990s. He describes them as moving from contract to contract throughout the Third World, expressing no specific interested in Mozambique itself:

Nearly all [of the INGO staff members] had career aspirations in international aid, academia, or public health and many were working their way up the ladder in their respective organizations. Some were younger Europeans who viewed their experiences in Africa as an adventure that alleviated pre-career ennui…Most aid workers expressed good intentions, but a majority described themselves in discussions as non-ideological technical specialists and professionals not particularly interested in Mozambican political history, culture, the context of international aid, or philosophical concerns with “development.” (Pfeiffer 2002:729)

Although this profile was written over ten years ago, Pfeiffer’s analysis is quite pertinent as it reveals some patterns of cultural behavior that are still present in Mozambique today. By using Pfeiffer’s descriptions of expatriate culture in Mozambique in the late 1990s, I can follow potential changes in that culture to the present day, while at the same time allowing for individual differences in perspective and behavior.

Anne Pitcher, an academic who also contributes much to postcolonial literature on Mozambique, has written on political economy and post-war transformations in the country. Her work “Transforming Mozambique: The Politics of Privatization, 1975-2000” is informative in understanding the complexities of privatization and the enormous changes that have taken place in Mozambique during those years. She argues, “although
privatization has certainly altered the role of state institutions in Mozambique, the process and outcome of privatization have not eliminated state power, only redirected it” (Pitcher 2002:xi). In this sense, Pitcher aligns herself with academics such as Ferguson, Gupta, and Hanlon as she argues that non-governmental privatization is not non-governmental at all but is instead a redirecting of state power and a replication of colonial practices.

**Conclusion**

Beginning with anthropological concepts relating to social and cultural capital, globalization theory, and postcolonial theory, and then examining theories related to development, the anthropology of development and writings focusing specifically on Mozambique, I have set the stage for the analysis of my data and thesis argument. These writings and the theories that they outline are vital to understanding the theoretical context in which to base my findings and demonstrate that my work is rooted in an anthropological but also multi-disciplinary framework. In the following chapters, the relevance of these theories will become even more apparent as I describe the nature of the agents and their cultural traits.

The next chapter will commence data analysis and will include an account of the first cultural group I encountered: rural Mozambicans working for local organizations that are currently or previously funded by international aid agencies. I will portray in detail my initial entrée into fieldwork in Manjacaze, including how I obtained informant contacts and the process by which I discovered the topic of this research. The data that was gathered will be presented, including an analysis of the significance of that
information and its implications for subsequent data analysis chapters. We shall see how rural Mozambicans in Manjacaze perceive, portray, and interact with international development programs in their community and how their cultural capital is utilized in relation to the development field. This analysis will fit firmly into the aforementioned theoretical framework and will rely on this background in order to reach its theoretical and analytical conclusions.
CHAPTER FOUR: THE DUSTY ROAD TO MANJACAZE

Manjacaze, or Mandlakazi in the region’s native language Xishangan, is 300 kilometers NorthWest of Maputo along rough and tumble roads. The majority of the drive is on Mozambique’s Estrada Nacional 1 (National Road 1), but the last portion goes into the Mozambican countryside on a minimally maintained unpaved road, requiring a vehicle that is up to the task. Upon arrival in Manjacaze, the weary traveler is greeted initially by an abandoned cashew factory, a relic of days when Mozambique was one of the largest exporters of cashews in the world, supplying 30% of global production (“Mozambique’s Lost Cashew Nut Industry” 2003). Further up the road more colonial-era buildings in need of a 21st century makeover come into view. These buildings have been converted into small businesses of various sorts, including bakeries and convenient stores, while some remain abandoned. People glance curiously at the truck containing three white females (myself, my advisor Dr. M. Dores Cruz, and graduate student Jennifer Moon), as this town does not receive many such visitors. Masses of uniformed schoolchildren walk in groups, laughing and chasing each other, often seemingly unaware of the pickup truck barreling towards them. A few young women stroll down the street, some with purses in hand and high heels on their feet. Even in this rural town people take pride in their professional appearance at work. Red dust from the road gently billows everywhere, covering storefronts, and cars. The road begins to climb and at the

94
top of the hill is the City Hall, complete with a statue of Ngungunyane, the last emperor of the Gaza Empire who battled against the Portuguese colonial armies.

Figure 7 A shop / store in downtown Manjacaze, a relic from colonial days (Cruz 2010)

This is a town of many contradictions; often bleakly poor, with families crippled by disease, but also vibrant in activity. Despite their struggles and the lingering effects of the 16 year violent civil war, the people here have rebuilt and are surviving, although significant daily challenges remain. Like many rural towns in Mozambique, Manjacaze is facing debilitating humanitarian aid issues ranging from the battle against the HIV/AIDS epidemic, malnutrition, malaria, domestic violence, and extreme poverty, some of which I witnessed firsthand or was related during interviews during my stay there. The primary means of local transportation relies on a network of a few aging chapas. It is virtually

11 Chapas are privately owned and operated mini-buses that service specified routes.
impossible for people living in the district or working for an association to purchase even an older model vehicle for private use. Some of these concerns are immediately obvious upon entering the town, while some remain hidden to the casual observer. As we drive through downtown and approach our destination, the poverty and crumbling colonial buildings are left behind as we pull up to the house, where we stayed for the duration of our fieldwork.

Built in 1973 for the Portuguese Catholic order of *Irmãs Concepcionistas*, the house has two stories and its immediate surroundings are brimming with life; the grass is green, flowers are in bloom, and a lush vegetable garden is growing. The impression it gives is one of an oasis, and over our two-month stay with the nuns, I learned that this was true in more ways than one. Although the *Irmãs Concepcionistas* arrived here in 1973 their initial stay was short lived. After Independence in 1975 and the implementation of the Marxist-Leninist FRELIMO regime, most religious orders were expelled from the country. The sisters abandoned their house in Manjacaze and were
allowed to return only after the end of the Civil War. In 1995, three years after the Rome Peace Accord was signed, the nuns once again took up residence in Manjacaze.

Now a respected and integral part of the Manjacaze community, the sisters have several different programs that provide direct support to the community. They run the programs, along with young Mozambican girls who are in training. Irmã Alice is a woman in her 60s who has a cheerful and kind disposition. She looks over the other nuns in the house and manages the programs. Irmã Angélica and Irmã Tânia are more serious and quiet in character, however once Irmã Angélica became more comfortable with us she often laughed and joked. The interior of the house is relatively spacious, with a dining room area, recreation room, small library, study and living quarters upstairs. Catholic paraphernalia adorns the walls, with a painting of the Last Supper hanging in the

Figure 9 The backyard of the nuns’ residence that pictures some of their gardens (Cruz 2012)
dining area. The painting depicts Jesus and the 12 Apostles as Africans. The individual rooms are named for various Catholic saints. Pamphlets concerning the order’s activities are scattered on the tables.

This was to be our home-base over the next few months as I gained entrée into the community, ascertaining informants and contacts. The nuns’ home provided an excellent starting point, as I had the ability to witness first hand the often overwhelming challenges faced by the people living in Manjacaze that the sisters were attempting to alleviate with their programs. On one occasion, I was invited to accompany a boy from the orphanage to his weekly visit to the health clinic in town. While there I took note of the huge mass of people waiting to be seen by the one nurse on staff, many of them in obvious poor health and in need of immediate medical attention. It was quite plain to me from an early start that this was a town where development agencies offering assistance in health care or income generation would be welcomed. How these organizations go about implementing their development programs in Manjacaze was still the subject of curiosity for me at the beginning of fieldwork, and I was eager to learn more about the humanitarian aid programs at work in the community. As I was to discover, the community members who work with the INGOs have developed distinct perspectives concerning these organizations and their role in the area.

Thus, the focus of this chapter will be the perspectives, perceptions, and motivations of the first group of agents; that is, Mozambicans who are on the receiving end of international development programs and who work with local associations. These perspectives are generated by the agents’ **habitus**, as described in Bourdieu’s theoretical
model of cultural production. As a reminder, Bourdieu suggested that an agent does not act alone or in a vacuum, but instead within a set of social situations, which he defines as “fields” (Bourdieu 1993:5). An agent’s *habitus* either predisposes them or disallows them to enter a certain field. In this case, I will focus on the position of rural Mozambicans in the development field, their relations to that field, and their relationship with other agents. I will do this by describing the cultural traits or pointers detected during informant interviews that indicate broader cultural expectations. The data gleaned from informant interviews discussed here was the result of the slow process of gaining entrée and expanding our social network in Manjacaze, and the interviews and observations of over 20 informants, which is described in the next section.

**On the Trail of Development: Investigative Fieldwork in Manjacaze**

After a restful sleep in our rooms at the sisters’ home, the next day saw the start of fieldwork in Manjacaze. Due to the intense bureaucratic administrative organization of Mozambique, it is necessary to follow the official methods of approval in order to conduct work in the area. In other words, we needed to speak to the right people in descending order of significance to inform them of our presence and research goals. If we did not go through these formal channels, we would face hurdles in garnering information. Mozambique is divided into provinces that partition the country, then each province is divided into separate districts, and districts are divided into municipalities, and lastly villages that make up the municipalities. At each level, there is an individual administrator who is in charge of their particular region and a party (FRELIMO)
representative, even if administrators are almost exclusively FRELIMO members. This relationship to political power indicates that in Manjacaze those connected to FRELIMO are better positioned to access the social capital available within this system.

So, early on in our stay in Manjacaze we sought out the Administrative Head of the District in order to explain the nature of my project and obtain her approval, as materialized by her signature on my official letter of research. The Administrative Head’s office is located in the City Hall building in downtown Manjacaze, where the statue of Nyunganyane is located as an official reminder of Manjacaze’s anti-colonial role and history. As we would come to expect, meeting with this administrator was not straightforward; upon our first arrival at the City Hall building, we were told to wait for the official to arrive. After waiting what seemed like at least half an hour and some confusion as to where the administrator was, we were told to come back the next day in the morning. So, doing as we were told, the next morning arrived and were again asked to wait for an extended period of time, but alas no District Administrator. With the third time apparently being the charm, we finally achieved a personal meeting with the administrator the following day.

This delay and promises of meetings (i.e., “come tomorrow”) were just the beginning of my taste of the time-consuming nature of fieldwork in Manjacaze and Mozambique writ large. As I was to learn, this relaxed attitude concerning time and follow-through plays a large role in Mozambicans’ role in the development field; Mozambicans who often do not possess the cultural capital of a Western-oriented value of time and thus have difficulty participating in certain aspects of the development field.
The District Administrator’s office is spacious and cool, and the official herself was seated behind a large wooden desk, awaiting our arrival. A large portrait of Armando Guebuza, the president of Mozambique, emphasizes the power of political connections, and the room is adorned with faux-leather couches and wood floors. Female leaders in Mozambique have had a significant presence since the Independence movement when leaders like Josina Machel, wife of first President Samora Machel, held prominent roles in encouraging the country to fight for independence, the collective good, and women’s participation in political and civic life. Josina Machel was the leader of OMM (Organização Mulher Moçambicana, or Mozambican Women’s Organization) one of the first FRELIMO associations established in 1973 that brings a high level of political involvement to women (Arnfred 2011:120). In fact, according to the Global Gender Gap Report by the World Economic Forum, Mozambique ranks 23rd in countries who have the least amount of gender gap, with the US ranking 22, only one country ahead (2012). In keeping with this tradition, despite a patrilineal kinship system, many leaders in Manjacaze are women, and they are well-respected community members.

After explaining the purpose of our visit and our intended research trajectory, the District Administrator signs our letters without many questions or expressing any concerns. Despite the administrator’s nonchalance, the real purpose of our visit is not necessarily required, but more respectful in nature; we must pay our respects to the highest officer before seeking audiences with lower ranking officers. Despite the slow-moving nature of this process, it is a basic step for maneuvering the bureaucratic system of the country.
From previous visits, Dr. Dores Cruz had made connections with an elementary school teacher in a nearby village that proved to be an extremely useful contact and able translator from Xishangan, Sr. Afonso Malauene\textsuperscript{12}. He was quite helpful in acting as a networking guide and translator among community members in Manjacaze. In conjunction, Dr. Cruz acted as a translator and guide to both the cultural and physical landscape of Manjacaze, helped to identify the informants for this chapter, as well as led the interviews. As mentioned in Chapter One, this project, particularly the data from Manjacaze, is a part of Dr. Cruz’s ongoing research in the area. Since I do not speak Portuguese, I rely heavily on summaries of translations of the interviews rather than real-time translations. So, I use less direct quotes from my informants in this chapter than in the proceeding chapters.

Most people who have some elementary school education have at least a rudimentary knowledge of Portuguese, some are fluent in Portuguese, and usually those without schooling prefer to speak only Xishangan. Thus, we had to be prepared to converse in both languages. Since this relationship was so successful for Dr. Cruz in previous years, we decided to seek out Sr. Afonso again for assistance. In addition, Sr. Afonso has a keen interest in local history and heritage, and thus is able to answer more nuanced questions pertaining to the region. On the first day of fieldwork, we picked up Sr. Afonso from the school in which he works, and he provided some suggestions for individuals we could contact, mostly nearby village chiefs and local association leaders.

\textsuperscript{12} In Portuguese, Sr. is used as a sign of respect, similar to Mr. in English, although Sr. can be used with the first name as well.
Local associations, or Community Based Organizations (CBOs) as they are officially called, are Manjacaze’s main source of aid. Outside organizations often funnel their support through these locally based groups. Ideally, CBOs should act as mediators between local communities and the international NGOs that may help support them. In reality, this ideal has varying levels of success. The length of time that an INGO assists a CBO varies, and often aid is revoked before the mission of the CBO is completed. In Manjacaze, many of the CBOs were initially founded with the assistance of an INGO for a specific purpose, and after two to three years, a common length for an INGO contract, the local organization is left to their own devices. There are a variety of ways in which a CBO might obtain funding from an INGO. In some instances, it is possible that the INGO itself might enter a community with the purpose of organizing a group of people to carry out tasks and represent the local population within Manjacaze. In other cases, a group of people might organize independently, then go in search of funding via INGOs.

This type of relationship was initially introduced to us via a meeting with Associação Communiária Hundzukane (Association for Community Orphans), which Sr. Afonso arranged on that first day. This association operates in the village of Aldeia das Laranjeiras, within the Manjacaze district. The way of arranging meetings in Manjacaze normally involves driving or walking to a location in hopes that the intended individual is there and willing to speak to you; if they are not there, or busy, future attempts are made until the goal is achieved. In this instance, Sr. Afonso knew where the president of the association lived and he guided us to her home, only to find that she was not there. Not to be dissuaded, however, Sr. Afonso then informed us that she also ran a small shop down
the road and that we might find her there. He again guided us to this location and discovered that the president was just about to open up shop for the day. This roundabout form of acquiring interviews with individuals was how I met with the majority of my informants while in Manjacaze. We managed to squeeze in a half an hour interview, with customary plastic chairs placed outside the shop for guests to sit on. Once again, the idea of a relaxed sense of time, accountability, and urgency is highlighted. This cultural trend was one of the first noticeable pointers that indicated the potential conflict with Western-oriented INGOs and their cultural capital; I was beginning to realize that accomplishing INGO directives in this community may take some time.

After lengthy introductions and greetings, the head of the association, Lidia Sengulane, seemed initially a bit wary to speak to us, but with Sr. Afonso’s encouragement she described in detail the association’s function and background. She informed us that the purpose of the organization is to assist children who have been orphaned due to HIV/AIDS or who may be at risk of contracting the disease themselves. According to Lidia, Save the Children funded the organization and visited them from time to time in order to conduct seminars and provide educational meetings for the community. In addition, Save the Children provided pencils, papers, and notebooks for the children and a team of oxen to help run the communal *machamba* (garden). To set up these seminars, Save the Children would call ahead and arrange with community members before arriving. Lidia informed us that Save the Children first arrived at their particular community through bureaucratic means; they went first through the central district administration and then through the village administration. She said that they
picked their village because they already had access to water, which was ready to use for production of the *machamba*, and therefore did not have to build additional boreholes. She said that she thought the Save the Children staff had come from the village of Manjacaze, but she was uncertain. Lidia was not sure whether they were still in Manjacaze, since she had not seen them in her village since the end of the contract (Sengulane 2012).

For this particular association, the Save the Children contract was only for two years. After the two years were up they never returned to the village and funding for the association ceased. The association was better, explained Lidia, when Save the Children were funding it because of the workshops, which took place every three months (Sengulane 2012). Sr. Afonso interjected to say that although running of the organization went more smoothly with the support of Save the Children and the various seminars, the village could still operate the association on their own. Lidia nodded, saying that the association has indeed continued after the loss of Save the Children’s funding. To be a part of the association, each member pays 10 *metricals* per month, and they now total 22 members. They still have the team of oxen that work on the community *machamba*, and they also rent out the oxen and charge 50 *metricals* a day for that service. Their activities pertaining to the *machamba* are their main sources of funding; they do not receive donations. They do, however, try to provide some of the same materials such as pencils, papers, and notebooks to children from their funds (Sengulane 2012).

This interview with Lidia outlines some of the basic themes we were to come across during interviews and observations in Manjacaze. It showcases the complicated...
relationship between the funders and CBOs being funded, which stem from the cultural
traits at work that create misunderstandings between the two agents. For Lidia, the
cessation of funding from Save the Children was confusing and frustrating. The
organization arrived in their village one day offering help and organizing the association,
holding meetings and seminars once every three months, coming in and out of their
village, and then disappeared one day, never to be seen again. The reasoning behind the
abrupt change was not explained to Lidia, and she feels somewhat irritated by their
departure when there is still so much still that they could assist with. Despite the
continuation of the association, the organizing and educational aspects are now almost
nonexistent. Lidia’s frustration stems from two cultural traits that are in conflict with
each other; Lidia’s concept of time is one that is much more casual and lenient, as
opposed to the INGO staff members who are working with strict timelines and deadlines.
As Lidia does not value their same sense of time, she becomes frustrated when Save the
Children funding ends based on their own project timeframes.

In addition, Lidia’s description of the association’s purpose in assisting children
who have been orphaned due to their parents dying of HIV/AIDs fits with the common
discourse of CBOs throughout Manjacaze. Children orphaned by HIV/AIDS are
currently a trending topic in the NGO world of Mozambique, with the vast majority of
CBOs and NGOs stating that they provide impact on the issue. Associação Communitária
Hundzukane is certainly no exception, for they do not want to be left out of the funding
cycle that is currently favoring programs that work with orphans. Regardless of what
Lidia and her cohorts might consider to be the most pressing issues in the community,
they run an organization based around orphans because that is currently what large international NGOs are providing funding for. Although Lidia and her colleagues who support the association have difficulty adjusting to differing conceptions of time, adhering to official INGO discourse is one example of how, despite their differences, local associations are attempting to negotiate the NGOs’ discourse and become a part of the global world from which they have been marginalized (see Ferguson 2006, and Piot 2010). Part of this marginalization can be attributed to Lidia’s unawareness of the vast and complicated dynamics at work that restrict international NGOs on the ground, and the political context in which these organizations operate. According to Dr. Cruz’s observations, these dynamics have shifted during her periods of research in the country. In 2005 the main discourse emphasized women’s participation in education and political life; in 2010, it centered on HIV/AIDS prevention, and now it concentrates on at risk children and microfinance (Cruz, per. comm.). By using the current terminology of the INGOs in their programs local associations are seeking acceptance from those international organizations.

This complicated relationship between the funders and CBOs being funded has created a unique set of perspectives within local populations in Manjacaze that has, over the years, helped to establish distinct cultures of individuals who are constantly in negotiation with INGOs. This group of development-minded individuals use their agency to obtain and maintain funding on an ongoing basis in order to continue their specific organization’s momentum. There are several trends that are inherent within this group of individuals and that work to define the group that they belong to. These traits of members
of CBOs are both specific to, and exacerbated by the influence of INGOs, and have created a subculture of participants in the development world. As I delved deeper into the world of CBOs in Manjacaze, these dynamics became more obvious.

The majority of my interviews were conducted with various leaders of CBOs who agreed to meet with me; some were interviewed only once, while others became key informants. The size of the CBOs interviewed ranged from a handful of members to dozens and sometimes hundreds of members – as was the case with one particular teachers’ association – but all of them had similar underlying themes in their mission statements. As previously mentioned, almost all of the CBOs stated at least one of their purposes to be “helping at risk children and HIV/AIDS orphans,” with activities including raising money through selling produce from *machambas* (gardens), raising chickens for sale on the market, renting out oxen for use in private *machambas*, making and selling clothing, and other pursuits. These kinds of responses were repeated over and over again when asked what the mission or purpose of the various CBOs were, and how they sustained the association. Often these statements were what the representatives of the associations said initially, and then gradually other activities would be described as well, including building clean water wells for communities, providing school supplies for children, HIV/AIDS education for communities, microfinance, and other activities. The mission of providing support for “at risk and orphaned children,” however, was usually first and foremost in their description. Of course, “at risk” and orphaned children due to HIV/AIDS are indeed a significant issue in Manjacaze. When asked why they chose to focus on this particular issue, however, one CBO member blatantly stated, “because
that’s what Save the Children was giving support for!” This response indicates that although orphaned children are a concern of local associations, perhaps their main reasoning for listing orphans as their mission has more to do with their negotiations with international funding than anything else. Much like the acceptance of IMF structural adjustment programs in the 1990s, many people in Manjacaze are forced to adopt the official Western discourse in order to receive aid (Harrington, et al. 1991; Pitcher 2002). Thus, there is a great deal of overlap with even the stated mission of these CBOs, and this was one of the many initial factors that indicated a general trend in perceptions within these local associations.

One of my key connections was Sr. Antonio Muthisse, who heads the government office of Repartição da Mulher e Acção Social (The Office of Woman and Social Action) in downtown Manajcaze. Sr. Muthisse, a man in his 50s, was educated partially during the colonial period and thus is witness to the vast socio-economic changes that have swept the country over the past 40 years. After independence he went to Czechoslovakia to study and enrolled at university, illustrating the connection between Eastern Europeans countries and FRELIMO’s Marxist-Leninist ideology. Our first meeting with Sr. Muthisse took place in his office in a small concrete building, with a few scattered computers and outdated furniture. Stacked around the room were various binders labeled “Save the Children,” “World Vision,” and other INGO names in an apparent attempt to keep track of INGOs in the area. Initially hesitant to delve deeper into his personal perspectives on international aid in Manjacaze, he provided us with an outline of World Vision and Save the Children’s activities.
Sr. Muthisse’s first discussed INGOs’ activities with language similar to that found on their websites and fundraising materials. According to him, World Vision builds schools, trains teachers, supports children with school supplies, builds houses for disadvantaged children, supports vaccine campaigns, trains staff and health activists on issues of nutrition and HIV/AIDS, and supports local organizations on issues of domestic violence of women and children. This litany of activities also included pursuits pertaining to sanitation and “children’s parliaments” meant to make children aware of their rights and provide education on domestic violence (Muthisse 2012). According to his list, World Vision is incredibly active and useful in the daily lives of Mozambicans living in Manjacaze. In this initial meeting, Sr. Muthisse, took on his official role and did not share his own perspective. He never strayed from what seemed to be an official script. If what he said were true, World Vision was an effective and essential part of development and daily life in Manjacaze. As a representative of the Mozambican government and a leader in the community, he had more of an incentive to provide the official discourse as opposed to his own, personal thoughts on World Vision. Throughout our time in Manjacaze, Sr. Muthisse connected us to various local associations and acted as a link between ourselves and association members, which proved to be essential.

He also highlighted a subtle, yet distinctive cultural trait we came across in Manjacaze, that of district officials adhering to the discourse of the NGOs and trying to keep track of their activities in the district. There could be several motivations behind this behavior, one of which stems from the colonial era appointed administrative figures such as the régulos, chefes do posto, and administradores who were representatives of the
ruling colonial government (Newitt 1995:382), thus allocating them more power and prestige. During the colonial period, *chefes do posto* and *administradores* were Portuguese, but Sr. Muthisse’s behavior relates to the concept of *assimilados*, as he was educated during the colonial period. As INGOs are a part of the current government’s development apparatus, Sr. Muthisse may see it as his responsibility to promote the official discourse of these organizations without revealing any personal opinions. This once again harkens back to what scholars refer to as the blurred boundaries between governmental and non-governmental power, and the naturalizing power of INGOs as they replace the paternalistic power of the state (Comaroffs 2002:35; Ferguson, Gupta 2002:993). In addition, like Lidia and other local association leaders, Sr. Muthisse is attempting to be a part of the globalization process that includes international NGOs, thus trying to avoid the marginalization that Ferguson and Mbembe refer to (Ferguson 2006:2; Mbembe 2001:228). In subsequent meetings, which did not take place in his office, Sr. Muthisse was more forthcoming about his personal opinions. With his help and the assistance of others, I was able to uncover the pattern of cultural traits inherent in the group of people who negotiate with development organizations.

Another such individual who we came across was Elisa Domingos, the elected municipal president of the town of Manjacaze, a position akin to mayor in the United States. After a number of failed attempts to meet her at her office, we finally arranged a meeting with Elisa at her home, with the aid of her assistant at her office. Although her home was not where we had intended to meet, it proved to be fortuitous as it provided a more relaxing and casual atmosphere and additional window into the daily lives of
government officers. The TV was on when we came in, and her husband was on the phone, having an animated discussion with an undisclosed individual. Her children and home staff were strolling about, and during our conversation it often felt as if she was paying more attention to her TV than to us. A spacious home in the center of downtown staffed with maids, certain luxuries, and recently renovated, it became obvious that Elisa was interested in showing her position of power and distinction to us. Although this was not her personal home, but the house provided by the government to the Mayor of Manjacaze, it was certainly an indicator of power and a display of wealth. During our interview we sat on a couch next to the blaring TV, and at one point she left the room for about 15 minutes without an explanation. Her husband remained seated the entire time, and to my dismay continued to turn up the volume on the TV as our discussion continued. We learned later that he owns a local construction business and he himself is wealthy and influential. Despite the competing noises of the television and my interview questions, it became obvious quickly that Elisa is a woman of strong opinions; she spoke blatantly of her feelings towards international NGOs and her involvement with them.

Elisa is the president of MUCHEFA (*Mulher Chefe de Família,* Women Head of Family), a local association that centers around the idea that women can and should play an active role in their communities and in their families. She founded the association in 1997 with ten other people, and after the floods of 2000 that had a devastating impact on the region, the organization became involved in creating community schools for young children and expanding their role in Manjacaze. She told us that one of her passions now is to work towards the education of women for public positions, although MUCHEFA is
involved with a multitude of projects throughout the town. With Elisa’s political connections and cultural capital, she was able to develop the association into one that is most stable and layered. In addition, one of her goals is to make MUCHEFA into a private business institute that she and her husband manage (Domingos 2012).

An educated woman, Elisa provided us with both further insights into the cultural traits inherent in her involvement with international NGOs, but also more of an analytical perspective. During one of our interviews with her, she mused that perhaps one reason why many associations in Manjacaze ultimately fail is because they are created when funding from aid organizations is offered for particular and specific programs, but the idea does not originate with the members of the association themselves. She thought that motivation might be the issue; if the members were not the initiators of the program they have less motivation to continue it (Domingos 2012). MUCHEFA itself has had a somewhat tenuous relationship with World Vision. That organization was funding fifty children at MUCHEFA’s schools, but Elisa stressed that this was not enough, as most children cannot afford to pay the fee to attend schools even with the minimal support of World Vision. She also described the feeling in the community among educated people that there should be more transparency in the INGO accounting, and that there is no continuity; they often bring in materials for products but the planning is poor, so the project fails (Domingos 2012). Her distrust for international aid organizations became apparent during our discussion, although her perspectives also hailed from an administrative viewpoint. Once again, the nature of the perspective of local populations on international NGOs becomes clear; intense distrust, feelings of confusion as to what
exactly the NGO is up to, and feelings of abandonment are apparent. Elisa has had more success with her association because of her relatively high level of education and political connections. Higher levels of cultural capital facilitate her access to social capital available.

One of the most constructive results of our acquaintance with Elisa was the subsequent invitation to one of MUCHEFA’s meetings, which happened to be one that aimed to gather all of the representatives of associations within the district of Manjacaze. We were lucky enough to attend the meetings and ask questions to the entire group, from which we received many opinions from individuals who were eager to share their thoughts on local associations’ relationship with INGOs. One of these individuals was Dinis Macuiana, whose association is located in Bahule, a village on the coastal area of the district. This association is focused on growing pineapples in communal machambas. Initially funded with the assistance of World Vision, who helped them establish the organization by providing the crowns and initiating the production of pineapples, Sr. Dinis seemed grateful for the help of the organization, but frustrated as to how they conduct their programming. He described to us how they taught them the proper techniques of how to grow pineapples, provided the organization with a watering pump for the fields, but then left. He exasperatedly explained that now they have all these pineapples to sell but no way of sending them for purchase in urban areas where they are consumed. Often the pineapples end up rotting before they can find a way to transport them. When questioned as to what was the main obstacle to prevent them from transporting these pineapples, he told us that they do not have sufficient funds to
purchase a truck because in order to save enough money for such an expensive item they need to sell large quantities of pineapples. He added that, according to him, part of the problem is that the aid organizations fund things that are not completely useful, and they may fund one part, but sometimes do not end up following through. As for the water pumps that World Vision donated, he continued that the type of pumps are not appropriate for the kind of watering they need to do. The tubes for irrigation need to be much longer and they waste massive amounts of water because they do not have the correct tubes or pipes and have no way of purchasing them. Sr. Dinis insisted that Word Vision should provide these tubes and fix the problem, as they did not have a way to obtain the necessary tools. Although his association was still functioning and not bankrupt as of yet, he said that they are not working as efficiently as they could be with what they had (Macuiana 2012). Many local associations become non-operational shortly after the cessation of INGO support, so his association was ahead of the trend in that respect.

Figure 10 Sr. Dinis explaining the functions of his community based organization, and his pineapple *machamba* (Cruz 2012)
Sr. Dinis’s narrative highlights one of the most prominent cultural traits present in the discourse of the villagers in Manjacaze, which is the idea that the INGO put a program into place, so they should intervene to fix whatever does not work or guide them through whatever obstacles may arise. Many of these association members consider it the INGOs responsibility to take control and provide for them. According to Elisa, part of this laid back attitude hails from the years just after the civil war, when aid agencies swooped in and provided material assistance to communities who were still in need of direct intervention (Domingos 2012). I also heard this opinion espoused by various expatriate aid workers and urban Mozambicans, who blamed the failure of some development programming on the idea that Mozambicans now do not know how to be self-sufficient. I did find that the idea of the INGOs being held responsible for all subsequent matters of a particular program, including repairs and continued execution of the association’s activities, was prevalent. The idea that INGOs did not carry through with a project from beginning to end (i.e., providing the crowns of pineapples to grow, but not providing transportation to sell them) was common in discussions with association members like Sr. Dinis as well. There was a tone to many of my interviewee’s communications that suggested the idea that they were owed the help by westerners, who to them appeared to have so much more material wealth. Therefore, this assumption contributes to the frustration and confusion concerning the abrupt end to INGO support. According to my informants’ perspective, if INGOs have the monetary funds then they should ensure that the associations they often initiate should be carried through effectively.
The Emerging Pattern of Cultural Traits: Investigative Fieldwork Continued

With connections made with individuals who were willing to help in my search for informants, I managed to secure several more interviews with community members, which reinforced insights previously gained and uncovered new patterns. One such interview was with members of the Associação Janet Mondlane, located in the village of Machahomo. I was directed to this association by Sr. Afonso, our key informant and Xichangan translator, who led us to the association headquarters. In anticipation of the meeting there were chairs and a table set up outside of a nice little house, which serves as the association’s headquarters. Many members and leaders of the association were present for the meeting; there were about six men and twelve women including Albino Zuculo, member of the board, Zacarias Matavele, the association secretary, and Ramos Mondlane\textsuperscript{13}, community leader. Some of the more prominent members of the organization were given chairs, while the rest sat on a traditional mat on the ground. All of the members sitting on the ground were women, and they were not introduced to us. Sitting on the mat versus on the chairs has to do with differing levels of status, but also due to the way women tuck their capulanas (skirt wrappers) under them when sitting. Only an older woman, who was the president of the association Virginia Chokwe, and who could not sit on the ground anymore was seated in a chair. Interestingly, although there were many women present, only the woman sitting in the chair spoke. This was typical in meetings with associations.

\textsuperscript{13} In addition, although we were introduced by name to each of the association members, it was difficult to keep track of all their names, thus some of association members’ names are left out in this chapter.
At the onset of our conversation, there was confusion as to who exactly we were. Initially, the organization members seemed to be under the impression that we were associated with an international NGO. This is most likely due to the fact that we were white and drove a truck, which usually signifies the arrival of aid workers. They wanted assistance from such an organization and asked us to find the contacts for some INGOs who could help them. It became clear from the subsequent conversation that the organization was non-operational and was in need of a reboot. This preliminary perception emphasizes a few of the traits discussed earlier, namely the idea that many members of local associations are looking to international NGOs to guide and provide for them, and that there is a great deal of confusion concerning INGOs in general. Whether the former idea is motivated from past actions of INGOs, as many attribute it to, or whether the INGOs do need to do more to assist these local associations is up for debate. What is clear, however, is the high volume of misunderstandings and confusion that arise from the INGOs’ activities.

The impression I gained from our interview with Associação Janet Mondlane was that the organization had been the recipient of multiple aid projects from various individuals and INGOs, but that none of them were sustainable or particularly successful. They did assert at one point that they had helped 335 children, which included those that were given meals and school supplies, but it was unclear as to any lasting positive effect this may have had. Founded in 1996, they began with ten members that wanted to buy sewing machines for women to teach them how to sew and become entrepreneurs. Since they did not have any funding at this point, however, they decided to start a machamba to
support the community. Then, Oxfam gave them a team of cattle, *Terre Des Hommes*, another INGO, gave them two ox carts, and at some point Save the Children helped them build two houses and a few boreholes/water pumps.

In the early 2000s, Save the Children decided to provide them with more ongoing support, which included providing notebooks, pencils, mosquito netting for orphans, as well as bi-weekly meals for the children in the community, given during association meetings. They would also hold meetings once every couple of months and give educational seminars. According to the association leaders, Save the Children funding ceased in 2010, and since then they have struggled to provide the same things to the community. Other association activities that were described during the interview included an attempt to raise chickens for profit, which reportedly failed after a storm destroyed the chicken coop, and a tie-dye *capulana* production effort that failed because they ran out of materials. When asked what the goal of the association is today, the leaders responded, “to help orphans of HIV/AIDS and at-risk children,” once again emphasizing the adherence to the trends in the INGO world, showcasing their attempt to be a part of larger global flows.

Now, the association president Virgínia Chokwe described, they only work in the *machamba* and do not have any funds to help the association. The *machamba*, because of a drought, is not producing anything. They still exist as an organization, but are not active in any single project. The president lamented that without support (from INGOs), they cannot “do anything.” This statement illustrates the members’ willingness to gather en masse for a potential meeting with international NGO staff members who may fund their
association. After multiple failed projects and limited support, they seemed frustrated and disagreed as to the next step.

When asked how they felt about the international NGOs, one of the association members seated in the plastic chairs spoke up to say that the INGOs were “doing wonderful things” and that they were “appreciative” and the people were very grateful. After he spoke, another member seated in the chairs interjected to say that he didn’t necessarily agree with that opinion. This man told the story of an artesian well that was built by an NGO and the trouble surrounding it, which uncovered a more nuanced perspective. He asserted that staff members from an international NGO, he was unclear as to exactly which INGO, came to build a well in their village. The organization started to build the well, but then never finished the project. They made the hole for the well but never inserted the mechanism to pump the water out. From December through February 2012, he was under the impression that the staff members ran into some trouble building the well, but then abandoned the project. One of his main complaints was that this organization did not hire local people to do the work and that they only brought in people from outside the community. He thought that the system would function more smoothly if they taught locals how to fix and maintain the well. Instead, they have to rely on the assistance from outside. The overall opinion concerning these organizations was that they “make promises but they never deliver,” emphasizing that they come and go without more accountability, transparency, or solid relationships with local community members.

The narrative gleaned from this association concerning the organization’s activity and relationship to INGOs highlights some critical trends that are vital to understanding
this particular group and their relationship to development. It also contributes to academic critiques of development, which focus on lack of sustainability and ineffective aid (Halon 2010; Piot 2010). Firstly, confusion and uncertainty as to who is funding the various aid projects, what their intentions are, and why they left runs rampant. The initial confusion as to who exactly we were highlights this trait, as well as the doubt concerning who had built the water wells and funded other projects over the years. There have been several international aid organizations coming in and out of the town since this association was founded in 1996, so it is no surprise that our arrival was assumed to be the same. An additional trait that indicates this group’s relationship to development is the distrust, feelings of deceit, and frustration over the INGOs’ actions. The second association member who spoke illustrates this idea most poignantly with his statement that INGOs “make promises but they never deliver,” but this concept was included throughout the association’s discourse. The association president was frustrated that the organization was no longer active since their loss of Save the Children’s funding, and seemed desperate to obtain additional funding. Despite one of the members stating that the INGOs were doing wonderful things in the community, this could stem from the early confusion that we were representatives of such an organization and thus he was eager to please.

Two other traits showcased in the interview with Associação Janet Mondlane as well. As previously mentioned, the idea of adhering to INGO discourse in order to secure funding, or the perception that they will receive support from this discourse, is apparent with this association. They are attempting to negotiate the INGOs mission and discourse.
Stating that their goal is to support “orphans and at-risk children” is in light with the other associations we came in contact throughout our time in Manjacaze, and seems to be the current trend in INGO funding. In addition, the association member who stated that the INGOs were doing wonderful things in the community was attempting to placate who he believed to be INGO representatives, and he was eager to please in the hopes that we might provide support for their association. Despite this anxiety and frustration pertaining to the loss of funding and their inability to operate, however, it seems as if this group is simply waiting for more international NGOs to arrive instead of considering alternative paths. Since this association has been witness to a plethora of aid agencies over the years that have provided programming, material aid, and guidance, this idea is not necessarily without reason. The traits listed here are all indicative of the cultural trends within the

Figure 11 Professor Cruz and the author at the Associação Janet Mondlane meeting. Pictured are the plastic chairs for the men, while the majority of the women are seated on the mat (Cruz 2012)
wider group of individuals working with local associations and their perspectives of the international development world. These traits position this class of agent in the development field and determine their access to the social capital available in that field. Certain characteristics, such as access to political connections and education, increase one’s ability to access social capital while others such as the idea that INGOs must provide all the support from start to finish do not.

An additional interview that highlighted some of these emerging trends was with schoolteacher Adriano Vidigal, who belongs to the teacher’s association: APROPADA (Associação de Professores Padecendo de SIDA, Association of Teachers Suffering from HIV/AIDS). This association has 135 members, and it is part of a national organization of teachers. Their mission is to educate teachers who may be at high risk of HIV/AIDS and to create awareness among teachers to seek treatment and give support to colleagues that can no longer work due to AIDS. Adriano cited that although they do receive some support from the national organization, they have also attempted various funding projects since their founding in 2006, including raising money through a chicken coop and a communal machamba, which have both since failed. One of their activities was to provide food baskets for ill teachers, but this program has since ceased since they do not have the funding to continue. He did mention that the association had applied to funding from Save the Children and World Vision, but they were ultimately unsuccessful; he mentioned that both of those organizations receive too many requests for projects that they cannot fund them all. He said that World Vision had “promised support” with funds, but that they did not come through, although it was unclear as to the exact circumstances.
of this promise. Adriano mentioned that World Vision tends to support agricultural associations with things like oxen and water pumps as opposed to his association of teachers, so APROPADA’s attempts at a *machamba* and a chicken coop may have been an effort to appeal to World Vision (Vidigal 2012). His frustration with INGOs was further highlighted when he described them as giving priority to the north of Mozambique as there is the perception that the level of literacy is lower in the area, thus ignoring some associations in southern Mozambique. This idea was also voiced by Elisa (Domingos 2012). Adriano said that the association has many plans and ideas of how to help teachers, but due to the lack of funding and assistance by an international aid organization they are not able to function properly (Vidigal 2012).

The interview with Adriano, while slightly different than other association members who have worked with INGOs directly, was elucidating in terms of emphasizing some previously uncovered traits of this group. Like members of *Associação Janet Mondlane*, Adriano and his association members are attempting to attain funding from organizations like Save the Children or World Vision, but are struggling for support. There have been attempts to appeal to these large INGOs like implementing agricultural activities and applying for funding, but in the case of Adriano’s association these attempts have ultimately failed, leading to frustration and with no clear path forward. It is interesting to note that out of the many associations interviewed, APROPADA was one of the only associations that did not initially state that their mission was to support orphans and vulnerable children, which may play a part in their failed funding attempts. Unlike other associations, APROPADA was not adhering to
the trending discourse of INGOs. APROPADA, however, like Associação Janet Mondlane and Associação Communitária Hundzukane, were currently mostly inactive, their activity on hold until they received additional support. Some of this support comes in the form of a fee of 10 or 20 meticals per association member, which is a significant amount of money for poor farmers in Manjacaze and difficult to pay. The associations’ inactivity and need for additional support emphasizes the trait that the local associations expect the INGOs to intervene at some point with financial support, and they depend on their funding to continue.

An association we came across that has had considerably more lasting success than APROPADA was Ajuda Família (Help Family). After visiting the school that Eduardo Mondlane had attended, we happened to ask a young man standing nearby about the school, and after some conversation we realized that he was the cousin of an association member we had met previously at the regional meeting of associations and who had offered to talk to us. After further inquiries, we learned that we were only a short walk away from the association’s machamba, and that the member we were hoping to meet was there. So, we were lead to the machamba, which was only about a fifteen minute walk from the school, and interviewed the association’s leading member, Victorino Simango. This episode once again reinforces the snowball interview process of fieldwork in Manjacaze. Sr. Simango’s association was initially created by World Vision in 2009 in order to support orphans and at-risk children. World Vision built a well for the association members to irrigate the communal machamba, provided a team of oxen, and provided other materials to get them started. Sr. Simango did say that although World
Vision had built a well for them they did not give the association members the correct type of tubing for the irrigation pump, so the wells were not currently functioning. Instead, they were using water pits near the *machamba*, from where individuals carry water cans to water the plots. Apparently, World Vision is no longer funding the association and he mentioned that he was hoping that sales from the *machamba* would allow the association to buy the correct tubing after the harvest (Simango 2012).

Despite World Vision’s cessation of funds, *Ajuda Familia* is still functioning well. Each member of the association receives their own plot of land in the association *machamba* in which they are permitted to grow whatever crop they wish. To use the land, however, they must pay 100 *metricals* to the association every three months at harvest time, in addition to 25 *metricals* per month as a membership fee. Those funds go towards supporting the association, but the members get the benefit of using the *machamba* to do as they wish with the produce, unlike many similar associations that keep most of the produce (Simango 2012). My impression is that the *machamba* seemed very productive and well organized, with lush fields and many plots. Sr. Simango explained that his success was due to knowledge about biology and plants that he had learned in school. He has applied his knowledge to running the association’s *machamba* successfully. Equipped with a high school education up to 11th grade, this gives him an advantage over many other people in and around Manjacaze. Although World Vision’s pumps were not functioning, their proximity to traditional water wells provided them with enough water to sustain the crops.
My interview with this successful association is consistent with information given by other informants, however it was also indicative of cultural capital that allows some associations to flourish while others decline. Despite his lack of political connections and difficulty in accessing markets for the goods, Sr. Simango was able to achieve some degree of success. His success is due to the accumulation of cultural capital. Sr. Simango achieved a high school level education in which he was taught biology and plant science, thus enabling him to put that knowledge to use for the association, although he was never able to get a well paid job in accordance with his high school degree. It seems that education, however, provides the cultural capital that assists rural Mozambicans in participating in development projects, offering the knowledge and skill foundation to function without the assistance of an INGO like World Vision or Save the Children.
Tingane Ni Wutomi (Shame and Life) is an example of another association that has become sustainable with the leadership of members with a specialized skill set and education. Created in 2004, the association’s programs support, not surprisingly, orphans and vulnerable children due to HIV/AIDS, an adult literacy program, a nutrition project, and a microfinance project. Their association is located in Macuácua, a village in the district of Manjacaze, about a 40 minute drive outside of the town. The office is a two-room reed house with posters on the wall outlining project goals and educational messages. On the day I met with this association we were able to speak at length with several members, including the founder of the association, Carlos Jamisse, and a member who helps to run their microfinance program, Ivan Diogo. Currently Tingane Ni Wutomi has two programs that are sponsored by World Vision: their literacy program and their microfinance program. World Vision pays for the teacher and provides a blackboard, books, and other equipment for the literacy program, and has provided the money box and training for microfinance. According to Sr. Jamisse, in the past World Vision had also supported their machamba by giving them a team of two oxen, but one ox had died and the other was stolen. They were provided with a water pump, which is apparently still functioning and in use for the machamba. World Vision also gave them seeds for cassava and starting plants for pineapples, which seemed to be successful (Jamisse 2012). The machamba is still in use today, with the association members working there every Wednesday. Each association member is assigned their own plot, and they can keep 60% of what they produce or sell it for themselves, and 40% goes to the association funds. They use that 40% to by uniforms and food for the children they support.
Sr. Jamisse, the founder of the association, has a varied background that allowed him to establish an association with diverse activities and funding sources. Originally from the village, he was a paratrooper during the civil war. Afterwards, he became involved in radio programming that advocated HIV/AIDS education, calling it *Tingani Ni Wutomi*. The program became popular and he received funding to take it elsewhere, including to towns in the Nampula province and other towns in the Gaza province. According to Sr. Jamisse, in 2004 he obtained additional funding to start the association in his home village. He also mentioned that at some point he had received some communications and journalism training, although he was unclear as to exactly where or how he had been trained (Jamisse 2012). Equipped with a background that provided him with a larger worldview, Sr. Jamisse was creative enough to maneuver through the development system and obtain the necessary funding to support his ideas and the association. His education, both informal and formal, bestowed him with the cultural capital to navigate through the development field and access the social capital available there.

There are also other association members involved with *Tingane Ni Wutomi* who provide the organization with the skills needed to be sustainable. Ivan Diogo, one of the other informants we spoke to during our visit, helps to run the microfinance program. The program runs similarly to a savings account at a bank: community members are encouraged to save their money in the program “box,” and they can also request loans to start their own business. The association holds microfinance meetings on the 12th for every month, and if someone has a project they can present it verbally to the group, and
then the group decides if the loan is approved or not. Members can request up to 5,000 meticals, and if they do receive the loan then they have a certain period to pay the loan back with interest. In order to run this program, association leaders must have at least a basic understanding of mathematics, finance, and banking. Sr. Diogo, along with other leaders in the association, helps to provide this knowledge. An accountant by profession, he was educated during the colonial period and had his own accounting office in Maputo. After retiring, he moved back the Manjacaze region, where he was born and raised, he now helps out with Tingane Ni Wutomi and does accounting for an office in Xai-Xai, the capital of the Gaza province (Diogo 2012).

The continuity of both funding and activity for this association can be attributed in part to the specialized education of some of its members, and for its ability to diversify in order to appeal to World Vision funding. As my data has shown, World Vision tends to sponsor programs that have an agricultural component (i.e., machambas) and that support orphaned and at-risk children. Tingane Ni Wutomi has been able to maintain the agricultural aspect and children who are supported by it. Unlike many other associations, their machamba has become sustainable, most likely partly due to the still functioning water pumps that World Vision provided and the system of providing the members with 60% of the harvest. The assistance of highly educated individuals like Sr. Diogo and more worldly members like Sr. Jamisse, however, are also essential in helping the association obtain funding and maintain programs. Once again, education seems to be a vital element in the success of associations, proving to be valuable cultural capital that allows this class of agents access to social capital in the development field.
Associations molding their discourse in order to obtain needed funding from international NGOs and the concept that education is vital to the success of associations can also be attributed to what Appadurai describes as the disjunctures brought on by globalization, specifically in terms of the various scapes that come in contact with one another (Appadurai 1996:329). This idea is reflected in the cultural trends of this class of agents that are affected most particularly by Appadurai’s ethnoscape and ideoscape. The current confluence of ideoscape and ethnoscape in Manjacaze is a reflection of changes in modern Mozambican history towards a neoliberal agenda, and provides an incentive for Mozambicans to mold their behavior in order to fit in with these changing trends. As aid agencies come and go, they influence the discourse and culture of the individuals they come in contact with, spreading their ideas and promoting a Western-centered worldview, which includes an emphasis on higher education.

Of course, World Vision plays a large role in the creation and continuation of many of these programs. I realized during my research in Manjacaze that to have a more complete picture it would be necessary to interview and observe the activities of World Vision from their perspective. Luckily, I was fortunate enough to have the ability to follow the staff of World Vision around the district for one day, observing some of their daily activities and their ongoing projects.

**World Vision**

The new World Vision office is located on the main street in downtown Manjacaze. The offices take up the whole first floor of the building, and the organization
is planning on expanding. The majority of staff members who work at the office are Mozambicans, as European staff usually work out of the Maputo headquarters, only venturing out into the countryside for short field visits. As a result, this office is run entirely by Mozambicans. Much more technologically equipped than the local association or administrative offices I visited in Manjacaze, these World Vision offices are filled with newer computers, fax machines, printers, large wooden desks, and several mini-fridges. The staff members I encountered during my time with World Vision were mostly young, educated and dressed in Western European fashion. One of my main informants, Pascoal Fernandes, wore a World Vision blazer and new-looking loafers, while another, Saimone Nuvunga, sported Nike shoes and a gold chain. These young men in their Western attire seem quite confident and brazen, illustrating what Comaroff and Comaroff would describe as globalized forms of consumption (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001:25). They are university educated and Pascoal was educated in the United States.

While talking with them, the young men spoke to me of disliking living in Manjacaze; there were no clubs, bars, restaurants, or cafés to go to, and they reported becoming bored in rural areas (Fernandes 2012). The individuals I interviewed were all
from Maputo, many of them with wives or girlfriends back home. As a result, the majority of them returned to Maputo almost every weekend, leaving Manjacaze on Thursday. They did not have ties to Manjacaze and preferred to return to Maputo as soon as possible.

On the day that I was there, the office was bustling with activity. The phone was ringing off the hook, various individuals came knocking on the door intermittently, and during my interview with staff members they would get up often to check on the current pressing issue. This was quite unlike many association meetings or administration offices we visited, which tended to be laid back, slow-paced, and without any technological equipment. In contrast to the association officees, in the World Vision offices there are bulletin boards with “deadlines” and “project goals” plastering the walls, and staff members pulling out their cell phones and laptops. It seems clear that this is a Western time-oriented world. One must partake in a paradigm shift away from traditional
Mozambican activities to a more Western-centered view of the world in order to participate.

For the past 13 years, World Vision has provided programs in the areas of education, health, nutrition, HIV/AIDS, food security (agriculture), water, sanitation, economic development (or microfinance), and child protection in the district of Manjacaze. As is evidenced by the long list of their areas of interest, World Vision covers a lot of ground, both geographically and ideologically in Manjacaze, providing the opportunity to promote their mission throughout the area. One of my informants, Pascoal, mentioned that one of the problems they encounter is that their resources are spread too thin, and that there are too many areas of development to attend to. World Vision, he said, is attempting to tackle all of these areas, but they have difficulty accomplishing all of their objectives well. He also emphasized several times that World Vision does not simply give monetary funding to associations, but instead they provide technical training, materials, build houses, and other “consumables” as he called them (Fernandes 2012).

The office in Manjacaze is sponsored by World Vision Canada, and he mentioned that once per year an official representative of the organization visits for one week. Pascoal mentioned that the Manjacaze staff has requested that the central office personnel extend their stay for a longer period of time, but thus far the visits have been limited to a week (Fernandes 2012).

World Vision splits responsibilities in the province with Save the Children, although there is no longer an actual Save the Children office in Manjacaze; they are now located in Xai-Xai, the capital city of Gaza Province. Generally, different INGOs are
assigned to different districts. The two organizations divide the district by different
villages and postos in an attempt to prevent duplication of activities. Pascoal explained
that the organizations try to target areas that the government does not have the funds and
capability to support, and the INGOs try to fill in the gaps. He explained that there are
mostly five-year projects, with six month to a year projects intended for specific issues
(Fernandes 2012).

According to Pascoal, the office’s budget is based on the number of children that
are registered with World Vision. He said that he currently had 3,600 children registered,
and from that number they created the budget of $217 per child for 2013. All of the
children under the age of twelve are identified through development committees in the
community that World Vision establishes. The money to sponsor the children comes
from individual donors who sponsor a child for $40 per month (“World Vision” 2014).
Although theoretically that equals $480 per year for each child, any amount over $217
will go towards functioning of the organization at the international level (Fernandes
2012).

Pascoal also described an interesting example of the ability of individual donors
to provide special donations for specific projects. One example he cited was of an
individual who donated funds for the specific purpose of building a well in the compound
of the child the donor was sponsoring. This created some conflict in the community, as
the donor had requested the well be built in a location that was difficult for the majority
of community members to access. So, World Vision built the well in a location that was
preferred by the community. When the donor visited, however, he was upset that the well
was not built in the exact compound of the child he sponsored, so they had to build another well. Pascoal complained that when donors give money they want the structures to be visible and according to their specific requests, despite what might be best for the community. That same donor, he explained, ended up providing more money to build a school in the community with his name on it so that he could be recognized individually. He also said that much of the money raised and donated goes towards the marketing for the organization and to paying salaries in Canada. Right now they are in the process of producing an advertisement for World Vision, which will feature several children in the district of Manjacaze who are handicapped. This commercial will be used for fundraising purposes on television (Fernandes 2012).

As we shall see in the next chapter, Pascoal is part of a group of urban Mozambicans working for INGOs in Mozambique who have grown quite skeptical in their positions. He feels frustrated as to the pressures from World Vision to cover so many issues in the district and his inability to focus more narrowly on one or two issues. He mentioned that he hopes World Vision policy will change so that they can concentrate on a single town to completely solve their problems, as opposed to not solving anybody’s problems. He also feels that much of the funding does not go towards actually helping the communities, but instead towards Canadian salaries and advertising (Fernandes 2012). Despite these frustrations, Pascoal is well paid in comparison to most Mozambican employees. He has a management role in Manjacaze and he is responsible for hiring local individuals to do work for World Vision. Therefore he has little incentive to leave the organization.
I was invited to tag along on a World Vision field day, following staff members as they visited different communities where World Vision programs are being carried out in the district. Meeting at 8am at the World Vision offices as arranged, we ended up not leaving until around 10am; although some of the Mozambican World Vision staff members have adopted preference for a Western lifestyle and appearance, a more flexible conception of time was still in practice. The stated reason for the delay was the procurement of supplies from a local grocery store for the first community meeting of the day. When we were reasonably supplied with several bulk food items we got in our cars and were underway. All of the staff present were at middle-manager or lower rank for this field visit.

Our first stop was at an association headquarters about a 30-minute drive from downtown Manjacaze, but still within the district. Many of the locations we visited were quite difficult to access as they were isolated and found along dirt roads that are only minimally maintained by local communities. For this first visit, there was a workshop being held by a community pastor in a building that World Vision had built as a gathering place for the association. As we arrived, people were filing into the building and a song of greeting broke out to welcome us. We were led to the front of the building, where there were plastic chairs placed for us. The rest of the individuals sat on the ground or on a few church pews. Additional songs were sung, all religious in nature, and then after all the pomp and circumstance had ceased we all took a seat. The pastor, seemingly the leader of this gathering, gave a speech and I perused the program for the meeting, which listed the various religious-oriented activities surrounding planned for the day.
When we went back to the cars we unloaded the items from the store that the World Vision staff had purchased earlier that morning and gave them to a group of women. The food was apparently going to be used for a meal during the World Vision meeting with the association. With food and a meal as an incentive, one must question whether the motivation to attend the meeting and be a part of this World Vision sponsored event stemmed from deep religious convictions and feelings of altruism to the community, or the possibility of being adequately fed and provided for that day. There did not appear to be a practical workshop or discussion planned. In a community where poverty and disease are prevalent, it seems doubtable that individuals would not attempt to negotiate aid in whatever form that is offered. This idea is consistent with other attempts I had witnessed by association members who are looking to conform to INGO values and activities, including using *machambas* for income generation and supporting orphaned and at-risk children as their mission.

According to the official World Vision website, their mission is religious in nature, as they state “our faith in Jesus is central to who we are, and we follow His example in working alongside the poor and oppressed” (“World Vision” 2014). They also cite their outcomes on their website, including having trained 157,967 “Christian Faith Leaders,” given away 1,296,038 bibles, and formed partnerships with 86,712 churches in 2012 (“World Vision” 2014). As one of their countries of interest, Mozambique is of course a part of these statistics, and Christian promotion was witnessed during my visits with them.
Our next stop was at a secondary school in another outlying community of Mangunze. It is a state school, but World Vision is helping to fund repairs from damages sustained during an intense windstorm in January 2012. One entire section of the school was missing the roof. The World Vision staff toured the damaged areas and took some measurements, talking amongst themselves. The school itself was large, with schoolchildren in uniforms roaming about. World Vision had built the library for the school, and while the staff members consulted each other concerning the best way to rebuild the damaged structures, I explored the library and the school’s campus. On the outer library wall there was a large sign with the World Vision logo, and a plaque stating that they had sponsored the building. Unfortunately, however, when I entered the building there were no books to be seen; the space seemed to be used for a study hall as opposed to a library. Throughout our day, many of the buildings built by World Vision had their symbol attached to it, and several of the association participants wore World Vision t-shirts or hats. In this sense, World Vision hopes that with the inclusion of their symbols and signs they will come to be associated with aid and assistance, and by wearing their t-shirts and hats, community members are identifying with their mission. Of course, however, this assistance comes with the price of adhering to World Vision ideologies and programs, such as the church gathering of the first stop.

Our next stopping point was for the purpose of viewing a location where two children, ages three and five, and their grandmother were discovered to be abandoned by their parents, and living in destitution. We were told that the parents had fought, the father left, and the mother left shortly after. It was conveyed to us that their grandmother
could not adequately take care of the children due to mental illness, and they had been living in a shelter thrown together by reeds and open on one side. It was the type of shelter typically used to protect kitchen areas during the rainy season and not a proper house. After viewing this structure we then drove to where the small family lives now, which is in a cement house belonging to someone else in the community and who was allowing the family to live there temporarily. The current house was an improvement from their old shelter, but still very bare bones. After visiting with the family, we then toured the new house that World Vision is building for them; it was about halfway done and made of a new kind of clay brick that is becoming commonly used in construction in the region.

The staff members of World Vision wanted to convey to us that with their assistance, this family was brought from destitution to living in civilization, where they will live out their lives in peace. In reality, this story is questionable. There was no evidence that the family will be able to support themselves in the new home as compared to the old shelter. In the home where they are currently living they did not have much to speak of; not a lot of food, proper cooking setup, or items to furnish the home. In addition, when one of the World Vision staff members learned that we were living with the nuns in Manjacaze, the staff member asked Dr. Cruz to inquire whether the sisters would provide the family with the necessary food and then insisted that the old woman go and get the food, rather than going to them directly to speak with the sisters about it. The sisters do not receive any aid from INGOs to provide supplies for any of their projects. It seemed as if World Vision staff were grasping at straws in order to provide
actual substance to this family. Overall, this venture felt more like an advertisement than a well-executed and sustainable humanitarian aid venture.

After visiting the family we stopped at another school, this time to see hand washing stations that World Vision had made for the school children. The stations were comprised of three plastic containers with big World Vision labels. A World Vision staff member approached one of the teachers and asked for him to have some children come out, clean their hands, and drink the water. A group of children came out and did just that, drinking from the spouts. The water comes from a bore hole that World Vision dug for them, The World Vision staff took some pictures while the children stood in line for the water. I understood this to be a stop almost entirely for our benefit with the intention of showcasing more World Vision programs.

The time spent with World Vision was quite illuminating on various points. Firstly, it seemed clear certain characteristics were a part of the culture of Mozambicans working for World Vision, namely their adherence to typical Western styles of dress and discourse, and their urgency to return to Maputo where life was more interesting. Their conspicuous consumption in the form of dressing in brand name clothing and wearing expensive items is an attempt to demonstrate that they have attained a higher status and are now more a part of the Western world than their rural Mozambican counterpart. These Mozambicans are a part of what Comaroff and Comaroff refer to as the forces of capitalism that dictate global flows of consumption; Mozambicans working for World Vision participate in forms of consumption that allow them to showcase their participation in the Western world (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001:25). In addition, there
are new houses being built in Manjacaze for them to live, as previously they had been renting rooms in nicer houses around town. These new buildings are being built with World Vision funding. My experiences with World Vision staff indicated that they are not highly invested in the communities they work with, and instead work towards living more in the Western NGO world than a rural Mozambican one. In addition, the World Vision staff members interviewed revealed that they are frustrated and skeptical as to the organization’s success in the communities they work with. These ideas will be reiterated in the next chapter, where a discussion of the class of agent of Mozambicans living in Maputo and working for international NGOs will unfold.

In stark contrast to my observations at World Vision, the programs that the Irmãs Concepcionistas run were very simple, straightforward, and completed even with their limited funding. Instead of providing workshops, trainings, and directives that dictate what types of associations and programs receive funding, they give tangible help to populations. Through their children’s home, nutritional center, daily school lunch program, and other activities in the community, they provide consistent and reliable services in the district that encourage education and help to keep children in school. There are no contracts or associations that must act as a liaison between them and the aid recipients; they give aid directly and regularly. They are also immersed in the community, unlike many of the Mozambicans working for World Vision who go back to Maputo every weekend and only remain as long as their contract allows. These ideas are reminiscent of Joseph Hanlon’s, Armando Barrientos’s and David Hulme’s “Just Give Money to the Poor” (2010), in which he argues for direct aid that bypasses middle men,
programs, and organizations that devise complicated ways to improve the lived conditions of communities. Instead, he argues, a more effective mechanism of aid is to give money to the poor and let them decide how best to improve their lives. Although the sisters do not “give money to the poor” per se they do give directly and without complication, and are thus an example of the type of tangible aid advocated by Hanlon.

Conclusions

Throughout my time in Manjacaze I was exposed to many different individuals, associations, and organizations who are all working together to achieve what they believe is best for the community and for themselves. For Mozambicans working for local associations, there is an intense distrust of international NGOs but also a dependency, so that they are forced to maintain the official discourse that is prescribed to them by development trends. At the same time, they expect the international NGOs that fund them to provide all of the assistance in the details of their programs, including fixing broken things and providing guidance. Once funding is revoked, there is much difficulty in sustaining programs. Many association members perceive international NGOs as somewhat mysterious entities that come and go and revoke funding as they please, with one informant stating that INGOs make promises but usually do not deliver.

Many of these traits observed during interviews and observation can be considered through the theoretical context discussed in the preceding chapters. Specifically, the effects of globalization have much to do with the formation of distinct perspectives and perceptions. As cultures that come into contact are continuously
influenced by and influencing each other (Wolf 1982), so have the ideologically Western INGOS and local Mozambican populations impacted the worldviews and motivations of each group. This concept relates to the convergence of ethnoscapes and ideoscapes (Appadurai 1996:330,333), as the ideology of international NGOs and their associated staff members come into contact with previously held ideologies and worldviews in Manjacaze. Worldviews that encompass the ideology of INGOS like World Vision and Save the Children influence rural Mozambicans seeking funding for their associations, who then conform to the standards of these organizations. Whether this includes advocating for human rights and economic development like microfinance or supporting at-risk children, these ideologies are adopted by rural Mozambicans as they negotiate with and navigate through the development world.

In addition to the influence of shifting groups of people and ideologies, there are other aspects of globalization that influence the traits discussed. These include the idea that globalization takes the form of marginalization in parts of Africa, as argued by academics such as James Ferguson (2001) and Achille Mbembe (2006). As they are mainly outside the forces of globalization in terms of obtaining the material things and lifestyles that are part of globalization flows, rural Mozambicans are attempting to access the globalized world through their interactions and negotiations with international NGOs. This behavior is similar to Piot’s (2010:166) description of the Togolese embrace of charismatic Christianity as a plea to establish their inclusion in a global society. This spatially bounded form of global connection leaves Africans with “only a tenuous and
indirect connection to the global economy” (Ferguson 2006:14), which encourages participation in international entities that can, in their eyes, mitigate this marginalization.

Postcolonial theory also plays a part in our understanding of the dynamics at work in the relationship between international NGOs and rural Mozambicans in Manjacaze. Although mimicry as understood in Homi Bhabha’s (1987) terms refers to an inexact replication of a colonizing culture, mimicry is seen in the behaviors of local associations. Associations themselves mimic what they have been taught by international aid agencies in terms of what type of programs they should have and how they should function, but in many ways they still retain mostly Mozambican characteristics. These characteristics can be seen in how associations members welcomed us during our interviews by singing songs, setting up plastic chairs for the guests and for the men, and having women sit on a reed mat during our interview. In addition, a less structured and more casual attitude concerning time and accountability plays a role in how the associations function, as exemplified by the roundabout manner in which we met with Lidia, president of Associação Comunitária Hundzukane. The traditional behaviors and attitudes, along with activities drawn from the influence of international NGOs allows rural Mozambicans to maintain their way of doing things while obtaining funding and support from the Western world. In this sense, there is a layer of resistance hidden beneath the activities of the local associations, empowering agents to access social capital but at the same time maintain aspects of their culture.

It is also true, however, that mimicry is not necessarily subversive, especially in this Mozambican case. For example, the achievements of the local association Ajuda
*Família* can be attributed in part to their productive adoption of World Vision’s programmatic dictates and the education of Sr. Simango. By mimicking some of the activities, discourse, and behaviors of a Western-oriented INGO, their attempt to access social capital has met with success, and is not subversive in nature. In turn, by rewarding local associations with social capital if they mimic to the discourse, behaviors, and programs of INGOs, aid agencies are asserting authority and control. In this sense, mimicry is what Bhabha would describe as “the desire for a reformed, recognizable Other, as a subject of a difference that is almost the same, but not quite” (Bhabha 1987:318). Local associations must conform just enough to receive the benefits of development.

The traits described in this chapter understood from a theoretical perspective play a large role in this agents’ position in the development field. There are several traits that can be viewed as cultural capital that helps the agents access the social capital available in the development field. A high school education, for example, is instrumental to the success of certain associations. Members in both *Tingane Ni Wutomi* and *Ajuda Família* possessed a level of education that allowed them to more easily navigate the development system and obtain the funding that their associations needed, as well as use their knowledge base to improve the associations. Unfortunately, however, access to education continues to be problematic for many members living in and around Manjacaze. It is also very difficult for rural individuals even with an education to secure suitable jobs due to their lack of political connections. This stems from the colonial period as well, when there were systematic inequalities throughout Mozambique that prevented many
Mozambicans who were not *assimilados* from receiving a thorough education (Isaacman 1983; Errant 1998). Rural individuals’ lack in political connections also prevents many from accessing the job market. Elisa is an exception to this trend, as her political connections allow her the cultural capital to expand and stabilize MUCHEFA. Rural individuals who have graduated from high school, however, generally have the cultural capital to help their associations benefit from the social capital in the development field in the form of funding and support.

Other traits such as adhering to the INGO discourse that they hope will help their organization receive funding have mixed results in the development field. Although almost every association I interviewed stated their mission as supporting orphans and at-risk children due to HIV/AIDS, which according to my interviews and observations with associations and World Vision seems to be the current trend in funding, not every association was successful in receiving adequate support from INGOs. This discourse seems to have worked for a limited amount of time, but after their contract with an INGO is up that discourse loses its efficacy to a certain extent. Despite this decrease in effectiveness, local associations continue to maintain this discourse as their primary statement of the purpose of their organization until members discover the new discourses appropriate to access funding.

The issue of time, as it is perceived by local associations, also plays a role in the agents’ position in the development field and their ability to access social capital. As I experienced during fieldwork and have mentioned throughout this chapter in various contexts, relaxed concepts of time concerning timelines and accountability is a trait that
prevents associations from obtaining maximum benefits from the development field. As showcased in the slow process of meeting with individuals who did not arrive on time or who told us to come on a different day during my entrée into fieldwork in Manjacaze, setting up INGO programs and following through on objectives takes a long amount of time. Often INGO contracts are only for a period of a few years, and many associations feel that an organization will leave before their work is completed. Association members interviewed seemed to feel that an INGO was never in their community for long enough and did not follow through as promised. As a result, many of these associations are left with unfinished projects such as water wells that do not function properly and machambas that fail after oxen provided by an INGO die or are stolen. Disparate ideas of how long support and funding should last and how long it takes for an association to become sustainable prevent rural associations from gaining the full benefits of INGO support.

There are several characteristics that are a result of their interactions with international NGOs and that do not contribute positively to their position in the development field. These include a frustration with the international NGOs they have come in contact with in terms of their cessation of funding and lack of commitment, their confusion as to how exactly INGOs function and why the funding ceased, and their expectation that these organizations will provide continuous guidance and support. These characteristics pertaining to INGO motivations and activities lead to a stationary position in the development field in which they are simply waiting for more funding without sustaining activity in their programs. The associations may continue to exist, as in the
case of Associação Comunitária Hundzukane or Associação Janet Mondlane, but in actuality they continue only in formality and potential to continue. The lack of commitment and ability to move forward after INGO support has stopped also stems from the difficult lives that many association members lead. In order for an association to survive they must invest a great deal of time in association activities, which is not possible for many people. Some association leaders were receiving an additional payment from the INGOs, so those individuals were more invested in the projects as they had an incentive. These perspectives affect their relationship to the development field in the sense that they have an increasingly negative opinion of it, but they also are waiting for the continuation of their assistance.

In this chapter, I have outlined some of the perspectives, perceptions, opinions, and behaviors of local associations involved in international aid work in Mozambique. Many of these traits stem from historical processes in the country and can be considered through the framework of previous theoretical work concerning development and globalization. From this data, we can see how certain trends in development in Mozambique as described by individuals such as Joseph Hanlon (2010) and James Pfeiffer (2004) may arise. As discussed in the previous chapter, Hanlon and Cunguara (2012) argue that despite the promise of economic growth poverty is actually increasing, particularly in rural areas. We can see the reflection of this argument in the complications of development witnessed through the associations interviewed and World Vision’s activities. The data may also strengthen Hanlon’s argument in “Just Give Money to the Poor” (2010), which advocates for putting the money directly in the hands of aid
recipients instead of channeled through INGOs in order to avoid complications and frustrations such as those described in this chapter.

In the next chapter, these concepts are further explored in the context of the second class of agent agent, urban Mozambicans who work for INGOs in Maputo. This group has also acquired certain traits that are a direct result of the presence of development and are a consequence of their attempt to access the social capital in that field. As with the rural Mozambicans involved with local associations, the urban Mozambicans described in the next chapter negotiate within the development sphere in order to work for their best interests. The perspectives, motivations, and behaviors of these individuals are similar to the informants in Manjacaze, as they also utilize various forms of cultural capital in order to access social capital. These forms of cultural capital include possessing education and valuing a Western concept of time and accountability. They also describe their frustration with international NGOs and the expatriates who work for them. In the urban world of Maputo, however, Mozambicans working for INGOs are faced with disparate challenges, influences, and pressures than their rural counterparts. These include increased access to wealth and material goods, daily interactions with INGOs and expatriates, and more exposure to Western lifestyles. Despite these differences, the development field is highly influential on rural Mozambicans, as exemplified by the descriptions of Mozambican staff members at World Vision in Manjacaze and the CBO members in this chapter.
CHAPTER FIVE: AN URBAN MOZAMBIAN PERSPECTIVE

Further south, seemingly worlds away from Manjacaze’s dusty roads, is Maputo, located on the southeastern tip of the country and home to hundreds of NGOs and international NGOs. A port city on the Indian Ocean with its economy centered on the harbor (Pitcher 2002:3), Maputo of the 21st century is filled with expatriate businesspeople and international NGO staff, a rising middle class of Mozambicans who often work for foreign businesses or development agencies, and hundreds of thousands of Mozambicans who have not tapped into the growing international economic opportunities.

Under Portuguese colonial rule Maputo was called Lourenço Marques after a Portuguese explorer who navigated its extensive bay (Neves 1879:2). According to a map of Lourenço Marques dating to 1964, eleven years before independence, the majority of the city’s streets are named after Portuguese historical figures, important dates in Portuguese history, and other significant Portuguese events and people. After independence in 1975, the name of the capital was changed from Lourenço Marques to Maputo, named after the Maputo River, which runs through South Africa, Swaziland, and Mozambique (Newitt 1995:541). Street names were altered to reflect revolutionary figures and events, as well as pre-colonial historical names (Figure 14). Two of the main avenues now intersecting the city are Avenue Eduardo Mondlane (running east/west) and
Avenue Vladimir Lenin (running north/south), in honor of the soviet Marxist-Leninist politician.

Figure 14 Map of Maputo. Map courtesy of maps.google.com

The way it was described to me by several Mozambican informants, the nice part of town where many expatriates and middle-class Mozambicans live can be found east of Avenida Vladimir Lenin, which is used in the local discourse as an unofficial boundary. Neighborhoods Polana Cimento and Sommershield are the wealthier parts of town where many international NGOs, their expatriate employees, and few wealthy Mozambicans live. Furthermore, there is a distinction between the Cidade de Cimento (concrete city), and Cidade de Caniço (reed city). Cidade de Cimento is where the wealthier neighborhoods of Polana Cimento and Sommershield are located, and walking through these neighborhoods one is likely to find expensive gated homes, embassies, INGO
headquarters, and European-style cafes and restaurants filled with expatriates. Cidade de Caniço is the indigenous area, where many of the houses are traditionally constructed with reed. Many middle-class Mozambicans who work for INGOs live in Matola, a city where Mozambicans can buy and rent more spacious homes for much less than the real estate prices in Maputo. For example, the median cost of renting a one-bedroom apartment in Maputo’s city center is 23,720 MZN\(^{14}\) (786.25 USD) per month, while the median rent for a one-bedroom apartment in Matola is 1,000 MZN (33 USD) per month (“Cost of Living in Mozambique” 2013). Indeed, it is certainly not inexpensive to live in Maputo, and the rental prices tend to skyrocket as more bedrooms are included; the median rental price for a three-bedroom apartment in Maputo’s city center is 52,500 MZN (1,740.22 USD) per month (“Cost of Living in Mozambique” 2013), which is moderate compared to how high rental prices can rise. It is not uncommon to find two bedroom apartments for rent for $6,000 per month and houses for $8,000 - $10,000 per month (“Club of Mozambique Classifieds” 2013). As the minimum wage for a Mozambican working in the civil service sector, for example, is only 2,699 MZN per month (89.46 USD), it seems clear that the vast majority of Mozambicans could not afford to live in the central areas of Maputo (“Minimum Wages in Mozambique” 2013).

Unlike the handful of small businesses and the single restaurant that dot the main road in downtown Manjacaze, Maputo’s streets are becoming increasingly filled with expensive restaurants, cafés, bakeries, shopping malls, and clubs that mostly cater to a foreign clientele or wealthy Mozambicans. One such café, aptly named Surf due to its proximity to the ocean and its beautiful coastal views, caters to a crowd looking to relax,

\(^{14}\) MZN represent *metricals*, the Mozambican currency. $1 = c. 30 MZN.
sip an espresso, and perhaps indulge in one of their decadent Portuguese pastries. On a daily basis, Surf is filled with expatriate businesspeople and international NGO employees. Few Mozambicans are seen at Surf apart from the staff and those who work for NGOs. Conversations concerning aid programming, investment strategies, and other logistical talk creates a din of chatter over the sound of the ocean. People with laptops work diligently with a latte in hand, while men in suits and briefcases hold business meetings or take a lunch break. This is also a hangout for young adults seeking a reprieve from school or their parents who come to smoke hookah or spend time at a nearby park. At the park Mozambican nannies can be seen with the Western children they are caring for. Many of the teenagers are of non-Mozambican descent, perhaps the children of expatriate aid or business workers who are currently living in the country.

Figure 15 Patrons at Surf. (Cruz 2012)
The scene at Surf represents the growing number of expatriates and Mozambicans who are taking advantage of both the increasingly cosmopolitan nature of the city and their ability to utilize disposable income to enjoy such luxuries. A large part of this trend includes the high amount of development-affiliated individuals, both expatriates living and working in Mozambique, as well as Mozambicans who work for international NGOs.

There are 37 international NGOs currently headquartered in Maputo (“International NGOs, Organisations in Mozambique” 2013), and due to recent changes in policy that require more incorporation of Mozambicans into the staff of international NGOs there are opportunities available for Mozambicans with the skills and desire to work at a development agency for significantly higher wages than typical Mozambicans. For example, an average salary for an entry level position such as a secretary at an international NGO is 603,372 MZN (10,000 USD) per year, ten times more than an individual working in the civil sector (“NGO Local Pay” 2013). This salary is also much higher than even the highest minimum wage for Mozambicans in the extraction industry, which is 5,320 MZN (190 USD), or 63,840 MZN (2,280 USD) per year (“Mozambican Government Approves New Minimum Salaries” 2012). Although I am using the minimum wage for the purpose of this example and individuals working in the extractive industry and civil service have the potential to make much more, a secretary at an INGO also represents an entry-level position at an INGO, thus providing a just comparison.

These opportunities are incredibly alluring for young Mozambicans who need to support their families, their education, and fuel a desire to participate in the consumption of increasingly available Western commodities. Often, according to my informants,
obtaining a job at a development agency is seen as the ultimate level of success, as Mozambicans receive higher salaries and also participate in the foreign, Western world of the expatriates. Over the years, the influence of international aid and individuals participating in development created a distinct culture. As I discuss in this chapter, this group views the NGO world and expatriate population in a specific way, which in turn contributes to how they vocalize their opinions, interact, and negotiate with the international development world, much like their counterparts in Manjacaze.

An additional emerging culture is the culture of expatriates who work for international NGOs in Mozambique, and which is described in the following chapter. As exemplified at Surf, a multitude of expatriate aid workers now call the country their home. Some aid workers only stay as long as their one-year contracts, while others eventually become semi-permanent or permanent residents of Mozambique. While these expatriates hail from a host of countries and work for various agencies, what they have in common is their participation in this cultural group and their distinct perceptions of the Mozambican population they work with. Recalling the party at Elliott’s rooftop and my initial introduction into expatriate culture in Mozambique, this group often includes a recreation of American or European lifeways and activities and a tendency to socialize only within expatriate development circles.

Distinct cultural characteristics demonstrate the nature of these groups, their perceptions of each other, and how they work to negotiate for their own best interests amidst the development field. In this chapter and the next, I examine characteristics that compose the aforementioned groups of Mozambicans and expatriates working for
international NGOS. I argue that the existence of these trends is due to the influence of international development in the country.

The data discussed in this chapter and the next stems from over 25 interviews and observations done during my two month stay in Maputo from August through October 2012. About half of those interviews included Mozambican participants who either worked for an international NGO, a national NGO, or had formerly done so. These interviews were achieved first through previously established connections in Maputo from Dr Cruz’s earlier fieldwork, and then grew out of suggestions and contacts from those individuals. With this snowballing effect as a part of my interview strategy, I was able to pinpoint the desired population demographic. The second half of interviews, to be discussed in Chapter Six, were exclusively done with foreigners who worked for international NGOs. Most were Americans, but others were Dutch, Portuguese, German, and French.

From my interviews and observations gained during my time in Maputo, I outline the perspectives, perceptions, and motivations of the groups examined. Some of these trends consist of specific perspectives within the group that were garnered via interviews, while others include data that was gained from observations and interpretations. Both categories contribute to the descriptions of the classes of agents. While each of these groups function independently on some levels and are discussed separately, part of their composition includes opinions and perceptions of each other; there is a codependency inherent in the groups’ characteristics. As a result, analysis of these chapters includes a discussion of the interdependence of the two groups as well as their interactions. My goal
is to elucidate the cultural trends within their discourse and behaviors of these classes of agents as well as determine which trends help or prohibit them from accessing the social capital in the development field.

Back at Surf, diligently taking notes while enjoying a sunset on the Indian Ocean, I marvel at how across the world and thousands of miles away I can feel very much at home in the presence of wireless internet, coffee, grilled sandwiches, Americans, and Europeans. It is easy to forget for a moment that I am in sub-Saharan Africa, in one of the poorest countries in the world and not instead in a café somewhere in Europe. This scene is in stark contrast to my everyday world in Manjacaze, with its dust roads and reed compounds, and where it was unusual to see a Western individual throughout town. Manjacaze, with its smattering of storefronts and lack of restaurants, bars, and cafes, seems like a wholly different world. Fascinated by this dynamic and the people who participate in it, I hope to examine how various individuals partake and support these activities. What are their motivations? Opinions? Perspectives? Why and how are the cultures of these groups formed and reinforced? These questions and more are considered in the following analysis of international development and its impact on Mozambicans working in Maputo.

“Poverty is a Big Business in Mozambique”

On Vladmir Lenin Street, amidst street vendors selling everything from cell phone minutes to fruit, vegetables, and jewelry, there is a quiet little café called Café Luanda nestled between storefronts. This expensive café is where I met informant Carlos Simões
for our first meeting after my stay in Manjacaze. We had originally planned to meet at Café Acácia, an even more expensive and upscale café with a view of the river and the bay of Maputo, but the weather was turning so we opted for a covered location instead. My interpretation of Carlos’s choice of locale is twofold; I assume that he wanted to pick a location that showcased Mozambique’s ability to cater to a wealthy foreign crowd and wanted to portray a certain image that implied his middle class status.

In his late 30s, Carlos has worked for national NGOs and has been involved in various development projects throughout Mozambique. His background is in architecture, and he studied and worked in Portugal before returning to Mozambique. Back in Mozambique he worked for the national Foundation for Community Development or FDC (*Fundação para o Desenvolvimento Comunitário*), created by Graça Machel, the widow of first Mozambican president Samora Machel and later Nelson Mandela. While at FDC, he worked for a specific program that provided education for individuals who wished to sell crafts to earn a profit. They would give some of their earnings to the program in return, which would be used to support orphans with HIV/AIDS. The main funders for this program were USAID and the Kellogg Foundation. Thus, he has firsthand experience in how development functions in Mozambique. He was also instrumental in putting together the arts and crafts market that has become a tourist staple in Maputo, he is involved in a program to teach street children how to make crafts in order to make an accumulative profit, and is also working on a project to create high quality Mozambican crafts for export. All of his projects are designed to support local Mozambicans in increasing their skills as craftsmen or businesspeople in order to better themselves,
become competitive and improve their quality of life and business opportunities. He is very interested in the combination of crafts and development, particularly for rural communities. An educated man himself, Carlos has been able, in some ways, to use that cultural capital to assist his fellow Mozambicans (Simões 2012).

As he is immersed in the development community, albeit as mostly a self-starter, Carlos has nevertheless come into contact with organizations that are trying to enact similar programs, whether with international NGOs or national NGOs. Carlos has thus developed very distinct and critical views pertaining to development in the country. As a representative of a group of individuals who have worked or are working for NGOs, Carlos’s views on international aid work in the country are indicative of the unique attributes of this emerging culture that is part and parcel of the rise of development cultures in the country.

One of the prominent perspectives that was immediately evident to me during my interviews with Carlos and other informants was the cynical stance that many of these individuals espoused. Out of all my Mozambican informants, Carlos tended to have the most intensely critical perspective. One of the first things he said to me was “poverty is a big business in Mozambique,” indicating that he is doubtful as to the motivations of aid organizations; he doubts whether they are in the country to eradicate poverty or rather for individuals to make money (Simões 2012). This cynicism, while present with other informants, was especially prominent with Carlos, most likely because Carlos is not currently working for an international NGO and therefore does not have his job at risk. In addition, Carlos is generally more outspoken and critical than many of his Mozambican
counterparts. From my interviews with him, I got the impression that he is more critical because his efforts to create local associations centered around crafts usually struggle due to lack of funding from INGOs or other sources.

Carlos was particularly incensed by the issue of expatriates in the country, citing a time when he has applied for a position with an NGO, which had been seeking a person knowledgeable in craft production and marketing, two skills that Carlos possesses. He was passed over, he says, in favor of a Brazilian woman who came from abroad. His conclusions from this situation were that expatriates are often favored by NGOs for employment, and that it does not necessarily matter if a Mozambican has the same skill set. He mentioned that sometimes NGOs were created for money laundering purposes and was incredibly suspicious as to their motivations. He did mention, however, that the presence of expatriates in the city is both positive and negative; they bring high culture to the city but they also take away culture as Mozambicans lose their own sense of identity. He was resentful of the negative impact of the inflation of lifestyle in Maputo because as the expatriates bring in more capital the rents start to go up, as do prices of other commodities, skewing the economic realities of Mozambicans.

Carlos was also critical of the structure of NGOs and the way that they function in the first place, citing the donor driven nature of the organizations to be the biggest problem:

There are several problems because some of [the NGOs] are donor driven, which means they are designed to circulate the money of the donor and not to deliver the results. They are not worried about that. They are more worried about how much money they can use to employ their own people. (Simões 2012)
As can be seen from this passage, not only is Carlos upset by what in his view are the unfair practices of NGOs, but also the very essence of the NGO structure. He is doubtful that a system that is constantly reporting back to donors in order to maintain their program is sustainable or effective. This relates to Hanlon’s argument for a more straightforward system that gives money directly to aid recipients, rather than creating complicated and problematic aid structures (Hanlon 2010). According to the discourse Carlos espoused, he would advocate for a similar approach.

During our conversation at the quiet café, I discussed with Carlos my experiences in Manjacaze with World Vision, citing the process by which they build houses in order to meet the quotas of their donors. Carlos was particularly skeptical as to how World Vision carries out this process and what he sees as the ineffective nature of it:

If I’m living in a place where I don’t have concrete, cement, stone, or wood, how am I going to repair a house without all that stuff? If there is a broken window, when can I go to buy one to replace it? If I have to travel all the way to Maxixe or Xai-Xai to buy glass to replace my window, it’s double the price of the glass. It’s not sustainable at all. It’s a problem of ownership. If there is a house built by World Vision it’s a World Vision house. So if the window is broken World Vision has to come and replace it because the people living in the house don’t have the money to buy one. It’s a matter of sustainability. That’s where most of the NGOs are failing…(Simões 2012)

Plainly, Carlos feels that the actions of NGOs in the field are also incredibly problematic and not necessarily effective. According to him, they are failing to be sustainable or valuable because of their emphasis on what Carlos deems NGO “ownership,” or their need to take credit for each project. If they report to their donors that they built $x$ amount of houses or taught a community to raise chickens for income generation, their donors are satisfied because the numbers are deceiving. In reality, however, according to Carlos the
actual results of these actions do not do much to improve the lived conditions of the community. This connects to the data gathered from interviews in Manjacaze where several informants expressed their frustration at the lack of sustainability in INGO programs. Sr. Dinis, for example, cited that World Vision provided pineapple crowns and equipment to start a machamba to support his association, but then did not provide a way for members to travel to the market in order to sell the pineapples. Carlos sees this as one of the main problems with INGOs.

My conversation with Carlos helped to illuminate some of the key perspectives that are inherent with this group, that of a critical view of international NGOs and development in Mozambique. Overall, Carlos is quite passionate about this issue and feels strongly that INGOs are hurting rather than helping rural communities like Manjacaze and urban Mozambicans who are living in poverty in Maputo. In his eyes, they are there purely for their own business purposes. This cultural trait, as shown through his verbose and fervent explanations of his criticism of development, deals with his reaction to international aid in his country. He makes a living out of development, but he also intensely critiques it.

Another informant that was essential to my introduction to this particular trait was a Mozambican graduate student and university lecturer called Alberto Inroga. Like Carlos, Alberto once relied on work with NGOs to make a living so he has an insider’s perspective on the functioning of specific NGOs in the region. I met up with Alberto at the University Eduardo Mondlane, where he lectures while working towards his Ph.D. in archaeology at Witwatersrand (South Africa). Alberto is a jovial and seemingly light-
hearted individual who laughs often in casual conversation, but when engaged in our discussion concerning international aid in Mozambique he listened intently and spoke seriously. Alberto had formerly worked for an international NGO in the northern province of Niassa, and he mentioned that many of his friends currently work for such organizations. His experience with that particular INGO informed much of his critical perspective pertaining to international aid.

Originally from Maputo, after completing his BA in history at Eduardo Mondlane, Alberto went to work for the organization in Niassa that was attempting to build water pumps in a rural community. He was hired as a community project manager, and put in charge of consulting with villages in the area in order to ascertain the best locations for the pumps in terms of walking distance. The budget and the project goals, however, had already been determined before the INGO staff actually arrived in Niassa. When he began to talk with community members about the wells they insisted that the health authorities had warned them not to drink the water at all, that it was unsafe, and that the water would need treatment before being safely consumed. Alberto and his colleagues reported their findings back to the NGO, but since the budget was already set they said they could not accommodate the purification of the water. Frustrated by the inflexibility of the organization, Alberto ultimately left the project after six months. Although he did not see the project to completion, he is sure that the water pumps were built despite the community’s hesitation about drinking the water (Ingroga 2012). This scenario is similar to many of the World Vision projects in Manjacaze that were described by my informants. A lack of ensuring that the wells and other materials
provided would be used effectively was commonplace. Whether it be deficiency of transportation for agricultural goods, wrong pipes for the water pumps, or building a house for shelter with materials foreign to the region, these are just a few of the examples that are consistent with Alberto’s narrative.

Alberto is quite skeptical as to the effectiveness of INGOs in Mozambique due to his experiences working for an international NGO. Like Carlos, he compared these NGOs to a business and said that everything about aid in Mozambique has become more business-oriented than anything else. He felt that many NGOs are tied down by the rigidity of their missions and budgets, and since most of these organizations are run by people that come in and out of the country, staff members do not make an effort to get to know the culture. Instead, they remain in their “bubble in Maputo” (Ingroga 2012). Some of these ideas are consistent with the data I found when interviewing expatriates who work for international NGOs. Most of the staff members I interviewed do not make a sincere effort to interact with Mozambicans on a social level, and instead socialize almost exclusively with other expatriates.

Alberto’s discourse coupled with my own observations with World Vision in Manjacaze can be seen in conjunction with critiques of development by anthropologists. They cite that despite the utilization of buzzwords such as community participation and partnership, as World Vision describes their programs with local associations, often these practices can override the autonomy of local communities (Cooke and Kothari 2001:12). In Manjacaze, this can be seen in the need of community members to conduct the activities of their organizations not how they see fit, but how World Vision or Save the
Children instruct them. The INGO that Alberto worked for cloaked their activities in supposed community input and best practice evaluations, but in reality their rigid budget and mission did not allow for such participation. This anecdote aligns with the critiques of anthropologists who claim that new language in development practice does not necessarily equal improved outcomes (Edelman and Haugerud 2005:49).

Alberto also expressed his criticism of the attitude of some INGO staff members and believes that their high salaries contribute to the problem because they then have the capability to disconnect themselves physically with their expensive homes and lifestyles. Alberto spoke of an NGO culture that consists of a separation between regular Mozambicans and NGO staff members:

> Many of them [expatriates] don’t experience the “other side” of things. People who can “afford to pay $20 for a meal create an entirely new economic class. [Walking around in a neighborhood like Polana] you only see the ocean and fancy cars, but not the real experience on the ground. (Ingroga 2012)

Once again this behavior was confirmed by my expatriate informants who isolate themselves from the poverty of Maputo and instead frequent expensive restaurants and live in condominiums on the coast. Like Carlos, Alberto had some conflicting feelings about the presence of international NGOs, citing the economic opportunities that these organizations provide for Mozambicans, even if the waves of foreigners in the country do take the top jobs and the positions reserved for Mozambicans are usually lower level. This is reminiscent of the situation during colonialism, when *assimilados* were allowed access to certain positions, but the Portuguese still held the top roles.
As can be seen through the perspective of Alberto, he too takes quite a critical stance on international development in the country, but is also conflicted because of his direct involvement in aid and the potential opportunities for Mozambicans. This dichotomy of criticisms versus dependency is a vital characteristic to this group, as they have or still do depend on opportunities with these organizations to make a better living. Ferguson and Gupta (2002) inform this phenomenon with discussions of the naturalizing powers of international aid agencies as they take the place of previously dominant and paternalistic government forces. As entities that have a tendency to de-privilege the state in favor of civil society organizations (Pitcher 2002:19-20), it is no wonder that individuals like Carlos and Alberto must work within the socially accepted confines of international development despite their criticisms.

Another individual who became one of my key informants is not only currently working for an international NGO but excelling in his position. Armando Pelembe, with whom I connected via Dr. Cruz, is a personable man in his mid 30s. Armando likes to laugh and joke around, but like Alberto became serious when speaking about topics related to his job and development in Mozambique. Our first official meeting was at a popular restaurant called Mimmos, an Italian-themed chain restaurant complete with ravioli, pasta, and pizza entrees, again found on Vladimir Lenin street. Armando works for an INGO based in the Netherlands called the Netherlands Institute for Multiparty Democracy (NIMD). NIMD has as a mission to “contribute to deepening and sustaining democratic political institutions in young democracies” (“Netherlands Institute for Multiparty Democracy” 2013). He also works with a national NGO called Sociedade
Aberta, formed by university educated Mozambicans, whose mission is to improve the living conditions of communities via entrepreneurial projects. These individuals wish to give back to local communities, particularly in rural areas. Sociedade Aberta was seen as a means of employment for them, but the members were also passionate about putting their skills to work in developing rural communities. So, Armando is clearly quite involved in development in the country and has witnessed first hand the processes involved. Despite his personal interests, Armando is also critical of international aid in Mozambique and has much to say on the topic.

Over our lunch of pizza, Armando spoke plainly of his views, sharing his feeling that many expatriates in the country have their own interests at heart and that some people are just here for employment, not because they know or love the country. Concerning favoritism shown to foreigners, in his opinion there is not always necessarily favoritism involved but often the expatriates are already a part of the INGO community here. Therefore, it can be easier for them to get jobs as opposed to Mozambicans who have to work their way in and may not have the personal connections. This highlights the expatriates’ ability to access social capital in the development field through expatriate connections. In Mozambique, there is a certain culture of personal connections and networks where who you know is often much more important than qualifications. He also mentioned that some INGOs do not hire Mozambicans, and will pay for another ad for a position if they do not receive expatriate applications at first. Similar to Alberto, Armando reasoned that international NGOs function more as a business and therefore make business-oriented decisions, even if they wish to be viewed as altruistic and
opportunity enhancing (Pelembe 2012). He felt that expatriates working in Mozambique also have an advantage:

They are usually given nice houses to live in, paid by the NGO, they have access to certain European lifestyles and education, they are viewed as having a high level of status and are able to get respect. Plus, they usually get better and longer contracts with INGOs than Mozambicans. (Pelembe 2012)

From Armando’s perspective, the expatriates’ access to this social capital only reinforces and multiplies that social capital, creating a snowball effect of advantages.

Like Carlos and Alberto, Armando also expressed his frustration with INGOs that are not result-oriented. He feels they are instead more concerned with what the donor reports say they do, which explains exactly where the money is going. He complained that there is no follow up and confirmation that the programs are actually being effective and sustainable. A large part of this problem, he explained, was inattentiveness to cultural complexities. An example he gave was what he deemed the chicken case, which he explained as being indicative of how many INGOs function. This example was similar to scenarios I witnessed in Manjacaze where cultural nuances were not only misinterpreted but completely ignored, as in the cases of local associations being assigned fundraising tasks that were not part of their cultural schemas (i.e., growing pineapples for profit with no way to sell them). According to Armando, the story was as follows:

An INGO set out to empower the women in one community who were not allowed by men to eat chicken. The INGO had as their mission to encourage the women to stand up to the men and eat the chicken, so they could have a more well-rounded diet. What the INGO did not realize was that not eating the chicken was actually part of their culture…the women were the ones in the community who were in charge of raising, handling, keeping track of, giving the chickens to whom they saw fit. In reality, the women had all of the power and control over the chickens, and didn’t eat them because they were above eating the chicken. So, the power dynamics
and reality of the situation are much more complicated. Empowering the
women to eat the chicken was disrupting local traditions and power
relationships. (Pelembe 2012)

So, the INGO was inadvertently decreasing women’s power in the community, despite
their goal to do just the opposite. Despite the fact that Mozambique has been ranked 23\textsuperscript{rd}
in countries who have the least amount of gender gap, with the US ranking 22\textsuperscript{nd} (“Global
Gender Gap Report by the World Economic Forum” 2012), international development
agencies continue to misinterpret women’s roles and power in communities.

Regardless of these criticisms and observations, however, Armando is also loyal
to his own INGO. He is the Mozambique Country Coordinator for his organization, so as
might be expected he takes pride in his work, position, and lifestyle. After lunch, we
toured the office and he explained the goal-setting procedure within the organization and
how one might go about promoting democracy in Mozambique. Armando seemed quite
proud of his work as he went into detail concerning the activities of the organization,
using words like representative, elections, and democratic ideals. This goes along with
the stated goals of the organization, which included “supporting electoral reform and the
interparty dialogue process” in Mozambique in 2012 (“Netherlands Institute for
Multiparty Democracy” 2012). Despite his critiques of international development in
Mozambique, he also participates in the official discourse as well. He feels that it is
unique and does contribute greatly to democratic thinking in Mozambique. He mentioned
that he was responsible for putting together a dinner between the President and leading
members of FRELIMO and RENAMO to commemorate the 20\textsuperscript{th} anniversary of the
signing of the Rome peace agreement (Pelembe 2012). Although it is unclear whether or
not this event was carried out due to recent violent developments between RENAMO and FRELIMO (see “Renamo revert to force, aging, spent, and broke” October 23rd, 2013). Clearly Armando is proud of the work he is doing and careful not to speak poorly of his own employer. As is seen later in the chapter, this is not by accident; Armando has thought carefully about his place in the development world and how best to achieve personal success.

The critical perspectives of development from Carlos, Alberto, and Armando are all examples of certain characteristics that comprise this particular group. These perspectives help to create animosity and skepticism amongst both current and former Mozambicans working for international development organizations. Some of the viewpoints expressed by Mozambican informants are a reaction to what Joseph Hanlon would deem the recolonization of Mozambique (1991), or the idea that white foreigners are exploiting Mozambicans for their own profit. When Carlos describes international development as a big business and all three informants identity a distinct expatriate culture that considers themselves above the plight of everyday Mozambicans, they are reacting to Hanlon’s descriptions of economic colonialism and the ineffectiveness of aid (Hanlon 1991, 1996; Hanlon and Smart 2008, Hanlon et al 2012). Individuals like Carlos, Alberto, and Armando are frustrated by what they see as a new form of colonialism and their inability to influence the business of poverty. As is seen in proceeding descriptions, however, how Mozambicans view themselves within this world is arguably more essential to how they negotiate and view the other groups described. In the following section, the perspectives of informants like Armando are examined, with conflicting
views of international NGOs, the expatriates who work for them, and the role that Mozambicans play in this process indicative of yet another element of this particular group; the distinct way in which Mozambicans working for NGOs perceive themselves. Together these two elements, an undeniably critical stance but also intense self-reflection, are key aspects in the cultural identities of this group.

“Stuck in the Middle”

Despite unfavorable perspectives concerning international development in their country, Mozambicans working for INGOs are also undeniably dependent on the presence of aid in their country for achieving an upper class lifestyle. Therefore they must accommodate the Western rules of these aid organizations in order to be perceived as worthy of employment, extended contracts, and perhaps promotion. This accommodation is done in a variety of ways and with differing levels of success, with employed individuals seeking to showcase their achievements through conspicuous consumption and other symbols of power. These displays of conspicuous consumption amidst bleak poverty are unique not only to Mozambique’s middle class, but to the black middle class in places like South Africa and Angola where the number of citizens who can afford things like expensive cars and jewelry is rapidly growing (see “Young, Rich, Black, and Driving an African Boom” 2006 and “Flats, cars and oil for China: Angola's growth tempered by growing inequality” 2012). In this section, I describe how middle class Mozambicans who work for INGOs see themselves within the development world of Mozambique, how they choose to present themselves, and how they negotiate within
the development field. A component of this process is a necessary adherence to a Westernized form of consumption, appearance, vocabulary, skills, and ideological paradigm. According to many of my informants and observations, only after ascribing to these ideas and behaviors can an individual attain success in Mozambique’s INGO circles.

This idea relates to the concept of *assimilados* from the colonial period (see Chapter Two). *Assimilados* were a class of Mozambicans considered a different category than other Mozambicans. In order to be classified as *assimilados*, individuals were required to dress like the Portuguese colonists, read and write Portuguese, and behave according to European norms (Errante 1998:285). *Assimilados* represented a middle class with aspirations to a Western lifestyle. The behavior of young professional Mozambicans today may reflect this history, as they continue to mimic the customs and dress of foreigners who hold positions of power in their country. In this sense, Mozambicans are participating in what Homi Bhabha would describe as mimicry, the idea that members in a colonial context imitate certain aspects of the colonizing population in an attempt to replicate the persons in power so as to achieve that same power (Bhabha 1987). In this situation, it can be argued that although the white foreigners involved with international aid are not colonial administrators, their behavior and Mozambican reactions to it are neocolonial in nature. *Assimilado* aspirations may also be why individuals living in Maputo can be more successful, as their families could have already have been *assimilado* during colonialism or at least had access to an urban life and education. Armando’s father, for example, was a policeman in Maputo and thus most likely had
certain connections to the government. Today, there is the cultural expectation in Maputo that Mozambicans who work for INGOs adhere to a Western lifestyle, thus recreating and mimicking (Bhabha 1987) features of the assimilado concept.

Returning to my conversation with Armando helps to illustrate some of the dynamics at work concerning Mozambicans who attempt to participate in the Western-oriented world of INGOs. One of the first things that Armando expressed to me as we took our seats at Mimmo’s was his sadness and slight feelings of guilt at how some of his friends and colleagues have not been able to achieve the success he has experienced in his own organization. He said,

Some Mozambicans are stuck in the middle. They are in their own world between the modern, expat, wealthy world of internationals and their own Mozambican background and heritage. They alienate their own culture by adopting this new, Western culture. (Pelembe 2012)

He described the process as follows: when a Mozambican begins working for international NGOs and earning a higher salary than the vast majority of their peers, they begin purchasing what I deem symbols of power. They buy cars, nice apartments or homes, designer clothes, and other expensive commodities because this showcases their higher status and position of power. For example, Armando drives an SUV, his wife also owns a car, and his brother owns a Mercedes and an SUV. Both he and his brother built homes in Matola, a city that is only 12 kilometers from Maputo, but much less inexpensive and where many young Mozambican professionals live. Armando said that often these young Mozambicans waste all of their money consuming symbols of power initially because they are eager to show off their wealth, however, they do not always plan ahead or save money. As a result, if they lose their jobs or their contracts with the
INGOs are up, they are trapped because they have not created a sustainable life for themselves (Pelembe 2012). This phenomenon is similar to the situation described by Brad Weiss in Tanzania (2009). Tanzanian youth in Arusha become driven by the values of a globalized world in an attempt to be a part of it, even as they have difficulty realizing those values in their lives. Weiss explains that Tanzanians use symbols in the form of adopting hairstyles, television shows, and American rap groups to communicate both their inclusion and exclusion in value production, and that this inclusion/exclusion dynamic helps to shape cultural practices in Arusha today (Weiss 2009:24). As Mozambicans are exposed to Westernized lifestyles and commodities, they too attempt to access these symbols of power to communicate their station in life.

Armando stressed his frustration at the lack of a business way of thinking in many Mozambicans and cited this as one of the major problems they face. As a contrast, Armando has a keen sense for business and is constantly searching for new opportunities, thus making him an attractive employee for an INGO. Armando’s success with INGOs is consistent with progress-prone and Westernized views of the world (Harrison 2006), which is rewarded by INGOs. Armando’s success also has to do with the idea that he possesses the cultural capital of valuing a Westernized business way of thinking that allows him to access the social capital of the development world.

Most often, INGOs hire employees on a contract basis, with most providing one to five year contracts. In Armando’s words, “people go crazy” when their contracts are up and are not renewed, because “they have to go back to another world and another way of living, with people they may have previously alienated” (Pelembe 2012). This is
consistent with the data found among World Vision staff in Manjacaze. Many of the field staff were under contracts that may or may not be renewed the following year. The display of nice clothing, jewelry, and discourse of missing their lifestyles in Maputo that I witnessed among World Vision staff in Manjacaze leads me to question whether their lifestyle is sustainable after their contracts are over.

To avoid this type of situation, Armando emphasized the idea of proving ones usefulness to their organization in order to get a contract renewed or to be promoted. Armando himself is under a contract, and he mentioned that if he does not do this on a continuing basis, his contract will be terminated. He said that to be successful as a Mozambican you must learn to “market yourself and your skills to the INGOs” both to keep your job and to know how to go about getting another job if your contract is up (Pelembe 2012). “You must make them believe that you are indispensible,” he said, explaining how he manipulates the system (2012). He went further, saying that young Mozambicans have to conform to what INGOS and expatriates say if they want to succeed, even if they feel that some of the policies are going against what they believe to be right. Even if Armando feels that there is a lack of responsibility and accountability to accommodate local culture on the INGOs part, he sees that this is the unfortunate reality.

Armando seemed conflicted about his role working for an INGO. On the one hand, he is grateful to have a well-paying job that garners prestige, but he also feels some sense of guilt about participating in a system that has what he sees as major flaws and negative impacts. At one point I mentioned being interested in speaking with more young Mozambicans who work for INGOs, and he threw his head back, laughed and said, “you
mean the traitors?” He was joking, but I think in a sense he does feel that way about himself, citing that although many Mozambicans recognize that the INGOs they work for are not especially culturally aware and have programs that work against indigenous knowledge, they go with the flow of the INGOs because they do not wish to risk their jobs and lifestyles (Pelembe 2012). Thus, conforming is a necessary aspect of their success. Once again, this perspective can be seen as quite similar to the assimilado experience of Mozambicans during the colonial period.

From my interview with Armando, it became increasingly clear that due to conflicting feelings and motivations, the relationship between Mozambicans working for international NGOs and the development world in Mozambique is a complicated one. According to Armando, Mozambicans must adhere to the ideological paradigm of the INGO they work for in order to keep their jobs. Armando attributes his accomplishments to his ability to negotiate his position within NGO expectations. In addition, Armando’s testimony illustrates the idea that if Mozambicans own the same material things as their expatriate counterparts they feel as though they can belong more in the INGO world, as well as show their fellow Mozambicans that they have achieved this kind of success. This concept relates to the ideas espoused by individuals like Achille Mbembe (2001), James Ferguson (2006), Charles Piot (2010), and Brad Weiss (2009) who argue that Africans’ marginalization from globalization encourages an attempt to participate through specific behaviors and activities, such as an embrace of Christianity or other modified behaviors. In this case, participation in conspicuous consumption of material things owned by elite expatriates or Mozambicans is an attempt to achieve belonging, acceptance, and de-
marginalization from the globalized, development world.

Like Armando, throughout our conversation Carlos expressed his own opinions and views of his fellow Mozambicans. Carlos, who had some of the most pointed criticisms of international development in Mozambique, also perceives his fellow Mozambicans in a somewhat negative light. He sees them as having a lack of cultural capital to improve their lived conditions. He is somewhat disdainful of how, in his view, the majority of Mozambicans have a difficult time fitting into the Western development world. During one conversation he described the difficulties of getting businesses to be successful in Mozambique. His experience with this stems from his attempts to start several local craft enterprises to support local development:

The majority of the craft artisans I work with need a checklist. You have to provide the checklist, otherwise they can’t move. They can’t think proactively. Your example this morning with the taxi, it’s the basics [referring to an issue I had before our meeting when my taxi driver ran out of gas on the way to the meeting]. It’s his job, he has to check if the gas is there. In a developed country you could just ask for the money back and leave, it’s your time that you’re losing. Imagine if I was an investor preparing to give you funding and you said you would be late because your taxi ran out of gas. I would say, sorry, I have other meetings - I can’t wait. (Simões 2012)

This excerpt from our conversation reveals that although Carlos was born and raised in Mozambique, due perhaps to his Western education in Portugal he is adhering to an ideologically Western construction of valuing time, organization, capitalistic pursuits, and investments. In reality, despite his capacity to think in a critical manner concerning international NGOs in Mozambique, he has become successful within that world because he has adopted that mindset. He has had no choice if he wishes to thrive within an INGO
context. Carlos’s conversation also highlights what Armando mentioned in terms of needing to conform to the ideology of the INGOs and expatriates. Even if he does not fully articulate it himself, Carlos has adopted this ideology to an extent that he now feels resentful when other Mozambicans have not done so. Although this is certainly due in part to the influence of his Western education, he has also learned from his experiences in Mozambique. He has been taught, both formally and informally, that in order to access any of the social capital available in the development field one must first accept the Western ideology included in that field.

During my conversation with Carlos, we also spoke about the motivations behind individuals working for an international NGO. He felt that many rural Mozambicans participate in INGO programs just because of the small benefits they receive, like the free meals at the World Vision meeting I witnessed. He said, “the NGOs are not attracting these people because of their vision. The people are there because they think they might get access to something. Even a capulana or a t-shirt” (Simões 2012). Carlos again feels disdainful of both INGOs who misunderstand this idea and Mozambicans themselves, as he feels that their motivations for working with INGOs like World Vision are not or akin to the INGOs mission but instead motivated by their own desperate needs. He dislikes what he sees as Mozambican populations working against themselves or not fully understanding the big picture, which only hinders any progress of positive development.

Another informant who helps to highlight the ideas found in both Armando and Carlos’s discussions is Filipe Diomba, a Mozambican who works for the Clinton Health Access Initiative, or CHAI. We met at a pizza restaurant aptly named Pizza House
located Av. Mao Tse Tung, one of Maputo’s busiest streets. Filipe manages donations, forecasting, orders, and distributions of medications for CHAI. He has worked for the organization since 2008 on one-year contracts, so his contact has been renewed four times. He will be with CHAI for at least one more year. This is somewhat stressful for him because he is never quite sure when he will lose his job, and participating in his lifestyle depends on this job. Considering Filipe’s position with CHAI, he was somewhat reluctant to speak too critically about development or INGOs.

He did speak often of his feelings towards his fellow Mozambicans and was highly critical, however, calling them lazy due to what he considers to be their inability to adopt to a Western concept of time. In order to be successful, he said, Mozambicans must have “individual priorities and skills” and have a “people mentality.” He said that for many Mozambicans, their laziness gets in the way of this sort of mindset (Diomba 2012). I interpreted his meaning of laziness to mean not prioritizing tasks in a manner demanded by Western supervisors. He mentioned that he himself had to adopt to issues of being on time and completing tasks in a timely manner and according to deadlines, otherwise he would have lost his job. He admitted that he had struggled a bit with this, but has adjusted appropriately according to what is expected of him. He said he has had to keep up and adopt quickly in order to keep his job (Diomba 2012). As an anecdote to this, Filipe was actually about 30 minutes late for our meeting, but apologized profusely upon arriving. I could tell that he may still be struggling with issues of time accountability, but was aware that his lateness would be viewed in a negative light by an American.

Like Armando and Carlos, Filipe understands the importance of his conversion to
a Westernized ideology, and like Carlos he has gotten so wrapped up in this world that he now feels resentful when other Mozambicans cannot or will not adapt in the same fashion. His transformation is so thorough that the ways in which he views other Mozambicans who have not achieved his level of success are affected. He feels that in order to enact positive change these individuals need to alter their cultural mores. Part of this alteration has to do with Filipe and Carlos’s adoption of a Westernized cultural concept of time, which is expanded upon below, and which has to do with valuing clock time as opposed to season or task-oriented time that is more closely associated with pre-industrial societies (Thompson 1967:59). The value that Filipe and Carlos have learned to place on clock time is symbolic of their rejection of a more traditional Mozambican cultural framework and their attempt to assimilate into Western culture.

As I became more familiar with the INGO landscape in Maputo and the various actors operating within it, I gradually came into contact with more Mozambicans working for development agencies that shared many similarities with Armando, Carlos, and Filipe. Among them was one informant from AWEPA (Parlamentares Europeus Para África), whose mission is to strengthen parliamentary democracy in Africa. Alcinda Comoana is a Mozambican who has risen to a relatively prominent position in the organization as a Program Manager. In her early 40s, slightly older than many of my other Mozambican informants, Alcinda immediately struck me as a person who is passionate about her work. A former employee of World Vision and Pathfinder before her career with AWEPA, she seemed to indicate her preference for AWEPA over her previous employers. She did mention that it was often easier to work for World Vision and Pathfinder as they had very
specific project goals, such as building a certain number of homes or schools in a particular district. She was cognizant of some of the problems in this kind of development work, however, and was critical of the programs in which she had worked.

It is worth noting with Alcinda that perhaps in order to achieve the success in the development world that she has, she has been required to distance herself somewhat from her culture. She expressed the idea that she was embarrassed by many of her fellow Mozambicans because she hates to see people begging on the streets, people asking outright for money from foreigners, and people’s seeming inability to achieve the kind of success that she has. Alcinda mentioned that she has herself had to adapt to the cultural requirements of the international NGOs she has worked with as well as the skills needed to be hired and promoted:

In my first job with World Vision I did not understand at first the importance of strict deadlines. My program manager at World Vision became angry when I did not complete this task by the assigned date because I thought that the date was flexible! I learned quickly though, because I wanted to do well. (Comoana 2012)

Thus, some of Alcinda’s feelings concerning other Mozambicans who do not act in this way stem from her own ability to adjust and change. She is undoubtedly a hardworking individual, and she has been far removed from the less wealthy world of many of her fellow Mozambicans for so long that it is somewhat difficult for her to conceive of anything else but a motivated mindset.

There are a whole slew of Mozambicans, however, who deal with international NGOs and other aid agencies in a slightly different way: working for a national NGO who is funded by various development agencies. One of these individuals is Augusto
Machava, who works for AMODEFA (Associação Moçambicana para Desenvolvimento da Família), a national NGO. AMODEFA’s focus is mainly on reproductive health, education advocacy, women’s rights, and getting youth involved in their communities in rural Mozambique. They also run a free clinic in their headquarters in Maputo. Operating out of the provinces Maputo, Gaza, Manica, Zambezia and Cabo Delgado, their stated mission is to,

...promote and defend the sexual and reproductive rights of adolescents and young people, women and men, contributing to the well being of the community through information, education and provision of quality services in partnership with the public and private sectors and civil society. (“AMODEFA” 2013)

Founded in 1989, AMODEFA’s major donors include the International Planned Parenthood Federation (IPPF), the United Nations Fund for Population Activities (UNFPA), Pathfinder International, the World Health Organization (WHO), French Cooperation, the National Council to Combat HIV / AIDS, the Japanese Trust Fund, the Federation Ford, the Foundation for Community Development (FDC), the Africa Group of Sweden (GAS), the United States President’s Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR) and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) (“AMODEFA” 2013). Aid from these entities necessitates that AMODEFA staff meet their requirements in order to receive aid. Therefore, although AMODEFA is a national NGO, for the most part it needs to conform to the demands and requirements of foreign donors as well.

During our conversation, Augusto spoke earnestly about the differences between Mozambicans who succeed in the development industry and those that do not,
specifically through his experiences as AMODEFA:

Most staff members at AMODEFA are all Westernized, and it is obvious who has received a Western education from outside and who has not. Mozambicans who have the good fortune to travel to Europe or America for higher education come back to Mozambique more Western than many other Mozambicans. The way they see the world [Western individuals] is more scientific and people who have this [Western] education get very good jobs. (Machava 2012)

This is apparently somewhat of a problem with AMODEFA, as many of these Mozambicans initially start working for them but then move on to international NGOs where they receive a higher salary. Augusto described how AMODEFA’s salary is very low compared with INGOs and as a result they may lose qualified people, making it a challenge for the organization to survive. This aspect of Augusto’s experience at AMODEFA speaks to the power of the cultural capital of a Western education and one’s ability to navigate the development system once adherence to a Western ideological paradigm takes place.

Augusto also mentioned a subcategory of this particular trait, that of a Westernized version of conspicuous consumption. Like Armando, he mentioned how for many Mozambicans it is difficult to resist the temptation to purchase symbols of power that are affiliated with a Western lifestyle once they are hired with NGOs:

Owning a car is like a dream… we have two life objectives in life, owning a car and having a house. We fight for that….we want the finer things in life: cars, clothes, houses. We like good cars. (Machava 2012)

Augusto said all this with a smile. He is implicated in this category himself, as I observed when he arrived at AMODEFA in his Mercedes Benz. Material things like cars are purchased not only for show amongst themselves, but also as symbols of their
affiliation with the international crowd. Owning an expensive car or wearing Western clothing sends a distinct message to both expatriates and Mozambicans that they are a part of the Western world. Although owning a car and a house are common aspirations for people living in the U.S., for Mozambicans this is a newer phenomenon. According to Dr. Dores Cruz (per. com.), the situation during my fieldwork in 2012 was quite different from her previous visits in 2004 and 2005, when the most expensive cars were owned almost exclusively by expatriates. Today, she noted that she has observed a significant increase in the amount of top of the line cars owned by Mozambicans, confirming Augusto’s assertion that owning a car is increasingly important to them.

Through the testimonies of Armando, Carlos, Filipe, Alcinda, and Augusto, we can see that these cultural trends fall under the categories of perceived negative opinion of Mozambicans who are outside the success of the development world, a conversion to a Western ideological paradigm and skill set, and the participation in conspicuous consumption of Western material things. All of these traits, furthermore, can be viewed in how Mozambicans working for international NGOs view themselves and how best to thrive in development positions and organizations in Mozambique. In turn, how this group views themselves affects how they interact and negotiate with American and European expatriates and the international agencies they work for.

Conclusion

In this chapter, I have discussed how Mozambicans working for international NGOs have developed their own cultural identity according to how they view themselves
and the wider INGO world in Mozambique. This identity includes an intense critique and mistrust of development agencies, expatriates working for INGOs, self-reflection, and a conversion to a Western development ideology in order to better themselves in a highly competitive world. While speaking with my Mozambican informants, I got the impression that many of them were quite passionate about conveying their criticism of INGO practices: the favoritism of expatriate employees, the ineffectiveness of certain programming, the unsustainable nature of many development projects, and its negative inflationary impact on Maputo’s economy. For the majority of informants these criticisms came without much prompt; it was as if they were waiting for someone to ask their opinion on the topic. My informants have no choice but to rely in the employment of such organizations, and as a result must not act on these opinions. Instead, in order to maintain their positions, they must fall in line.

It is undeniable that this particular group of Mozambicans is affected by the wider forces of globalization, and what Jean and Jon Comaroff describe as the “Gucci-gloved fist” of consumerism (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001:24). The trait of conspicuous consumption stems from the desire to consume Western brand names that are meant to indicate to others that these Mozambican individuals have arrived at a level of success that is equal to their expatriate colleagues. What is described as a marginalization by globalization (Mbembe 2001; Ferguson 2006) is also relevant here, as the desire to consume expensive cars, brand name clothing, and Western-style houses is fueled by the realization of this marginalization, and thus the need to offset it by attempting to prove their capacity for participating in a globalized system.
An inherent aspect of feeling marginalized and which motivates the desire to constantly prove that they do indeed belong, stems from conceptions of Africa as absent in relation to the globalized world (Ferguson 2006:2). Ferguson argues that only a select few truly participate in globalization; Africa’s participation has included a highly selective and spatially bounded form of global connection (Ferguson 2006). This select few in Mozambique include Mozambicans looking to improve their station in life, gain political connections, and participate in an international arena by working for an INGO. Part of this process, however, includes a necessary conversion to a Western paradigm and lifestyle in order to fit into flows of globalization such as the “Gucci-gloved fist” of consumerism. Thus, we see individuals like Armando, Carlos, Filipe, Alcinda, and Augusto who must work constantly to prove their allegiance to Westernized values, paradigms, skills, and lifestyles. As highly successful individuals within the development world, they have proven their worth in a Western context, becoming some of the few that can participate in globalization.

What V.Y. Mudimbe calls “alterity” (1988) and Edward Said and Achille Mbembe deem “orientalism,” (Mbembe 2001; Said 1978) also contributes to our understanding of certain perspectives and motivations. According to my informants, one of their biggest criticisms of INGOs include how false perceptions of Africa and African communities (Mbembe 1988; Said 1979) are utilized when implementing INGO protocols, and the negative or ineffective impact of these actions. Their discourse is often laden with intense resentment and disapproval of INGO actions due to this false perception. Many Mozambicans in this group view poverty as being “a big business in
Mozambique,” (Simões 2012) which is fueled by incorrect perceptions and stereotypical views of Africa by INGOs as riddled with poverty (Hanlon et al. 2012). These perceptions represent the West’s false construction of non-Western identity (Mbmebe 1988; Said 1979). The false perceptions thus reinforce West and non-West dichotomies. Effective aid cannot be efficiently implemented as long as these incorrect versions of the non-West places are maintained.

Furthermore, the idea of a West and non-West dichotomy relates to the racialization of aid. This refers to the concept that aid is primarily given by white people to black people, with white and black not only an issue of skin color but of social and historical categories (Loftsíttir 2009:6), therefore creating racialized power dynamics. The ensuing dynamic generates expectations for each party, where being white signals certain appropriate behaviors and vice versa (Loftsíttir 2009:7). This idea is specifically significant for the Mozambican case study, as my Mozambican informants clearly saw aid coming directly from white Westerners and associated certain lifestyles and behaviors with them, creating a discord between the groups.

Despite this friction, mimicry, as described by Homi Bhabha (1987), is seen when Mozambicans working for INGOs attempt to emulate the Western lifestyles of their expatriate colleagues, which includes the aforementioned “Gucci-gloved” motivated form of conspicuous consumption. This includes the desire to eat at expensive cafés filled with expatriates and affluent Mozambicans such as Surf, Pizza House and Café Acária where I met with Mozambican informants. By mimicking the activities and lifestyles of international NGOs and their staff members, Mozambicans are attempting to access that
power, status, and prestige. Not only do these Mozambicans wish to obtain this power, however, but they must also do so in order to satisfy the demands of their foreign employers who expect adherence to a Western ideological paradigm.

The concept of clock time versus seasonal time was touched on earlier in this chapter, and is also elemental to understanding components of mimicry and Mozambican attempts to meet the expectations of their Western-oriented employers. Clock-time is associated with measuring time in terms of deadlines and by the hour, and is a result of the industrial revolution in the West where the workday began to be measured in such increments (Thompson 1967:60). Seasonal time, or a framework of time focused on completion of tasks and the environment, is associated with pre-industrial periods and non-industrial societies. E.P. Thompson, one of the first academics to examine the shift in time-sense, suggests that the comprehension of time is highly influenced by the industrial system in which people work. This comprehension is reflected in working habits, rules, economies, and cultural characteristics (Thompson 1967:58). Following this line of thought, the behaviors of successful Mozambicans involved with development reflect an embrace of clock-time, with the more successful individuals being the ones who have adopted a post-industrial ideology of time.

Whether consciously or unconsciously, this class of agent is mostly adhering to what Lawrence E. Harrison describes as a “progress-prone” worldview, one that values habits such as “saving, planning for the future, advancement based on merit, rationality, and achievement” (Harrison 2006:97). Harrison equates “progress” with Western-style
values of capitalism, and as components in the development world Mozambicans must conform to these values. In this sense, this group is complying to one end of the spectrum concerning how best to go about achieving effective development; implementing cultural change in favor of Western ideals of progress.

The values, perceptions, opinions, negotiations, and activities of this group include a deep criticism of the INGO world, but at the same time a submission to it. In order to more fully understand this complicated relationship, however, it is useful to examine the cultural traits of expatriates working for INGOs that play such an important role in this dynamic. The next chapter explores the perspectives and activities of expatriates living in Maputo and working for INGOs, and the characteristics that comprise that particular group. Once again, these characteristics are categorized by both perceptions of Mozambicans and perceptions of themselves, but with differing motivations and circumstances. These two groups cannot be conceived of being completely separate, as they are constantly being influenced by and negotiate with each other in order to achieve their own best interests. As explained, however, expatriates working for INGOs in Maputo often work to distance themselves from their Mozambican surroundings in order to recreate their European and American lifestyles abroad. This and other cultural trends are examined to determine how this group functions within the wider world of development in Mozambique and how they use their cultural capital to access the social capital available in the development field.
CHAPTER SIX: ESPRESSO AND EXPATRIATES

Recall the introduction from last chapter in which I described Surf Café, an expatriate-filled establishment. Surf is in a prosperous neighborhood in Maputo and caters to both foreigners working in Mozambique and wealthy Mozambicans, mostly with high government jobs. The lattes are flowing, panini’s are being grilled, and the patrons enjoy a fantastic view of the ocean. The chatter of INGO employees fills the air, with mentions of budgets, deadlines, and programming strategies impossible to ignore. The scene at Surf, with its affluent crowd and European impression, sets the stage for the following descriptions of cultural traits that comprise the next emerging cultural group: expatriates who work for INGOs in Mozambique.

This group has developed unique perceptions of development in Mozambique and of Mozambicans. These include perceptions of how they function within Mozambican development and society that have emerged through their positions and relationship to international aid in the country. These include a criticism of development in general but continuing to work for an INGO and repeat the same self-criticized patterns, and a frustration with the Mozambican way of doing things that in their view hinder efficiency at the office. Perceptions of themselves and their function within Mozambican society include their desire to continue living a Western lifestyle of relative luxury, and an
intense value placed on travel, adventure, and increasing their status in the development world. Like the previous chapter, I begin with expatriate perceptions of INGOs in Mozambique and the criticisms that are sometimes shared with their Mozambican counterparts.

“An NGO is like a Seagull…”

As I took another sip of my Mozambican beer Laurentina Preta, I leaned back in my chair, listening to Doug Harris’s cynical description of how an NGO functions. We had met at a small, off the beaten path café in the Coop neighborhood of Maputo. Given that we were surrounded only by Mozambicans at this particular café, Doug apparently felt no qualms in expressing his critiques of development. A rather unconventional man himself, it is doubtful that he would have withheld his opinions even in a different setting. A missionary who was previously based at a church called “Scum of the Earth” in Denver, Doug moved to Mozambique a few years ago to begin his own aid organization. The purpose of his NGO, “Free the Ladies,” is to provide women with the opportunity to sell second-hand bras sent from supporters in the U.S. at markets and on the streets of Maputo. Although his organization operates only with the support of his church and other small-scale funders at home, since he has lived in Maputo for the last three years and has witnessed the expatriate culture and INGO operations in the country he has developed distinct perspectives of aid. With a mischievous twinkle in his eye, he used an animal analogy to depict the situation. “An NGO is like a seagull” he said, “they swoop in, leave
their shit, take what they need, and leave” (Harris 2012). I pondered on the irony of how Doug, as an employee of an aid organization working in Mozambique, has such passionate criticisms of development while at the same time continues to participate in that world himself, albeit on his own terms. “For an NGO,” he continued, “all solutions are money based. It’s like, the tail is wagging the dog” (Harris 2012). Doug’s sentiments, while perhaps more colorful, were repeated over and over throughout my discussions with expatriates working for INGOs.

In fact, this was not even the only animal analogy. An informant, Adrian Miles, a South-African whose American wife works for an INGO, described the relationship between USAID (The United States Agency for International Development) and INGOs as such: “USAID is like a feeder shark, with all the little feeder fish trailing behind…they are dependent on each other to survive, but ultimately the shark is more powerful and can control the little fish, and the little fish follow it around” (Miles 2012). Adrian felt that such a huge entity like USAID determines the moves of all the INGOs, and thus trickles down to the actions of smaller NGOs and associations who are supported by these INGOs, so that all of them are at the mercy of USAID’s dictates and in reality do not have much autonomy of their own.

These descriptions, while hyperbolic in nature, reflect the self-awareness and critical sentiments of many Americans and Europeans working for international NGOs in Mozambique. Expressing deep disapproval while continuing to be a component in that same system is a cultural trait that comprises this group. This indicator was articulated to me multiple times over my interviews with informants and participant observation.
Adrian’s wife, Dana Miles, whom I had met through the local Jewish community in Maputo, works for Absolute Return for Kids (ARK), a UK based NGO that works in the areas of education, health, and child protection. Dana is in her early thirties and has a two-year old son, Zachary. Originally from Wisconsin, she has lived and worked in Maputo for five years. She lives in a large home near the coast off of Avenida Mao Tse Tung, directly across the street from the tourist craft market that Carlos helped to establish. Dana had met Adrian during a vacation in Mozambique, and they were married at a resort in Inhambane, a popular Mozambican vacation spot for expats. The family has lived in Mozambique ever since, although Dana expressed a keen interest to return to the U.S. in one to two years.

Over lunch and a coffee, I spoke with Dana on the trials of working for an INGO in Mozambique and the flaws in the system itself. Dana seemed skeptical of the expatriate INGO on a few different levels; the inefficiency and money-driven nature of INGOs, the isolation of expatriates, and their luxurious lifestyle. “NGOs just have so much money,” she complained, “that they get…complacent. There’s a lack of efficiency and lack of thinking towards the future because there doesn’t necessarily have to be. It’s all about maintaining the status quo” (Miles 2012). Dana expressed her dislike of the need for INGOs to constantly refer to donor demands and the assurance of maintaining donor funding. “It’s enough to make you crazy!” she said with a smile, although it was clear that she was personally frustrated by this component of her job (Miles 2012).

“People are always worried about their next job,” she continued, “so they manipulate the system – you can make a lot more money abroad. You don’t pay for
housing, there’s no taxes. Plus you get other luxuries like maids and childcare. It’s all just a game…you have to know how to work the system” (2012). It was apparent that Dana herself knew how to work the system, but also felt disdainful towards the game she had to play. She also spoke of how there is not much integration with the Mozambican community, and that the INGO community tends to stick to themselves. With a note of distaste in her voice, she said, “Oh no, are you kidding? Expats love their isolation…it’s what they come here for” (Miles 2012)! While said in a joking manner, underlying her teasing tone there was a level of truth. She feels that in some ways, the expatriate population is here more for their own enjoyment than the betterment of the communities they work with. This includes the luxuries and the isolation afforded to them. In Maputo, they are able to maintain their Western lifestyles without becoming submersed in Mozambican culture. The irony inherent in her discourse became clear as she described her feelings toward the subject, as Dana herself participates in the activities that she deplores in others.

While I return to Dana in order to examine more of the characteristics of this group, she is also an excellent example of how the expatriate population views themselves in the INGO world in Maputo. They enjoy their prestigious positions and international lifestyle that they can only achieve in third world countries due to cheap labor and their comparatively high salaries, yet they are self-aware in their criticisms as well. This sentiment was also portrayed by Katherine Thompson, a program manager at an INGO who has dedicated her life to living abroad. Although from Phoenix, she plans to live permanently in Africa. Since her fiancé is from Swaziland they will most likely
make their permanent home there. She works at AWEPA (*European Parliamentarians with Africa*), the same organization as Alcinda from the last chapter. Like Dana, she has become skeptical and cynical about development work, but she continues participating in that system. Of all the expatriate informants I spoke with, Katherine had the most intense criticism and the most to say concerning the pratfalls of the development industry. She feels that it is essentially a business, and functions in order to accumulate wealth for a select few and to achieve political dominance:

[Development] is a way of wielding political influence. You can ask questions from the top to the bottom, and you’ll find things that disturb you along the way….it’s a pretend world where donors pretend to care, and the local people pretend to give a shit. And why? Because it’s an industry and in the end both sides are making money, but how does that help the Mozambican people overall? (Thompson 2012)

Here, Katherine is communicating her distaste for the industry side of development and the idea that the people involved, even expatriates like herself, are in an endless cycle of political influence, money-driven programs, and pretending in order to keep the cycle going. She also touched on how many people working for local associations in rural communities play the game as well, as was described in Chapter Four:

Proposals are what get people the money. And then they have this front – it’s almost like they are fronting a business and then doing something else behind the scenes. You do what you have to do to get your foot in the door and then go about doing things that are more meaningful to you afterwards, that help the communities themselves. Like if you’re working for orphans and vulnerable children, OVC, there’s always going to be an acronym. The problem being that it leads to a culture in which people don’t actually know what those words mean, the acronyms become just what you have to do to put in the proposal, you put the proposal in and then you get the money. (Thompson 2012)

Katherine’s sentiments reflect some of the observations made by my informants in
Manjacaze. There is a need to adapt to the system in order to negotiate for their own best interests and to receive much needed aid. This can be seen in local associations’ use of terminology such as “orphans and vulnerable children,” which was espoused as the mission of many local associations I came across. Since rural populations are so easily left out of the funding cycle, this is a necessity. From this excerpt, we can see that Katherine is well aware of these activities, and the idea that the communities that INGOs work with conform to the system as much as urban INGO employees do.

In addition, Katherine also seemed to disapprove of the motivations of expatriate INGO employees, the profits they accumulate, and the comfortable lifestyle they live in Maputo:

And it’s not just profiting, it’s like really, really profiting. Because you know what, I don’t live the same lifestyle as I do in other places. Here, you’re gonna have a maid, you’re gonna have guards. Everyone has the guard because it’s fashionable, and everyone has the empregada [maid] because you can, and it actually helps a lot. You can live a better life here than anywhere else in the world because the cost of labor is so cheap. (Thompson 2012)

Most Mozambicans do not consider the cost of living to be cheap in Maputo, but for many expatriates the cost of living and labor is comparatively cheap to living in the U.S. To compare, by including herself in the activities of expatriates working for INGO and their questionable motivation, Katherine is implying that although she has these criticisms, her disdain for the system and for the expat lifestyle do not deter her from working and living in that world herself.

My discussion with Katherine helped to elucidate the intensity of the criticisms expressed by some expatriates working for INGOs, so I decided to delve further to see if
this indicator was coincidental or prevalent in most expatriate discourse. To help answer this question, I turned to Anna Alpers, a young Dutch woman who is a contracted civil engineer working for an organization trying to improve water sanitation systems in Maputo. She had also lived in Botswana for many years working for an INGO there. Anna is a tall woman with a broad smile who laughs easily. Like Katherine, Dana, and Doug, Anna is critical of some expatriate activities in Maputo, but she also participates in the standard activities inherent in expatriate lifestyles such as traveling to touristic places on weekends and becoming involved almost exclusively with other expatriates. She did start off our conversation, however, with a bold critical statement:

“It’s a big mistake that people come in and look through Western glasses, and there’s a certain arrogance that [Westerners] think their system is right and that Mozambicans should live like us. Development work shouldn’t exist if Mozambicans don’t ask for it, but the money is just flooding in. We come up with our own ideas about development and that everyone should have things like water, and we have to ask, are people ready? Why not wait for people to give the sign that they’re ready? We expect Mozambique to start from nothing and reach that level in ten years time. That’s why it doesn’t work, because they are not motivated because it’s being pushed upon them. (Alpers 2012)

It is clear that Anna is quite frustrated with the system of development itself. She critiques how it functions, its motivating influences, and the philosophical reasoning for implementing development projects in Mozambique. These ideas can be related to Escobar’s critiques of development. Namely, that the Third World is synonymous with poverty and that the only logical step is the intervention of Western nations to spur development and economic growth (Escobar 1995:90). At the same time, however, Anna is working on a development project in Maputo. She partly blames the Mozambican people for development obstacles, despite her deep distrust of the ideology behind her
chosen profession. Anna’s perspective connects to ideas concerning the racialization of
development, and how development is often viewed in distinct categories of Western and
non-Western, black and white (Loftsdóttir 2009). Anna’s discourse reveals that she
views Mozambicans clearly in one camp and Western expatriates in the other, with
Mozambicans being partly responsible for the difficulties she and others encounter
in the development field. Although Anna’s statements concerning the readiness of
Mozambicans to accept aid may and her thoughts on whether or not Mozambicans should
or should not receive aid from Western nations place too much blame on development
concerns on Mozambicans, Anna is an example of one Western expatriate who questions
the validity of the industry she is participating in.

“It’s just very Mozambican”

Despite the vast criticisms expressed by expatriates working for INGOs in
Mozambique, many individuals still articulate perceptions and opinions that work to
directly affect how Mozambicans fit into the development world, namely how
Mozambicans must conform to a Western ideological paradigm in order to succeed
within their organization. These perceptions are another trend that are essential to
understanding not only the culture of this sphere but also how it influences the culture of
others as well.

To explore this indicator in great depth, I sought to obtain interviews with not
only entry level expatriate employees working for INGOs but also individuals who had
worked within the system for quite some time. Luckily, after locating Save the Children’s
headquarters in Maputo and getting in touch with their Office Manager, I was able to schedule an interview with Bill Lesuwsiki, the Country Director for Save the Children USA. Living in Mozambique since 1998, Bill has worked his way up in the organization. The data garnered from his interview helps to illustrate the contradictions in both Mozambican and expatriate discourse. Bill’s interview also exemplifies how powerful individuals within INGOs can highly influence the types of skills that are valued in Mozambicans who work for development agencies.

The Save the Children office is located off of Avenida Mao Tse Tung, where many INGOs also have their offices. Upon arrival I was ushered into the waiting area, which was bustling with various staff members, each with papers, pens, and briefcases in hand and chatting animatedly with their coworkers. I was led to Bill’s office by his secretary, and I followed her up and down staircases and around several corners, until finally we reached his pleasantly air conditioned office. In his late 40s, Bill is a calmly spoken man who articulates his experiences and opinions with confidence. Like so many expatriates who work for INGOs, he is a former Peace Corps volunteer in Malawi and has traveled extensively through Africa with various development projects. Bill first introduced the idea of cultural conflicts within the workplace in Maputo by explaining that working for a large international NGO like Save the Children is very much like working within a multicultural work environments as some of the cultures in the workplace clash. Although clearly attempting to be diplomatic when describing these clashes, he then went on to describe how and why this occurs:

It is always a balancing act between Western viewpoints and Mozambican viewpoints concerning how to run a business: the speed at which expectations are met, which can be a huge friction and a huge
concern, and establishing indicators of results that can be demonstrated empirically, which donors expect. This can be a tough nut to crack. The difference there lies in being exposed to Western education and what

Westerners are taught from preschool up – multitasking, making tough choices, reliability. Making decisions is an issue. (Lesuwski 2012)

Bill illustrates that although he understands how and why Mozambicans have different values and skills than Westerners, it is still a huge problem and concern when there are cultural conflicts between Mozambicans and expatriates, particularly when Mozambicans cannot keep up the fast paced development world. Bill’s discourse, while not replicating colonial discourse exactly, has a similar tone and implication. Mozambican culture presents problems in the INGO workplace, and thus only a Western education can help alleviate the problem. Bill’s discourse is similar to what Joseph Hanlon describes as the recolonization of Mozambique in the form of international development (Hanlon 1991:1). Hanlon says, “this is not *neocolonialism*; it is the *recolonization* of Mozambique…If history does not repeat itself exactly, the similarities with the colonial era are nevertheless striking” (Hanlon 1991:1). Although there is no formal legislation dictating that Mozambicans behave in a certain way in order to be considered for certain position, informants like Bill and others make it clear that in reality this is the case.

Bill later described how the decision-making issues stem from Mozambican colonial history, when Portuguese appointed governors made all the decisions. This sentiment reflects the idea that Westerners working for INGOs are frustrated with the conduct of their Mozambican coworkers and thus find ways to understand what they see as irrational or aggravating behavior. This behavior includes the reluctance to make decisions, voice opinions, and difficulty in prioritizing Western time restraints.
According to some of my Mozambican informants such as Carlos, however, INGOs normally do not appoint Mozambicans for high positions either, reinforcing the idea that foreigners make all the decisions and strengthening Hanlon’s recolonization argument.

Another point of conflict Bill addressed was the issue of lack of risk-taking and communication amongst Mozambicans:

Western business gurus talk about the delegation of tasks (to try and resolve the problem of decision and risk-taking), but this idea just doesn’t account for the fear of decision and fear of risk-taking here. Mozambicans never want to say no for fear of upsetting a foreigner – they might lose face if they do. People avoid conflict by not communicating. Westerners tend to face conflict head on, but Mozambicans tend to avoid conflict. Save the Children makes an effort to have workshops and group discussions about conflict resolution, but I haven’t really seen a dramatic change over the years. (Lesuwski 2012)

From these comments, Bill once again relates the idea that from his vantage point, expatriates working for INGOs have workplace habits and culture that is much more easily adaptable to the developed world. Mozambicans struggle with the basics of a Western work culture and this presents major problems in the workplace. He also makes sure to point out that Save the Children attempts to alter this behavior, but they mostly remain frustrated with these cultural tendencies. Thus, it seems clear that if a Mozambican did happen to adapt and conform to more Western behavioral patterns, they would be rewarded and promoted. In other words, if a Mozambican individual has the cultural capital of adapting to a Western business mindset, they are valued within the international development industry.

Again, this idea can be critiqued as being quite similar to the *assimilado* concept
and parallels activities that occurred during the colonial era. Whether he realizes it or not, Bill is advocating for cultural change that is a recreation of colonial policies (Escobar 1995; Hanlon 1991) that also promotes Western ideas of progress (Harrison 2006). The attitudes expressed by Bill reflect Escobar’s critiques of development activities that continually reinforce the divide between the reformer and the reformed, the aid giver and the aid receiver, thus making the Third World seem less accomplished or humane (Escobar 1995:90). Bill’s statements are representative of Save the Children’s position that imply the need to continually reform their Mozambican employees, and that working with Mozambicans is a frustrating reality. As these sentiments become more apparent, the motivation behind the adoption of Western behaviors and lifestyle by Carlos, Armando, and Filipe described in the previous chapter becomes obvious.

Bill, in fact, is certainly not the only expatriate INGO employee who communicated this perspective to me. Anna, my Dutch informant, was particularly forthright about cultural difficulties in the workplace between foreigners and Mozambicans. She laughed about how she’s received marriage proposals from two of her coworkers, but other complications were much more serious for her:

I get frustrated when they [Mozambicans] say that they’re going to do something but then just don’t, they don’t follow through. I would much rather they just tell me they can’t do it! People make promises but they don’t carry them out. They just don’t say anything about not being able to do it because they feel that it’s not polite and just keep quiet. It’s just very Mozambican. (Alpers 2012)

This excerpt illustrates some contradictions in expatriate discourse. INGO expatriates criticize Mozambican reactions to authority, but at the same time expect that expatriates are in positions of power over Mozambicans, thus reinforcing this behavior. Using
language like “it’s just very Mozambican” and “frustrated” or “frustration,” it was clear that Anna equates typical Mozambican behavior with what she considers to be exasperating behavior in the workplace. She often found it difficult to work in an environment with conflicting ideas and values concerning work ethic and behavior. In this statement, she lists several different frustrations, including lack of follow through, a paralyzing fear of authority, and issues with getting things done on time.

Another informant, Kyle Palm, who works for USAID as a development consultant, helped to confirm the idea that expatriate frustration fuels the type of Mozambicans that are hired and promoted within an INGO. Kyle is in his mid 40s and is now living with his wife and young child at the U.S. Government Compound in Maputo, off of Aveidia Kenneth Kauna and Avenuea Julius Nyere. Open and honest about his perspectives, he shared some of his experiences working for USAID throughout Africa and his current position working for the Ministry of Health in Maputo. Through his experiences with USAID and as a former Peace Corps volunteer, Kyle has come in contact with many INGOs in Mozambique and shared his perspectives on how Mozambicans function within the system. He described to me how USAID can cancel projects at any time, so this “does not exactly contribute to feelings of job security [for Mozambicans]” (Palm 2012). He mentioned that this can be extremely stressful especially for Mozambicans who work for INGOs and who have short contracts. Despite the stress, however, he also pointed out that for many Mozambicans, working with an INGO is still one of the best options. According to him there are not many other job options in Maputo and job security is almost nonexistent:

With my job at the Ministry I know a lot of Mozambicans who are
constantly searching for jobs within INGOs – which are seen as highly desirable. I know someone who is very skilled and capable and I think he’ll find a job with an INGO in no time. If you have the skills and ability you’ll find a job, because that’s kind of rare, for the most part. (Palm 2012)

Kyle is implying that although working for an INGO can be stressful for a Mozambican, the individuals that have the skills, or the cultural capital, to excel within the development world have no problem finding a secure position as they are seen as rare and difficult to find. One example of this kind of individual is Armando, who has been promoted within his organization. Thus, once again it becomes clear that if a Mozambican wishes to succeed in the development world, they must first alter their behaviors to fit accepted western paradigms.

Like Kyle, Dana also confirmed the idea that INGOs are looking for highly skilled Mozambicans to work for them, meaning individuals who have more of a Western skill set than other Mozambicans. Dana, the woman described above who is married to Adrian, is the Country Director for ARC and is thus responsible for choosing which Mozambicans to hire. When asked what kind of individual she looks for in an employee, she responded that she is looking for a particular skill set: ability to work in a fast paced environment, ability to present themselves in a professional manger, highly motivated, and ability to work autonomously. She mentioned that once someone is hired, she puts a lot of time and effort into helping individuals alter their behavior to fit these expected behaviors if they have not done so already. It is sometimes difficult, she said, to accomplish set goals and tasks in Mozambique. Change can take a long time because people are often resistant to it (Miles 2012). From an outsider’s perspective it seems obvious that people would be resistant to change as it is their culture and worldview that
are the subject of that change, but from Dana’s perspective this is a necessary and prudent alteration.

As someone who is responsible for hiring individuals to work for an INGO, Dana helps to create and sculpt the culture of Mozambicans who work for development agencies and the idea that they must conform to workplace norms in order to be hired or excel. This perspective ignores some of the difficulties felt by Mozambicans, who face impediments in the form of transportation, cultural expectations, and access to education. For example, *chapas*, a type of mini-bus or van that is the main form of transportation in the city, are notoriously unreliable and overcrowded. It may take hours to travel from Maputo to Matola via *chapa*, which is only about 12 kilometers away. Despite the problems with the *chapa*, however, the majority of Mozambicans in Maputo rely on it to go in and out of the city center. Thus, although Mozambicans do have differing perspectives of time as opposed to expatriates, from a practical standpoint it is often simply difficult to arrive according to a set schedule when using a *chapa*. As it is quite rare for an expatriate to even consider using the *chapa*, there is a lack of understanding for how most Mozambicans get around the city.

In the next section, I analyze how despite critical perspectives of the development world, the majority of expatriates attempt to replicate their American and European lifestyle, but at luxury levels. This particular trait was expressed to me in numerous forms. It was described in interviews, observed daily in the shopping malls and cafés, and observed while participating in various expatriate activities in Maputo. For many expatriates, they can achieve levels of comfort and status in their lifestyles in Maputo that
they cannot obtain in their home country, but at the expense of low income Mozambicans who work for them. Typically, gate guards earn around $70 per month from their expatriate employers, and *empregadas* earn somewhere between $100 and $200 per month (“Cost of Living in Mozambique” 2013) Although expatriate employers tend to pay their hired help more than Mozambican employers (“Expat Women Living in Mozambique,” 2013) these rates are still low for expatriates who are earning anywhere between $4,000 $8,000 per month, depending on their position (“Cost of Living in Mozambique,” 2013). Thus, as I continued to interview, observe, and participate in the expatriate development world in Maputo, it became clear that the trait of recreation of the Western comforts of home, embrace of the luxuries available in Mozambique, and exploitation of Mozambican workers was significant to their relationship to Mozambicans and perspective of their position in Maputo.

“Let’s go to Coconuts!”

It is a Friday night in Maputo. Restaurants are welcoming their late-night customers, taxicabs are prowling the streets, the clubs and bars are ushering in their early bird clientele, and my American friends intend to head out on the town.

“Let’s go to Coconuts!” yells Molly, an American INGO employee who has invited all of her friends over to her high-rise apartment on Avenida Julius Nyere for an evening barbeque. The group is entirely American, and American rap music is blaring on the stereo. A few of the guests are enjoying their dinner and a beer out on the porch, which looks out over the now darkened Indian Ocean. Molly had informed me previously that the apartment, which she shares with another American who also works for an
international NGO, is paid for through funds provided by their organizations. Their rent is $1,000 per month, and with two bedrooms, two bathrooms, a large living room and kitchen, and a beautiful view of the ocean, it is certainly one of the more comfortable living spaces I have encountered in Maputo thus far.

Currently, there is a dispute as to what the night’s club destination will be. Coconuts, a club that caters mainly to foreigners working in Maputo, or Xima, a club that caters more to a Mozambican clientele. The anecdotal discourse concerning Coconuts essentially describes it as a place where Americans and Europeans go to experience Mozambican nightlife without actually interacting much with Mozambicans. It is seen as more of a expatriate gathering than anything else. Xima, on the other hand, features only local musicians, and the club is usually packed with young Mozambicans looking to dance. After a few arguments for each side, Coconuts eventually wins, and everyone clears out and jumps into a cab on the way to the club.

This glimpse into American activities in Maputo illustrates the priorities, expectations, and perceptions of the young expatriate population living in Maputo, which include an emphasis on enjoying Western-style nightlife activities with fellow white foreigners. Most of these young professionals are between the ages of 21 and 35, with some of them interning at an INGO or government development agencies and others staying in Mozambique for years at a time. An essential aspect of this group of expatriates living in Maputo includes the recreation of an American or European lifestyle, and utilization of certain comforts that are available to expatriates in Maputo but not necessarily back home, such as the service of maids, cooks, gardeners and guards.
Regardless of any hesitations they might feel towards the ideology of development or frustrations at the workplace with Mozambicans, the majority of expatriates I encountered nevertheless take full advantage of the economic and lifestyle opportunities available in Maputo.

As seen through descriptions of the gathering at Elliott’s apartment in the Introduction and Molly’s party above, I was initially introduced to this indicator through participant observation and social circles. Elliott’s party, with its Mexican food, Trader Joe’s hot sauce, beer pong games, and American music, truly exemplifies the idea of recreating a Western atmosphere in Maputo. As I delved deeper into these social circles, however, I realized that this characteristic was not relegated only to a younger generation of expatriates recreating Western activities like parties, but that the scope spanned much further to the everyday lifestyles and activities that expatriates participate in while living and working in Mozambique.

I was able to witness the depth of this trend firsthand when I was invited to housesit for Dana, the American Country Director of ARC, whom I described earlier. As my interview with Dana was drawing to a close, our discussion turned more personal as she explained how she and her husband were going away for the weekend. They were going to Nelspruit, a South African town, to shop for groceries and clothing that could only be obtained across the border. Nelspruit is considered to be more Western than Maputo, and it is a popular travel destination for expatriates to purchase commodities they feel they cannot find in Mozambique. She asked if I was interested in staying at their home for the weekend, and I took the opportunity to experience another side of Maputo.
The family lives in a posh neighborhood near the center of Maputo and very close to the ocean, so I was not exactly resistant to the idea.

As the Country Director of ARC, Dana’s home, house service, and some travel to and from the United States are funded by her organization. She had informed me of this during our interview, but it was not until reaching her home did I fully realize the significance of this fact. Costing $5,000 per month to rent, the home was sophisticatedly decorated, had three large bedrooms, three bathrooms, a very large kitchen, living room, dining room, a large television with surround sound, and a lovely backyard, complete with a garden and play set for her son.

The entrance to the house was kept by a gate guard, typical for the nicer neighborhoods in Maputo, and the family employed one gardener, and two empregadas (maids) to watch after their son, cook, and clean. As stated above, the typical rate for gate guards working for expatriates is approximately $70 per month, and empregadas earn somewhere between $100 and $200 per month (“Cost of Living in Mozambique” 2013). The economic gaps between expatriates and the Mozambicans working for them represents a dynamic that places all of the power into the hands of expatriates. This was illustrated almost immediately upon entering the home, when Dana became involved in a dispute concerning the manner in which her son’s peanut butter and jelly sandwiches were made for the trip. Apparently one of the empregadas had not made them as instructed, and Dana was frustrated. Yelling in Portuguese, Dana was obviously quite aggravated at this mistake, but when the empregada began remaking the packed meal she relented. Dana is fluent in Portuguese, as she has been in Mozambique for a few years

210
and has made an effort to learn the language. Dana’s skills in Portuguese mitigated her efforts to reprimand the empregadas and make her wishes clear, reinforcing her power over and gap between them. Continuing the tour of the home, Dana instructed me on how to use the television, DVD, and DVR in the living room, and then the family was off to Nelspruit. The empregadas did not stay to cook for me, but the gate guard remained at his post.

My experience at Dana’s house illustrates the nature of this particular trait. Expatriate families, where at least one member is working for an INGO, can and do recreate their comfortable Western lifestyles in Maputo and exploit the Mozambican help. They can even extend beyond what their comfort levels are at home. Despite Dana’s complaint that “NGOs just have so much money that they get…complacent” (Miles 2012) she fully participates and enjoys the money that her particular INGO provides for her life in Maputo. Indeed, Dana’s family is not atypical or even unusual, as I would come to learn.

Through further interviews and observations I garnered information that added to the homogeneity of this specific characteristic. My interview with Kyle, the man who works for USAID described above, exemplified some of these ideas as well. Although Kyle himself is an expatriate living a comfortable lifestyle in Maputo, he did say that he finds it somewhat ironic that people want to live an exotic life abroad but then recreate their American-style lives in Mozambique, explaining that many of them were initially drawn to the idea of working internationally because of the exotic experiences they might have (Palm 2012). Despite these observations, Kyle and his family live in the U.S.
Government living compound, a gated community where he feels comfortable letting his children run around and play with the other expatriate children. Kyle delved a bit deeper into how this process had happened for him:

When I was younger and traveling I would always walk everywhere and try to stay at normal hotels in the middle of downtown. Then I started experiencing what it was like to travel as an expat working for the USG, and I was initially shocked. The hotels were minimum $200 per night, and I would always be driven around in nice white SUVs and live a life of luxury. Now I’ve adapted to this lifestyle and place more of an emphasis on things like having a house with a view. I have to say that I’m now fully integrated in the expat life in Maputo…some expats have some social relationships with Mozambicans, but most are isolated in their own expatriate environment. (Palm 2012)

Although Kyle was initially hesitant to engage in more of the typical activities and lifestyles of expatriates, he eventually succumbed to the pressure of conforming to what is typical with expatriates; not only the recreation of Western lifestyles, but an enhancement in that lifestyle as well. As the expatriate community grows, it becomes easier for those living in Maputo to become more and more isolated.

Kyle also described how leisure activities for foreigners depends mostly on age group. Younger, unattached people tend to frequent the nightlife and bar scene (i.e., Coconuts), while older generations are more likely to patronize expensive restaurants, value activities like play dates for their children, or visit bars that cater to an older crowd. Both young and old, however, do typically stick together, and although some may date Mozambicans or sustain casual friendships, the majority of their core social group is American or European. Some of the components of my interview with Kyle highlight the connection between expatriate behavior in Mozambique and Edward Said’s descriptions
of conceptions of the Orient that include “exoticism, glamour, mystery, and promise” (Said 1978:340). Although expatriates envision working in Africa as an exotic and glamorous place to travel, in reality this conception is enacted in abstraction only and not in their everyday lives. Although Kyle does not currently work for an INGO and instead is employed through USAID, his discourse reflect the experiences of many individuals working for an INGO in Mozambique, as many in Kyle’s social circle are employed by aid organizations. Indeed, his remarks confirm my observations of this lifestyle as well, and contribute to the idea that this trait is an essential perspective of the culture of foreigners working for INGOs in Maputo.

“Who do you know?” “Where have you been?”

The recreation and exploitation of a luxurious way of life in Maputo is not the only characteristic concerning INGO expatriate values and motivations. Another trait that became clear to me via observations and interviews was the way in which these individuals placed a high emphasis on career-motivated travel and adventure rather than a passion for Mozambique itself. These ideas were conveyed to me consistently throughout my fieldwork in Maputo, mostly through direct observations and interviews. From my data, I concluded that there is a competition hidden in the meta messages of the discourse of these individuals that compared how many countries someone had worked in. According to how someone described themselves, it seemed as if one were considered better or more respectable if they had worked for a development agency in more numerous and dangerous countries.
One individual who portrayed this sentiment to me quite clearly was Rachel Johnson. She works for DIALAGO, which concentrates on governance issues in Mozambique. In her early 40s, she has traveled much of the world working for international NGOs. She is slightly distinct from some of her expatriate counterparts because she holds some disdain for individuals who live in American compounds or who do not appreciate Mozambican culture. She and her husband, however, do take advantage of the lifestyles available to them here. They live in an apartment funded by Rachel’s INGO, they go running and biking in Maputo each day, they hold parties at their apartment often with expatriate-only crowds, and they have an empregada.

Nevertheless, Rachel is surely accustomed to harsher ways of living abroad, as she has traveled to many dangerous countries during times of conflict. During our interview she mentioned that she has worked in Pakistan, Afghanistan, and other high-risk countries. She did not choose Mozambique as a work destination specifically; the opportunity came up and she took it. Rachel does not seem particularly happy to be living here because she feels that life is too easy in Mozambique and she is only planning on being in the country for another six months. As a veteran of travel and adventure development, Rachel gave the impression that she was somewhat bored with life in Maputo, saying “there isn’t much happening here that’s all too uncomfortable. It’s very easy to live easily here…it’s sort of like the training wheels of Africa” (Johnson 2012). This statement illustrates that in some ways, Rachel is judgmental of Mozambique and the easy lifestyles expats can live here. She preferred her dangerous development work in the Middle East instead. Although Rachel’s sentiments are particularly apparent, she is
one of many foreigners who work for international NGOs that expressed this idea to me.

I first observed the general discourse surrounding this particular characteristic through participant observation at Elliott’s party. I spoke with eight individuals at length during the course of that gathering, and seven out of the eight conversations began with introductory questions pertaining to one’s travel status. After initial introductions, the typical discourse involved listing the litany of countries where the individual has lived and worked, and then inquiring after my experiences. Dominating the general conversation were stories involving the various development projects and the different adventures one has had while traveling. When asked why someone had become involved with development in the first place, the majority of the answers I received reflected what one informant described to me as, “I saw so much poverty in the world, and I wanted to help.” It seemed as if the more prestigious the organization one had worked with, the more status they gained in the group. The sense I got from my conversations with these individuals is that this status mattered. Someone who had no travel or development experience might not feel entirely comfortable in this social circle.

During our interview, Dana confirmed this idea. Although a part of this culture, she has observed this type of behavior and discourse during her own experiences in the Mozambican development world:

Everybody knows everybody – reputation goes far here. It’s a small world with not much integration in the Mozambican community, so it’s really a lot of ‘who do you know?’ and ‘where have you traveled?’ It isn’t just restricted to Mozambique, but it does happen a lot here. (Miles 2012)
In order to succeed in the development field, is very important in order to possess social capital that allows access to benefits. Thus, there is a need and desire to compete with each other in order to secure one’s reputation and status. Expatriates must maintain a positive reputation and compete for status in terms of influential people or organizations they are familiar with and places they have traveled.

Jessica Gundersen, a young American currently working for Pathfinder, has observed this phenomenon in Mozambique as well. She conveyed to me that she has always wanted to work and live abroad and she has been able to realize that dream through her position with Pathfinder. She explained that she had not learned Portuguese very well yet (she has been in the country for about six months), as almost everyone speaks English at the Pathfinder office and she did not prepare well before arriving in the country (Gundersen 2012). Living on one of the most foreign-populated areas of Maputo, she does not have much of a need to learn Portuguese and is able to function quite well in restaurants and cafés with only basic Portuguese. As a former Peace Corps volunteer, her passion is geared more toward international travel as opposed to Mozambique specifically.

This was a trait that I noticed often amongst expatriate INGO employees, particularly amongst people who were scheduled to be in Mozambique for only six months or so at a time. With Jessica as an example, there was not much of an expectation for them to seriously learn Portuguese. This can be contrasted with the need for Mozambicans to learn and speak English fluently before receiving employment. While waiting at the offices of Save the Children, I started a conversation with a male employee
who was answering phones at the front desk. He explained to me that he was not very skilled in English yet, and that he was working hard and taking classes in order to improve. He said that he could not receive a higher paying position at an INGO before he could speak English more fluently. In fact, he was quite eager to practice his English with me. This anecdote provides an example of the contradiction in expectations between expatriate and Mozambican INGO employees.

Despite her own participation in this cultural group in Maputo, Jessica is also self-reflective and observant on the attitudes and values of fellow expatriates. She feels that many individuals are self-aggrandizing in their discourse concerning their travels:

> Everyone on Facebook loves to post where the latest exotic place they’ve been to is, all the work they’re doing to help poor people around the world. They post pictures with little black children who they are supposedly saving from poverty. And then their friends comment on how wonderful they are for doing this, how adventurous. It’s mostly a competition, an act. And most expat aid workers fit the typical description of go getters who are out to save the world. That goes on here all the time. And the celebrity culture on development – now that’s posh and popular. (Gundersen 2012)

Although Jessica works for a development agency in an African country she has observed some of the same tendencies that became a trend in my data. Foreigners working for INGOs in Maputo seem mostly concerned with furthering their country count and adventure status as opposed to having a passion and a specific reason for traveling to Mozambique. Jessica also touches on the idea that being seen as charitable and giving has become trendy within celebrity culture, as shown by celebrities who, for example, visibly support the United Nation’s Millennium Development Goals (“Celebrities join push for action on the Millennium Development Goals” 2010). This behavior relates to James Pfeiffer’s observations of the relationship between expatriates and Mozambicans, in
which he describes how aid professionals “moved from contract to contract throughout the Third World and expressed no particular interest in Mozambique itself,” preferring instead to compete with each other for exotic prestige (Pfeiffer 2002:729). Being attracted to the exotic also relates to Said’s ideas of exoticism and Orientalism in which the West creates an exotic and alluring representation of non-Western places (Said 1978). Reflecting on how they perceive themselves and their functions within Mozambican development and society, the majority of expatriates working for INGOs in Mozambique that I encountered fit firmly into this framework.

Conclusion

As illustrated through the data gathered by means of observations and interviews, the group of expatriates working for international NGOs in Mozambique is filled with contradictory perceptions, discourse, and behaviors. The trends in this group include; a) a critical stance on the ideology and practices of development in general but a continuing participation in the system; b) intense frustrations with workplace cultural clashes and an attempt to influence their Mozambican coworkers to convert to Western behavioral paradigms; c) a recreation of Western lifestyles and exploitation of luxuries available to foreigners living in Mozambique, and; d) a high value and competition placed on where you have traveled, who you know, and your status as a development worker. In addition, despite the high value placed on adventure, and travel, the majority of my informants enjoyed their comfortable and luxurious life in Maputo, living in isolation from Mozambican populations and culture. Many of them do not speak Portuguese well and
have not made a serious attempt at learning the language. These contradictions are vital to understanding this particular group and how it functions in relation to the other two: Mozambicans working for INGOs and rural populations working with local associations in Manjacaze. The cultural characteristics examined here are composed of how this group views and interacts with Mozambicans, as well as how they understand their own situation in life according to their unique positions.

It is clear that like the previous group, expatriates working for INGOs are also affected by the wider forces of globalization, and what the John and Jean Comaroff describe as the undeniable power of consumerism that is essential to understanding globalization in the 21st century (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001). They speak of the invisible hand that dictates flows of capital and is a consumer-motivated force, propelling globalized forms of wealth accumulation and consumerism (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001:25). In this case, however, conspicuous consumption has more to do with consumption of the exotic and fitting in with the standards of the expatriate community as opposed to Mozambican motivations of recreating Western lifestyles. As explained to me by informants and during conversations with expatriates living in Mozambique, many aid workers travel often to vacation destinations in and around Mozambique, while visits to rural areas where most of the aid recipients live occurs infrequently. It is seen as abnormal if an aid worker does not participate in these behaviors, thus reinforcing the idea that the consumption by expatriates is fueled by already set standards. These behaviors, in turn, have a high impact on the lifestyles of Mozambicans in Maputo who are aspiring to emulate the behavior of INGO employees in an attempt to access power.
Not only is this “invisible hand” seen in the conspicuous consumption of expatriates in Maputo, however, it can also be considered in some ways to be the motivating force behind the perspectives of frustration and mistrust of INGOs in Mozambique by all three classes of agents described. John and Jean Comaroff argue that at the Millennial moment, there is a loss of human integrity experienced in the spreading commodification of persons, bodies, cultures, and histories, in the substitution of quantity for quality, abstraction for substance, due in large part to this consumer-motivated force (Comaroff and Comaroff 2001:25). Many of the frustrations expressed to me by informants in Manjacaze and Maputo alike included a critique of the quality of INGO programs, a lack of cultural understanding, and the exploitation of persons and cultures for financial gain. Individuals who espoused these critiques were people like Carlos and Armando whose discourse included phrases such as “poverty is a big business in Mozambique.” Thus, we can see that the “invisible hand” and globalization as John and Jean Comaroff see it not only affects the activities and perspectives of expatriates, but are highly influential on both rural and urban Mozambicans as well.

In addition, I argue that some of the behaviors, perspectives, and activities observed amongst the foreign aid worker population in Maputo are neocolonial in nature, and represent a recreation of colonialism as well, or recolonization as Joseph Hanlon argues (Hanlon 1991). Neocolonialism, a term used to describe the continued existence of colonial relationships in today’s world, is reflected here in the form of hegemonic cultural dominance that influences the activities of Mozambicans. By recreating Western lifestyles, taking advantage of the economic opportunities available to them in Maputo,
and participating in an affluent lifestyle, expatriate INGO employees are setting a precedent for how Mozambicans must act if they wish to participate within their globalized system. As shown, Americans and Europeans espouse much frustration when dealing with Mozambican coworkers who have not converted to a Western cultural paradigm of valuing a capitalist skill set. They are exercising neocolonial dominance over these populations by compelling Mozambicans to convert to Western behaviors in order to succeed in the development system. The argument for recolonization is strengthened when one compares the situation today with the colonial precedent set before independence, particularly the *assimilado* legislation enacted by the Portuguese. By rewarding those Mozambicans who are more Western in behavior, INGOs are recreating colonial policies.

These behaviors by expatriates are also neocolonial in nature because they are continuing the existence of power dynamics between “West” and “East,” dominator and dominated, that was essential to a colonial era mindset. Achille Mbembe and James Ferguson suggest that classic perceptions of Africa as the “other” continue to serve as a mechanism for the West to declare its difference from the rest of the world and define Africa through a series of problems and failings (Ferguson 2006:2; Mbembe 2001:228). If Africa, from the perspective of the West, can been seen as a failed continent that is in stark contrast to the success of the West, then justification for the intervention of INGOs and development can follow. This intervention occurs not only in the implementation of aid programs, but in the process of attempting to alter the culture of Mozambicans who wish to participate in the system. This is seen in Bill Lesuweki’s interview when he
described how Save the Children attempts to change the behavior of their Mozambican employees and from the testimonies of individuals like Dana who only hire Mozambicans who can adjust to Western time schedules.

This showcases what Lawrence Harrison describes as the need to change cultural behavior before positive development can take place. Like many of the international NGOs I observed and employees I interviewed, he equates progress with Western-style values of capitalism. A progress-prone worldview includes an emphasis on rationality, achievement based on merit, value in the individual, saving, planning, and time (Harrison 2006:97). By encouraging their Mozambican employees to adhere to these qualities, INGOs are promoting the type of culture change that Harrison endorses. Escobar provides a critique to this behavior and questions the idea that natives must sooner or later be reformed and civilized. He says that this attempt at reform from an INGO perspective continually reinforced the separation between the reformers and those who are to be reformed, and keeps alive the idea that the Third World is inferior (Escobar 1995:90). This separation can be connected to Mbembe and Ferguson’s argument of the continuation of the East/West polemic (Ferguson 2006; Mbembe 2001), and to Loftsdóttir’s critique of the racialization of development that divides and categorizes the development field (Loftsdóttir 2009). Escobar, Ferguson, and Mbembe provide a contrast to Harrison’s argument for cultural change as the key to successful development that is shared by many of my informants in Maputo.

In accordance with the power of international aid agencies to alter the culture of
the populations they work with, the idea of horizontal governance as described by Ferguson and Gupta (2002) are instrumental to understanding the effects of INGOs and their expatriate employees on Mozambican culture. Horizontal governance, as opposed to the traditional understanding of vertical governance, can be understood as the process by which INGOs are welcomed into the functioning and stabilizing processes of Mozambique, not just in their programmatic functions but in their cultural impositions as well. Thus government forces, which have previously been the naturalizing and governing entities that persuade populations of proper cultural conduct and mores, are now being increasingly displaced by international NGOs and international influences. Expatriates working for international NGOs in Mozambique do much to influence those values, activities, and consumptions that Mozambicans must convert to in order to be successful in a world increasingly dominated by the horizontal naturalizing power of INGOs.

Despite the incredible influence that the expatriate INGO population has over the Mozambican groups, I have found that there is indeed some surprising overlap in how foreigners negotiate and perceive the development system. First and foremost, a critical stance on the ideology, practices, and sustainability of international NGOs is present in all three groups. While they are not necessarily the same critiques, all three groups are quite skeptical of the role of development in Mozambique despite their participation in it. At the same time, however, as the groups are dependent on development for funding, employment, or increasing their career status, they also submit to the system of development and proceed to participate. In addition, the traits described are also used to
negotiate between the groups in order to work for their own best interests. Whether or not these attempts are successful, however, have to do with the levels of cultural capital possessed by each group and whether or not they can access the social capital in the development field.

In the next chapter, I reexamine some of these cultural traits and how well the groups are able to access the social capital in the development field according to varying levels of cultural capital. I more closely examine the relationship between these three classes of agents and their positions in the field. In addition, we consider the significance of this case study as compared to general trends within international development and look towards the future for how our understanding of how these groups can contribute to potential improvements in development practices.
CHAPTER SEVEN: CONCLUSION

Walking through Maputo near the hustle and bustle of Avenida Vladmir Lenine and Mao Tse Tung, past the affluent neighborhoods of Sommerschield, and Polana Cimento, offices of international NGOs are found amidst homes and apartment buildings, dotting the streets with their signs. From these offices men and women, Westerners and Mozambicans alike, stride purposefully in and out of the entrances. Inside posters and pictures of women and children cover the walls, with program goals, accomplishments, and mission statements clear for all to see. Meetings, multi-national phone conferences, and goals set by country and program directors dictate what type of aid will go to these individuals in the posters, and what they must do to receive it. After work, the employees of the INGO return home to their families or friends; American staff members might return to the U.S. government compound, or to a home paid for by the organization, while Mozambican staff members may drive their Mercedes or Lexus back to their apartments or homes in Matola, grateful for a renewed contract or promotion. In rural Mozambique, meanwhile, members of a CBO are for the most part unaware of the complexities and cultural dynamics occurring in Maputo that determine if their organization will continue to receive funding or if their children will be fed for another year.
The lives of expatriate employees working for INGOs, their Mozambican coworkers, and rural Mozambicans working with community based organizations are all inextricably linked. In the proceeding chapters, I analyzed various characteristics pertaining to these groups in order to understand how individuals in the group perceive and interact with issues concerning development in Mozambique. In this chapter, I will take this analysis a step further and expand upon Bourdieu’s theoretical model of cultural production to describe how the three groups or agents (Bourdieu 1993) employ their cultural capital that determines their position in the development field. In addition, I will examine potential next steps forward in terms of how this study fits into the wider paradigm of development and anthropology, the limitations of this study, and potential for future research. To review, the three groups described represent three classes of agents who are all attempting to derive maximum benefits from development in Mozambique. Certain cultural traits deriving from *habitus* and cultural capital indicate whether or not an agent can access the social capital in that field and thus be included in the benefits of those networks. These traits and their indications of social capital indicate broader cultural expectations.

Perhaps the most pronounced indication of whether or not an individual is able to access social capital in the development field is whether or not they have the cultural capital of adhering to Western conceptions of time and efficiency. As the data has shown, Mozambicans who modify their behavior to conform to time-oriented deadlines and office behavior tend to excel over Mozambicans who have more difficulty doing so. Western conceptions of time that dominate the functioning of international NGOs and
that most American and Europeans are raised with has its origins during the Industrial Revolution, when “clock time” became the measurement by which workers and employers would organize labor (Thompson 1967:60). Thus, since the 19th century, industrialized Western nations have been ingrained with valuing timeliness, deadlines, and clock time in a way that the majority of Mozambicans have not. This disparity can be seen in the behaviors of Mozambicans who have not been exposed to this conception to the degree of Westerners, and thus are not always equipped with the cultural capital of valuing a Western time ideology. Instead, if they wish to participate in the development field they must learn this trait and work to earn the cultural capital on their own accord. For expatriates in Mozambique, on the other hand, this is a part of their *habitus*. Thus, they can more easily and quickly access social capital and receive benefits such as networking with employers that provide them with jobs and increasing status.

If the value placed on time is such a critical indicator of whether or not an individual in Mozambique can access the benefits of development, then it seems clear that many of the cultural traits described in this work are directly related to it. Rural Mozambicans living in Manjacaze have the most difficulty in accessing social capital in the development field both because they are less directly influenced by the daily presence of the expatriates and organizations in Maputo and because they have less access to an education that might expose them to Western influences as well. Carlos, for instance, was educated and worked in Portugal prior to returning to Mozambique and thus could more easily adjust his expectations of time. He prides himself on always being on time and ahead of schedule for meetings. Another example is Armando who is originally from
Maputo and studied in the United States. Armando has learned to adopt the language of the agency he works for and work within a Western system. Both of these men were more prepared to adapt to working for aid agencies that expect their employees to respect deadlines, timelines, and arriving on time to work and meetings. Thus, some of the traits that I observed in Manjacaze such as the roundabout manner in which meetings with associations occurred and the perspective that INGO programs do not remain in communities for an adequate length of time stem from differing perspectives of time. Since many rural Mozambicans do not value the regimented manner of clock time as Westerners do, they then become frustrated when behaviors concerning this value differ, namely INGOs leaving seemingly unexpectedly and too soon.

Another trait that I observed that can be directly related to expectations of time are the frustrations espoused by expatriates in Maputo concerning Mozambicans who do not necessarily adhere to their conceptions of time. These frustrations and methods to alter the values and behavior of Mozambicans are a direct consequence of differing cultural viewpoints and indicate a lack of understanding as well as a sincere desire to understand Mozambican culture. An example of this can be seen in Bill’s discourse at Save the Children, where he described the frustrations and difficulties of working with Mozambicans and the programs and workshops that are designed to change their behavior. Of course, not every frustration is necessarily related to time, but throughout my interviews with informants it became clear that time was a major factor when considering their view of Mozambicans. When speaking with Anna, almost all of her complaints about her Mozambican coworkers were related to how, according to her, they
would not accomplish tasks by the assigned date, would agree to take on tasks even if they did not have time to accomplish them, and were seemingly unaware of her time priorities. Clearly, viewpoints related to time are highly influential in shaping the perspectives of expatriates and Mozambicans alike. As international NGOs shape their own Western-oriented policies, however, they dictate the behaviors of Mozambicans who work for them, and are thus subject to critique from individuals like Hanlon (1991) and Escobar (1995).

Although much of my data indicates that differing perspectives of time specifically play a large role in forming the frustrations, misunderstandings, and criticisms of the agents discussed, overall the patterns of behavior point to larger trends in the relationship between them. When considered from a broader perspective, the cultural traits that allow for maximum benefits in the development field and the cultural traits that prevent agents from accessing social capital have to do with the classification assigned to them. Specifically, from an INGO perspective, Mozambicans participating in this field are either *assimilado* or not. In other words, their behaviors have been altered to fit a Western paradigm or they have not, and if they have not than they have much more difficulty accessing the benefits connected to development. Of course, there are varying levels of whether or not groups or individuals have altered their behavior or discourse. As is seen through the data, however, the more an agent behaves, dresses, and speaks like a Westerner, the more benefits they will receive.

An example of the adoption of Western discourse and behavior can be seen in the activity of local associations in Manjacaze as they attempt to employ the discourse and
organizational pattern suggested by the international NGOs that fund them, but oftentimes the associations ultimately retain their own ways of doing things. As Mozambicans replicate the behavior of INGOs and expatriates, they are participating in Bhabha’s concept of mimicry (Bhabha 1987). They are attempting to access the social capital of these organizations and individuals by imitating their behaviors, to varying levels of success.

There is a broad range of unintended effects of international development on Mozambicans that intertwine with historical events and memories. In order to capture the importance of these forces in the lives of those affected, I will employ the term developscape, coined by Kristín Loftsdóttir (2009) and adopted from Arjun Appadurai’s (1996) idea of globalization consisting of various scapes as presented in Chapter Three. The meeting of ethnoscape and ideoscape contribute to the emergence of the developscape, creating distinct worlds of overlapping flows of ideas and people (Appadurai 1996). Developscape is the lived practices, perceptions, and imagined constructions of development that underlines globalization in terms of movements of people, products, ideas, desires, and images that are absorbed into a local context (Appadurai 1996; Loftsdóttir 2009:6). In short, the developscape represents the confluence of these localized perceptions and dynamic flow of globalization.

The practical implications of developscape are seen in Jean and John Comaroff’s (1991) description of how colonial missionaries in South Africa attempted to transform Tswana people and how their efforts had a significant impact on even the mundane level. Basic behavior and cultural activities such as getting dressed, sitting at a school desk,
marrying, bartering, building a home, ploughing, and praying were altered, while missionaries claimed that they were preparing the Tswana for the changing political economy of South Africa (Comaroff and Comaroff 1991). While the scope of this project does not cover daily domestic behaviors, many parallels can be drawn between the colonial-era alterations of the Tswana people and the modern cultural modifications taking place in Mozambique, making it clear that the phenomenon of the developscape is certainly not unique to Mozambique. The discourse of INGO employees implies that they are on a civilizing mission; the justification for altering Mozambican behavior is to train them to work or benefit from the development field and more readily equip them with the skills to continue development projects themselves. Like the missionaries who undoubtedly believed that their actions would ultimately benefit the Tswana, expatriate INGO employees also believe that their modification practices are for the benefit of Mozambicans. Their perspectives and actions, however, reinforce the notion of recolonization advocated by Joseph Hanlon (1991) that point to the recreation of colonial tendencies and their repercussions.

The developscape can also take on hegemonic tendencies. Jean and John Comaroff refer to hegemony as “that order of signs and practices, relations and distinctions, images and epistemologies - drawn from a historically situated cultural field - that come to be taken for granted for as the natural and received shape of the world” (Comaroff and Comaroff 1991). In this sense, hegemony does not necessarily take the form of immediately recognizable power dynamics, but instead can be found in the everyday habits and behaviors of individuals under hegemonic influence. In the
Mozambican case, the hegemonic power of international NGOs over Mozambicans has naturalized certain cultural tendencies such as the trends in conspicuous consumption that motivate Mozambicans to dress like Westerners and consume things such as expensive cars, spacious houses, and expensive restaurants and cafés, which is also affected by the presence of development and the confluence of globalized ideas.

As a result of the naturalizing hegemonic power of international NGOs and the subsequent behaviors it encourages, the disparate level of the agents’ access to social capital in the development field and the ability to participate in it shapes the distinct perspectives and perceptions they have of the other groups. For example, expatriate INGO employees feel a sense of power and authority over Mozambican employees because they can easily access the benefits in development, whereas Mozambicans working for INGOs feel slighted by expatriates as they must work very hard to access those same benefits in their own country. Those benefits may lead to the ability to purchase the symbols of power that Armando discussed in Chapter Five, and to participate in an emulation of the conspicuous consumption of expatriates.

Jean and John Comaroff’s definition of hegemony can be compared to Arturo Escobar’s analysis of development, as he says that development is a “historically specific representation of social reality, which permits particular modes of thinking and doing, whilst disqualifying others” (Escobar 1995:171). In this light, Escobar emphasizes that development as a representation of social reality allows and disallows certain patterns of behavior and ideology that reinforces behavior in agents that is specific to development. Going further, Escobar explains, “this involves specific forms of knowledge, systems of
power which regulate practice, and subjectivities by which people recognize themselves as developed or underdeveloped” (Escobar 1995:171). Thus, forms of knowledge, power systems, and practices that are regulated by forces outside the third world countries, in which Western development policies are implemented, act to formulate artificial ideas of what it means to be developed or underdeveloped (Escobar 1995). I have shown this to be true in Mozambique, where the presence of international NGOs and their expatriate employees work to naturalize conceptions of success, perceptions of self, what it means to be developed, and perspectives of development in the country. In turn, Mozambicans who work for these international aid organizations reinforce the power dynamics by converting to the forms of knowledge, power, and practice that are espoused by outsiders.

In addition, I argue that the hegemonic power of development discourse and practice disincentives any pragmatic changes except from the true architects of the development machine itself. Thus, despite the criticisms of development from all three classes of agents who work for INGOs that I interviewed in Mozambique, no real change or action is taken. This idea is also in line with Escobar’s theories, who says that development discourse can only be criticized from within, and those opposed to it can only propose slight modifications or improvements, for “development (has) achieved the status of a certainty in the social imaginary” (Escobar 1995:5). Therefore, although the Mozambicans and expatriates described work for organizations related to international development in Mozambique, they are in actuality minor cogs in the system; in order to affect real change it must come from within the greater forces of development, such as the policy makers and leaders at the World Bank (Escobar 1995:5).
As the socio-cultural dynamics concerning NGOs and aid recipients are based on the impact of international policies and neoliberal ideologies like those at the World Bank or United Nations, and as globalization is part of the neoliberal movement, globalization theory is also important when considering this data. In the proceeding chapters, I show that all three classes of agents are influenced by capitalism in the 21st century and manifests itself in neoliberal and global form (2001:4). Jean and John Comaroff argue that 21st century globalization is experienced through the spreading commodification of people, cultures, histories, and the substitution of quantity for quality, abstraction for substance. People in Manjacaze are affected by this form of globalization when INGOs like World Vision and Save the Children report back to donors on a different continent who are more concerned with number of houses built, for example, rather than the quality of efficacy of those houses.

Moreover, the cultures that are represented by INGOs to individual donors are done so in abstract form, turning the intended recipients of aid into commodities for a Western audience. This idea connects to Spivak’s concept of *Vertreten*, and *Darstellen* (Spivak 1988:293); in Mozambique, aid recipients are represented by aid agencies that are not members of the community, and thus their depictions are subject to misinterpretation and missteps. Globalization allows these *Vertreten* representations to be shared with millions of people around the world through images of poverty and helplessness. This amplifies the consequences of incorrect portrayals, adding to feelings of marginalization and a categorization of otherness (Ferguson 2006; Mbembe 2001), as well as contributing to the idea of the racialization of development (Loftsdóttir 2009),
discussed in more detail below. According to Loftsdóttir, development aids in reinforcing racial and socio-economic categorizations by constantly defining the aid giver and aid receiver by the color of their skin and economic status. Vertreten representations only aid to this racialization.

Indeed, the data from Mozambique shows that globalization is not a universalizing movement but instead creates wider divides and can increase marginalization, as authors like James Ferguson (2006) and Achille Mbembe (2001) argue. Instead, only a select few truly participate in a globally connected world, and the rest are constantly attempting to access it (Ferguson 2006:2). Part of these attempts include efforts by Mozambicans in Manjacaze and Maputo to alter their behavior and discourse in order to receive funding by INGOs in their community or work for an INGO. Since the majority of Mozambicans are marginalized from the globalized world of development, it is symbolic of power if Mozambicans who can access the material things and lifestyle associated with global forces do so. Thus, the idea that a globalized world exists but is unreachable by the majority of people living in Mozambique leads to deeper divides and encourages the capitalistic consumerism described by John and Jean Comaroff (2001).

The idea of mimicry and cultural hybridization as referenced by Homi Bhabha (1987) and Escobar (1995) connects to ideas of the developscape and Bourdieu’s theory of cultural production as well. Mimicry, as discussed in Chapter Three, refers to the attempt by a colonized people to replicate the behavior of the colonizer so as to access their power. According to Bhabha, mimicry can be subversive (Bhabha 1987:321) but it
is not necessarily so. In this case, mimicry is observed in the discourse of local associations adhering to the trending terminology of INGOs, urban Mozambicans who increasingly consume, behave, and dress like Westerners, and Mozambican INGO staff members who adopt the ideology and paradigms of their Western INGO. As seen in Chapter Four and the successful association *Ajuda Família*, mimicking Western INGOs can potentially result in the ability to access social capital, and is not subversive. From the perspective of INGOs, mimicry, according to Bhabha, can also reinforce the power dynamics at work in colonization, and in this case, development. INGOs create a similar version of themselves, yet the recipients of aid are still a distinct Other. In this sense, informants such as Filipe and Alcinda, who have altered their behaviors and habits in order to mimic the Westerners who work for their respective INGOs, ultimately strengthen the power dynamics between the two; Mozambican INGO staff are constantly working to prove their ability to adhere to Western-oriented cultural capitals.

Cultural hybridity, as applied to flows of cultures and their interactions, refers to a mix of the old and the new and can be seen as a cultural effect of globalization and is part and parcel of the *developscape* (Bhabha 1987; Escobar 1995). “If we continue to speak of tradition and modernity,” Escobar writes, “it is because we continually fall into the trap of not saying anything new because the language does not permit it. The concept of hybrid cultures provides an opening toward the invention of new languages” (1995:219). While this particular quote from Escobar hails from a 1995 publication, the idea of recognizing cultural hybridization as a reality of the presence of development continues to be an essential component in conceptualizing the affects of INGOs on urban and rural
Mozambicans. Cultural hybridization in Mozambique can work to produce a novel way of thinking about the whole picture of development and its impact on peoples and cultures. I have shown that the Mozambican classes of agents described are indeed hybrids of certain cultures, or represent a developscape as Loftsdóttir would put it, with Mozambicans adopting a more Westernized paradigm in order to negotiate for their own best interests. *Assimilados* are an example of individuals participating in this developscape; they are the most successful in the context of NGOs but at the same time represent continuity between colonial past and present.

Finally, Loftsdóttir also addresses the issue of the racialization of development as an essential aspect of the developscape. Loftsdóttir suggests that development creates and reinforces social categorizations such as “whiteness” and “blackness” that perpetuate power dynamics between those that provide aid and those that receive aid (Loftsdóttir 2009:6). She emphasizes that the terms white and black are, “not only an issue of skin colour, [or] fixed constructions, but social categorization that are to some extent localized and draw from a historical categorization formalized in 19th century European discourses” (Loftsdóttir 2009:6). It is highly significant, however, that the line of development funds pass between those formerly seen as civilized and white and those seen as uncivilized and dark, as well as the visibly obvious idea that those who work in the low-paid jobs in development have for the most part a different skin color from those managing the projects and offices (Loftsdóttir 2009:7). Significantly for this thesis, she observed very similar dynamics concerning development in Niger to what I discuss in Mozambique:

The developscape was also visible in the everyday life of Niamey, with
signs everywhere advertising an array of projects by a variety of development institutions. When large jeeps drove by, many were marked with the logo of such institutions. Certain spaces were also reserved for Westerners or more affluent Nigeriens, along with bars and restaurants…there was a strong relationship between skin colour and prosperity. Many were surprised to hear that in my native country my mother did not have servants to clean and cook for the family, and that my brother did not have a desk job. (Loftsdóttir 2009:7)

This excerpt illustrates the connection between Mozambique and other parts of Africa, and suggests that some of the trends I observed in Mozambique are not unique to the country. As described in Chapters Four and Five, informants expressed similar sentiments, and there seemed to be a clear divide between the more prosperous Westerners and their Mozambican counterparts. Carlos, Armando, and Alberto, for example, were particularly clear in vocalizing their observations of these modalities and how Mozambicans felt marginalized by the Westerners who held powerful positions within INGOs. My own observations support their opinions, as I frequently witnessed bars, restaurants, and neighborhoods that were reserved for Westerners, while it was met with great surprise when others learned that I, as a Westerner, did not have a maid or a cook. Thus, the racialization of development is enforced as a categorization not only in the idea of Westerners giving aid to non-Westerners, but in the behaviors and activities of Westerners living in the aid recipients’ country.

To sum up, I suggest that the hegemonic power of INGOs have the ability to naturalize shared behaviors, motivations, and perspectives that influence Mozambicans to adjust their cultural capitals to fit with the values of Western-oriented INGOs. Activities of INGOs and their associated Western expatriates that live in Mozambique perpetuate the idea of the racialization of development by reinforcing boundaries of white and black,
those who provide aid and those that receive aid. Moreover, international aid has created a distinct *developscape* with significant cultural impacts that alter the lived realities and culture of Mozambicans. From the civilizing mission of early anthropologists, the colonial policies of *assimilados*, to the structural adjustment period after the civil war, parallels can be drawn between the nature of colonial policies and the behavior and effects of modern aid agencies. According to this line of thought, the activities of INGOs are akin to the recolonization that Joseph Hanlon describes (1991).

The result of power dynamics, hegemonic and naturalizing program practices, and the mimicry of development that result in a distinct *developscape* leads us to question how these activities affect development programs in Mozambique. According to Joseph Hanlon, despite the rapid rise in GDP and the expansion of roads, electricity, and schools, poverty is increasing in Mozambique, with the gap between the poorest and the better off widening (Hanlon 2009:1). Moreover, the most recent analysis of rural income concludes that “the poorest households in 2005 are considerably poorer than the poorest households in 2002, while the wealthiest households in 2005 are considerably wealthier than the wealthiest households in 2002” (Mather et al., 2008:vii). The same study indicates that rural households are so poor that 41% cannot afford to own a chicken or a duck (Mather et al., 2008:4). Hanlon and Cunguara cite the lack of changes in farming practice and lack of cash income as contributing to the poverty trap in Mozambique (2012). The authors go on to discuss the failure of donor-led development models and look at Mozambique and other countries for alternative policies that might reduce poverty and raise agricultural production. Hanlon, Armando Barrientos, and David Hulme in *Just Give Money to the
Poor (2010) describe how the majority of Mozambicans are caught in the poverty trap, and even if improved infrastructures such as roads or development mechanisms such as local associations exist, they are unable to make use of them because they cannot make the investments necessary to make use of new infrastructure (Hanlon et al. 2010:1). In addition, a study by the international NGO Care showed that only the better off in communities join groups or associations, because the poorest among them have nothing to bring to the group (Whiteside and Gouveia 2003). This was seen in the data that I gathered in Manjacaze, where many of the local associations required minimum payments, as low as 10 to 20 meticals, to participate in the group that helped to maintain the association’s functions. If a poor individual was not able to contribute even at the most basic level, they are then not able to access the benefits of that association.

Thus, poverty in Mozambique seems to be increasing rather than decreasing, which is in direct contrast to the mission of INGOs like World Vision and Save the Children. Not only is the presence of these international aid organizations seemingly not reversing the cycle of poverty, but may be adding to problems of widening income gaps and expectation levels for Mozambicans. The Mozambican Peer Review Mechanism Forum warned that the widening gap between rich and poor creates the potential for exclusion and conflict (Forum Nacional do MARP, 2009:50,64). This gap was the source of frustration amongst some of my Mozambican informants who worked for INGOs, as they increasingly saw the possibilities of wealth accumulation and the desire for conspicuous consumption. The Forum’s findings are supported by Dores Cruz’s observations from previous years as well. When interviewed, she described how from her
experiences life in the rural areas of Mozambique appears to be getting worse. She has observed more children and elderly people who are abandoned, and deep changes in the extended family structure, often originated in life being more expensive and people not being able to fulfill traditional family obligations that are normally expected. In the city, prices have increased to levels that make these traditions difficult. She also added that the most expensive cars only belonged to foreigners in 2005, and now she has witnessed an affluent class of Mozambicans who are buying these cars and living a more affluent lifestyle (Cruz per. com.). As Dores has spent extended lengths of time in Mozambique since 2005, she has witnessed changes in both in Maputo and Manjacaze. Although some Mozambicans participate in a lifestyle that was previously difficult to obtain, many more Mozambicans seem to be falling more deeply into the cycle of poverty.

In light of the complications, frustrations, miscommunications, and increase in poverty that the implementation of traditional development policies have led to in Mozambique, alternative approaches to development should be considered. As alluded to in previous chapters, one such approach is promoted by Joseph Hanlon, Armando Barrientos, and David Hulme in Just Give Money to the Poor (2010). The authors argue that simply giving money to the poor with no strings attached, no conditions to meet, and no time limits, is the most compelling approach for reducing poverty and advocating long-term, sustainable development (2010). According to the authors, data from direct cash transfer programs around the world lead them to conclude that transfers are affordable for governments and donors, the recipients of the transfers use the money efficiently, cash transfers reduce hardship and poverty effectively, and they have the
potential to reduce longer-term poverty through economic and social development (Hanlon et al. 2010:x). They also note that these outcomes are most likely to be achieved when the cash transfer programs meet certain criteria and they offer five principles to guide them, saying they should be fair, assured, practical, provide enough cash to be affective, and be popular with the people (2010:x). Thus, they are not implying that cash should be given out completely without structure, preparation, or cultural awareness; the cash transfer programs should be implemented only when it is in accordance with local political thought, popular consent, and within reason.

The authors’ theory debunks the myth of the powerful trend towards soft paternalism and behavioral economics, the premise of which is that people will not be rational when it comes to decisions concerning their personal health, wealth, and happiness, but instead will make decisions that go against their own self-interests. Thus, according to this line of thought, people should not be trusted and it is the task of policymakers to make these decisions for them and guide them in the right direction (Hanlon et al. 2010:xi). Hanlon’s approach is in direct opposition to how many INGOs operate in Mozambique today, including organizations like World Vision who purposely take a more paternalistic approach and provide aid on strict conditions that do not necessarily match with the needs or expectations of the people they help, in addition to their religious programming.

As a result of this new way of thinking about development, more organizations have already begun to implement cash transfer programs. GiveDirectly, (“Give Directly” 2013) is an international NGO working in Kenya to alleviate poverty. On their website,
GiveDirectly describes the four step process in their program, which reads “1) You donate through our webpage, 2) We locate poor households in Kenya, 3) We transfer your donation electronically to a recipient’s cell phone, and 4) The recipient uses the transfer to pursue his or her own goals” (“Give Directly” 2013). They also list their values as compared to the general development industry values, saying that their standard is to “put at least 90% of every donated dollar in the hands of the poor” versus the industry standard to “spend money on fundraising and administration, and a high proportion on programming expenses, which is a vague category that includes the costs of staff salaries, field operations, subcontractors, and does not measure value created for the poor” (“Give Directly” 2013). This type of program, if implemented on a wide scale and in Mozambique, would eliminate many visible expatriate positions in Maputo and drastically change the cultural dynamics at work in the development field in Manjacaze. Instead of relying on the support of large INGOs like World Vision or Save the Children in Manjacaze, local community members could use the cash for whatever purposes they see fit, without having to adjust to the conditions set for them by outsiders. The entire field would shift, giving more power to Mozambicans and relieving them of the need to adjust their cultural characteristics in order to receive the social capital of the development field as it is now.

Of course, there are limitations to the scope of this work that do not include how Mozambicans might feel about a potential paradigm shift in how development functions in their country. While in the field, I did not question informants on their views of cash transfer programs. It is clear, however, that there is great potential for further study on
this topic. The potential for anthropologists to do research on development in Third World countries remains large, especially considering the long-term impact of development on communities, and how changing policies might affect sites of traditional anthropological study. Along those lines, William F. Fisher suggests that given the significant impact on these communities by transnational development actors, there will be ever newer opportunities for anthropologists to inform policy and contribute to an ongoing conversation (Fisher 2000:459). My data has shown that the presence of aid organizations and their associated employees have altered the cultural and social landscape of Manjacaze and Maputo to an extent that they can no longer be considered out of context of a development paradigm. Therefore, as the full implications of this impact may not be fully understood for some time, anthropologists can continue to provide insight into local perspectives of communities, networks, and social relations in an ethnographic framework in order to help explicate the influencing power of development and its actors.

Following Fisher’s lead and a call for anthropologists to examine communities through a critical lens of development and its impact, perhaps the effects of international aid in Mozambique can be more clearly understood. Whether or not development as recolonization (Hanlon 1996), development as neocolonialism (Escobar 1995), and other critical examinations such as those by James Pfeiffer and M. Anne Pitcher who question the success of international development in Mozambique can be more fully expounded upon to reveal the complex dynamics at work in the country. This thesis adds to the understanding of these cultural complexities in Mozambique and reveals the perceptions,
perspectives, and opinions of individuals on the ground and involved in the daily mechanisms of development in the country.

For individuals like Lidia, Elisa, Armando, Carlos, Alberto, and Filipe, the presence of international development in Mozambique has provided both opportunities and possible personal economic improvements, but has also contributed to the creation of new cultural worlds that they must learn to navigate and adhere to in order to receive these benefits. For expatriate populations, the presence of development in Mozambique has provided the opportunity for an exotic travel experience while at the same time enhancing their career as development-minded individuals. They are able to do this as they recreate their Western lifestyles, providing a paradox of motivation and experience. In Manjacaze, local associations struggle to keep up with the latest trends in development terminology and become frustrated as aid agencies come in and out of their community, often leaving a smattering of concrete houses and unusable water pumps behind. As poverty and humanitarian aid issues continue to affect millions of Mozambicans, a mechanism for the delivery of meaningful development is very much needed. By understanding the complex histories, social constructions, perspectives, and motivations of the agents described in this work, perhaps we are one step closer to creating effective policies that can positively alter the lived conditions of everyday Mozambicans.

For me, the imbalances of aid in Mozambique are best illustrated by the ongoing extreme poverty in Manjacaze that the Irmãs Concepcionistas are working to alleviate. One of the programs, The Table, is carried out in the village of Macassalane outside of the town of Manjacaze. Everyday at lunchtime, over one hundred school children are
served a hot meal of a little fish or meat and xima, Mozambique’s staple starch food. For many of the children this is the only meal that they will get that day, and the prospect of a hot meal encourages them to continue attending the nearby school. I participated in helping the irmãs with The Table on a few occasions.

Throughout my observations, it struck me that despite the abundance of international aid programming through local associations and INGOs in the district of Manjacaze, it has barely touched the lives of these children and their families who still struggle with the basics for survival. The Table is trying to fill a vacuum not filled by the more visible INGOs by providing people with tangible help, having continuity in their projects, and trying to impact the community by helping children to complete school. The programs of Irmãs Concepcionistas do much to mitigate this struggle, but there is much room for economic development and long-term change.

Irmãs Concepcionistas, with their goal of providing people with the basics for survival, are able to help so many because of their in-depth knowledge and understanding of Manjacaze. They know what is needed, where, and how to get it there. They have an appreciation for the needs of the community because they have lived there for decades, and because most of the sisters are Mozambican, they are attuned to the local culture and deal with situations from within Mozambican culture, not by imposing Western standards of time management and ideological discourse. Perhaps the best hope for the children of The Table, therefore, is an extensive reevaluation of development policies. This reevaluation should take into consideration the complex and long term effects of international aid, the intricate history of the cultures and peoples receiving that aid, and the
most efficient way to improve the lives of Mozambicans without consideration to previously held ideas of how development should work. Whether this reevaluation should include programs like GiveDirectly’s or more structured aid programs akin to World Vision remains to be seen. What is certain, however, is that in-depth ethnographic studies pertaining to how best to create the conditions for Mozambicans’ development is in order so that we can more clearly understand the impact of aid on cultures and communities, and thus the best method for aid delivery. As I was reminded at Elliot’s rooftop apartment party during my first few weeks in Maputo, I had indeed “come to the right place” to study the intriguing culture surrounding international development. Indeed, Mozambique provides an excellent case study for such an analysis, and I hope that this research contributes to the growing wealth of investigations into non-governmental agencies and their impact on cultural and global flows in the 21st century and beyond.
REFERENCES

Adam, Yussuf

African Socialism

Alpers, Edward A.

Amaral, Diogo Freitas do

AMODEFA

Appadurai, Arjun

Arnfred, Signe
2011 Sexuality and Gender Politics in Mozambique: Rethinking Gender Africa. Rochester: Boydell and Brewer, Inc.

Asad, Talal

Barnes, Sam

Basto, Maria-Benedita
2012 Writing a Nation or Writing a Culture? Frelimo and Nationalism During the


Clarence-Smith, W.G

Club of Mozambique Classifieds
2013  Club of Mozambique, Electronic Document. 

Coelho, João Paulo Borges

Comaroff, Jean, John L. Comaroff


Chronology of Mozambique

Convery, Ian

Cooke, Bill, and Uma Kotharai, eds.

Cost of Living in Mozambique
2013  Cost of Living Index, Electronic Document. 

Crush, Jonathan, Vincent Williams, and Sally Peberdy

Cruz, M. Dores
2007  Portugal Gigante: Nationalism, Motherland, and Colonial Encounters in

2011  Pots are pots, not people: material culture and ethnic identity in the Banda Area (Ghana), nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Azania: Archaeological Research in Africa 46(3).


Dias, Jorge, Margot Dias, Manuel Viegas Guerreiro

Donnelly, John, A. D. Roberts, Roland Anthony Oliver

Edelman, Marc, and Angelique Haugerud, eds.

Earthy, Dora E.

Eduardo Mondlane

End in sight for Mozambique Civil War
1992  Austin American Statesman, August 8.

Engels, Friedrich and Karl Marx

Eriksen, Thomas Hylland, and Finn Sivert Nielsen
Errante, Antoinette

Escobar, Arturo

Evans-Pritchard, E. E.,

A Faltering Phoenix: Corruption, Crime and Unemployment Threaten Success Story
2010  The Economist, July 8.

Ferguson, James


Ferguson, James, and Akhil Gupta

Ferraz, Bernardo and Barry Munslow

First, Ruth

Fisher, William

Flats, cars and oil for China: Angola's growth tempered by growing inequality
2012  The Guardian, August 30.

Forum Nacional do MARP (Mecanismo African de Revisão de Pares)
2009  Relatório de Auto-avaliação do País, Tomo 1, Maputo: MARP.

Friedland, William and Carl G. Rosberg Sr.
1964  African Socialism. Stanford, California: Hoover Institution on War,
Gardner, Katy, and David Lewis  
1996   Anthropology, Development and the Post-Modern Challenge. London:  
Pluto Press.

Gaza province in Mozambique completely free from landmines  

Geschiere, Peter and Francis Nyamnjoh  
2001   Capitalism and autochthony: the seesaw of mobility and belonging. In  
Millennial capitalism and the culture of neoliberalism. Durham, N.C: Duke  
University Press.

Giddens, Anthony  
2000   Runaway world: How globalization is reshaping our lives. New York:  
Routledge.

Give Directly  

Gow, David D.  
2002   Anthropology and development: Evil twin or moral narrative? Human  

Hall, Margaret and Tom Young  
1997   Confronting Leviathan: Mozambique since independence. Athens: University  
of Ohio Press.

Hamilton, C., ed.  
1995   The Mfecane Aftermath: Reconstructive Debates in Southern African  
History. Johanessburg: Pietermaritzburg: Witwatersrand University Press,  
University of Natal Press.

Hanlon, Joseph  
1996   Confronting Leviathan: Mozambique since Independence. London: C. Hurst  
2004   “It is possible to just give money to the poor,” Development and Change  
35(2):375-383


Hanlon, Joseph and Teresa Smart


Hanlon, Joseph, Armando Barrientos and David Hulme

2010  Just Give Money to the Poor. Sterling: Kumarian Press.

Hanlon, Joseph and Benedito Cunguara


Harrigan, Jane, Paul Mosley and John Toye


Harries, Patrick


Harris, Marvin


Harrison, Lawrence E.


Henri Alexandre Junod (1863 - 1934)

2004  Accessed January 5th, 2013

Henriksen, Thomas H.


Hiddleston, Jane

Hobart, Mark

Honwana, Alcinda

Igreja, Victor
2007  The Monkey’s Sworn Oath. Cultures of Engagement for Reconciliation and Healing in the Aftermath of the Civil War in Mozambique: Leiden University Medical Center (LUMC), Faculty of Medicine, and Research School CNWS, School of Asian, African, and Amerindian Studies: Leiden University

International NGOs, Organisations in Mozambique

Isaacman, Allen

Isaacman, Allen and Barbara Isaacman

Junod, Henri A.

Liesegang, Gerhard

Loftsdóttir, Kristin

Manning, Carrie
Marks, Shula

Mather, David, Benedito Cunguara, and Duncan Boughton
2008 Household Income and Assets in Rural Mozambique, 2002-2005: Can Pro-
Poor Growth Be Sustained? Michigan State University, Food Security

Mbembe, Achille
University Of California Press: US.

McCain urged Reagan Admin to Meet Terror Groups Without Preconditions
2008 The Huffington Post, October 23.

McKay, Ramah
2012 Humanitarian Histories and Critical Subjects in Mozambique. Cultural
Anthropology 27(2):286-309.

Meyns, Peter

Mfecane

Minimum Wages in Mozambique
2013 Minimum Wage Index, Electronic Document,
http://www.wageindicator.org/main/salary/minimum-wage/mozambique,
accessed October 14th, 2013.

Mondlane, Eduardo

Moss, David
2013 The Anthropology of International Development The Annual Review of
Anthropology.

Mozambique

Mozambique Battles Rebels
1987 Chicago Tribune, August 2.
Mozambican government approves new minimum salaries

Mozambique: historical demographical data of the whole country

Mozambique’s Lost Cashew Industry

Mozambique still a foreign aid economy

Mozambique Profile

Mozambique Rebels Kill 72

Mozambique: Renamo revert to force, aging, spent, and broke

Mudimbe, V. Y.

Murphy, Julia E.

Ndege, George O.

Netherlands Institute for Multiparty Democracy

Newitt, Malyn

das Neves, Diocleciano Fernandes
NGO Local Pay

Not Quite as Stellar as it Looks: One of Africa’s Success Stories Comes in for Closer Scrutiny
2007 The Economist, November 29

Núñez, Benjamín

Patch, Richard and Leon McMorrow

Pels, Peter

Pfeiffer, James


Piot, Charles

Pitcher, M. Anne


Portuguese Revolution (1974-1976)

Rapley, John

Ribeiro, P. Armando

Robertson, Roland

Rubin, Vera

Rupiya, Ramah

Said, Edward W.

Saul, John


Schafer, Jessica
2007 Soldiers at peace: Veterans and society after the civil war in Mozambique. New York: Palgrave Macmillan Ltd.

Seddon, David

Sheldon, Kathleen

Shillington, Kevin

Sidaway, James

Silva, T. Cruz e

Spivak, Gayatri

Stocking, George

Sumich, Jason

Thompson, E.P.

United Nations Development Program’s Human Development Index

United Nations Millenium Development Goals

Uphoff, Norman, and C. M. Wijayaratna

Vail, Leroy and White, Landeg
1980   Capitalism and Colonialism in Mozambique. Minneapolis: University of
Minnesota Press.

Walker, David M. and Daryl Glaser

Webster, David Joseph

West, Harry G.


West, Harry G. and Scott Kloeck-Jenson
1999   Betwixt and between: 'traditional authority' and democratic decentralization in post-war mozambique. African Affairs 98(393): 455-84.

Weiss, Brad

Whiteside, M., and Filipa Gouveia
2003   The Role of Groups and Associations in Agricultural Livelihood Development in Northern Mozambique–Experience from CARE Programmes.

Wilson, K.B.

Wolf, Eric

World Bank Indicators
2013.

World Vision


Young, Rich, Black, and Driving an African Boom

86 Mozambicans die in rebel attack
1987 The Globe and Mail, August 15.

Interviews


Diogo, Ivan. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, August 8, 2012.

Domingos, Elisa. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, July 24, 2014.

Fernandes, Pascoal. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, August 6, 2012.

Group Interview with Association Janet Mondlane. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, July 24, 2012.

Gundersen, Jessica. Interviewed by Carly Santoro. Maputo, Mozambique, October 2, 2012


Jamisse, Carlos. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, August 8, 2012.


Macuiana, Dinis. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, July 25, 2013.

Miles, Adrian. Interviewed by Carly Santoro. Maputo, Mozambique, September 27, 2012.


Muthisse, Antonio. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, July 24, 2012.

Nuvunga, Saimone. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, August 6, 2012.


Simango, Victorino. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, August 15, 2012.


Thompson, Katherine. Interviewed by Carly Santoro. Maputo, Mozambique,
September 14, 2012.

Vidigal, Adriano. Interviewed by Dores Cruz and Carly Santoro, Manjacaze, Mozambique, August 6, 2012.